

Mark N. Todzo, State Bar No. 168389  
Howard Hirsch, State Bar No. 213209  
Victoria Hartanto, State Bar No. 259833  
LEXINGTON LAW GROUP  
503 Divisadero Street  
San Francisco, CA 94117  
Telephone: (415) 913-7800  
Facsimile: (415) 759-4112  
mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com  
vhartanto@lexlawgroup.com

Counsel for Plaintiff  
CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

Coordination Proceeding Special Title:	)	Judicial Council Coordination Proceeding
PROPOSITION 65 COCAMIDE DEA CASES	)	Case No. 4765
_____	)	<b>[PROPOSED] CONSENT</b>
This Document Relates To:	)	<b>JUDGMENT AS TO BIOPELLE,</b>
	)	<b>INC.</b>
<i>CEH v. Biopelle, Inc.</i> , A.C.S.C. Case No. RG14-	)	
726964	)	
_____	)	

**1. INTRODUCTION**

1.1 The parties to this Consent Judgment (“Parties”) are the Center for Environmental Health (“CEH”) and defendant Biopelle, Inc. (“Settling Defendant”). CEH and Settling Defendant are referred to collectively as the “Parties.”

1.2 Settling Defendant is a corporation that employs ten (10) or more persons and that manufactures, distributes and/or sells shampoo, liquid soaps and cleansers that contain coconut oil diethanolamine condensate (cocamide diethanolamine) (hereinafter, “cocamide DEA”) in the State of California or has done so in the past.

1           1.3           On February 7, 2014, CEH served a 60-Day Notice of Violation under  
2 Proposition 65 (The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health  
3 & Safety Code §§ 25249.5, *et seq.*) (the “Notice”) to Settling Defendant, the California Attorney  
4 General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys  
5 for every City in the State of California with a population greater than 750,000. The Notice  
6 alleges violations of Proposition 65 with respect to the presence of cocamide DEA in shampoo,  
7 liquid soaps and cleansers manufactured, distributed and/or sold by Settling Defendant.

8           1.4           On June 4, 2014, CEH filed the action entitled *CEH v Biopelle, Inc.*, Case No.  
9 RG14-726964 naming Settling Defendant as a defendant in that action. On July 7, 2014, the  
10 *Biopelle* action was coordinated with several other related Proposition 65 actions in the  
11 *Proposition 65 Cocamide DEA Cases*, Case No. JCCP 4765, currently pending before this Court.

12           1.5           For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that: (i) this  
13 Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the operative Complaint  
14 applicable to Settling Defendant (the “Complaint”) and personal jurisdiction over Settling  
15 Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; (ii) that venue is proper in the County of  
16 Alameda; and (iii) that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment.

17           1.6           Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by  
18 the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance  
19 with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact,  
20 conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, and all such allegations are specifically  
21 denied. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy,  
22 argument or defense the Parties may have in any other legal proceeding. This Consent Judgment  
23 is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties for purposes of  
24 settling, compromising and resolving issues disputed in this action.

## 25       **2.       DEFINITIONS**

26           2.1           “Covered Products” means shampoo, liquid soaps and cleansers manufactured,  
27 distributed and/or sold by Settling Defendant.

2.2 “Effective Date” means the date on which this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court.

### 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall not manufacture, distribute, sell or offer for sale any Covered Product that contains cocamide DEA and that will be sold or offered for sale to California consumers. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a product “contains cocamide DEA” if cocamide DEA is an intentionally added ingredient in the product and/or part of the product formulation. Lot numbers (which correspond to a specific manufacture date) for Covered Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date are shown on Exhibit A. Settling Defendant represents that the lot numbers on Exhibit A apply to Covered Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date.

3.2 **Specification to Suppliers.** Settling Defendant has advised its suppliers that Covered Products for sale into California shall not contain intentionally added cocamide DEA.

#### 3.3 **Action Regarding Specific Products.**

3.3.1 On or before the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall cease selling the Biopelle Cream Cleanser, SKU No. 8-51263-00139-2 (the “Section 3.3 Product”) in California. On or before the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall also: (i) cease shipping the Section 3.3 Product to any of its stores and/or customers that it knows resells the Section 3.3 Product in California, and (ii) send instructions to its stores and/or customers that it knows resells the Section 3.3 Product in California instructing them either to: (a) return all the Section 3.3 Product to Settling Defendant for destruction; (b) directly destroy the Section 3.3 Product or (c) not sell the Section 3.3 Product into California.

3.3.2 Any destruction by Settling Defendant of Section 3.3 Product shall be in compliance with all applicable laws.

3.3.3 Within sixty days of the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall provide CEH with written certification from Settling Defendant confirming compliance with the requirements of Section 3.3.1.

1     **4.     ENFORCEMENT**

2             4.1             CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the  
3     Superior Court of Alameda County, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent  
4     Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3  
5     above, CEH shall provide Settling Defendant with a notice and a copy of any test results which  
6     purportedly support CEH's notice. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for  
7     CEH's anticipated motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including  
8     providing Settling Defendant a reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any  
9     alleged violation. Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, CEH may file its enforcement  
10    motion or application. This Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties. Settling  
11    Defendant contends that despite the efforts undertaken by Settling Defendant, Settling  
12    Defendant's Covered Products may be sold in California by third parties who are not authorized  
13    agents of Settling Defendant and Settling Defendant cannot prevent that from occurring.

14    **5.     PAYMENTS**

15             5.1     **Payments by Settling Defendant.** Within five (5) business days of the Effective  
16    Date, Settling Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$15,000 as a settlement payment. The total  
17    settlement amount for Settling Defendant shall be paid in four separate checks delivered to  
18    counsel for CEH at the address set forth in Section 8.1 below. The funds paid by Settling  
19    Defendant shall be allocated between the following categories:

20                     5.1.1     \$1,650 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b),  
21    such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12  
22    (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard  
23    Assessment). The civil penalty check shall be made payable to the Center For Environmental  
24    Health.

25                     5.1.2     \$2,250 as a payment in lieu of civil penalty to CEH pursuant to Health &  
26    Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use  
27    such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic  
28    chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Consent

1 Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendant's products to confirm compliance. In  
2 addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four  
3 percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to  
4 educate and protect people from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such  
5 groups can be found at the CEH web site at [www.keh.org/justicefund](http://www.keh.org/justicefund). The payment pursuant to  
6 this Section shall be made payable to the Center For Environmental Health.

7 5.1.3 \$11,100 as reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable attorneys' fees  
8 and costs. A check for \$9,600 shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group, and a check  
9 for \$1,500 shall be made payable to the Center For Environmental Health.

## 10 **6. MODIFICATION**

11 6.1 **Written Consent.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to  
12 time only by: (1) express written agreement of the Parties; or (2) by an order of this Court upon  
13 motion and in accordance with law.

14 6.2 **Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall  
15 attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to  
16 modify the Consent Judgment.

## 17 **7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

18 7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH on  
19 behalf of itself and the public interest and Settling Defendant, and its parents, subsidiaries,  
20 affiliated entities that are under common ownership and their predecessors, successors and  
21 assigns, directors, shareholders, officers, employees, and attorneys ("Defendant Releasees"), and  
22 all entities to whom they directly or indirectly provide, distribute or sell Covered Products,  
23 including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees,  
24 cooperative members, licensors and licensees (individually or collectively "Downstream  
25 Releasees") of any violation or claimed violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been  
26 asserted in the Complaint against Settling Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream  
27 Releasees, based on failure to warn about alleged exposure to cocamide DEA contained in  
28 Covered Products that were manufactured, sold, or distributed prior to the Effective Date.

1 Subject to the provisions of Section 3.3.1, this release specifically includes all Covered Products  
2 containing cocamide DEA manufactured before the Effective Date, as shown by applicable lot  
3 numbers on Exhibit A, regardless of when the item was sold, purchased or used.

4 7.2 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Settling Defendant  
5 and the Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Settling  
6 Defendant, its Defendant Releasees and their Downstream Releasees with respect to any alleged  
7 failure to warn about cocamide DEA in Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold after  
8 the Effective Date.

9 7.3 This is a full and final release applying to all unknown and/or unanticipated  
10 claims, penalties, damages and injunctive terms relating to or arising out of the claims alleged in  
11 the Notice and Complaint, as well as those now known, whether or not disclosed, and CEH, on its  
12 own behalf only, and with regard to the claims alleged in the Notice and Complaint, hereby  
13 relinquishes and waives all rights or benefits conferred upon it by the provisions of Section 1542  
14 of the California Civil Code, which states as follows:

15 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS  
16 WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO  
17 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF  
18 EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR  
19 HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER  
20 SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

21 7.4 Nothing in this Section 7 affects CEH's right to commence or prosecute an  
22 action under Proposition 65 against any person other than Settling Defendant, Defendant  
23 Releasees, or Downstream Releasees.

## 24 **8. NOTICE**

25 8.1 When CEH is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the  
26 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Mark Todzo  
Lexington Law Group  
503 Divisadero Street  
San Francisco, CA 94117  
mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com

8.2 When Settling Defendant is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

Malcolm Weiss  
Hunton & Williams LLP  
550 South Hope Street  
Suite 2000  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
[mweiss@hunton.com](mailto:mweiss@hunton.com)

and

Biopelle Inc.  
c/o Elliott Milstein  
780 West 8 Mile Road  
Ferndale, Michigan 48220  
[EMilstein@biopelle.com](mailto:EMilstein@biopelle.com)

and

David W. Warren  
Joelson Rosenberg PLC  
30665 Northwestern Highway, Ste. 200  
Farmington Hills MI 48334  
[dwwarren@joelsonrosenberg.com](mailto:dwwarren@joelsonrosenberg.com)

8.3 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

**9. COURT APPROVAL**

9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective upon entry by the Court. CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Settling Defendant shall support entry of this Consent Judgment.

9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court within one year of the date it is fully executed by the Parties, it shall be of no force or effect and shall never be

introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose other than to allow the Court to determine if there was a material breach of Section 9.1.

## **10. ATTORNEYS' FEES**

10.1 The prevailing Party on any motion, application for an order to show cause or other proceeding to enforce a violation of this Consent Judgment, shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application.

10.2 Except as otherwise provided in this Consent Judgment, each Party shall bear its own attorneys' fees and costs.

## **11. OTHER TERMS**

11.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

11.2 This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon CEH and Settling Defendant, and its respective divisions, subdivisions, and subsidiaries, and the successors or assigns of any of them.

11.3 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

11.4 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall release, or in any way affect any rights that Settling Defendant might have against any other party, whether or not that party is a Settling



1 Defendant.

2 11.5 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
3 Consent Judgment.

4 11.6 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts  
5 and by means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be  
6 deemed to constitute one document.

7 11.7 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully  
8 authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into  
9 and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that  
10 Party.

11 11.8 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of  
12 this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties.  
13 This Consent Judgment was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been  
14 accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel. Accordingly, any  
15 uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any  
16 Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this  
17 Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to  
18 be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent  
19 Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.

20  
21 **IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

22 **CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH**

23  
24 

25 Charlie Pizarro  
26 Associate Director  
27  
28

1 BIOPELLE, INC.

2 

3 \_\_\_\_\_  
4 Signature

5 MARK DIEKMANN

6 \_\_\_\_\_  
7 Printed Name

8 SECRETARY AND TREASURER

9 \_\_\_\_\_  
10 Title

11  
12 IT IS SO ORDERED:

13  
14 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_, 2014

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of the Superior Court

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

EXHIBIT A

AFA Cream Cleanser

Lot674  
Lot674A  
Lot871  
Lot1021  
Lot1082  
Lot1123  
Lot1209  
Lot1250  
Lot9042  
Lot9052  
Lot13011  
Lot13034  
Lot13052  
Lot016108  
Lot020108  
8001  
8005  
14012  
14002  
F60903C

Biopelle Cream Cleanser

Lot1295  
Lot1295A  
Lot8808  
Lot13029  
Lot13081