

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF MARIN

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL  
HEALTH, a non-profit corporation,  
  
Plaintiff,  
  
v.  
  
CARDINAL BRANDS, INC., *et al.*,  
  
Defendant.

Case No. CIV 1105699  
  
**[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT RE:  
CARDINAL BRANDS HOLDING  
COMPANY, INC.**

**1. INTRODUCTION**

1.1. This Consent Judgment is entered into by the Center For Environmental Health, a California non-profit corporation (“CEH”) on the one hand, and Cardinal Brands Holding Company, Inc. (“Defendant”) on the other hand, to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against Defendant as set forth in the operative complaint in the matter entitled *Center for Environmental Health v. Cardinal Brands, Inc., et al.*, Marin County Superior Court Case No. CIV 1105699 (the “Action”).

1.2. On August 24, 2011, CEH provided a “Notice of Violation of Proposition 65” to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000, and to Defendant regarding the presence of lead and lead compounds (collectively referred to herein as “Lead”) in

1 photo albums and scrapbooks (“Covered Products”).

2 1.3. On November 18, 2011, CEH filed the complaint against Defendant in the Action.

3 1.4. Defendant is a corporation that employs 10 or more persons, and that  
4 manufactures, distributes and/or sells Covered Products in the State of California.

5 1.5. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and Defendant (the “Parties”)  
6 stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the  
7 Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that  
8 venue is proper in the County of Marin, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent  
9 Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the  
10 Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products manufactured,  
11 distributed, and/or sold by Defendant.

12 1.6. CEH and Defendant enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement  
13 of all claims that were raised in the Complaint, or which could have been raised in the Complaint,  
14 arising out of the facts or conduct related to Defendant alleged therein. By execution of this  
15 Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any facts or  
16 conclusions of law including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law suggesting or  
17 demonstrating any violations of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, common law or equitable  
18 requirements. Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the  
19 Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with  
20 the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact,  
21 conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Defendant denies the material, factual and  
22 legal allegations in CEH’s Complaint and expressly denies any wrong doing whatsoever.  
23 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or  
24 defense the Parties may have in this or any other pending or future legal proceedings. This  
25 Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties  
26 solely for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this action.

27 **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

28 2.1. **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date of entry of this Consent

1 Judgment (the “Effective Date”), Defendant shall not manufacture, ship, sell or offer for sale any  
2 Covered Product unless such Covered Product complies with the following Lead Limits:

3 2.1.1. “Paint or other Surface Coatings” as that term is defined in 16 C.F.R. §  
4 1303.2(b): no more than 0.009 percent Lead by weight (90 parts per million (“ppm”).

5 2.1.2. All other materials: no more than .01 percent Lead by weight (100 ppm).

6 2.2. **Market Withdrawal of Covered Products.** On or before the Effective Date,  
7 Defendant shall cease shipping the Generations Memory Album in Red, SKU No. 0-12722-  
8 60335-3, Style No. GA60335, as identified in CEH’s pre-suit Notice of Violation to Defendant  
9 (the “Recall Covered Products”), to stores and/or customers in California, and Defendant shall  
10 withdraw the Recall Covered Products from the market in California, and, at a minimum, send  
11 instructions to any of its stores and/or customers that offer the Recall Covered Products for sale in  
12 California to cease offering such Recall Covered Products for sale and to either return all Recall  
13 Covered Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy the Recall Covered  
14 Products. Any destruction of the Recall Covered Products shall be in compliance with all  
15 applicable laws. Defendant shall keep and make available to CEH for inspection and copying  
16 records and correspondence regarding the market withdrawal and destruction of the Recall  
17 Covered Products. If there is a dispute over the corrective action, the Parties shall meet and  
18 confer before seeking any remedy in court.

19 2.3. **Products in the Stream of Commerce.** The obligations of Section 2.1 do not  
20 apply to any of Defendant’s Products that have been manufactured, distributed, shipped, sold, or  
21 that are otherwise in the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date.

### 22 **3. ENFORCEMENT**

23 3.1. **Enforcement Procedures.** Prior to bringing any new action, motion, or order to  
24 show cause to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, a Party seeking to enforce shall  
25 provide the violating party thirty (30) days advanced written notice of the alleged violation. Said  
26 written notice shall describe with particularity the circumstances surrounding the alleged  
27 violation. The Parties shall meet and confer during such thirty (30) day period in an effort to try  
28 to reach agreement on an appropriate cure for the alleged violation. After such thirty (30) day

1 period, the Party seeking to enforce may, by new action, motion or order to show cause before the  
2 Superior Court of Marin, seek to enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent  
3 Judgment.

4 **4. PAYMENTS**

5 4.1. **Payments From Defendant.** Within seven (7) days of the entry of this Consent  
6 Judgment, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$50,000 as a settlement payment.

7 4.2. **Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for Defendant shall be paid  
8 in three separate checks delivered to the offices of the Lexington Law Group (Attn: Howard  
9 Hirsch), 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, California 94117, and made payable and allocated  
10 as follows:

11 4.2.1. 4.2.1 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$6,600 as a penalty pursuant to  
12 Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with  
13 Health & Safety Code § 25249.12. The penalty check shall be made payable to the Center For  
14 Environmental Health.

15 4.2.2. 4.2.2 Defendant shall pay the sum of \$9,900 as payment to CEH in lieu of  
16 penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title  
17 11, § 3202(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people  
18 from exposures to toxic chemicals, including heavy metals. CEH may also use a portion of such  
19 funds to monitor compliance with the reformulation requirements of this and other similar  
20 Consent Judgments and to purchase and test Covered Products to confirm compliance with such  
21 reformulation requirements. In addition, as part of its *Community Environmental Action and*  
22 *Justice Fund*, CEH will use four percent of such funds to award grants to grassroots  
23 environmental justice groups working to educate and protect people from exposures to toxic  
24 chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at  
25 [www.ceh.org/justicefund](http://www.ceh.org/justicefund). The payment in lieu of penalty check shall be made payable to the  
26 Center for Environmental Health.

27 4.2.3. Defendant shall pay the sum of \$33,500 as reimbursement of reasonable  
28 attorneys' fees and costs. The attorneys' fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made

1 payable to the Lexington Law Group.

2 **5. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

3 5.1. **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by  
4 express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this  
5 Court upon motion and in accordance with law.

6 5.2. **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment  
7 shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with the other Party prior to filing a motion to  
8 modify the Consent Judgment.

9 **6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

10 6.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH and  
11 Defendant and Defendant's parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners,  
12 sister companies and their successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all to whom they  
13 directly distribute or sell Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors, wholesalers,  
14 customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees, including OfficeMax  
15 Incorporated and OfficeMax North America, Inc. ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any  
16 violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could  
17 have been asserted in the public interest against Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and  
18 Downstream Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Lead arising in  
19 connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant prior to the  
20 Effective Date.

21 6.2. CEH, for itself and acting on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health &  
22 Safety Code § 25249.7(d), releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims against  
23 Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any  
24 violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could  
25 have been asserted in the public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Lead  
26 arising in connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant prior  
27 to the Effective Date.

28 6.3. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and the

1 Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant, the  
2 Defendant Releasees and their Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged  
3 failure to warn about Lead in Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant  
4 after the Effective Date.

5 **7. PROVISION OF NOTICE**

6 7.1. When any Party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the  
7 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail as follows:

8 7.1.1. **Notices to Defendant.** The person for Defendant to receive Notices  
9 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:

10 John Dames  
11 Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
12 191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606  
[John.Dames@dbr.com](mailto:John.Dames@dbr.com)

13 7.1.2. **Notices to Plaintiff.** The person for CEH to receive Notices pursuant to  
14 this Consent Judgment shall be:

15 Howard Hirsch  
16 Lexington Law Group  
17 503 Divisadero Street  
San Francisco, CA 94117  
[hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com](mailto:hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com)

18 7.2. Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by  
19 sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

20 **8. COURT APPROVAL**

21 8.1. This Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date, provided  
22 however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and  
23 Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.

24 8.2. If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or  
25 effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any  
26 purpose.

27 **9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION**

28 9.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of

1 California.

2 **10. ATTORNEYS' FEES**

3 10.1. A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this  
4 Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable attorneys' fees and  
5 costs unless the unsuccessful Party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this  
6 Consent Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the  
7 Civil Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure Section 2016, *et seq*

8 10.2. Notwithstanding Section 10.1, a Party who prevails in a contested enforcement  
9 action brought pursuant to Section 3 may seek an award of attorneys' fees pursuant to Code of  
10 Civil Procedure § 1021.5 against a Party that acted with substantial justification. The Party  
11 seeking such an award shall bear the burden of meeting all of the elements of § 1021.5, and this  
12 provision shall not be construed as altering any procedural or substantive requirements for  
13 obtaining such an award.

14 10.3. Nothing in this Section 10 shall preclude a party from seeking an award of  
15 sanctions pursuant to law.

16 **11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

17 11.1. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding  
18 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,  
19 negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein  
20 and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties  
21 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied,  
22 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party  
23 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise,  
24 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically  
25 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the  
26 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation,  
27 modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in  
28 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent

1 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof  
2 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

3 **12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

4 12.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6 **13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

7 13.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized  
8 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and  
9 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.

10 **14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

11 14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim  
12 against another entity on terms that are different than those contained in this Consent Judgment.

13 **15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

14 15.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by  
15 means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

Dated: <u>1/7</u> , 2013	<b>CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH</b> <u>CHARLIE PIZARRO</u> Printed Name <u>ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR</u> Title
Dated: _____, 2013	<b>CARDINAL BRANDS HOLDING CO., INC.</b>  Printed Name  Title

**IT IS SO ORDERED, AJUDGED,  
AND DECREED**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_, 2013

\_\_\_\_\_  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE  
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

Dated: _____, 2013	<p><b>CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH</b></p> <hr/> Printed Name  <hr/> Title
Dated: <u>1/8</u> , 2013	<p><b>CARDINAL BRANDS HOLDING CO., INC.</b></p> <p><i>Marybeth T. / He</i>  <i>Marybeth VP. VSS Counsel for all</i>  <i>Succession in regard</i>  <i>to Cardinal Brands</i></p> <hr/> Printed Name  <hr/> <i>Vice President, VSS Counsel Counsel</i> Title

**IT IS SO ORDERED, AJUDGED,  
AND DECREED**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_, 2013

\_\_\_\_\_  
 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE  
 STATE OF CALIFORNIA