1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE S'	TATE OF CALIFORNIA	
9	FOR THE COUNTY (	OF ALAMEDA	
10	UNLIMITED JUR	ISDICTION	
11	PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ex rel. BILL LOCKYER, Attorney General, et al.,	Case No. RG 04-162075	
12	Plaintiffs,	(Consolidated with RG 04-162037, RG 04) -169511)	
13	vs.	) ) [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT	
14	BURLINGTON COAT FACTORY	AS TO CREATIVE VISIONS, INC. DBA COUNTRY CLUTTER	
15	WAREHOUSE CORPORATION, et al,	) )	
16	Defendants.	) )	
17		)	
18	AND RELATED CONSOLIDATED CASES.	) )	
19			
20	1. INTRODUCTION		
21	1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into	by the Center For Environmental Health, a	
22	California non-profit corporation ("CEH"), and Creative Visions, Inc. dba Country Clutter		
23	("Defendant"), to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against Defendant as set forth in the		
24	operative complaint in the matter entitled Center for Environmental Health v. Nadri, Inc., et al.,		
25	Alameda County Superior Court Case No. RG 06-269531 (the "Nadri Action").		
26	1.2 On May 12, 2006, CEH filed the original complaint in the <i>Nadri</i> Action, which wa		
27	later consolidated with three other actions including the lead case entitled People v. Burlington		
28	Coat Factory et al. (Alameda Superior Court Case N	o. RG 04-162075).	
REPARED	- 1 -		

- 1.3 On February 21, 2006, upon noticed motion, the Court entered a Consent Judgment against a group of other defendants in the consolidated actions (the "Master Consent Judgment").
- 1.4 On June 15, 2006, upon noticed motion, the Court amended the Master Consent Judgment by entering an Amended Consent Judgment in the consolidated actions (the "Amended Master Consent Judgment").
- 1.5 On November 12, 2007, CEH provided a "Notice of Violation of Proposition 65" to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000, and to Creative Visions, Inc. dba Country Clutter regarding the presence of lead in jewelry manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant.
- 1.6 On February 15, 2008, the Complaint in the *Nadri* Action was amended to name Creative Visions, Inc. dba Country Clutter as a defendant.
- 1.7 Defendant is a corporation that employs 10 or more persons, and which manufactures, distributes and/or sells Covered Products in the State of California.
- 1.8 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and Defendant (the "Parties") stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Defendant.
- 1.9 CEH and Defendant enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims that were raised in the Complaint, or which could have been raised in the Complaint, arising out of the facts or conduct related to Defendant alleged therein. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law, including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law suggesting or demonstrating any violations of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, common law or equitable requirements relating to lead in jewelry. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as

DOCUMENT PREPAREI

an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in this or any other or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this action.

1.10 CEH and Defendant intend, and the Court finds, that the injunctive terms contained in Sections 2, 3.1 through 3.4, and 4 of this Consent Judgment are "substantially identical terms as provided in Sections 2, 3 and 4 of the amended consent judgment," as those terms are used in Health & Safety Code §25214.3(d).

#### 2. **DEFINITIONS**

- 2.1 The term "Person" shall have the same meaning as that term is defined in California Health & Safety Code §25249.11(a).
- 2.2 The term "Covered Products" means (a) the following ornaments worn by a person: an anklet, arm cuff, bracelet, brooch, chain, crown, cuff link, decorated hair accessories, earring, necklace, pin, ring, and Body Piercing Jewelry, or (b) any bead, chain, link, pendant, or other component of such an ornament.
- 2.3 The term "Body Piercing Jewelry" means any part of a Covered Product that is manufactured or sold for placement in new piercings and/or mucous membranes, and does not include those parts of Covered Products not placed within new piercings and/or mucous membranes.
- 2.4 The term "Children's Products" means Covered Products that are made for, marketed for use by, or marketed to, Children.
- 2.4.1 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Children" means children aged 6 and younger.
- 2.4.2 A Covered Product is made for, marketed for use by, or marketed to Children if it is either:

comply with the lead content requirements as set forth in Sections 3.2, 3.3, and 3.4 of this Consent Judgment.

- 3.5.3 **Accelerated Lead Phase-Down.** The lead content requirements effective August 31, 2009, in Sections 3.2.2.1 and 3.2.2.3 shall become effective on March 1, 2009.
- Date, Defendant shall cease shipping the Metal and CZ Necklace, Retail ID No. FNK08, that was identified in the 60 Day Notice of Violation sent by CEH to Defendant (the "Recall Product") to stores and/or customers in California, and Defendant shall withdraw the Recall Product from the market in California, and, at a minimum, send instructions to any of its stores and/or customers that offer the Recall Product for sale in California to cease offering such Recall Product for sale in California and to either return all Recall Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy the Recall Products. Any destruction of the Recall Products shall be in compliance with all applicable laws. Defendant shall keep and make available to CEH for inspection and copying records and correspondence regarding the market withdrawal and destruction of Recall Products. If there is a dispute over the corrective action, the Parties shall meet and confer before seeking any remedy in court.

#### 4. ENFORCEMENT

- 4.1 **General Enforcement Provisions.** The Attorney General or CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before this Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment, subject to the following:
- 4.1.1 Any action to enforce the terms of Section 3 of this Consent Judgment shall be brought exclusively pursuant to this Section 4.
- 4.1.2 No action to enforce this Consent Judgment may be brought by CEH unless the Attorney General either joins in such action or provides written non-objection to the proposed enforcement proceedings at the conclusion of the meet-and-confer requirement of Section 4.2.4. The Attorney General agrees to provide either a written objection or written non-objection to a proposed enforcement proceeding within 15 days of receipt of a written request for such a response from CEH, provided that the Attorney General may extend such 15 day response

time by a single extension of an additional 15 days by writing to the requesting party. The fact that the Attorney General provides a written non-objection shall not be construed as endorsement of or concurrence in an enforcement action. Any written non-objection shall be admissible in court only if Defendant challenges the right of CEH to enforce this Consent Judgment for failure to obtain the written non-objection.

4.1.3 For purposes of this Section 4 only, the term "Defendant" includes a Person that was a party to the Amended Master Consent Judgment or to a consent judgment that contained "identical or substantially identical terms as provided in Sections 2, 3 and 4 of the amended consent judgment," as those terms are used in Health & Safety Code §25214.3(d).

#### 4.2 Enforcement of Materials Violation.

4.2.1 **Notice of Violation.** In the event that, at any time following the Effective Date, the Attorney General or CEH ("Notifying Person") identifies one or more Covered Products that the Notifying Person believes in good faith do not comply with Section 3 of this Consent Judgment, the Notifying Person may issue a Notice of Violation pursuant to this Section 4.

#### 4.2.2 Service of Notice of Violation and Supporting Documentation.

- 4.2.2.1 The Notice of Violation shall be sent to the person(s) identified in Section 6.5 to receive notices for Defendant, and must be served within 45 days of the date the alleged violation(s) was or were observed. The Notice of Violation shall also be served on Defendant as a Supplier of the Covered Products identified by Brand Names listed on Exhibit D to the Amended Master Consent Judgment for the Covered Product(s) in question.
- 4.2.2.2 The Notice of Violation shall, at a minimum, set forth for each Covered Product: (a) the date(s) the alleged violation(s) was observed, (b) the location at which the Covered Product was offered for sale, (c) a description of the Covered Product giving rise to the alleged violation, and (d) all test data obtained by the Notifying Person regarding the Covered Product and supporting documentation sufficient for validation of the test results, including all laboratory reports, quality assurance reports and quality control reports associated with testing of the Covered Products. Such Notice of Violation shall be based upon test data that meets the criteria of Exhibit C. Wipe, swipe, and swab testing are not sufficient to support a Notice of

- 4.2.2.3 The Notifying Person shall promptly make available for inspection and/or copying upon request all supporting documentation related to the testing of the Covered Products and associated quality control samples, including chain of custody records, all laboratory logbook entries for laboratory receiving, sample preparation, and instrumental analysis, and all printouts from all analytical instruments relating to the testing of Covered Product samples and any and all calibration, quality assurance, and quality control tests performed or relied upon in conjunction with the testing of the Covered Products, obtained by or available to the Notifying Person that pertains to the Covered Product's alleged noncompliance with Section 3 and, if available, any exemplars of Covered Products tested.
- 4.2.3 **Notice of Election of Response.** No more than 30 days after receiving a Notice of Violation, Defendant shall provide written notice to the Notifying Person whether it elects to contest the allegations contained in a Notice of Violation ("Notice of Election").
- 4.2.3.1 If a Notice of Violation is contested the Notice of Election shall include all then-available documentary evidence regarding the alleged violation, including all test data, if any. If Defendant or the Notifying Person later acquires additional test or other data regarding the alleged violation, it shall notify the other party and promptly provide all such data or information to the party. Any test data used to rebut a Notice of Violation shall meet the criteria of Exhibit C.
- 4.2.3.2 If a Notice of Violation is not contested, the Notice of Election shall include a description of Defendant's corrective action pursuant to Section 4.2.6. The Notice of Election shall include the name, address, telephone number, and other contact information, of Defendant's Supplier(s) of each Covered Product identified in the Notice of Violation, and any other Defendant to whom it sold any Covered Product(s) identified in the Notice of Violation.
- 4.2.4 **Meet and Confer.** If a Notice of Violation is contested, the Notifying Person, the Attorney General, and the Defendant shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve their dispute. Within 30 days of serving a Notice of Election contesting a Notice of Violation, and if no enforcement action has been filed, Defendant may withdraw the original Notice of Election

Notice of Violation, Defendant shall make a required contribution in the amount of \$2,500 for

1	each Supplier from whom it purchased the Covered Product(s) identified in any Notices of	
2	Violation served within a 30-day period.	
3	4.2.7.3 If Defendant withdraws a Notice of Election contesting the violation	
4	and serves a new Notice of Election not to contest the allegations in a Notice of Violation within	
5	60 days after receipt of the Notice of Violation, and before any enforcement action concerning the	
6	violations alleged in the Notice of Violation is filed, Defendant shall make a required contribution	
7	in the amount of \$7,500 for each Supplier from whom it purchased the Covered Product(s)	
8	identified in any Notices of Violation served within a 30-day period.	
9	4.2.7.4 The contributions shall be paid within 15 days of service of a Notice	
10	of Election.	
11	4.2.7.5 Defendant's liability for required contributions shall be limited as	
12	follows:	
13	4.2.7.5.1 Defendant as a Supplier to one or more retailers shall	
14	be liable for one required contribution within any 30-day period,	
15	regardless of the number of retailers to whom the Covered Product	
16	is distributed.	
17	4.2.7.5.2 If Defendant has manufactured, sold, or distributed a	
18	Covered Product identified in a Notice of Violation, only one	
19	required contribution may be assessed against the Defendant	
20	potentially liable therefore in any 30-day period, in the following	
21	order of priority: (1) Manufacturers; (2) Importers; (3) Distributors,	
22	and (4) Retailers.	
23	4.2.7.5.3 Defendant's monetary liability to make required	
24	contributions under Section 4.2.7.2 shall be limited to \$5,000 for	
25	each 30-day period. Defendant's monetary liability to make	
26	required contributions under Section 4.2.7.3 shall be limited to	
27	\$15,000 for each 30-day period.	
28	4.2.7.6 If Defendant has paid either of the payments set forth in Sections	
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	- 12 -	

CONSENT JUDGMENT – CREATIVE VISIONS

4.2.7.2 and 4.2.7.3 more than six times in any 18-month period, or more than three times in any 12-month period for Covered Products sold to Defendant from the same Supplier then, at the Notifying Person's option, the Notifying Person may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, or remedies are provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment.

4.2.8 **Limitation on Liability.** Defendant's liability when it elects not to contest a Notice of Violation shall be limited to the contributions required by Section 4.2.7.

#### 5. PAYMENTS

- 5.1 **Payments From Defendant.** Within five days of the entry of this Consent Judgment, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$15,000 as a settlement payment. Any failure by Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late fee in the amount of \$100 for each day after the delivery date the payment is received. The late fees required under this section shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys' fees, by way of motion to enforce this Consent Judgment.
- 5.2 **Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for Defendant shall be paid in three separate checks delivered to the offices of the Lexington Law Group, LLP (Attn: Eric Somers), 1627 Irving Street, San Francisco, California 94122, and made payable and allocated as follows:
- 5.2.1 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$600 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with Health & Safety Code \$25249.12. The \$600 penalty check shall be made payable to the Center For Environmental Health.
- 5.2.2 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$4,600 as payment to CEH in lieu of penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, title 11, \$3202(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals, including heavy metals. In addition, CEH may use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with the reformulation requirements of this and other similar Consent Judgments, to purchase and test jewelry, and to prepare and compile the information and documentation necessary to support a Notice of Violation. The payment in lieu of penalty check

\_

shall be made payable to the Center For Environmental Health.

5.2.3 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$9,800 as reimbursement of reasonable attorneys fees and costs. The attorneys fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group, LLP.

#### 6. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION

- 6.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this Court upon motion and in accordance with law.
- 6.2 **Subsequent Legislation.** If, subsequent to the Effective Date, legislation is adopted that addresses the lead content of Covered Products sold in California, any Party shall be entitled to request that the Court modify this Consent Judgment for good cause shown.
- order amending Sections 2, 3 or 4 of the Amended Master Consent Judgment, the corresponding terms of Sections 2, 3.1 through 3.4, or 4 of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed amended, so that the injunctive terms contained in Sections 2, 3.1 through 3.4, or 4 of this Consent Judgment remain "substantially identical terms as provided in Sections 2, 3 and 4 of the amended consent judgment," as those terms are used in Health & Safety Code §25214.3(d). Defendant's obligation to undertake additional injunctive relief under Section 3.5 of this Consent Judgment shall not be subject to amendment under this section, and may not be modified absent stipulation of the parties or court order.
- 6.4 **Reopeners.** The Parties may seek to reopen the requirements of Section 3 as to Covered Products other than Children's Products as follows:
- 6.4.1 **Limited Reopener of Component Designation for Certain**Components. The parties acknowledge that the materials described in Sections 3.2.1.8 and 3.2.1.9 are not generally known to contain or expose users to lead and, as such, have been designated as Class 1 Components. CEH, with the written non-opposition of the Attorney General, may seek to modify this Consent Judgment by seeking the re-designation of any material described in Sections 3.2.1.8 and 3.2.1.9 from Class 1 Component to a Class 2 Component with a

	I	
1	lead standard for such material, if, subsequent to the Effective Date, CEH obtains information that	
2	demonstrates that such material contains lead and that the use of the material in any Covered	
3	Product exposes users of the Covered Product to lead in an amount greater than 0.5 micrograms	
4	per day.	
5	6.4.2 <b>Reopener for Class 3 Components.</b> Any Party may seek to modify this	
6	Consent Judgment by seeking to designate a Class 3 Component as a Class 1 Component or as a	
7	Class 2 Component with a lead specification standard.	
8	6.4.3 <b>Required Showing to Obtain Reopeners.</b> A reopener pursuant to	
9	Sections 6.4.1 or 6.4.2 shall be granted if the court finds the following:	
10	6.4.3.1 A Class 3 Component shall be redesignated as a Class 1 Component	
11	if the moving party demonstrates that such material does not contain lead, or that the use of the	
12	material in any Covered Product does not expose users of the Covered Product to lead in an	
13	amount greater than 0.5 micrograms per day.	
14	6.4.3.2 A Class 3 Component, and the materials described in Sections	
15	3.2.1.8 and 3.2.1.9, shall be redesignated as a Class 2 Component with a lead specification	
16	standard if the moving party demonstrates that use of such material at or below the standard does	
17	not expose average users of the Covered Product to lead in an amount greater than 0.5 micrograms	
18	per day.	
19	6.5 <b>Notice; Meet and Confer.</b> Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment	
20	shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to	
21	modify the Consent Judgment.	
22	6.5.1 <b>Notices to Defendant.</b> The person for Defendant to receive Notices	
23	pursuant to this Consent Judgment, until and unless modified pursuant to Section 8, shall be:	
24	John P. Kinsey	
25	Sagaser, Jones & Helsley P.O. Box 1632	
26	Fresno, CA 93717 Tel: (559) 233-4800 / Fax: (559) 233-9330	
27	jkinsey@sjhattorneys.com	
28		

6.5.2 1 **Notices to Plaintiff.** The person for CEH to receive Notices pursuant to 2 this Consent Judgment, until and unless modified pursuant to Section 8, shall be: 3 Eric S. Somers Lexington Law Group, L.L.P. 4 1627 Irving Street San Francisco, California 94122 5 Tel: (415) 759-4111 / Fax: (415) 759-4112 esomers@lexlawgroup.com 6 7 7. **CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE** 8 7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH and 9 Defendant and their parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies and their successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities other than 10 11 those listed on Exhibit D to this Consent Judgment to whom they distribute or sell Covered 12 Products, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any violation of 13 Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could have been 14 asserted in the public interest against Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream 15 Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposure to lead arising in connection 16 17 with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant prior to the Effective Date. 7.2 CEH, for itself and acting on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health and 18 19 Safety Code §25249.7(d), releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims against 20 Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could have been 21 22 asserted in the public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to lead arising in 23 connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant prior to the Effective Date. 24 25 7.3 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and its Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by that Defendant, its 26 Defendant Releasees and their Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged 27 failure to warn about Lead in Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant 28 - 16 -

after the Effective Date.

7.4 Nothing in this Section 7 shall apply to any Supplier that is not Defendant unless such Supplier is a parent, subsidiary, or sister company of Defendant.

#### 8. PROVISION OF NOTICE

8.1 When any party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the notice shall be sent by certified mail and electronic mail to the Party(ies) identified in Section 6.5. Any party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending each other party notice by certified mail and/or other verifiable form of written communication.

#### 9. COURT APPROVAL

- 9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date, provided however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.
- 9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.

#### 10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION

- 10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.
- 10.2 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. This Consent Judgment has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code §1654.

#### 11. ATTORNEY'S FEES

11.1 A party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent

Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs unless the unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure §§2016.010, *et seq*.

- 11.2 Notwithstanding Section 11.1, a party who prevails in a contested enforcement action brought pursuant to Section 4 may seek an award of attorneys' fees pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure §1021.5 against a party that acted with substantial justification. The party seeking such an award shall bear the burden of meeting all of the elements of §1021.5, and this provision shall not be construed as altering any procedural or substantive requirements for obtaining such an award.
- 11.3 Nothing in this Section 11 shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

#### 12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

12.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

#### 13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

CONSENT JUDGMENT - CREATIVE VISIONS

2	14.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized		
3	by the party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and		
4	execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.		
5	15. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS		
6	15.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim		
7	against an entity that is not Defendant on terms that are different than those contained in this		
8	Consent Judgment.		
9	16. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS		
10	16.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by		
11	means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.		
12	IT IS SO STIPULATED:		
13	Dated: October, 2008 CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH		
14	·		
15			
16			
17	Printed Name		
18			
19	Title		
20			
21	Dated: October 27, 2008 CREATIVE VISIONS, INC. d/b/a COUNTRY CLUTTER		
-22			
23	Allud		
24			
25	Jacqueline H. Rudominer Printed Name		
26	President		
27	Title		
28	- 19 -		
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	CONVENTED WITH ALL ATTIME A PROPERTY AND A STATE A STAT		

CONSENT JUDGMENT - CREATIVE VISIONS

AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT

14.

1	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED
2	AND DECREED
3	
4	Dated: Honorable Robert J. Freedman
5	Judge of the Superior Court of the State of California
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	- 20 -

CONSENT JUDGMENT – CREATIVE VISIONS

### EXHIBIT A (CLASS 1, 2, AND 3 COMPONENTS AND BODY PIERCING JEWELRY)

**CLASS 1 COMPONENTS** 

Karat gold

Sterling silver

Platinum, palladium, iridium, ruthenium, rhodium, or osmium ("platinum group metals")

Natural and cultured pearls.

Stainless and surgical steels

Glass, ceramic, and crystal decorative components (e.g., cat's eye, cubic zirconia (sometimes called cubic zirconium, CZ), glass, rhinestones, cloisonne).

Any gemstone that is cut and polished for ornamental purposes except the following: aragonite, bayldonite, boleite, cerussite, crocoite, ekanite, linarite, mimetite, phosgenite, samarskite, vanadinite, and wulfenite.

Elastic, fabric, ribbon, rope, and string with no intentional lead and not otherwise listed as a Class 2 component.

Natural decorative materials (e.g., amber, bone, coral, feathers, fur, horn, leather, shell, wood) that are in their natural state or are treated in a way that does not add lead.

Adhesives

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

#### **CLASS 2 COMPONENTS**

COMPONENT	LEAD CONTENT LIMITS
Metal substrates that are electroplated	Metal alloys with less than 10 percent
	lead by weight ("88 metal") that are
	electroplated with suitable under and finish
	coats and that are plated utilizing the Best
	Management Practices described in Exhibit B.
	For Covered Products shipped by Defendant as
	a Supplier after December 31, 2008 to a third
	party for retail sale in California, and for
	1

**EXHIBIT A** (CLASS 1, 2, AND 3 COMPONENTS)

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

1		products sold or offered for retail sale in
2		California by Defendant after August 31, 2009,
3		this standard shall be metal alloys with less
4		than 6 percent lead by weight ("92 metal") that
5		are electroplated with suitable under and finish
6		coats and that are plated utilizing the Best
7		Management Practices described in Exhibit B.
8	Unplated metal not defined as Class 1	1.5%
9	Components.	
10	Metal (plated and unplated) used in	0.06% (600 ppm)
11	Children's Products	
12	Plastic/Rubber (e.g., acrylic,	0.06%, (600 ppm). For Covered
13	polystyrene, plastic beads/stones, polyvinyl	Products shipped by Defendant as a Supplier
14	chloride (PVC))	after December 31, 2008 to a third party for
15		retail sale in California, and for products sold
16		or offered for retail sale in California by
17		Defendant after August 31, 2009, this standard
18		shall be no more than 0.02 percent (200 ppm)
19		lead by weight
20	Dyes and Surface Coatings	0.06% (600 ppm)
21	Printing inks or ceramic glazes used in	0.06% (600 ppm)
22	Children's Products	
23	Glass or crystal decorative components	Total weight no more than 1.0 gram,
24	used in Children's Products	excluding glass or crystal decorative
25		components that contain less than 0.02 percent
26		(200 parts per million) lead and have no intentionally added lead.
27		
28	- 2	2 -
EPARED PAPER	EXHII	

1	CLASS 3 COMPONENTS
2	Class 3 Components shall contain no more than 0.06% lead.
3	Class 3 Components used in Children's Products shall contain no more than 0.02% lead.
4	BODY PIERCING JEWELRY
5	Body Piercing Jewelry shall be made of one of the following materials:
6	Surgical Implant Stainless Steel
7	Surgical Implant grades of Titanium
8	Niobium (Nb)
9	Solid 14 karat or higher white or yellow nickel-free gold
10	Solid platinum
11	A dense low porosity plastic such as Tygon or PTFE with no intentionally added lead
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	- 3 -

1	EXHIBIT B (BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES FOR PLATING FACILITIES)
2	PRE-PLATING PROCEDURE
3	The pieces must be cleaned. Any polishing compound must be removed before plating by
4	cleaning with aqueous cleaning solution or solvent and rinsed with water.
5	The pieces must be activated.
6	The pieces must be rinsed in clean water before plating.
7	PLATING BATH MAINTENANCE
8	The temperature of each plating bath must be controlled to the appropriate temperature in
9	accordance with the recommendations of the equipment and plating chemical suppliers.
10	The nickel and nickel-substitute tanks must be agitated or aerated in accordance with the
11	chemical suppliers' recommendations.
12	All baths must be filtered continuously during plating and filters changed at least than
13	monthly.
14	pH must be measured each day of plating and adjusted within the chemical supplier's
15	recommendations.
16	All plating employees must be trained on the use of the equipment in accordance with
17	recommendation of equipment manufacturer and plating chemical suppliers.
18	The plating baths must be maintained in accordance with the plating chemical suppliers
19	recommendations.
20	Plating tanks must be swept at least weekly.
21	Anodes must be inspected monthly in accordance with the anode supplier's
22	recommendations.
23	Racks must be stripped at least annually.
24	The electrical equipment must be sized appropriately for each tank in accordance with
25	equipment manufacturer's recommendations and calibrated annually.
26	PLATING PROCEDURES
27	Substantial pieces such as pendants, drops, and rings without prongs or other such feature
28	- 1 -

shall be plated with at least 15 minutes combined plating with copper (copper strike and/or acid copper), nickel or nickel substitute, and/or finish coat. The pieces will also be rinsed between plating tanks. Finish decorative coatings include brass, bronze, copper, gold, gun metal, hematite, imitation rhodium, matt finish, palladium, platinum, rhodium, or silver. If desired, plated pieces can be treated to produce other finishes such as matt, oxidized, or smut black finishes.

Mechanical, functional (e.g., lobster claws, spacers, mechanical closures, connectors), or fine pieces such as prongs and fine chains may be plated to cover the exposed surface consistent with good manufacturing practices for appearance and function. Components that articulate closely together such as snake chain and tight hinges or that need to be manipulated into position will be plated to prevent binding, stiffness, and cracking of plating.

# 

## 

## 

## 

#### EXHIBIT C (TESTING PROTOCOLS)

The following test methods must be used to determine compliance with the lead standards set forth in this Consent Judgment. A material shall not meet the applicable lead standard if the mean lead level of: (1) one or two samples exceeds 300% of the component specification limit; (2) three samples exceeds 200% of the component specification limit; or (3) four or more samples exceeds the component specification limit.

Laboratory sample preparation protocols specific for testing the lead content of jewelry components are not readily available. The sample preparation method used in USEPA Method 3050B or Method 3051 shall be followed, as modified in the following table for use with jewelry samples. The laboratory should make every effort to assure that samples removed from jewelry pieces are representative of the component to be tested, and are free of contamination from extraneous dirt and material not related to the jewelry component to be tested. All jewelry component samples shall be washed prior to testing using standard laboratory detergent, rinsed with laboratory reagent grade deionized water, and dried in a clean ambient environment. If components must be cut or scraped to obtain a sample, then metal snips, scissors, or other cutting tools used must be made of stainless steel and washed and rinsed before each use and between samples.

Samples should be digested in containers that are known to be free of lead using acids that are not contaminated by lead. Analytical Reagent grade digestion acids and reagent grade deionized water are required. Method Blanks, consisting of all reagents used in sample preparation handled, digested and made to volume in the same exact manner and in the same container type as samples, shall be tested with each group of 20 or fewer samples tested. The results for the Method Blank shall be reported with each group of sample results, and shall be below the stated reporting limit for sample results to be considered valid.

All jewelry components samples shall be prepared for testing in accordance with USEPA Method 3050B or 3051, with the following additional notes and exceptions:

COMPONENT	NOTES AND EXCEPTIONS
Metals plated with suitable	Digestion using hot concentrated nitric acid with optional
undercoats and finish coats	hydrochloric acid and optional hydrogen peroxide. Sample size should be 0.050 g to 1 g. Digested samples may require dilution
	prior to analysis. Digestion and analysis should achieve a reported detection limit no greater than 0.1% for samples. Any
	necessary dilutions shall be made to assure that measurements are made within the calibrated range of the analytical instrument.
Unplated metal and metal	Digestion using hot concentrated nitric acid with optional
	hydrochloric acid and optional hydrogen peroxide. Sample size should be 0.050 g to 1 g. Digested samples may require dilution
1	prior to analysis. Digestion and analysis should achieve a reported detection limit no greater than 0.01% for samples. Any
	necessary dilutions shall be made to assure that measurements are made within the calibrated range of the analytical instrument.
Polyvinyl chloride (PVC)	Digestion using hot concentrated nitric acid with optional
Tory viniyi emoriae (1 ve)	hydrochloric acid and optional hydrogen peroxide. Sample size
	should be a minimum of 0.05 g if using microwave digestion or 0.5 if using hot plate digestion, and should be chopped or
	comminuted prior to digestion. Digested samples may require dilution prior to analysis. Digestion and analysis should achieve
	a reported detection limit no greater than 0.001% (10 ppm) for samples. Any necessary dilutions shall be made to assure that
	measurements are made within the calibrated range of the analytical instrument.
Non-PVC Plastic/Rubber	Digestion using hot concentrated nitric acid with optional
(e.g., acrylic, polystyrene, plastic beads/stones).	hydrochloric acid and optional hydrogen peroxide. Sample size should be a minimum of 0.05 g if using microwave digestion or
	0.5 if using hot plate digestion and should be chopped or comminuted prior to digestion. Plastic beads or stones should be
	crushed prior to digestion. Digested samples may require dilution prior to analysis. Digestion and analysis should achieve
	a reported detection limit no greater than 0.001% (10 ppm) for samples. Any necessary dilutions shall be made to assure that
	measurements are made within the calibrated range of the analytical instrument.
	·
Coatings on Glass and Plastic Pearls.	The coating of glass or plastic beads should be scraped onto a surface free of dust, such as a clean weighing paper or pan, using
	a clean stainless steel razor blade or other clean sharp instrument that will not contaminate the sample with lead. The razor blade
	or sharp instrument should be rinsed with deionized water, wiped to remove particulate matter, rinsed again, and dried between
	samples. Weigh the scrapings. A minimum of 50 mg of scraped - 2 -
	Unplated metal and metal substrates not defined as Class 1 Components.  Polyvinyl chloride (PVC)  Non-PVC Plastic/Rubber (e.g., acrylic, polystyrene, plastic beads/stones).  Coatings on Glass and

1		coating should be used for analysis. If less than 50 mg of scraped
2		coating is obtained from an individual pearl, then multiple pearls from that sample must be scraped and composited to obtain a
3		sufficient sample amount. The number of pearls used to make the
4		composite must be noted. Avoid inclusion of the substrate pearl material in the scrapings. Digest the scrapings according to
		USEPA Method 3050B or 3051 or equivalent procedure for hot
5 6		acid digestion in preparation for trace lead analysis. Dilute the digestate in the minimum volume practical for analysis. Analyze the digested sample according to specification of Exhibit C
7		(approved, validated methodology for inductively-coupled plasma mass spectrometry). A reporting limit of 0.001% (10
8		ppm) in the coating must be obtained for the analysis. The
9		sample result must be reported within the calibrated range of the instrument. If the initial test of the sample is above the highest
10		calibration standard, then the sample must be diluted and reanalyzed within the calibrated range of the instrument.
11	Dyes, paints, coatings,	Digestion using hot concentrated nitric acid with optional
12	varnish, printing inks, ceramic glazes, glass,	hydrochloric acid and optional hydrogen peroxide. Sample size should be a minimum of 0.050 g, and should be chopped or
13	crystal	comminuted prior to digestion.
14		Digested samples may require dilution prior to analysis.
15		Digestion and analysis should achieve a reported detection limit
16		no greater than 0.001% (10 ppm) for samples. Any necessary dilutions shall be made to assure that measurements are made
	Class and amountal and the	within the calibrated range of the analytical instrument.
17 18	Glass and crystal used in Children's Products (for weight)	The components should be free of any extraneous material such as adhesive before they are weighed. The scale used to weigh these components should be calibrated using NIST certified (S-
19		class) weights of 1 and 2 grams immediately before the
20		components are weighed. The calibration should be accurate to within 0.01 gram.
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		- 3 -

1		EXHIBIT D
2		(LIST OF ENTITIES NOT SUBJECT
3		TO DOWNSTREAM DEFENDANT RELEASE)
4	1.	Albertson's LLC; Albertson's, Inc.; New Albertson's, Inc.
5	2.	A-List, Inc. dba Kitson
6	3.	Amiee Lynn, Inc.
7	4.	AZ3, Inc.
8	5.	BCBG Max Azria Group, Inc.
9	6.	Beena Beauty Holding, Inc.
	7.	Big A Drug Stores, Inc.
10	8.	Busch Entertainment Corporation
11	9.	Charles Gantt dba Country Clutter
12	10.	Conair Corporation
13	11.	Cousin Corporation of America
14	12.	Elite Distributing Company dba Edco
15	13.	Estée Lauder Inc.; The Estée Lauder Companies Inc.
16	14.	Furla (U.S.A.) Incorporated
17	15.	Georgiou Studio, Inc.
18	16.	Goody Products, Inc.
19	17.	Hand & Mind, Inc.
20	18.	Hayun Fashion Investments Corporation dba Planet Funk
	19.	I Love Bracelets, Inc.
21	20.	Ivorette-Texas, Inc. dba Upstart Crow Trading Company
22	21.	Jacadi USA, Inc.
23	22.	La-Kontra
24	23.	Learning Express, Inc.
25	24.	Legoland California LLC
26	25.	Lisa Kline, Inc.
27	26.	Long Rap, Inc
28	27.	Mango
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER		- 1 - EXHIBIT D
ON RECTCEED I AFER		(ENTITIES NOT SUBJECT TO DOWNSTREAM RELEASE)

1	28.	Marin Beauty Company
2	29.	Max Rave, LLC
3	30.	Maxfield, Inc.
4	31.	Peninsula Beauty Supply, Inc.
5	32.	Peter David, Inc.
	33.	Planet Beauty, Inc.
6	34.	Raley's
7	35.	Rite Aid Corporation
8	36.	Save Mart Supermarkets
9	37.	Safeway Inc.
10	38.	Scünci International, Inc.
11	39.	Sea World, Inc.
12	40.	Shoe Pavilion Corporation; Shoe Pavilion, Inc.
13	41.	Six Flags Theme Parks, Inc.
14	42.	Urban Outfitters West LLC; Urban Outfitters, Inc.
15	43.	Venus Fashion Jewelry
16	44.	Whole Foods Market California, Inc.; Whole Foods Market, Inc.
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
REPARED	-	- 2 -