

1 Josh Voorhees, State Bar No. 241436  
Christopher Tuttle, State Bar No. 264545  
2 THE CHANLER GROUP  
2560 Ninth Street  
3 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
Berkeley, CA 94710-2565  
4 Telephone: (510) 848-8880  
Facsimile: (510) 848-8118

5 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
6 PAUL WOZNIAK

7  
8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
9 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA  
10 UNLIMITED CIVIL JURISDICTION  
11

12 PAUL WOZNIAK,

13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 FLP, LLC, *et al.*,

16 Defendants.  
17

Case No. RG14750997

**[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.*)

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 Parties**

3 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Paul Wozniak (“Wozniak”) and FLP,  
4 LLC (“FLP”), with Wozniak and FLP each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as  
5 the “Parties.”

6 **1.2 Plaintiff**

7 Wozniak is an individual residing in California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures  
8 to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances  
9 contained in consumer products.

10 **1.3 Defendant**

11 FLP employs ten or more individuals and is a “person in the course of doing business” for  
12 purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code  
13 section 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

14 **1.4 General Allegations**

15 Wozniak alleges that FLP manufactures, imports, sells, or distributes for sale in California,  
16 nylon cooking utensils that contain 4,4’-Methylenedianiline (“4,4’-MDA”) without first providing the  
17 exposure warning required by Proposition 65. 4,4’-MDA is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a  
18 chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. Wozniak also alleges that FLP  
19 manufactures, imports, sells, or distributes for sale in California, kitchen tools with vinyl/PVC grips  
20 that contain di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (“DEHP”) without first providing the exposure warning  
21 required by Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the  
22 State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

23 **1.5 Product Description**

24 The products covered by this Consent Judgment are: (a) nylon cooking utensils containing  
25 4,4’-MDA that are manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed for sale in California by FLP  
26 including, but not limited to, *Cook’s Kitchen Basting Spoon, (UPC No. 7 40985 88248 1)*; and  
27 (b) kitchen tools with vinyl/PVC grips containing DEHP that are manufactured, imported, sold, or  
28 distributed for sale in California by FLP including, but not limited to, *Cook’s Kitchen Bottle Opener,*

1 #092612 (UPC No. 7 40985 88204 7). The nylon cooking utensils and kitchen tools with vinyl/PVC  
2 grips described herein are collectively referred to as “Products”.

3 **1.6 Notice of Violation**

4 On or about September 30, 2014, Wozniak served FLP and certain requisite public  
5 enforcement agencies with a “60-Day Notice of Violation” (“Notice”) alleging that FLP violated  
6 Proposition 65 by failing to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Products expose  
7 users to 4,4’-MDA and DEHP. To the best of the Parties’ knowledge, no public enforcer has  
8 commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

9 **1.7 Complaint**

10 On December 10, 2014, Wozniak filed the instant action (“Complaint”) naming FLP as a  
11 defendant for the alleged violations of Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 that are the subject of  
12 the Notice

13 **1.8 No Admission**

14 FLP denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint,  
15 and it maintains that all of the products that it has sold and distributed for sale in California, including  
16 the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment  
17 shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation  
18 of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission  
19 of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not,  
20 however, diminish or otherwise affect FLP’s obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this  
21 Consent Judgment.

22 **1.9 Jurisdiction**

23 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
24 jurisdiction over FLP as to the allegations contained in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the  
25 County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this  
26 Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1           **1.10 Effective Date**

2           For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Effective Date” means the date on which  
3 the Consent Judgment is entered by the Court.

4           **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION**

5           **2.1 Reformulated Products**

6           As of the Effective Date, FLP shall only purchase or manufacture “Reformulated Products”  
7 for sale in California.

8                   **2.1.1 4,4’-MDA**

9           With respect to 4,4’-MDA, Reformulated Products are products that:

- 10                   *i.*    contain less than or equal to 200 parts per million (“ppm”) 4,4’-MDA by  
11                               weight using validated preparation and analytical methods used to detect the  
12                               presence of 4,4’-MDA in a solid substance;
- 13                   *ii.*   and produce a leach result of 10 ug/L or less 4,4’-MDA by digesting the food  
14                               contact end of the product into 100 ml of 3% acetic acid de-ionized water for 2  
15                               hours at 100°C, replenishing the acetic acid solution as needed to maintain 100  
16                               ml, and analyzing the leachate using a validated method to detect the presence  
17                               of 4,4’-MDA in a liquid.

18           The testing shall be conducted in an accredited laboratory with qualified personnel.

19           All analytical reports must contain quality control data that verify the laboratory’s performance for  
20 the results in each analytical report.

21                   **2.1.2 DEHP**

22           With respect to DEHP, Reformulated Products are products that contain a maximum  
23 of 1,000 parts per million DEHP by weight in any accessible component (i.e., any part or feature of a  
24 Product that may be touched during use) when analyzed pursuant to Environmental Protection  
25 Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C, CPSC-WH-C1001-09.3, or equivalent  
26 methodologies utilized by state and federal agencies to determine DEHP content in a solid substance.

1           **2.2    Non-Reformulated Products**

2           As of September 1, 2015, FLP represented that it does not sell or distribute for sale in  
3 California any non-reformulated Products. Further, FLP does not intend to sell or distribute for sale  
4 in California any non-reformulated Products in the future. FLP is using and will continue to use its  
5 best efforts to ensure that non-reformulated Products remaining in its inventory are not sold or  
6 distributed for sale in California.

7           **3.       MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS**

8           **3.1    Civil Penalty Payments**

9           Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), in settlement of all the claims referred to in  
10 this Consent Judgment, FLP shall pay \$8,000 in civil penalties. Each civil penalty payment shall be  
11 allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d) with seventy-five  
12 percent (75%) of the funds paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
13 (“OEHHA”) and twenty-five percent (25%) of the funds remitted to Wozniak. Within two business  
14 days after the Effective Date, FLP shall provide its payment in two checks for the following amounts  
15 made payable to: (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$6,000; and (b) “Paul Wozniak, Client Trust  
16 Account” in the amount of \$2,000.

17           **3.2    Reimbursement of Attorney’s Fees and Costs**

18           The parties acknowledge that Wozniak and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without  
19 reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving the issue to  
20 be resolved after the material terms of this Consent Judgment had been settled. Shortly after the  
21 other settlement terms had been finalized, FLP expressed a desire to resolve Wozniak’s fees and  
22 costs. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Wozniak  
23 and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at  
24 California Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 for all work performed through the mutual  
25 execution of this Consent Judgment. Within two business days the Effective Date, FLP shall pay  
26 \$30,700 for the fees and costs incurred by Wozniak investigating, bringing this matter to FLP’s  
27 attention, litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

1           **3.3     Payments Held in Trust**

2           All payments due under this Consent Judgment shall be held in trust until such time as the  
3 Court approves the Parties' settlement. All payments due under this agreement shall be delivered to  
4 FLP's counsel within five (5) business days of the date that this Consent Judgment is fully executed  
5 by the Parties, and held in trust by FLP's counsel until the Court grants the motion for approval of  
6 this Consent Judgment contemplated by Section 5. Within two business days of the Court's  
7 approval of this Consent Judgment, FLP's counsel shall tender the initial civil penalty payments and  
8 attorneys' fee and costs reimbursements required by Sections 3.1 and 3.2.

9           **3.4     Payment Address**

10          All payments required by this Consent Judgment shall be delivered to the following  
11 address:

12                           The Chanler Group  
13                           Attn: Proposition 65 Controller  
14                           2560 Ninth Street  
15                           Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
16                           Berkeley, CA 94710

15   **4.     CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

16           **4.1     Wozniak's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims**

17          Wozniak, acting on his own behalf and in the public interest, releases FLP and its parents,  
18 subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, and  
19 attorneys ("Releasees") and each entity to whom it directly or indirectly distributes or sells the  
20 Products including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers  
21 (including defendant Rite Aid Corporation), franchisees, cooperative members, licensors and  
22 licensees ("Downstream Releasees") for any violations arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned  
23 exposures to 4,4'-MDA and DEHP from the Products, as set forth in the Notice and Complaint.  
24 The releases provided by this Section include and apply to all Products manufactured, purchased, or  
25 acquired by FLP before the Effective Date, including those Products that may be supplied to third-  
26 parties by FLP after the Effective Date that are not intended to be sold in California pursuant to  
27 Section 2.2. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with  
28 Proposition 65 with respect to failures to warn about 4,4'-MDA and DEHP from the Products sold

1 by FLP after the Effective Date.

2 **4.2 Wozniak's Individual Release of Claims**

3 Wozniak, in his individual capacity only and *not* in his representative capacity, also provides  
4 a release to FLP, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees which shall be effective as a full and final  
5 accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses,  
6 attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of Wozniak of any nature, character  
7 or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual  
8 exposures to 4,4'-MDA and DEHP in the Products. The releases provided by this Section include  
9 and apply to all Products manufactured, purchased, or acquired by FLP before the Effective Date,  
10 including those Products that may be supplied to third-parties by FLP after the Effective Date that are  
11 not intended to be sold in California pursuant to Section 2.2.

12 **4.3 FLP's Release of Wozniak**

13 FLP, on its own behalf, and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives,  
14 attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Wozniak and his  
15 attorneys and other representatives (or those that could have been taken or made), for any and all  
16 actions taken or statements made by Wozniak and his attorneys and other representatives, whether  
17 in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this  
18 matter, or with respect to the Products.

19 **5. COURT APPROVAL**

20 This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall  
21 be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it  
22 has been fully executed by the Parties.

23 **6. ENFORCEMENT**

24 Wozniak may, by motion or application for an order to show cause brought in the Alameda  
25 County Superior Court, enforce the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing  
26 any such motion or application, however, Wozniak agrees to provide FLP with notice and any  
27 relevant information supporting the alleged breach or violation including, without limitation, test  
28 results indicating excess amounts of 4,4'-MDA or DEHP in the accused Products, purchase

1 information, and Product identification (i.e., Product brand name, model number, UPC, and/or SKU).  
2 The Parties shall then meet and confer for a period of not less than thirty days regarding  
3 Wozniak's allegation(s) and potential informal resolutions of the same. Should such attempts  
4 at resolution fail, Wozniak may enforce this Consent Judgment by motion, application or any  
5 other legal means available. This Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties.

6 **7. SEVERABILITY**

7 If, subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment as a judgment, any  
8 provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be  
9 adversely affected.

10 **8. GOVERNING LAW**

11 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California  
12 and apply within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is  
13 otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then FLP may  
14 provide written notice to Wozniak of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further  
15 obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are  
16 so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve FLP from any  
17 obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal toxics control laws.

18 **9. NOTICE**

19 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment  
20 shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail,  
21 return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

22 For FLP:

23 Paul Croisdale, President  
24 FLP, LLC  
25 2405 South Roosevelt Street  
26 Tempe, AZ 85282

27 with a copy to:

28 Peg Carew Toledo, Esq.  
Toledo Don LLP  
3001 Douglas Boulevard, Suite 340  
Roseville, CA 95661



1 For Wozniak:

2 The Chanler Group  
3 Attn: Proposition 65 Coordinator  
4 2560 Ninth Street  
5 Parker Plaza, Suite 214  
6 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

7 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all  
8 notices and other communications shall be sent.

9 **10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

10 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable  
11 document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when  
12 taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

13 **11. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES**

14 Wozniak agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and  
15 Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety  
16 Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement. In  
17 furtherance of obtaining such approval, Wozniak and FLP agree to mutually employ their best  
18 efforts, and those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain  
19 judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts"  
20 shall include, at a minimum, cooperating on the drafting and filing of the necessary moving papers,  
21 supporting the motion, and appearing at the hearing before the Court.

22 **12. MODIFICATION**

23 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and  
24 entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any  
25 Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment by the Court.  
26  
27  
28

1 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

2 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and have read, understood,  
3 and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

4 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

5  
6 Date: September 21, 2015

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

7  
8 By:  \_\_\_\_\_  
9 PAUL WOZNIAK

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Paul Croisdale, President  
FLP, LLC

10 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

11  
12 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

13 \_\_\_\_\_  
14 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

2 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and have read, understood,  
3 and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.


4 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

5  
6 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 9/23/2015

7  
8 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
PAUL WOZNIAK

By:  \_\_\_\_\_  
Paul Croisdale, President  
FLP, LLC

9  
10 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

11  
12 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28