1	Clifford A. Chanler (State Bar No. 135534) CHANLER LAW GROUP 71 Elm Street, Suite 8		
2			
3	New Canaan, CT 06840		
4	Telephone: (203) 966-9911 Facsimile: (203) 801-5222		
5	Daniel Bornstein (State Bar No. 181711)		
6	PARAS LAW GROUP		
7	655 Redwood Highway, Suite 216 Mill Valley, CA 94941		
8	Telephone: (415) 380-9222 Facsimile: (415) 380-9223		
9	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
10	Russell Brimer		
11	Ryan T. Dunn (State Bar No. 215383) PHILLIPS, SPALLAS & ANGSTADT LLP		
12	650 California Street, 10 th Floor		
13	San Francisco, CA 94108 Telephone: (415) 278-9400		
14	Facsimile: (415) 278-9411		
15	Attorneys for Defendants Dave & Buster's, Inc.		
16			
17			
18	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
19	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA		
20	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION		
21			
22	RUSSELL BRIMER,	Case No. 105-CV-034242	
23	Plaintiff,	CENTRAL A TRIONI AND INDODOCEDI	
24	v.	STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER RE: CONSENT JUDGMENT	
25	DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.; and DOES 1 through 150,,		
26	Defendants.		
27	——————————————————————————————————————		
28			
	1		

STIPULATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER RE CONSENT Case No. 105-CV-034242

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 **Plaintiff and Settling Defendant**. This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff Russell Brimer (hereafter "Brimer" or "Plaintiff") and Dave & Buster's, Inc. (hereafter "D&B"), with Plaintiff and D&B collectively referred to as the "Parties" and Brimer and D&B each being a "Party."
- 1.2 **Plaintiff.** Brimer is an individual residing in Alameda County, California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products.
- 1.3 **General Allegations.** Plaintiff alleges that D&B has manufactured, distributed, furnished and/or sold in the State of California shot glasses, and other glassware and ceramic products intended to hold food and/or beverages with colored artwork, designs or markings on the exterior surface with materials that contain lead and/or cadmium that are listed pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 et seq., also known as Proposition 65, to cause cancer and birth defects (or other reproductive harm). Lead and/or cadmium shall be referred to herein as "Listed Chemicals."
- 1.4 **Product Descriptions.** The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are defined as follows: glassware and ceramic products intended to hold food and/or beverages manufactured, sold, furnished and/or distributed by D&B with colored artwork, designs or markings on the exterior surface including, by way of example and without limitation, glassware products contained in the items listed at Exhibit A. Such products collectively are referred to herein as the "Products."
- 1.5 **Notices of Violation**. Beginning on October 18, 2004, Brimer served D&B and various public enforcement agencies with documents, entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice") that provided D&B and such public enforcers with notice that alleged that D&B was in violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn purchasers that certain products that it sold expose users in California to lead and/or cadmium (hereafter "the Listed Chemicals"). On or before July 15, 2005, plaintiff shall serve a Supplemental Notice on D & B and all required public enforcement agencies expanding plaintiff's prior allegations concerning the Products to

include ceramic products intended to hold food and/or beverages. If no public enforcer filed an action based on the Supplemental Notice, such ceramic products intended to hold food and/or beverages shall be included as Products within this Consent Judgment.

- 1.6 **Complaint.** On January 20, 2005, Brimer, in the interest of the general public in California, filed a complaint entitled *Russell Brimer v. Dave & Buster's, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 105 CV 034242 (hereafter referred to as the "Complaint" or the "Action") in the Superior Court for the County of Santa Clara against D&B and Does 1 through 150, alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 based on the alleged exposures to one or more of the Listed Chemicals contained in certain products furnished and/or sold by D&B.
- 1.7 **No Admission**. D&B denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in Plaintiff's Notices and Complaint and maintains that all products that it has furnished, sold and/or distributed in California including the Products have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by D&B of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by D&B of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties of D&B under this Consent Judgment.
- 1.8 **Consent to Jurisdiction**. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over D&B as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Santa Clara, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment and to enforce the provisions thereof.
- 1.9 **Effective Date**. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Effective Date" shall be June 30, 2005.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: PROPOSITION 65

2.1 WARNINGS AND REFORMULATION OBLIGATIONS

(a) **Required Warnings.** After the Effective Date, D&B shall not sell, furnish or transmit to any individual, distributor or retailer in California or any entity located

1	(b) Point-of-Sale Warnings. D&B may execute its warning obligations,	
2	where applicable, through arranging for the posting of signs at D&B locations in the State of	
3	California at which Products are used or sold, in accordance with the terms specified in	
4	subsections 2.2(b)(i), 2.2(b)(ii) and 2.2(b)(iii).	
5	(i) Point of Sale warnings may be provided through one or more signs	
6	posted at or near the point of use, sale or display of the Products that state:	
7	WARNING: The materials used as colored decorations on the	
8	exterior of this product contain lead and cadmium, chemicals known to the State of	
9	California to cause birth defects or other	
10	reproductive harm.	
11	or	
12		
13	WARNING: The materials used as colored decorations on the exterior of the following ceramic and glassware	
14	products sold in this store contain lead and cadmium, chemicals known to the State of	
15	California to cause birth defects or other	
16	reproductive harm.	
17	(List Products to by product name, pattern, type and size)	
18	(ii) A point of sale warning provided pursuant to subsection 2.2(b)(i)	
19		
20		
21	individual under customary conditions of use or purchase and shall be placed or written in a	
22	manner such that the consumer understands to which <i>specific</i> Products the warnings apply so as	
23	to minimize if not eliminate the chances that an overwarning situation will arise. Any changes to	
24		
25	following: (1) approval of Plaintiff; (2) approval from the California Attorney General's Office,	
26	provided that written notice of at least fifteen (15) days is given to Plaintiff for the opportunity to	
27	comment; or (3) Court approval.	
28		

(iii) If D&B intends to utilize point of sale warnings to comply with this Consent Judgment, it must provide written notice as required by this Consent Judgment to each entity to whom D&B ships the Products for sale in California, obtain the written consent of such entity before shipping the Products and secure their agreement to ensure that such warnings will be posted at the point of sale in California. The notice provided by D&B shall include a copy of this Consent Judgment and any required warning materials including, as appropriate, signs and/or stickers. If D&B has obtained the consent of its retailers to provide point of sale warnings, D&B shall not be found to have violated this Consent Judgment if it has complied with the terms of this Consent Judgment and has proof that it transmitted the requisite warnings in the manner provided herein.

- 2.3 **REFORMULATION STANDARDS:** Products satisfying the conditions of section 2.3(a) and 2.3(b) are referred to as "Reformulated Products" and are defined as follows:
- (a) If the colored artwork, designs or markings on the exterior surface of the Product do not extend into the top 20 millimeters of the ware (*i.e.*, only appear below the exterior portion of the lip and rim area as defined by American Society of Testing and Materials Standard Test Method C 927-99, hereinafter the "Lip and Rim Area"), produce a test result no higher than 1.0 micrograms ("ug") of lead and 4.0 micrograms (ug) of cadmium using a Ghost WipeTM test applied on the decorated portions of the surface of the Product performed as outlined in NIOSH method no. 9100; or
- (b) If the Product utilizes paints for all colored artwork, designs or markings containing six one-hundredths of one percent (0.06%) lead and cadmium or less by weight as measured at D&B's option, either before or after the material is fired onto (or otherwise affixed to) the Product, using a sample size of the materials in question measuring approximately 50-100 mg and a test method of sufficient sensitivity to establish a limit of quantitation (as distinguished from detection) of less than 600 parts per million ("ppm").²

² If D&B tests the decoration after it is affixed to the Product, the percentage of the Listed Chemical by weight must relate only to the other portions of the decorating material and not include any calculation of non-decorating material.

this agreement within fifteen (15) days of receipt of a written request from D&B following notice of the issuance of the Court's decision.

- (b) The Parties agree that D&B's potential interest in and ability to acquire and market Reformulated Products is to be accounted for in this section and, since it is not a remedy provided for by law, the absence of D&B previously acquiring, manufacturing, marketing or selling Reformulated Products is not relevant to the establishment of a penalty amount pursuant to section 3.1 above.
- (c) Apportionment of Penalties Received. After Court approval of this Consent Judgment pursuant to section 6, all penalty monies received shall be apportioned by Plaintiff in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the remaining 25% of these penalty monies retained by Plaintiff as provided by Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d). Plaintiff shall bear all responsibility for apportioning and paying to the State of California the appropriate civil penalties paid in accordance with this section.

4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

4.1 The Parties acknowledge that Plaintiff and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. D&B then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Plaintiff and his counsel under the private attorney general doctrine codified at Code of Civil Procedure §1021.5 for all work performed through the Effective Date of the Agreement. Under the private attorney general doctrine, D&B shall reimburse Plaintiff and his counsel for fees and costs, incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter (as well as any other matters reasonably related to the furnishing and/or sale of D&B's Products allegedly sold in violation of Proposition 65) to D&B's attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. D&B shall pay Plaintiff and his counsel \$40,000 for all attorneys' fees, expert and investigation fees, and litigation costs related to the various claims made against D&B. The

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	7
1	8
1	9
2	0
2	1
2	2
2	3
2	4
2	5
2	6
2	7

payment shall be made payable to the "Chanler Law Group" and shall be delivered to Plaintiff's counsel on or before June 30, 2005, at the following address:

CHANLER LAW GROUP Attn: Clifford A. Chanler 71 Elm Street, Suite 8 New Canaan, CT 06840

4.2 Except as specifically provided in this Consent Judgment, D&B shall have no further obligation with regard to reimbursement of Plaintiff's attorney's fees and costs with regard to the Products covered in this Action.

5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to sections 3 and 4, Plaintiff, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, and in the interest of the general public, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and release all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "Claims"), against D&B and each of its licensors, licensees, auctioneers, dealers, customers, owners, purchasers, users, parent companies, corporate affiliates, subsidiaries and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents, and employees (collectively, "D&B Releasees") arising under Proposition 65, related to D&B's or D&B Releasees' alleged failure to warn about exposures to or identification of Listed Chemicals contained in the Products.

The Parties further agree and acknowledge that this Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution of any violation of Proposition 65, that have been or could have been asserted in the Complaints against D&B for its alleged failure to provide clear and reasonable warnings of exposure to or identification of Listed Chemicals in the Products.

In addition, Plaintiff, on behalf of himself, his attorneys, and their agents, waive all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all Claims against the D&B Releasees arising under Proposition 65, related to each of the D&B Releasees' alleged failures to warn about exposures to or identification of Listed Chemicals contained in the Products and for all actions or statements made by D&B or its attorneys or representatives, in the course of responding to alleged violations of Proposition 65 by D&B. Provided however, The Parties shall remain free to institute any form of legal action to enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

It is specifically understood and agreed that the Parties intend that D&B's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment resolves all issues and liability, now and in the future (so long as D&B complies with the terms of the Consent Judgment) concerning D&B and the D&B Releasees' compliance with the requirements of Proposition 65, as to the Listed Chemicals in the Products.

This release expressly excludes any entity that manufactured or supplied any of the Products to D&B.

5.2 **D&B's Release of Plaintiff**. D&B waives all rights to institute any form of legal action against Plaintiff, or his attorneys or representatives, for all actions taken or statements made by Plaintiff and his attorneys or representatives, in the course of seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 in this Action.

6. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by all Parties, in which event any monies that have been provided to Plaintiff or his counsel pursuant to section 3 and/or section 4 above, shall be refunded within fifteen (15) days.

26 / / /

27 / / /

28 / / /

7. SEVERABILITY

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

If, subsequent to court approval of this Consent Judgment, any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

8. ATTORNEYS' FEES

In the event that a dispute arises with respect to any provision(s) of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall, except as otherwise provided herein, be entitled to recover reasonable and necessary costs and reasonable attorneys' fees incurred from the resolution of such dispute.

9. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products specifically, then D&B shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, those Products are so affected.

10. NOTICES

All correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (1) first-class, registered, certified mail, return receipt requested or (ii) overnight courier on either Party by the other at the following addresses. (Either Party, from time to time, may, pursuant to the methods prescribed above, specify a change of address to which all future notices and other communications shall be sent.)

To D&B:

Dave O. Corriveau, President Dave & Buster's, Inc. 2481 Manana Drive Dallas, TX 75220

With a copy to:

Robert K. Phillips, Esq. Phillips, Spallas & Angstadt LLP

2627

2728

1	650 California Street, 10 th Floor
2	San Francisco, CA 94108
3	To Plaintiff:
4	Clifford A. Chanler
5	Chanler Law Group 71 Elm Street, Suite 8
6	New Canaan, CT 06840
7	11. NO ADMISSIONS
8	Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall constitute or be construed as an admission by
9	D&B of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with
10	this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by D&B of any fact, finding,
11	conclusion, issue of issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by D&B.
12	D&B reserves all of its rights and defenses with regard to any claim by any party under
13	Proposition 65 or otherwise. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect D&B's
14	obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Consent Judgment.
15	12. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES
16	This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which
17	shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the
18	same document.
19	13. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(F)
20	Plaintiff agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health &
21	Safety Code § 25249.7(f). Pursuant to regulations promulgated under that section, Plaintiff shall
22	present this Consent Judgment to the California Attorney General's Office within five (5) days
	after receiving all of the necessary signatures. A noticed motion to enter the Consent Judgment
23	after receiving an of the necessary signatures. A noticed motion to enter the Consent Judgment
2324	will then be served on the Attorney General's Office at least forty-five (45) days prior to the date
24	will then be served on the Attorney General's Office at least forty-five (45) days prior to the date
2425	will then be served on the Attorney General's Office at least forty-five (45) days prior to the date a hearing is scheduled on such motion in the Superior Court for the City and County of Santa

14. ADDITIONAL POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

The Parties shall mutually employ their best efforts to support the entry of this Agreement as a Consent Judgment and obtain approval of the Consent Judgment by the Court in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. Accordingly, the Parties agree to file a Joint Motion to Approve the Agreement ("Joint Motion"), the first draft of which D&B's counsel shall prepare, within a reasonable period of time after the Execution Date (*i.e.*, not to exceed thirty (30) days unless otherwise agreed to by the Parties' counsel based on unanticipated circumstances). Plaintiff's counsel shall prepare a declaration in support of the Joint Motion which shall, *inter alia*, set forth support for the fees and costs to be reimbursed pursuant to Section 4. D&B shall have no additional responsibility to Plaintiff's counsel pursuant to C.C.P. §1021.5 or otherwise with regard to reimbursement of any fees and costs incurred with respect to the preparation and filing of the Joint Motion and its supporting declaration or with regard to Plaintiff's counsel appearing for a hearing or related proceedings thereon.

15. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (1) written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon, or (2) motion of any Party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court. The Attorney General shall be served with notice of any proposed modification to this Consent Judgment at least fifteen (15) days in advance of its consideration by the Court.

16. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

1 2	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
3	Date: 6.30.05	Date:
456	By: Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	By: Defendant DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
7 8	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
9	Date: 6/30/05	Date:
11	PARAS LAW GROUP	PHILLIPS, SPALLAS & ANGSTADT LLP
12	By:	By:
13	Daniel Bornstein	Ryan T. Dunn Attorney for Defendant
14	Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
15 16		
17	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
18		
19	Date:	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
20		
21		8
22 23	×	8
24	e	
25	2	
26		
27		
28		

STIPULATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER RE CONSENT Case No. 105-CV-034242

2	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
3	Date:	Date:
4		WATE 65)
5	By: Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	By: Defendant DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
6	riamini, Robbiss	
7 8	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
9	Date:	Date:
10	PARAS LAW GROUP	PHILLIPS, SPALLAS & ANGSTADT LLP
12	By:	Ву:
13	Daniel Bornstein	Ryan T. Dunn Attorney for Defendant
14	Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
15		
16		
17	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
18 19	Date:	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
20		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COOK
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	,	54
	STIPHLATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER	RE CONSENT
	STIPULATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER Case No. 105-CV-034242	

1	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
2	et e	
3	Date:	Date:
4		
5	By: Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	By:
6	Flamini ROSSELL BRIMER	Defendant DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
7		
8	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
9	Date:	Date:
10		
11	PARAS LAW GROUP	PHILLIPS, SPALLAS & ANGSTADT LLP
12	Ву:	By:
13	Daniel Bornstein	Robert K. Philips
14	Attorneys for Plaintiff RUSSELL BRIMER	Robert K. Philips Attorney for Defendant DAVE & BUSTER'S, INC.
15		
16		
17	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
18		
19	Date:	
20		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
		1.4
	STIPULATION AND (PROPOSED) ORDER RE CONSEN Case No. 105-CV-034242	14 VT

1	Exhibit A
2	All shot glasses, and ceramic and glassware products intended to hold food and/or beverages
3	with colored artwork, designs or markings on the exterior surface including, but not limited to:
4	Glass, Clear Shooter, City Specific
5	Glass, Clear Shot, City Specific Glass, Pub, Logo
6	Glass, Pilsner 23 oz., Logo Glass, Martini, Logo
7	Glass, Lemon Drop, Logo Glass, Tulip Shot, Logo
8	Glass, Hurricane Shooter, Logo Glass, Vodka Shooter, Logo
9	Glass, Blue Stripe Shot, Logo Glass, Beveled Beer Mug, Logo
10	Frosted Glass, Shot, Logo Frosted Glass, Shooter, Logo
11	Frosted Glass, Whiskey, Logo Frosted Glass, Tankard, Logo
12	Frosted Glass, Coffee Mug, Logo Ceramic, White Coffee Mug, Logo Commis Saun Man Logo
13	Ceramic, Soup Mug, Logo TNtea, glassware Over/Under, glassware
14	Over/Onder, grassware
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	15