

MAY 14 2013

ORIGINAL FILED  
LOS ANGELES SUPERIOR COURT  
JAN 07 2013  
LOS ANGELES SUPERIOR COURT

METZGER LAW GROUP  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
RAPHAEL METZGER, ESQ., SBN 116020  
KATHRYN A. SALDANA, ESQ., SBN 251364  
401 E. OCEAN BLVD., SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CA 90802-4966  
TELEPHONE: (562) 437-4499  
TELECOPIER: (562) 436-1561  
WEBSITE: www.toxictorts.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff,  
Council for Education and  
Research on Toxics ("CERT")

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES, CENTRAL DISTRICT

COUNCIL FOR EDUCATION AND )  
RESEARCH ON TOXICS, a California )  
corporation, acting as a private )  
attorney general in the public )  
interest; )

Plaintiff, )

vs. )

BRAD BARRY COMPANY, LTD., a )  
California corporation; BRISTOL )  
FARMS, a California corporation; )  
CARIBOU COFFEE COMPANY, INC., a )  
Minnesota corporation; COSTCO )  
WHOLESALE CORPORATION, a )  
Washington corporation; DD IP )  
HOLDER LLC, a Delaware )  
corporation; DUNKIN' BRANDS, )  
INC., a Delaware corporation; )  
DUNKIN' DONUTS LLC, a Delaware )  
corporation; F. GAVINA & SONS, )  
INC., a California corporation; )  
THE FOLGERS COFFEE COMPANY, a )  
Delaware corporation; et al., )  
Defendants. )

CASE NO. BC461182  
Related to Lead Case No.  
BC435759  
Assigned to the Honorable Elihu  
Berle, Dept. 323  
CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO  
DEFENDANTS CARMEL ROASTERS,  
INC. AND MONTEREY COFFEE  
COMPANY, INC.

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
RAPHAEL METZGER  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
RAPHAEL METZGER  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

# 1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. On May 9, 2011, the Council for Education and Research on Toxics ("CERT") filed a complaint for civil penalties and injunctive relief for violations of Proposition 65 in the Superior Court for the County of Los Angeles. CERT's complaint alleges that the Defendants failed to provide clear and reasonable warnings that ingestion of the Covered Products (as defined in Paragraph 2.1), would result in exposure to acrylamide, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. The complaint further alleges that under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6, also known as "Proposition 65," businesses must provide persons with a "clear and reasonable warning" before exposing individuals to these chemicals, and that the Defendants failed to do so.

1.2. Carmel Roasters, Inc., was not named as a Defendant in Plaintiff's original complaint. However, on June 21, 2012, CERT served Carmel Roasters, Inc., with "Notice of Proposition 65 Violations" consistent with the present lawsuit and thereafter named Carmel Roasters, Inc., as a defendant in this lawsuit under its true name. Monterey Coffee Company, Inc., is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Carmel Roasters, Inc. Carmel Roasters, Inc., and Monterey Coffee Company, Inc., are hereinafter referred to as "Settling Defendants."

1.3. Settling Defendants are corporations that employ more than 10 persons, or employed 10 or more persons at some time relevant to the allegations of the complaint, and which manufacture, distribute and/or sell Covered Products in the State of California or have done so in the past.

1.4. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in CERT's complaint and personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendants as to the acts alleged in CERT's complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were raised in the complaint based on the facts alleged therein.

1.5. CERT and Settling Defendants enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims that were raised in the complaint (except as specified in Paragraph 9.1),

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1 arising out of the facts or conduct alleged therein. Settling Defendants have expressly waived their  
2 statute of limitations defenses with respect to the claims alleged in CERT's complaint. By execution  
3 of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to provide the relief and remedies specified herein, Settling  
4 Defendants do not admit any violations of Proposition 65, or any other law or legal duty. Except as  
5 expressly set forth herein, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right,  
6 remedy, or defense that CERT and Settling Defendants may have in any other or in future legal  
7 proceedings unrelated to these proceedings. However, this paragraph shall not diminish or otherwise  
8 affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of the parties under this Consent Judgment.

9 **2. DEFINITIONS**

10 2.1 "Covered Products" means all coffee beans or grounds, flaked, instant or freeze-  
11 dried coffee, or any other packaged coffee that is not sold as ready-to-drink and that is sold in any  
12 establishment in the State of California, including in restaurants, coffee houses, and retail speciality  
13 stores owned and/or operated by Settling Defendants ("Company Restaurants") or restaurants, coffee  
14 houses, and retail specialty stores owned and operated by third parties pursuant to franchise or license  
15 agreements with Settling Defendants ("Franchise Restaurants").

16 2.2 "Effective Date" means the date upon which this Court enters this Consent  
17 Judgment.

18 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF; CLEAR AND REASONABLE WARNINGS**

19 3.1. Settling Defendants shall provide warnings in the manner required by this  
20 Consent Judgment for all Covered Products.

21 3.2. Warning Message. The warning message provided, under the permitted warning  
22 methods, shall be the following:

23 a. **WARNING**

24 "Chemicals known to the State of California to cause  
25 cancer and reproductive toxicity, including acrylamide,  
26 are present in our coffee products. Acrylamide is not  
27 added to our products, but results from the roasting of  
28 coffee beans. As a result, acrylamide is present in our  
brewed coffee products. Your personal cancer risk is  
affected by a wide variety of factors. For more  
information regarding acrylamide see [www.fda.gov](http://www.fda.gov). For

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

more information about acrylamide and Proposition 65, visit [www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/acrylamide.html](http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/acrylamide.html).”

b. Wherever the warning language in this Consent Judgment uses the phrase “chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer,” Settling Defendants, at their option, may use either the phrase “chemical known to cause cancer” or “chemical that causes cancer.”

3.3. Warning Method. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the back of the package of the Covered Product, in typeface equal to the typeface of other product information on the label so as to render the warning easily read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. Such warnings shall accompany the Covered Product sold into California beginning no later than sixty (60) days after of the Effective Date.

3.4. Nothing in this Consent Judgment requires that warnings be given for Covered Products sold outside the State of California.

**4. CIVIL PENALTIES**

4.1. Calculation of Civil Penalties

4.1.1. A company who violates Proposition 65 shall be liable for civil penalties not to exceed two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500) per day *for each violation* in addition to any other penalty established by law pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(1).

4.1.2. In assessing the amount of civil penalties for violations of Proposition 65, all of the following factors must be considered pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(2):

- a. The nature and extent of the violation.
- b. The number of, and severity of, the violations.
- c. The economic effect of the penalty on the violator.
- d. Whether the violator took good faith measures to comply with this chapter and the time these measures were taken.
- e. The willfulness of the violator’s misconduct.
- f. The deterrent effect that the imposition of the penalty would have on both the violator and the regulated community as a whole.
- g. Any other factor that justice may require.

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4498  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

4.2. Settling Defendants voluntarily agreed to provide warnings for the Covered Products without any litigation, and agreed to comply with Proposition 65 immediately upon receiving a Proposition-65 Notice of Intent to Sue Letter, prior to being named or served as a defendant. Further, based on financial statements provided by Settling Defendants, Settling Defendants are small businesses with limited financial resources, such that they cannot afford civil penalties. As a result, the parties have agreed that Settling Defendants will not have to pay civil penalties in this case. This agreement is based on consideration of all the penalty factors set forth in Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b)(2), and on 11 C.C.R. § 3203(a) which provides that a "settlement with little or no penalty may be entirely appropriate."

**5. PAYMENTS**

5.1. Settling Defendants voluntarily agreed to be bound by the terms of this Consent Judgment prior to the elapse of 60 days from the date of receiving a Proposition 65 Notice informing them of their violations of Proposition 65 and CERT's intent to sue if these violations were not abated. As such, Settling Defendants will not be required to make any payments in this case. Settling Defendants will bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.

**6. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT**

6.1. This Consent Judgment may be modified by written agreement of CERT and Settling Defendants, after noticed motion, and upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the court thereon, or upon motion of CERT or Settling Defendants as provided by law and upon entry of a modified consent judgment by the court. Before filing an application with the court for a modification to this Consent Judgment, Settling Defendants may meet and confer with CERT to determine whether CERT will consent to the proposed modification. If a proposed modification is agreed, then Settling Defendants and CERT will present the modification to the court by means of a stipulated modification to the Consent Judgment.

6.2. If Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations are changed from their terms as they exist on the date of entry of judgment, the parties may seek modifications in the Consent Judgment as follows:

//

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1 a. If the change establishes that warnings for acrylamide in the Covered  
2 Products are not required, Settling Defendants may seek a modification of this Consent Judgment to  
3 conform to the judgment to the change in law.

4 b. If the change establishes that the warnings provided by this Consent  
5 Judgment would not comply with the law, either party may seek a modification of the Consent  
6 Judgment to conform the judgment to the change in law.

7 c. If the change would provide a new form or manner of an optional or  
8 safe-harbor warning, Settling Defendants may seek a modification to provide a warning in the newly  
9 permitted form, but the modification shall not be granted unless the court finds that the new warning  
10 would not be materially less informative or likely to be seen, read, and understood than the warnings  
11 provided under this Consent Judgment.

12 6.3 If Settling Defendants correspond in writing to an agency or branch of the United  
13 States Government in connection with the application of Proposition 65 to Acrylamide in the Covered  
14 Products, then, so long as such correspondence is not confidential and would be retrievable by CERT  
15 under the Freedom of Information Act, Settling Defendants originating such communication shall  
16 provide CERT with a copy of such communication as soon as practicable, but not more than 10 days  
17 after sending or receiving the correspondence; provided, however, that this section shall not apply to  
18 correspondence to or from trade associations or other groups of which Settling Defendants are a  
19 member.

20  
21 **7. ENFORCEMENT**

22 7.1. CERT may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before this  
23 Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. In any such proceeding,  
24 CERT may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, or remedies are provided by law for failure to comply  
25 with the Consent Judgment and where said violations of this Consent Judgment constitute subsequent  
26 violations of Proposition 65 or other laws independent of the Consent Judgment and/or those alleged  
27 in the complaint, CERT is not limited to enforcement of the Consent Judgment, but may seek in  
28 another action, whatever fines, costs, penalties, or remedies are provided for by law for failure to

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

comply with Proposition 65 or other laws. In any action brought by CERT alleging subsequent violations of Proposition 65 or other laws, Settling Defendant may assert all available defenses.

**8. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

8.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.

**9. CLAIMS COVERED**

9.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CERT and Settling Defendants, of any violation of Proposition 65 that has been asserted in the Complaint dated May 9, 2011, up through the Effective Date, for failure to provide clear and reasonable warnings of exposure to acrylamide from the use of the Covered Products, whether based on actions committed by Settling Defendants or by an entity to whom it distributes or sells coffee products, and for any franchisee who sells or has sold Covered Products in the State of California. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to acrylamide from Covered Products as set forth in the Complaint dated May 9, 2011.

**10. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

10.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement the Consent Judgment.

**11. PROVISION OF NOTICE**

11.1. When any party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the notice shall be sent by overnight courier service to the person and address set forth in this Paragraph. Any party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending each other party notice by certified mail, return receipt requested. Said change shall take effect for any notice mailed at least five days after the date the return receipt is signed by the party receiving the change.

//  
//  
//

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

11.2. Notices shall be sent to the following when required:

For CERT:

Raphael Metzger  
Metzger Law Group  
401 E. Ocean Boulevard, Suite 800  
Long Beach, CA 90802  
Telephone: (562) 437-4499  
Facsimile: (562) 436-1561

For Settling Defendant:

Elizabeth J. Stevens, Esq.  
Parravano Witten PC  
198 Bonifacio Place  
Monterey, CA 93940  
Telephone: (831) 373-0486  
Facsimile: (831) 373-4207

**12. COURT APPROVAL**

12.1. This Consent Judgment shall be submitted to the Court for entry by noticed motion. If this Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect and may not be used by CERT or Settling Defendant for any purpose.

**13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

13.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the parties.

//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//  
//



TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
RAPHAEL METZGER  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**14. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

14.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

DATED: January 4, 2013

METZGER LAW GROUP  
A Professional Law Corporation



RAPHAEL METZGER, ESQ.  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
COUNCIL ON EDUCATION AND RESEARCH  
ON TOXICS ("CERT")

DATED: January \_\_, 2013

PARRAVANO WITTEN PC

ELIZABETH J. STEVENS, ESQ.  
Attorneys for Settling Defendants  
CARMEL ROASTERS, INC. and  
MONTEREY COFFEE COMPANY, INC.

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:**

DATED:

HON. ELIHU M. BERLE  
Judge of the Superior Court

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (827) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 438-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4866

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LONG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

14. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS

14.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

IT IS SO STIPULATED:

DATED:

METZGER LAW GROUP  
A Professional Law Corporation

\_\_\_\_\_  
RAPHAEL METZGER, ESQ.  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
COUNCIL ON EDUCATION AND RESEARCH  
ON TOXICS ("CERT")

DATED: *January 7, 2012*

PARRAVANO WITTEN PC

\_\_\_\_\_  
*[Signature]*  
ELIZABETH J. STEVENS, ESQ.  
Attorneys for Settling Defendants  
CARMEL ROASTERS, INC. and  
MONTEREY COFFEE COMPANY, INC.

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

DATED: MAY 14 2013

ELIHU M. BERLE

\_\_\_\_\_  
HON. ELIHU M. BERLE  
Judge of the Superior Court

ELECTRONIC PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 years and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 401 E. Ocean Blvd., 8<sup>th</sup> Floor, Long Beach, CA 90802.

On January 7, 2013, I served the foregoing document, described as: CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANTS CARMEL ROASTERS, INC. AND MONTEREY COFFEE COMPANY, INC. on the interested parties to this action by submitting an electronic version of the document via FTP upload to LexisNexis/FileAndServe pursuant to the Court's Order.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct.

Executed on January 7, 2013, at Long Beach, California.

Susan M. Simpson, Declarant

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4498  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
RAPHAEL METZGER  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SERVICE LIST  
(CERT vs. Starbucks, Case No. BC435759)

-o0o-

Richard W. Lasater II, Esq.  
Foley & Lardner  
555 S. Flower St., Suite 3500  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-2411  
(Gloria Jean's Gourmet Coffees Corp.,  
Gloria Jean's Gourmet Coffees Franchising  
Corp., It's a Grind Inc., Praise  
International North America, Inc.)

Trenton H. Norris, Esq.  
Rachel L. Chanin, Esq.  
Arnold & Porter  
Three Embarcadero Center, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
(7-Eleven, Inc. BP America Inc., BP  
Products North America Inc., BP West Coast  
Products LLC, Winchell's Franchising, LLC,  
Yum Yum Donut Shops, Inc.)

Gabriel J. Padilla, Esq.  
Arnold & Porter  
777 S. Figueroa St., 44<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90017-5844  
(7-Eleven, Inc. BP America Inc., BP  
Products North America Inc., BP West Coast  
Products LLC, Winchell's Franchising, LLC,  
Yum Yum Donut Shops, Inc.)

Michele B. Corash, Esq.  
Robin S. Stafford, Esq.  
Morrison & Foerster  
425 Market Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2482  
(Starbucks Corporation, Starbucks Holding  
Company, Seattle Coffee Company, Peet's  
Operating Company, Inc. (incorrectly sued  
herein as Peet's Coffee and Tea, Inc.);  
International Coffee & Tea, LLC)

(Updated June 25, 2012 jlp)

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4459  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SERVICE LIST

(CERT v. Brad Berry, Case No. BC461182)

-000-

Lisa A. Cole, Esq.  
Nixon Peabody  
2 Palo Alto Square  
3000 El Camino Real, Suite 500  
Palo Alto, CA 94306  
(The Kroger Co., Ralphs Grocery Company,  
Food For Less of Southern California, Food  
4 Less Holdings, Inc., Food For Less  
Merchandising, Inc., Food For Less of  
California, Inc.)

Jeffrey B. Margulies, Esq.  
Tambry L. Bradford, Esq.  
Fulbright & Jaworski  
555 S. Flower St., 41<sup>st</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
(Target Corporation, Safeway, Inc. Sprouts  
Farmers Markets, LLC; Reilly Foods Company;  
H.N. Fernandez, Inc.)

Renee D. Wasserman, Esq.  
Lauren B. Kramer, Esq.  
Rogers Joseph O'Donnell  
311 California Street  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
(Bristol Farms, Costco Wholesale, Inc. and  
Supervalu Inc.)

Carla Christofferson, Esq.  
Margaret A. Moeser, Esq.  
Kate Ides, Esq.  
O'Melveny & Myers  
400 S. Hope Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-2899  
(Trader Joe's Company; Mountanos Brothers  
Coffee Company)

Michael D. Abraham, Esq.  
Robert H. Bunzel, Esq.  
Kerry L. Duffy, Esq.  
Bartko, Zankel, Tarrant & Miller  
900 Front St., Suite 300  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
(Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. and Sam's West,  
Inc.)

Michele B. Corash, Esq.  
Robert Falk, Esq.  
Robin Stafford, Esq.  
Travis Brandon, Esq.  
Morrison & Foerster  
425 Market Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2482  
(Brad Barry Company, Ltd., Caribou Coffee  
Company, Inc., F. Gavina & Sons, Inc.,  
Green Mountain Coffee Roasters, Inc., Illy  
Caffe North America, Inc., International  
Coffee & Tea, LLC, the J.M. Smucker  
Company, Kraft Foods Inc., Massimo Zanetti  
Beverage USA, Inc., Melitta U.S.A., Inc.,  
Nestle USA, Inc., Peet's Coffee & Tea,  
Inc., Rowland Coffee Roasters, Inc., Sara  
Lee Corporation, Seattle's Best Coffee LLC,  
Smucker Foodservice, Inc., Starbucks  
Corporation, TC Global, Inc., Vilore Foods  
Company, Inc., DD IP Holder LLC, Dunkin'  
Brands, Inc., The Folgers Coffee Company,  
Godiva Chocolatier, Inc., Newman's Own  
Organics - the Second Generation, Inc.,  
Starbucks Holding Company; Kraft Foods  
Global, Inc.; Apffels Coffee, Inc., Coffee  
Bean International, Inc., Dona Mireya,  
Inc., dba Jones Coffee Roasters; Equator  
Coffee & Teas; Boyer Coffee Company; Caffe  
Ibis, Inc.; The Coca-Cola Company;  
Community Coffee Company, Inc.; Copper Moon  
Coffee, LLC; JBR, Inc., dba Rogers Family  
Company; Lavazza Premium Coffees Corp.;  
Cascade Coffee, Inc.; Coffee Roasters of  
Arizona, Inc.; Gold Medal Products Co.;  
Millstone Coffee, Inc.; Mother Parkers Tea  
& Coffee, Inc.; Southern Wine and Spirits  
of America, Inc.; Central Coast Coffee  
Roasting Co., Inc.; Eight O'Clock Coffee  
Company; James c. Cannell Coffees, Inc. Db  
Jim's Organic Coffee; Pacific Coffee, Inc.  
dba Maui Coffee Company; Paradise  
Beverages, Inc. dba Hawaii Coffee Company;  
Regal Commodities; Steep & Brew, Inc.;  
Victor Allen's Coffee, LLC; Napa Valley  
Coffee Roasting Company; Kauai Coffee  
Company LLC; Peerless Coffee Co., Inc., dba  
Adam's Organic Coffees; Montana Coffee  
Traders, Inc.; Falcon Trading Company,  
Inc.; Intelligentsia Coffee & Tea, Inc.;  
Mayorga Coffee, LLC)

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1 Brendan W. Brandt, Esq.  
Andrew Ross  
2 Varner & Brandt  
3 3750 University Ave., Suite 610  
Riverside, CA 92501  
(Stater Bros. Markets)

4 J.T. Wells Blaxter, Esq.  
5 Blaxter Law  
6 One Bush St., Suite 650  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
(Whole Foods Market California, Inc.;  
7 Allegro Coffee Company)

8 Joshua A. Bloom, Esq.  
9 Samir J. Abdelnour, Esq.  
Barg Coffin Lewis & Trapp, LLP  
10 350 California St., 22<sup>nd</sup> Flr.  
San Francisco, CA 94104-1435  
(BYB Brands, Inc.; Snyder's-Lance, Inc.)

11 Henry Ben-Zvi, Esq.  
12 Ben-Zvi & Associates  
3231 Ocean Park Blvd., Suite 212  
13 Santa Monica, CA 90405  
(Cameron's Coffee and Distribution Company)

14 Duane R. Menting, Esq.  
15 705 Magnolia Avenue  
Larkspur, CA 94939  
16 (Big River Coffee Company, Inc.)

17 Lawrence Y. Wong, Esq.  
18 Darryl J. Horowitz, Esq.  
Coleman & Horowitz, LLP  
1880 Century Park East, Suite 404  
19 Los Angeles, CA 90067  
(Luberski, Inc., dba Hidden Villa Ranch)

20 Trevor J. Allen, Esq.  
21 Bryan Cave LLP  
3161 Michelson Dr., Suite 1500  
22 Irvine, CA 92612-4414  
(Kerry Inc., dba Kerry Ingredients, Inc.)

23 Megan I. Lennox, Esq.  
24 Bryan Cave LLP  
25 Two N. Central Avenue, Suite 2200  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
26 (Co-counsel for Kerry Inc., dba Kerry  
Ingredients, Inc.)

27 Melissa A. Jones, Esq.  
28 Carissa M. Beecham, Esq.

Stoel Rives LLP  
500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1600  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
(Land O'Lakes, Inc.)

Douglas D. Wirth, Esq.  
Law Offices of Steven C. Sabbadini  
823 North Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
(Puroast Coffee Company, Inc.)

Thomas M. Brown, Esq.  
Brown White & Newhouse LLP  
333 South Hope Street, 40<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
(Comfort Foods, Inc.)

Ian K. Boyd, Esq.  
Matthew A. Stratton, Esq.  
Harvey Siskind LLP  
Four Embarcadero Center, 39<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
(Rockstar, Inc.)

Tara Sky Woodward, Esq.  
Womble Carlyle Sandridge & Rice LLP  
10050 N. Wolfe Road, Suite 260  
Cupertino, CA 95014  
(Specially Appearing for S&D Coffee, Inc.)

Michele B. Corash, Esq.  
Robin S. Stafford, Esq.  
Susan L. Landsittel, Esq.  
Morrison & Foerster  
425 Market Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2482  
(New England Tea and Coffee Co., Inc.;  
Zavida Coffee Company, Inc.)

Jeannette K. Witten, Esq.  
Elizabeth J. Stevens, Esq.  
Parravano Witten PC  
198 Bonifacio Place  
Monterey, CA 93940  
(Carmel Roasters, Inc.; Kean Coffee, LLC;  
Monterey Coffee Company, Inc.; Santa  
Barbara Coffee & Tea, Inc. dba Santa  
Barbara Roasting Company; Santa Cruz Coffee  
Roasting Company)

Charles F. Gorla, Esq.  
Gorla, Weber & Jarvis

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
**RAPHAEL METZGER**  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1011 Camino del Rio South, Suite 210  
San Diego, CA 92108  
(Café Calabria Coffee Roasting Company)

(Updated 01/02/13 nsv)

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES )

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 years and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 401 East Ocean Blvd., #800, Long Beach, CA 90802.

On January 7, 2013, I served the foregoing document, described as: CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANTS CARMEL ROASTERS, INC. AND MONTEREY COFFEE COMPANY, INC. as follows:

X  (BY MAIL) I caused copies of such document, enclosed in sealed envelopes, to be deposited in the mail at Long Beach, California with postage thereon fully prepaid to the persons and addresses indicated on the attached list. I am "readily familiar" with the firm's practice of collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. It is deposited with U.S. Postal Service on that same day in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of any party served, service is presumed invalid if the postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after the date of deposit for mailing set forth in this affidavit to:

Office of the Attorney General  
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

X  (BY E-MAIL) I delivered such document by electronic mail to: Laura J. Zuckerman, Deputy Attorney General, 1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor, Oakland, California 94612 at Laura.Zuckerman@doj.ca.gov, and Dennis A. Ragen, Deputy Attorney General, 110 West A Street, Suite 1100, San Diego, California 92186-5266 at Dennis.Ragen@doj.ca.gov. Said document was transmitted by email transmission, which was reported complete and without error.

X  (STATE) I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct.

(FEDERAL) I declare that I am employed in the offices of a member of this court, at whose direction service was made.

Executed on January 7, 2013, at Long Beach, California.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Susan M. Simpson, Declarant

TELEPHONE (562) 437-4499  
TOLL-FREE (877) TOX-TORT  
TELECOPIER (562) 436-1561  
WWW.TOXICTORTS.COM

LAW OFFICES OF  
RAPHAEL METZGER  
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION  
401 EAST OCEAN BOULEVARD, SUITE 800  
LONG BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90802-4966

PRACTICE CONCENTRATED IN TOXIC  
TORT & ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION  
OCCUPATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL LUNG  
DISEASE, CANCER, AND TOXIC INJURIES

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28



## Angela Simm

---

**From:** LexisNexis File & Serve [TransactionReceipt@fileandserve.lexisnexis.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, January 07, 2013 2:20 PM  
**To:** Angela Simm  
**Subject:** Case: BC435759; Transaction: 48782569 Transaction Receipt

To: Angela Simm  
Subject: Transaction Receipt

This email is to confirm receipt of your documents. The transaction option you selected was "Serve Only - Public". The details for this transaction are listed below.

**Court:** CA Superior Court County of Los Angeles  
**Case Name:** Council for Education & Research on Toxics (CERT) vs Starbucks Corp (BC435759) & Brad Barry Co Ltd (BC461182) et al  
**Case Number:** BC435759  
**Transaction ID:** 48782569

**Document Title(s):**

Notice of Motion and Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlements and [Proposed] Consent Judgments, Memo of Points and Authorities re Brad Barry (31 pages)

Declaration of Kathryn Saldana Submitted in Support of Pltf's Notice of Motion and Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment re Brad Barry (134 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Propositin 65 Settlement as to Kean Coffee, LLC and [Proposed] Consent Judgment re Brad Barry (8 pages)

Request for Judicial Notice in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlements and [Proposed] Consent Judgments re Brad Barry (91 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co. Inc. and [Proposed] Consent Judgment re Brad Barry (8 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea, Inc. DBA Santa barbara Roasting Co. and [Proposed] Consent Judgment (8 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Propositin 65 Settlement as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. and [Proposed] Consent Judgment re Brad Barry (8 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea Inc. DBA Santa Barbara Roasting Co. re Brad Barry (16 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co., Inc. re Brad Barry (16 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Kean Coffee, LLC re Brad Barry (16 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. re Brad Barry (16 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Kean Coffee, LLC re Brad Barry (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co., Inc. re Brad Barry (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea, Inc DBA Santa Barbara Roasting Co. re Brad Barry (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. re Brad Barry (8 pages)

Notice of Motion and Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlements and [Proposed] Consent Judgments, Memo of Points and Authorities re Starbucks (32 pages)

Declaration of Kathryn Saldana Submitted in Support of Pltf's Notice of Motion and Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment re Starbucks (131 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. re Starbucks (8 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea, Inc. DBA Santa Barbara Roasting Co. re Starbucks (8 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co., Inc. re Starbucks (8 pages)

Notice of Lodgment in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and [Proposed] Consent Judgment as to Kean Coffee, LLC re Starbucks (8 pages)

Request for Judicial Notice in Support of Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlements and [Proposed] Consent Judgments (84 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Kean Coffee, LLC (19 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co., Inc re Starbucks (19 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. re Starbucks (19 pages)

Consent Judgment as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea Inc. DBA Santa Barbara Roasting Co re Starbucks (19 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Kean Coffee, LLC re Starbucks (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Carmel Roasters, Inc. and Monterey Coffee Co., Inc. re Starbucks (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Santa Barbara Coffee & Tea, Inc. DBA Santa Barbara Roasting Co. re Starbucks (8 pages)

[Proposed] Order Granting Pltf's Motion to Approve Proposition 65 Settlement and Enter Consent Judgment as to Bronson Baker DBA Santa Cruz Coffee Roasting Co. re Starbucks (8 pages)

Authorized Date/Time: Jan 7 2013 2:18PM PST

Authorizer: Kathryn Saldana

Authorizer's Organization: Metzger Law Group

Sending Parties:

Council for Education & Research on Toxics Served Parties:  
45 parties

Thank you for using File & ServeXpress.

Questions? For prompt, courteous assistance please contact File & ServeXpress Customer Service by phone at 1-888-529-7587 (24/7).