

BENCHLINE

July 8, 2026

Re: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 to § 25249.14 (“Proposition 65”) and Notice of Intent to Sue

Dear Conservas Portugal Norte, LDA d/b/a Porthos Sardines, International Loft LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and the appropriate public enforcement agencies:

My firm represents WHEN Justice (“WHEN”) in this matter, and I submit this Notice of Violation and Notice of Intent to Sue (“Notice”) of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 to 25249.14 (hereinafter “Proposition 65”), pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, on its behalf. This letter serves as a Notice to Conservas Portugal Norte, LDA d/b/a Porthos Sardines, International Loft LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., and Amazon.com Services LLC (“Alleged Violator(s)”) and the appropriate public enforcement agencies.

Also enclosed please find a Certificate of Merit¹, Additional Supporting Information² thereto, and Certificate of Service³ appended hereto as Attachment(s) A, B, and C, respectively.

WHEN is a California nonprofit public benefit corporation dedicated to building a cleaner, safer, and more just world by advocating for stronger health, environmental, and safety laws, regulations, and policies. Through impact litigation, education, and advocacy, WHEN mobilizes a community of passionate supporters to drive meaningful, long-lasting change.

I. Notice of Intent to Sue Provided No Public Enforcement Actions against Alleged Violator(s)

If a public enforcement agency has not commenced a diligent prosecution within sixty (60) days of this Notice, in addition to time allotted for method of service, WHEN intends to file a private enforcement action against Alleged Violator(s) in the public interest, pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

¹ Attachment A has been provided to the Alleged Violator(s) and Attorney General.

² Attachment B has only been provided to the Attorney General.

³ Attachment C has been provided to all recipients of this Notice.

II. Proposition 65 Legal Background

Under Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, “[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual,” subject to exceptions. Additionally, pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.8, the State of California has published a list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity within the meaning of Proposition 65.⁴ Listed chemicals relevant to this Notice include: lead⁵ and lead and lead compounds⁶, and mercury and mercury compounds⁷.

For guidance, the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment created a summary (“Summary”) of Proposition 65 which includes general information about Proposition 65. A true and correct copy of the Summary is appended hereto as Attachment D.⁸

III. Alleged Violator(s) and Consumer Products with Listed Proposition 65 Chemicals

The names of Alleged Violator(s) encompassed within this Notice for violations of Proposition 65 are:

- **Manufacturer:** Conservas Portugal Norte, LDA d/b/a Porthos Sardines (*manufacturer*);
- **Distributor/ Retailer:** International Loft LLC;
- **Distributor/ Retailer:** Amazon.com, Inc.; and
- **Distributor/ Retailer:** Amazon.com Services LLC.

WHEN has identified violations of Proposition 65 by Alleged Violator(s) in regard to the products (“Covered Products”) identified below in Table 1. Alleged Violator(s) sell or otherwise provide consumer products directly to consumers by any means, including via the internet, in the State of California that contain listed chemicals without the required clear and reasonable warnings and/or in exceedance of allowable limits.

⁴ See the Proposition 65 list here: <https://oehha.ca.gov/proposition-65/proposition-65-list>.

⁵ On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity.

⁶ On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

⁷ On July 1, 1990, the State of California officially listed mercury and mercury compounds as chemicals known to cause developmental and reproductive toxicity. On May 1, 1996, the State of California officially listed methylmercury and methylmercury compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

⁸ Attachment A has only been provided to the Alleged Violator(s).

Table 1

Covered Products	Listed Chemical(s)	Uniform Product Code ("UPC")
Porthos Spiced Sardines in Olive Oil	Lead, Mercury	5604912410022

These violations have occurred and are continuing every day since at least September 4, 2025. Upon information and belief, the Covered Products identified in Table 1 have been in violation of Proposition 65 since the products were introduced into the State of California's marketplace and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are produced and until these chemicals are either removed from, or reduced to allowable levels, in the Covered Products.

IV. Route of Exposure

Exposure is through ingestion by following the recommended use of the products.

V. Preservation of Relevant Evidence

Alleged Violator(s) are obliged to maintain and preserve all documents in their possession that relate in any way to the activities underlying the allegations in this Notice. Document and evidence preservation includes, but is not limited to, the suspension of any document deletion and/or destruction with respect to *all* documents in Alleged Violator(s)' possession, custody, or control. "Document" or "documents" includes, but is not limited to, all hard copy writings as defined in Cal. Evid. Code § 250 ("writing" means handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostating, photographing, photocopying, transmitting by electronic mail or facsimile, and every other means of recording upon any tangible thing, any form of communication or representation, including letters, words, pictures, sounds, or symbols, or combinations thereof, and any record thereby created, regardless of the manner in which the record has been stored") and all Electronically Stored Information ("ESI") as defined in Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 2016.020 ("(d) 'Electronic' means relating to technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities" and "(e) 'Electronically stored information' means information that is stored in an electronic medium"). *See also Cedars-Sinai Medical Center v. Superior Court*, 18 Cal. 4th 1, 8, 954 P.2d 511, 515 (1998).

WHEN may continue to investigate these Covered Products and other products that may reveal additional violations and result in successive notices of violation.

VI. Conclusion

Consistent with the public interest and community right to know goals of Proposition 65, and a desire to have these ongoing violations rectified, WHEN is interested in

seeking a resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by Alleged Violator(s) to: (1) reformulate the Covered Products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these Covered Products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65, and its applicable regulations, to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three (3) years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation.

Please direct any inquiries or correspondence regarding this Notice to the below listed individual:

Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq.
Benchline PLLC
3540 Wilkinson Lane #8
Lafayette, CA 94549
jackie@benchline.law

Sincerely,



Jacqueline E. Biner
Founder & Managing Partner
Benchline PLLC

Enclosures and/or Attachments:

1. Certificate of Merit (to Alleged Violator(s) and Attorney General);
 - a. Exhibit 1 to Certificate of Merit: Additional Supporting Information (to Attorney General);
2. Certificate of Service (to all recipients of this Notice); and
3. OEHHA Summary (to Alleged Violator(s)).

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT


Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: Conservas Portugal Norte, LDA d/b/a Porthos Sardines, International Loft LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 violations

I, Jacqueline E. Biner, hereby declare and certify:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty (60) day Notice in which it is alleged that the party(ies) identified in the Notice violated Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by exposing individuals to chemical(s) known to the state of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning(s) to such individual(s).
2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy of the notice for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical(s) that is/are the subject of the Notice.
4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the California Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies, and data reviewed by that person).

Dated: July 8, 2026



Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 3540 Wilkinson Lane #8, Lafayette, CA 94549.

I. On July 8, 2026, I caused to be served the following:

1. **SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);**
2. **THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (“PROPOSITION 65”): A SUMMARY; AND**
3. **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT.**

by **Certified First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each Alleged Violator listed below, and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service representative:

Conservas Portugal Norte, LDA Rua Sousa Aroso, 580-620 Apartado 2041 4450-287 Matosinhos Portugal	Michael D. Deal, or Current Manager, or Managing Partner Amazon.com Services LLC c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Dr. Wilmington, DE 19808
Current President or CEO Amazon.com, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Dr. Wilmington, DE 19808	Current Manager or Managing Partner Amazon.com Services LLC c/o 155 Corporation CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive Sacramento, CA 95833
Current President or CEO Amazon.com, Inc. c/o 155 Corporation CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive Sacramento, CA 95833	Legal Department or Current President or CEO International Loft LLC 1342 W. McNab Road Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309

II. On July 8, 2026, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

1. SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and
2. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT.

via **Electronic Mail**, by sending true and correct copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the recipients listed on the “Electronic Mail Service List” as contained on the Office of the Attorney General Website located at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/electronic-service> and listed below:

Ursula Jones Dickson, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Robert K. Priscaro, District Attorney Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleville, CA 96120 prop65enf@alpinecountyca.gov	Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org	James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667 EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us	Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov
Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us	Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator Lassen County 2950 Riverside Drive Susanville, CA 96130 dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive Room 145 San Rafael, CA 94903 consumer@marincountyda.org
Walter W. Wall, District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org	Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Todd Spitzer, District Attorney Orange County 300 N. Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65notice@ocdapa.org
Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov	David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main Street Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcodaa.org
Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney

Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org	San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7 th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Prop65@sfcityatty.org	Brooke Jenkins, District Attorney San Francisco County 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Prop65@sfgov.org	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street 16 th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov
Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org	Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Carla Rodriguez, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 ECLD@sonoma-county.org
Tim Ward, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Boulevard Visalia, CA 95370 damail@tularecounty.ca.gov	Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S. Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org


III. On July 8, 2026, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

1. **SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);**
2. **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**
3. **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

by **Electronic Upload**, by uploading true and correct copies of the documents, addressed to the California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the “Electronic Upload Service List,” located at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>, the office of which is physically located at:

Office of the California Attorney General
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Executed on July 8, 2026, at Lafayette, California.



Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq.