1	Daniel M. Bornstein, State Bar No. 181711 Laralei S. Paras, State Bar No. 203319		
2	PARAS LAW GROUP		
3	655 Redwood Highway, Suite 216 Mill Valley, CA 94941		
4	Tel: (415) 380-9222 Fax: (415) 380-9223		
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff Russell Brimer		
6	Russell Billier		
7	Judith M. Praitis, State Bar No.151303 SIDLEY AUSTIN BROWN & WOOD LLP		
8	555 West Fifth Street		
9	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Tel: (213) 896-6000		
10	Fax: (213) 896-6600		
11	Attorneys for Defendant Enesco Group, Inc.		
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
13	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO		
14	UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION		
15			
16	RUSSELL BRIMER,	Case No. CGC-05-440239	
17	Plaintiff,	STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]	
18	v.	ORDER RE: CONSENT JUDGMENT	
19	ENESCO GROUP, INC.; and DOES 1 through 150,		
20	Defendants.		
21			
22	1. INTRODUCTION		
23	1.1 Plaintiff and Settling Defendant. This Consent Judgment is entered into by and		
24	between plaintiff Russell Brimer (hereafter "Brimer" or "Plaintiff") and defendant Enesco Group,		
25	Inc., (hereafter "Defendant" or "Enesco"). Plaintif	f and Defendant are collectively referred to as	
26	the "Parties" and each party being a "Party".		
27	1.2 Plaintiff. Brimer represents that he	is an individual residing in Alameda County,	
28	California, who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human		
	STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED ORDER]	RE: CONSENT JUDGMENTFINAL	

health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products.

- 1.3 **General Allegations.** Plaintiff alleges that Enesco has either manufactured, sold and/or distributed in the State of California, goblets, glass bowls and other glassware products intended for the storage or consumption of food or beverages with colored artwork, colored designs or painted or affixed markings (the "Decorations") on the exterior surface with materials that contain lead and/or cadmium, as those two chemicals are listed pursuant to the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 *et seq.*, also known as Proposition 65, at 22 Cal. Code Reg. § 12000. Lead and/or cadmium as listed pursuant to Proposition 65 shall be referred to herein as "Listed Chemicals."
- 1.4 **Product Descriptions.** The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are defined as follows: goblets, glass bowls and other glassware products intended for the storage or consumption of food or beverages, either manufactured, sold and/or distributed by Enesco with Decorations on the exterior surface containing lead and/or cadmium, including, by way of example and without limitation, the items listed at Exhibit A. Such products collectively are referred to herein as the "Products".
- 1.5 **Notices of Violation**. On December 17, 2004 and March 31, 2005, Brimer served Defendant and various public enforcement agencies with documents, entitled "60 Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice") that provided Defendant and such public enforcers with notice which alleged that Enesco was in violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn purchasers that certain products sold in California expose persons in California to lead and/or cadmium.
- 1.6 **Complaint.** On April 8, 2005, Brimer, acting in the interest of the general public in California, filed a complaint in the Superior Court in and for the County of San Francisco against Enesco Group, Inc. and Does 1 through 150, alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failure to warn of alleged exposures to one or more of the Listed Chemicals contained in certain glassware products either manufactured, sold and/or distributed by Enesco. On or before July 15, 2005, Brimer, acting in the interest of the general public in California, will

file an amended complaint (hereinafter referred to as the "First Amended Complaint") in the Superior Court in and for the County of San Francisco against Enesco Group, Inc. and Does 1 through 150, alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, as set forth in the December 17, 2004 and the March 31, 2005 notice letters, for failure to warn of alleged exposures to one or more of the Listed Chemicals contained in certain glassware products either manufactured, sold and/or distributed by Enesco. The original complaint and First Amended Complaint are collectively referred to herein as the "Action" or "Complaint."

- **No Admission.** This is a settlement of disputed claims, allegations and defenses intended by the Parties to avoid the time, expense and uncertainty of litigation, with no admission of liability, or the validity of any claim, allegation or defense, by any Party. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties of the
- **Consent to Jurisdiction**. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Enesco as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment and to enforce the provisions thereof.
- **Effective Date.** For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the "Effective Date" shall

WARNINGS AND REFORMULATION OBLIGATIONS

- **Required Warnings.** After July 15, 2005, Enesco shall not ship to any distributor or retailer in California, or otherwise offer for sale in California, any Products containing the Listed Chemicals, unless warnings are given in accordance with one or more provisions in subsection 2.2 below.
- (b) **Exceptions.** The warning requirements set forth in subsections 2.1(a) and 2.2 below shall not apply to any Reformulated Products as defined in subsection 2.3 below.

28

25

26

2.2 CLEAR AND REASONABLE WARNINGS

(a) **Product Labeling.** A warning is affixed to the packaging, labeling or directly to or on a Product by Enesco, its agent, the manufacturer, the importer, or the distributor of the Product that states:

WARNING: The materials used as colored decorations on the exterior of this product contain lead and cadmium, chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

or

WARNING: The materials used as colored decorations on the exterior of these products contain chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.¹

Warnings issued for Products pursuant to this subsection shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to purchase. Any changes to the language or format of the warning required by this subsection shall only be made following on one or more of the following events: (1) approval in writing by the California Attorney General's Office, provided that written notice seeking such approval is sent at least fifteen (15) days in advance to allow Plaintiff the opportunity to comment; or (2) Court approval upon consideration of a motion with notice as provided for in section 14.

- (b) **Point-of-Sale Warnings.** Enesco may execute its warning obligations, where applicable, through arranging for the posting of signs at retail outlets in the State of California at which Products are sold, in accordance with the terms specified in subsections 2.2(b)(i), 2.2(b)(ii) and 2.2(b)(iii).
- (i) Point of Sale warnings may be provided through one or more signs posted at or near the point of sale or display of the Products that state:

This formulation of the warning may only be used with respect to Products sold as a set.

1	WARNING:	The materials used as colored decorations on the
2		exterior of this product contain lead and cadmium, chemicals known to the State of
3		California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.
4		
5	or	
6	WARNING:	The materials used as colored decorations on the exterior of the following glassware products sold
7 8		in this store contain lead and cadmium, chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm:
9	(List Each Product by Brand Name/Manufacturer and Product Description, e.g., Enesco	
10	Geranium Glass)	
11	,	
	, ,	A point of sale warning provided pursuant to subsection 2.2(b)(i)
12	shan be pronimently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words,	
13	statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary	
14	individual prior to purchase and shall be placed or written in a manner such that the consumer	
15	understands to which <i>specific</i> Products the warnings apply so as to minimize if not eliminate the	
16	chances that an overwarning situation will arise. Any changes to the language or format of the	
17	warning required for Products by this subsection shall only be made following on one or more of	
18	the following events: (1) approval in writing by the California Attorney General's Office,	
19	provided that written notice seeking such approval is sent to Plaintiff at least fifteen (15) days in	
20	advance to allow Plaintiff the opportunity to comment; or (2) Court approval upon consideration	
21	of a motion with notice as provided in section 14.	
22	(iii)	After July 15, 2005, if Enesco intends to utilize point of sale
23	warnings to comply with this	Consent Judgment, it must provide notice as required by this
24	Consent Judgment to each entity to whom Enesco ships the Products for sale in California and	
25	obtain the written consent of such entity that it will transmit the warning as required by	
26	subsection 2.2(b)(i)-(ii) with respect to the Products it offers for sale in California. Such written	
27	consent shall be obtained before Enesco ships the Products to that entity. Such notice by Enesco	
28	22.102.11 31.11.1 30 33.11.110 30.10	21 Surpt the 11000000 to that entry. Such notice by Elicoco

shall include a copy of this Consent Judgment and the warning materials identified in subsection 2.2(b)(i). If Enesco has obtained the written consent of an entity to whom it ships the Products that such entity will provide warnings in the manner required by subsection 2.2 herein, Enesco shall not be found to have violated this Consent Judgment if it has complied with the terms of this Consent Judgment and has proof that it complied with this subsection 2.2(b)(iii).

- 2.3 **Reformulation Standards**. Products satisfying the applicable conditions set forth below qualify as "Reformulated Products."
- (a) The Product must produce a test result no higher than 1.0 micrograms (ug) of lead and 8.0 ug of cadmium using a Ghost WipeTM test applied to the colored Decorations on the exterior surface of the Product, performed as outlined in NIOSH method no. 9100, or
- (b) The colored Decorations on the exterior surface of the Product must contain or consist of only materials containing six one-hundredths of one percent (0.06%) of lead by weight, or less, and forty-eight one-hundredths of one percent (0.48%) of cadmium by weight, or less, as measured, at Defendants' option, either before or after the material is fired onto (or otherwise affixed to) the Product, using EPA Test Method 3050b.²
- (c) If the colored Decorations on the exterior surface of the Product extend into the top 20 millimeters of the ware (*i.e.*, the exterior portion of the lip and rim area as defined by American Society of Testing and Materials Standard Test Method C927-99, hereinafter the "Lip and Rim Area"), the Product must produce test results acceptable under section 2.3(a) or 2.3(b) above, and the decorative materials used in the Lip and Rim Area of the Products must contain no detectable lead or cadmium.³

If the Defendant tests any Decorations on the Products, using EPA Test Method 3050b, after the Decorations are affixed to the Product, the percentage of lead by weight and the percentage of cadmium by weight must relate only to the other portions of the decorating material and not include any calculation of non-decorating material.

For purposes of this subsection, "no detectable lead or cadmium" shall mean that lead is not detected at a level above two one-hundredths of one percent (0.02%) by weight and cadmium is not detected at a level above eight one-hundredths of one percent (0.08%), respectively, using a sample size of the materials in question measuring approximately 50-100 mg and a test method of sufficient sensitivity to establish a limit of quantitation of less than 200 ppm.

4.3 Except as specifically provided in this Consent Judgment, Enesco shall have no further obligation with regard to reimbursement of Plaintiff's attorney's fees and costs with regard to the Products which are the subject of the Complaint.

5. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 **Plaintiff's Releases**. In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to sections 3 and 4, Plaintiff, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, and in the interest of the general public, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and release all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees and costs, expert fees and costs and attorneys' fees and costs) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "Claims"), against Enesco and each of its contract manufacturers, distributors, wholesalers, licensors, licensees, auctioneers, retailers, dealers, customers, owners, purchasers, users, parent companies, corporate affiliates, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors and assigns, and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents, and employees (collectively, "Enesco Releasees") arising under Proposition 65 related to Enesco's or Enesco Releasees' alleged failure to warn about exposures to or identification of Listed Chemicals contained in the Products.

The Parties further agree and acknowledge that this Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution of any violations of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been asserted in the Complaints against Enesco and the Enesco Releasees for alleged failure to provide clear and reasonable warnings of exposure to or identification of Listed Chemicals in the Products.

In addition, Plaintiff, on behalf of himself, his attorneys, and their agents, waive all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all Claims against the Enesco Releasees arising under Proposition 65 related to each of the Enesco Releasees' alleged failures to warn about exposures to or identification of Listed Chemicals contained in the Products and for all actions or statements made by Enesco, the Enesco Releasees,

26

27

or their attorneys or representatives, in the course of responding to alleged violations of Proposition 65 by Enesco.

Plaintiff shall remain free to institute any form of legal action to enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment.

It is specifically understood and agreed that the Parties intend that Enesco's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment resolves all issues and liability, now and in the future (so long as Enesco complies with the terms of the Consent Judgment) concerning Enesco and the Enesco Releasees' compliance with the requirements of Proposition 65 as to the Listed Chemicals in the Products.

5.2 **Enesco's Release of Plaintiff**. Enesco waives all rights to institute any form of legal action against Plaintiff, or his attorneys or representatives, for all actions taken or statements made by Plaintiff and his attorneys or representatives, in the course of seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 in this Action.

6. **COURT APPROVAL**

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court by January 1, 2006, in which event the monies that have been provided to Plaintiff or his counsel pursuant to Sections 3 and 4 above shall be refunded to Enesco by January 15, 2006.

7. **SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to Court approval of this Consent Judgment, any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

8. **ATTORNEYS' FEES**

In the event of an action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing Party shall, except as otherwise provided herein, be entitled to recover reasonable and necessary costs and reasonable attorneys' fees incurred in that enforcement action.

//

9. **GOVERNING LAW**

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California without regard to its choice of law provisions. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products specifically, then Enesco shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, those Products are so affected.

10. **NOTICES**

All correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (1) registered, certified mail, return receipt requested, or (ii) overnight delivery to the representatives of each Party as listed below:

To Enesco: Koreen A. Ryan, Esq., General Counsel

ENESCO GROUP, INC.. 225 Windsor Drive Itasca, IL 60143.

With a copy to: Judith M. Praitis, Esq.

SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD, LLP

555 West Fifth Street Los Angeles, CA 90013.

To Plaintiff: Laralei S. Paras, Esq.

PARAS LAW GROUP

655 Redwood Highway, Suite 216

Mill Valley, CA 94941.

11. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

12. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Plaintiff agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f). Pursuant to regulations promulgated under that section, Plaintiff shall present this Consent Judgment to the California Attorney General's Office within five (5) days after receiving all of the necessary signatures. A noticed motion to enter the Consent Judgment

1

3

4

5

6 7

8

1011

13

12

1415

16

17

18

19

2021

22

23

24

25

26

2728

will then be served on the Attorney General's Office at least forty-five (45) days prior to the date a hearing is scheduled on such motion in the Superior Court for the City and County of San Francisco, unless the Court allows a shorter period of time.

13. ADDITIONAL POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

The Parties shall mutually employ their best efforts to support the entry of this Agreement as a Consent Judgment and obtain approval of the Consent Judgment by the Court in a timely manner. The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. Accordingly, Plaintiff agrees to file a Motion to Approve the Agreement ("Motion"), within a reasonable period of time after the execution of this Agreement. Enesco agrees to file a joinder in support of said Motion, provided Enesco has been granted an opportunity to review said Motion prior to filing and Plaintiff and Defendant resolve any concerns respecting such Motion prior to filing. In the event that any third party, including the Attorney General or any other public enforcer, objects or otherwise comments to one or more provisions of this Agreement, the Parties agree to undertake their best efforts to satisfy such concerns or objections and support the terms of this Agreement, with the Party to whom an objection is addressed taking the lead in resolution of that matter. Enesco shall have no additional responsibility to Plaintiff's counsel pursuant to C.C.P. § 1021.5 or otherwise with regard to reimbursement of any fees and costs incurred with respect to the preparation and filing of the Motion, resolving third-party concerns addressed to Plaintiff, or with regard to Plaintiff's counsel appearing for a hearing or related proceedings thereon.

14. **MODIFICATION**

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (1) written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon, or (2) motion of any Party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court. The Attorney General shall be served with notice of any proposed modification to this Consent Judgment at least fifteen (15) days in advance of its consideration by the Court.

//

//

Y	13. AUTHORIZATION	
2	The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their	
3	respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this	
4	Consent Judgment.	
5	ACREED TO	A CINCIPA MO
6	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
7	Date: 7-14-25	Date:
8	7 115	
9	By: frysll Sia	By:
10	Plaintiff Russell Brimer	Defendant Enesco Group, Inc.
11	e e	
12	z z	
13	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
14	Data	D
15	Date:	Date:
16	PARAS LAW GROUP	SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD, LLP
17		
18	Ву:	By:
19	Laralei S. Paras, Esq. Attorneys for Plaintiff	Judith M. Praitis, Esq. Attorneys for Defendant
20	RUSSELL BRIMER	ENESCO GROUP, INC.
21		*
22		
23	IT IS SO ORDERED.	3
24		я
25	4	
26	Date:	
27		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
28	STIPLII ATION AND INCOME.	OSEDI OPDER DE COVERNIA
ll ll	OTH OPATION AND INCOME.	INDITION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PARTY OF THE

1	15. AUTHORIZATION	
2	The undersigned are authorize	ed to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their
3	respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this	
4	Consent Judgment.	
5		
6	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
7	Date:	Date:
8		
9	By:Plaintiff Russell Brimer	By: Defendant Enesco Group, Inc.
10	Plaintiff Russell Brimer	Defendant Enesco Group, Inc.
11		
12		
13	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
14	Date: 7/15/05	D
15	Date:	Date:
16	PARAS LAW GROUP	SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD, LLP
17	Pan	
18	By: The Philas	By: Judith M. Praitis, Esq.
19	Laraler S. Paras, Esq. Attorneys for Plaintiff	Judith M. Praitis, Esq. Attorneys for Defendant
20	VRUSSELL BRIMER	ENESCO GROUP, INC.
21		
22		× ×
23	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
24		
25	9	5
26	Date:	
27		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
28	CTIDI II ATIONI ANIO	[PROPOSED] ORDER RE: CONSENT JUDGMENT
	STIFULATION AND	13

	, a
15. AUTHORIZATION	11. 0
The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their	
respective Parties and have read, unc	lerstood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of the
Consent Judgment.	
AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
AGREED TO:	MOREDO TO.
Date:	Date:
By:	B
By: Plaintiff Russell Brimer	Delendant Enesco Group, Inc.
APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
1	
Date:	Date:
PARAS LAW GROUP	SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD, LLP
Ву:	By:
Laralei S. Paras, Esq. Attorneys for Plaintiff	Judith M. Praitis, Esq. Attorneys for Defendant
RUSSELL BRIMER	ENESCO GROUP, INC.
IT IS SO ORDERED.	
to the first field of the state	
Date:	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COUR
STIPULATION AND	PROPOSED] ORDER RE: CONSENT JUDGMENT

1	15. AUTHORIZATION	
2	The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their	
3	respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this	
4	Consent Judgment.	
5		
6	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
7	Date:	Date:
8		
9	By:Plaintiff Russell Brimer	By:
10	Plaintiff Russell Brimer	Defendant Enesco Group, Inc.
11		
12		
13	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
14	Date:	Date: July 12, 2005
15	Date.	Date: (, 2003
16	PARAS LAW GROUP	SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD, LLP
17		Λ
18	Ву:	Ву:
19	Laralei S. Paras, Esq. Attorneys for Plaintiff	Judith M. Praitis, Esq. Attorneys for Defendant
20	RUSSELL BRIMER	ENESCO GROUP, INC.
21		
22		
23	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
24		
25		
26	Date:	
27		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
28		

1	Exhibit A
2	<u>L'AMOR A</u>
3	The following Goblets, Glass Bowls and Other Glassware intended for the Consumption of Food or Beverages with Colored Decorations (containing lead) on the Exterior:
4	
5	Geranium Goblet (#0 45544 73153 9)
6	Geranium Glass
7	(#0 4554473154 6)
8	The following Goblets, Glass Bowls and Other Glassware Intended for the Storage or
9	Consumption of Food or Beverages with Colored Decorations (containing cadmium) on the Exterior:
10	Geranium Goblet
11	(#0 45544 73153 9)
12	Geranium Glass
13	(#0 4554473154 6)
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	