1 2	WILLIAM VERICK, SBN 140972 FREDRIC EVENSON, SBN 198059 KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTE	P.R.
3	424 First Street Eureka, CA 95501	
4	Telephone: (707) 268-8900 Facsimile: (707) 268-8901	
5	Facsimile: (707) 268-8901 E-mail: wverick@igc.org E-mail: ecorights@earthlink.net	
6	DAVID WILLIAMS, SBN 144479	
7	BRIAN ACREE, SBN 202505 370 Grand Avenue, Suite 5	
8	Oakland, CA 94610 Telephone: (415) 271-0826	
9	Facsimile: (415) 271-0829 E-mail: davidhwilliams@earthlink.net	
10	E-mail: brianacree@earthlink.net	
	Attorneys for Plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE	
11	FOUNDATION FOUNDATION	
12	CUMERIOR COURT OF THE	
13	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
14	CITY AND COUNTY	OF SAN FRANCISCO
15		
16	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION,	Case No. CGC-11-512718
17	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT MIDEA
18	v.	AMERICA CORPORATION
19	TAPRITE-FASSCO MFG., INC. (F.K.A.	
20	NORTH AMERICAN DISPENSE SYSTEM,	
21	INC.); CNA INTERNATIONAL; HAIER AMERICA TRADING, LLC; LELAND	
22	LIMITED, INC.; PERLICK CORPORATION; and PACIFIC MERCHANTS (Krome	
23	Dispense),	
24	Defendants.	
25		
26		
27		
28		
20		Case No. CGC-11-512718

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT MIDEA AMERICA CORPORATION

5

1

6 7

8

16 17

14

15

19 20

18

21

22 23

24

25 26

27

28

On or about December 15, 2011, plaintiff Mateel Environmental Justice 1.1. Foundation ("Mateel"), provided a 60-Day Notice of Violation to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of each county in California, and the City Attorneys of each California city with a population exceeding 750,000, and defendant Midea America Corporation ("Midea America"), claiming that Midea America, through its sales in California of beer taps, faucets and dispensing equipment that utilize valves, nozzles, spigots and stopcocks ("Covered Products") allegedly containing lead and/or lead compounds, was in violation of California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249, et seq. ("Proposition 65") by knowingly and intentionally exposing persons to lead and/ or lead compounds, chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning. On or about May 19, 2011, Mateel issued a 60-Day Notice of Violation to CNA International, Inc. ("CNA International"). On or about September 22, 2011, Mateel issued a 60-Day Notice of Violation to Vinotemp International Corporation ("Vinotemp International"), Maytag Corporation and Whirlpool Corporation. Together, the 60-Day Notice of Violation issued to Midea America, the 60-Day Notice of Violation issued to CNA International, and the 60-Day Notice of Violation issued to Vinotemp International, Maytag Corporation and Whirlpool Corporation are referred to as "60-Day Notice Letters."

On or about August 5, 2011, Mateel by its attorneys, the Klamath Environmental 1.2. Law Center ("KELC"), acting on behalf of the public interest, filed a First Amended Complaint for civil penalties and injunctive relief in the Superior Court for the City and County of San Francisco in the action entitled Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation v. Taprite-Fassco Mfg., Inc. et al., Case No. CGC 11-512718 against CNA International and other defendants. The First Amended Complaint in the action alleges, among other things, that defendants violated provisions of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65"). In particular, Mateel alleges that defendants knowingly and intentionally exposed persons to lead or lead compounds, which under Proposition 65 are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects of other reproductive

harm. More than 70 days have passed since Mateel sent the 60-Day Notice Letter, dated December 15, 2011, to Midea America and, for purposes of this Consent Judgment, the Court may deem that Midea America has been named as a defendant in the pending action, subject to the provisions of Paragraph 1.5 of this Consent Judgment.

- 1.3. Midea America is a business that employs ten or more persons and markets manufactures, sells and/or distributes and/or causes or allows the sale and distribution of Covered Products to or within the State of California, which are alleged to contain lead and/or lead compounds.
- 1.4. Lead and lead compounds are chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, and lead is a chemical known to the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.9. Under certain circumstances, products containing lead and/or lead compounds that are sold or distributed in the State of California are subject to Proposition 65's warning requirement. Mateel alleges that the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, sold and/or marketed by Midea America and its downstream customers for use in California require Proposition 65 warnings.
- 1.5. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, and without waiving any arguments to the contrary that it might assert in any other matter, Midea America agrees not to contest the Court's jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the 60-Day Notice Letter and the First Amended Complaint and over Midea America and to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement and resolution of the allegations made against Midea America contained in the 60-Day Notice Letters and First Amended Complaint and of all claims that were or could have been raised against Midea America based on the facts alleged therein or arising there from, and that venue is proper in the City and County of San Francisco. Mateel stipulates to the Court's jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the 60-Day Notice Letters and the First Amended Complaint and over it and to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement and resolution of the allegations made against Midea America contained in the 60-Day Notice Letter and First Amended Complaint and of all claims that were or could have been raised against Midea America based on

the facts alleged therein or arising there from, and that venue is proper in the City and County of San Francisco.

- 1.6. This Consent Judgment resolves all claims in the 60-Day Notice Letters, which are all denied and disputed by Midea America. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of any and all claims between the Parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. This Consent Judgment shall not constitute an admission with respect to any allegation made in the 60-Day Notice Letters or the First Amended Complaint, nor may this Consent Judgment or compliance with it be used as an admission or evidence of any fact, wrongdoing, misconduct, culpability, violation of law or liability on the part of Midea America or any person or entity released herein.
- 1.7. Upon Mateel's receipt of this Consent Judgment executed by Midea America, Mateel will promptly dismiss the pending action identified in Paragraph 1.2 against CNA International without prejudice. Mateel will not file an action against Vinotemp International, Maytag Corporation or Whirlpool Corporation arising out of the allegations made in the 60-Day Notice Letters issued on September 22, 2011.

2. <u>SETTLEMENT PAYMENT</u>

2.1. In settlement of all of the claims that are alleged, or could have been alleged, in the 60-Day Notice Letters and First Amended Complaint concerning Covered Products, Midea America shall pay a total amount of \$60,000 to be allocated as follows: \$5,000 in civil penalties; \$40,000 to the Klamath Environmental Law Center ("KELC") to cover a portion of Plaintiff's attorneys' fees and litigation costs; \$7,500 to the Ecological Rights Foundation, and \$7,500 to Californians for Alternatives to Toxics for use toward reducing exposures to toxic chemicals and other pollutants, and toward increasing consumer, worker and community awareness of health hazards posed by lead and other toxic chemicals. Mateel waives its entitlement to 25% of the civil penalties, and thus the entire amount of civil penalties shall be made payable, pursuant to the statute, to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA). The above described payments shall be forwarded by Midea America to its counsel so that they are received at least five days prior to the hearing date scheduled for approval of this Consent Judgment.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Midea America's counsel shall notify via email Klamath Environmental Law Center upon receipt of the funds. If the Consent Judgment is not approved within 120 days of the date scheduled for approval, the above described payments shall be returned to Midea America and the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall become null and void. If the Consent Judgment is approved and entered by the Court, within five days of that date, Midea America's counsel shall ensure the above described payments are delivered, via UPS or FedEx for next business day delivery, to Klamath Environmental Law Center.

3. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

3.1. The Parties hereby request that the Court promptly enter this Consent Judgment. Upon entry of this Consent Judgment, the Parties waive their respective rights to a hearing or trial on the allegations of the Complaint.

4. MATTERS COVERED BY THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT

4.1. Mateel's Release On Behalf of the Public Interest. As to alleged exposures to lead or lead compounds from Covered Products, this Consent Judgment provides a full release of liability on behalf of the Public Interest for all claims that were or could have been brought up through the Effective Date (which shall be the date this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court) and as to Covered Products in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date to Midea America, as well as any and all entities related to or otherwise involved with Midea America including, but not limited to, its past, present and future parents, holding companies, controlling entities, joint ventures or other investment vehicles, related or affiliated companies, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, and assigns to any of them, and its officers, directors, employees, and all customers including, but not limited to, CNA International, Vinotemp International, Maytag Corporation and Whirlpool Corporation, as well as their past, present, and future parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, predecessors, successors, assigns to any of them, and their officers, directors, employees, and to their retail customers including, but not limited to Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. and its affiliates and subsidiaries or any other person in the course of business involving the Covered Products and the successors and assigns of any of them, as to all claims and matters raised in the 60-Day Notice Letters. The intent of this provision is to release any and all persons

27

28

and or entities in the course of business involving the Covered Products and the successors and assigns of any of them as to all claims and matters raised in the 60-Day Notice Letters. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Judgment, no claim or matter is released on behalf of the Public Interest unless that claim or matter was raised in the 60-Day Notice Letters.

4.2. Mateel's Release on Behalf of Itself. As to exposures to lead and lead compounds alleged to be caused by the Covered Products as set forth in the 60-Day Notice Letters, Mateel, acting in its individual capacity only and not in its representative capacity, waives all rights to institute any form of legal action and releases all claims which were or could have been brought up through the Effective Date and as to Covered Products in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date against Midea America as well as any and all entities related to or otherwise involved with Midea America including, but not limited to, its past, present and future parents, holding companies, controlling entities, joint ventures or other investment vehicles, related or affiliated companies, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, and assigns to any of them, and its officers, directors, employees, and all customers including, but not limited to, CNA International, Vinotemp International Corporation, Maytag Corporation and Whirlpool Corporation, as well as their past, present, and future parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, predecessors, successors, assigns to any of them, and their officers, directors, employees, and to their retail customers including, but not limited to Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. and its affiliates and subsidiaries or any other person in the course of doing business involving the Covered Products and the successors and assigns of any of them. The intent of this provision is to release any and all persons and or entities in the course of business involving the Covered Products and the successors and assigns of any of them as to all claims and matters raised in the 60-Day Notice Letters. In furtherance of the foregoing, Mateel, acting on behalf of itself, hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have, conferred upon it with respect to lead exposures alleged to be caused by the Covered Products by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

> "A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE

19 20

22

21

23 24

25

26

27 28

Mateel understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even if Mateel has future claims arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, it will not be able to pursue that claim against as Midea America as well as any and all entities related to or otherwise involved with Midea America including, but not limited to, its past, present and future parents, holding companies, controlling entities, related or affiliated companies, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, and assigns to any of them, and its officers, directors, employees, and all customers including, but not limited to, CNA International, Vinotemp International Corporation, Maytag Corporation and Whirlpool Corporation, as well as their past, present, and future parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, predecessors, successors, assigns to any of them, and their officers, directors, employees, and to their retail customers including, but not limited to Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. and its affiliates and subsidiaries, or any other person in the course of business involving the Covered Products. Furthermore, Mateel acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such claims which may exist as of the date of this release but which Mateel does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether its lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

4.3. Entities Not Released From Liability. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Judgment, including the releases provided for in sections 4.1 and 4.2 above, no claim or matter is released by Mateel, or on behalf of the Public Interest, against the corporate entities listed on Exhibit A, including, but not limited to, their past, present and future parents, holding companies, controlling entities, related or affiliated companies, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, and assigns to any of them, and their officers, directors, employees, suppliers and customers.

Case No. CGC-11-512718

5. ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT

5.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the Parties hereto.

6. <u>MODIFICATION OF JUDGMENT</u>

- **6.1.** This Consent Judgment may be modified only upon written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court, or upon motion of any Party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.
- 6.2. If the Attorney General of the State of California or Mateel permit any reformulation standard and/ or test protocol for lead in products similar to the Covered Products by way of settlement or compromise with any person in the course of doing business, or any other entity, or if a reformulation standard and/or test protocol for lead in Covered Products is incorporated by Mateel in any final judgment as to any other person in the course of doing business, or any other entity, Midea America shall be entitled to apply the reformulation standard and/or test protocol to Covered Products.
- **6.3.** Midea America shall be entitled to a modification to this Consent Judgment to establish a reformulation standard and/or test protocol for lead content in Covered Products consistent with any "safe use determination" regarding lead content in Covered Products issued by the OEHHA, pursuant to 27 Cal. Code Regs. Section 25204 or any successor regulation.

7. **INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

Midea America may comply with the provisions of either **7.1** or **7.2**, either of which shall be deemed to be in compliance with Proposition 65:

7.1. Discontinuance of Sale

7.1.1. Midea America agrees that it will discontinue and no longer offer for sale into California any Covered Products that use leaded brass spigots, including those items specifically identified in the 60-Day Notice Letters, except those that have already been manufactured and are already within the stream of commerce prior to the date of entry of this Consent Judgment. Covered Products already in the stream of commerce prior to the date of entry of this Consent Judgment may be sold into California by third parties not under the control

of Midea America. Midea America represents that it is not aware of any other beverage dispenser that it continues to sell to California consumers, except those that have already been manufactured and are already within the stream of commerce prior to the date of entry of this Consent Judgment, that also use a leaded brass spigot for dispensing drinking liquids.

7.1.2. After the date of entry of this Consent Judgment, Midea America shall not sell any Covered Products that utilize any material that contains lead if in the normal intended use of the Covered Product that material contacts any food or beverage dispensed from the Covered Product.

7.2. Use of a Testing Protocol

7.2.1. Using the testing protocol identified in 7.2.2, or other protocol agreed upon by the Parties, any Covered Product for which the Lead Concentration Level (outcome of test protocol 7.2.2) is less than 1.5 micrograms per liter shall be deemed in compliance with Proposition 65 and may be shipped for sale in California with no warnings.

7.2.2. Testing Protocol

- (a) For each product line or manufacturing specifications of a Covered Product, 3 units of the Covered Product shall be selected to be tested. The Covered Products which will be tested shall be randomly selected using any generally accepted random sampling method such as International Standards Organization 2589-1 (1989).
- **(b)** The Exposure Solution referred to below shall be a laboratory standard 4 percent acetic acid solution.
- shall be analyzed for lead, using the method of analysis (with detection limit of 0.05 micrograms of lead per liter of solution) used in the test of the Covered Product under paragraph 7.2.g. The analysis shall be conducted using a sample of the size set forth in paragraph 7.2.e and by dispensing the Exposure Solution into a container of the type set forth in such paragraph. The result shall be the Sample Blank Level.
- (d) The Covered Product to be tested will be washed in potable water containing dishwashing detergent, rinsed and dried and will be sanitized before use with a

commercial sanitizing solution per the manufacturer's instructions. If the Covered Product is an unattached faucet, the Covered Product will be attached to a test vessel designed to accept a Covered Product in a manner similar to a retail version of a vessel that incorporates the Covered product and which has also been washed and sanitized. The test vessel shall have a lid that will reduce evaporation of the Exposure Solution during subsequent steps, shall be of a size to contain a minimum of 3 liters of Exposure Solution, and manufactured from a material (such as 300 series stainless steel) that will not leach lead into the Exposure Solution during the testing.

Notwithstanding the foregoing, any lead that does leach from the test vessel shall be added to any lead in the Sample Blank Level and considered to be a part thereof. If the Covered Product includes a vessel, which contains an external spigot, the vessel it shall be filled to a minimum of 3 liters or its full capacity, whichever is less.

- faucet, the test vessel with the Covered Product faucet attached shall be filled with the 3 liters of Exposure Solution. Approximately 250 milliliters of the Exposure Solution shall be dispensed by opening the valve of the faucet and then closing the valve, and discarded. The Exposure Solution shall be held in the test vessel or Covered Product for a period of 4 hours, during which time no Exposure Solution is to be dispensed and no ingredients or contaminants or other Exposure Solution are to be added. After the 4 hours, 355 milliliters (12 ounces) are to be dispensed (drawn) through the faucet by opening the valve. The sample is to be dispensed into a clean PTFE, polyethylene or HDPE container with an air-tight lid containing an appropriate preservative, if any.
- (f) An additional sample of 355 milliliters (12 ounces) is to be dispensed after 1/2 hour and a third is to be dispensed after an additional 1/2 hour.
- (g) Each Exposure Solution sample shall be analyzed for lead using a method of analysis which has a detection limit of 0.05 micrograms per liter (0.05 ug/L) or less The concentration level for the unit of the Covered Product shall be the level of lead that results from the analysis of the sample, minus the Sample Blank Level.

Case No. CGC-11-512718

10.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction to implement the Consent Judgment.

28

I	11. <u>ENTIRE AGREEMENT</u>		
2	11.1. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding	ng	
3	of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,		
4	negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or		
5	otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party		
6	hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be		
7	deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties.		
8	12. GOVERNING LAW		
9	12.1. The validity, construction and performance of this Consent Judgment shall be		
10	governed by the laws of the State of California, without reference to any conflicts of law		
11	provisions of California law.		
12	13. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(f)		
13	13.1. Mateel agrees to comply with Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)'s reporting fo	rm	
14	and approval requirements and as implemented by various regulations.		
15	14. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPART		
16	14.1. This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and/or by facsimile,		
17	which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one original document.		
18	15. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>		
19	15.1. If this Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, it shall be of no force or		
20	effect, and cannot be used in any proceeding for any purpose.		
21	IT IS SO STIPULATED.		
22	Dated: March, 2012 MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION		
23			
24	By:		
25	William Verick CEO of Mateel Environmental Justice	•	
26	Foundation, Klamath Environmental Law Center		
27			
28			

Case No. CGC-11-512718

- 11 -

Dat	ed: March \$, 2012	MIDEA AMERICA CORPORATION
		. /2.
		By: Qu Yiping General Manager of Midea America Corporation
		General Manager of Midea America Corporation
	IT IS SO ODDEDED ADJUNCED	AND DECREED
	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED	AND DECKEED.
Dat	ted:	
		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
-		
		Case No. CGC-11-5

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DETENDANT MIDEA AMERICA CORPORATION

EXHIBIT A

ENTITIES NOT RELEASED

- 1. Wasserstrom
- 2. The Middleby Corporation
- 3. Haier America Trading LLC
- 4. Danby Products, Ltd.
- 5. Leland Limited, Inc.
- 6. Perlick Corporation
- 7. Wilbur Curtis Company
- 8. Bunn-O-Matic Corp.
- 9. Felix Storch, Inc.
- 10. Grandmaster Cecilware Corp.
- 11. Whole Foods Market, Inc.
- 12. Target Corporation
- 13. Wells Bloomfield, LLC
- 14. Polar Wear Company