1 2 3 4 5 6	LEXINGTON LAW GROUP Mark N. Todzo, State Bar No. 168389 Abigail Blodgett, State Bar No. 278813 503 Divisadero Street San Francisco, CA 94117 Telephone: (415) 913-7800 Facsimile: (415) 759-4112 mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com ablodgett@lexlawgroup.com Attorneys for Plaintiff
7	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
8	
9	SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA
11	
12	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, ) Case No. RG 15-770932
13	Plaintiff, ) [PROPOSED] AMENDED CONSENT
14	) JUDGMENT AS TO AVAIL VAPOR, v. ) LLC
15	SPACE JAM JUICE LLC, et al.,
16 17	Defendants.
18	)
19	
20	1. INTRODUCTION
21	<b>1.1.</b> This Amended Consent Judgment is entered into by Plaintiff Center for
22	Environmental Health, a non-profit corporation ("CEH"), and Avail Vapor, LLC ("Settling
23	Defendant") to settle claims asserted by CEH against Settling Defendant as set forth in the
24	operative Complaint in the matter Center for Environmental Health v. Space Jam Juice LLC, et
25	al., Alameda County Superior Court Case No. RG-15770932 (the "Action"). CEH and Settling
26	Defendant are referred to collectively as the "Parties."
27	
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-1-

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO AVAIL VAPOR, LLC – CASE NO. RG 15-770932

- 1.2. On February 27, 2015, CEH served a 60-Day Notice of Violation (the "Notice") relating to the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65") on Settling Defendant, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in State of California with a population greater than 750,000. The Notice alleges violations of Proposition 65 with respect to the presence of nicotine in electronic cigarette devices designed for use with nicotine-containing liquid manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant.
  - **1.3.** On May 19, 2015, CEH filed the Action naming Settling Defendant.
- **1.4.** On July 27, 2015, the Parties entered into a Consent Judgment resolving CEH's claims relating to its February 27, 2015 Notice.
- 1.5. On September 2, 2015, CEH served four additional 60-Day Notices of Violation (the "Second Notices") alleging additional violations with regard to the Products. Specifically, the Second Notices allege that the Products produce formaldehyde and acetaldehyde when used in their intended fashion.
- **1.6.** Settling Defendant is a corporation that employs ten (10) or more persons and that manufactures, distributes, and/or sells Covered Products (as defined herein) in the State of California or has done so in the past.
- 1.7. For purposes of this Amended Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that:

  (i) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Notice, Second Notices, and Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; (ii) venue is proper in the County of Alameda; and (iii) this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged in the Notice and Complaint with respect to Covered Products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant.
- **1.8.** The Parties enter into this Amended Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint arising out of the

facts or conduct related to Settling Defendant alleged therein and in the Notice and Second Notices. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Amended Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Settling Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and Complaint and expressly denies any wrongdoing whatsoever. Except as specifically provided herein, nothing in this Amended Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense any of the Parties may have in this or any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Amended Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this Action.

1.9. Upon entry of this Amended Consent Judgment, the Complaint in the Action shall be deemed amended as to Settling Defendant to include the allegations set forth in the Second Notices.

### 2. **DEFINITIONS**

- **2.1.** "Covered Products" means "Covered Liquid Products" and "Covered Device Products."
- **2.2.** "Covered Liquid Products" means liquids that are designed for use with electronic cigarette devices, also known as tanks and vape pens, that are manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant in California.
- 2.3. "Covered Device Products" means electronic cigarette devices, also known as tanks and vape pens, which contain nicotine or are designed and intended for use with nicotine-containing liquid, that are manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant in California.
- **2.4.** "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court enters this Amended Consent Judgment.

ON RECYCLED PAPER

# 2

# 3 4

## 5

# 6

# 7 8

# 9

# 10 11

# 18

# 19 20

### 21

## 22

# 23

# 24

# 25

26

## 27

# DOCUMENT PREPARED

ON RECYCLED PAPER

#### **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

Clear and Reasonable Warnings for Covered Liquid Products. As of the Effective Date, no Covered Liquid Product may be manufactured for sale, distributed or sold in California unless such Covered Liquid Product has a clear and reasonable warning on the outer label of the product. The warning shall state the following:

> **WARNING**: Use of this product will expose you to formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer.

The warning shall not be preceded by, surrounded by, or include any additional words or phrases that contradict, obfuscate, or otherwise undermine the warning. The warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the Covered Liquid Product with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer label of a Covered Liquid Product, the warning required herein shall be separated from the other warnings by a line that is at least the same height as a line of text on the label. For internet, catalog, or any other sale where the consumer is not physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the Covered Liquid Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Liquid Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

3.1.1. Warnings for Covered Liquid Products in the Stream of Commerce.

Proposition 65 for Covered Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.1, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall provide warning materials by certified mail to each of its California retailers or distributors to whom Settling

In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with

Defendant reasonably believes sold Covered Liquid Products prior to the Effective Date. Such

warning materials shall include a reasonably sufficient number of stickers in order to permit the

physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the Covered Device Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Device Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for Covered Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.2, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall provide warning materials by certified mail to each of its California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendant reasonably believes sold Covered Device Products prior to the Effective Date. Such warning materials shall include a reasonably sufficient number of stickers in order to permit the

retailer or distributor to affix the warning on each Covered Device Product such customer has

purchased from Settling Defendant. The warning stickers shall contain the warning language set

forth in Section 3.2 above. The warning materials shall also include a letter of instruction for the

placement of the stickers, and a Notice and Acknowledgment postcard.

3.2.1. Warnings for Covered Device Products in the Stream of Commerce.

3.3. Optional Additional Injunctive Provisions. In order for Settling Defendant to be eligible for a waiver of the additional penalty/payment in lieu of penalty payments set forth in Section 4.1.5 below, Settling Defendant shall undertake the additional actions below. If Settling Defendant opts to be bound by this Section, Settling Defendant must provide CEH with a written election stating which optional provision(s) it is agreeing to implement.

**3.3.1. Product Safety Requirements.** A Settling Defendant opting to participate in Section 3.3 shall make the following changes to the Covered Products to increase the safety of such products:

**3.3.1.1.** Within ninety (90) days following the Effective Date, all Covered Liquid Products manufactured for sale in California shall be manufactured with child proof caps in accordance with the standards set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 1700.15(b).

**3.3.1.2.** Within ninety (90) days following the Effective Date, all Covered Products manufactured for sale in California shall be manufactured such that use of the Covered Products will not produce detectable levels of formaldehyde and acetaldehyde.

**3.3.2. Prohibition on Sales and Advertising to Minors.** A Settling Defendant opting to participate in Section 3.3 shall not sell Covered Products to persons younger than eighteen (18) years of age and shall take reasonable steps to prevent the sale of Covered Products to such persons, including, but not limited to the following measures:

3.3.2.1. Settling Defendant shall implement one or more systems for checking the age of persons who purchase Covered Products on the Internet or in person. The system shall include age verification by requiring and checking an official government identification card or verifying through a reputable credit agency the age of anyone who purchases Covered Products on the Internet, or of anyone under twenty-six (26) years old who purchases in person. The system shall be put into place within ninety (90) days of the Effective Date.

3.3.2.2. Settling Defendant shall not use advertisements that target minors. Specifically, Settling Defendant will not use models or images of people that appear to be younger than twenty-eight (28) years of age, cartoons, art, fashion, or music that is intended and designed to appeal to people under the legal smoking age in advertisements or promotional materials that appear in California, including on the Internet. Additionally, Settling Defendant will not: (a) advertise in any media that has more than 25% under 18 readership; (b) utilize any form of outdoor advertising within 1,000 feet of any school or playground; (c) advertise using Instagram; and (d) sponsor any athletic, musical or other cultural events unless such events are designated as prohibiting patrons under the age of eighteen (18).

**3.3.3. Prohibition on Health and Safety Claims.** A Settling Defendant opting to participate in Section 3.3 shall not make health and or safety claims unless such claims have been reviewed and approved by the Federal Food and Drug Administration. Examples of prohibited claims include the following:

**3.3.3.1.** Settling Defendant shall not advertise Covered Products as smoking-cessation devices. This prohibition includes any claims or testimonials about quitting smoking, using e-cigarettes as a treatment for tobacco dependence or addiction.

**3.3.3.2.** Settling Defendant shall not make any claim that the Covered Products do not expose users carcinogens or are better or safer than tobacco.

**3.3.3.** Settling Defendant shall not make any claim that the Covered Products produce no second hand smoke.

#### 4. PAYMENTS

- **4.1.** Settling Defendant shall initially pay to CEH the total sum of \$22,500, which shall be allocated as follows:
- **4.1.1.** \$570 as a civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment).
- **4.1.2.** \$855 as a payment in lieu of civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Amended Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendant's Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund.

4.1.3	• \$21,075 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable attorneys'
fees and costs. This	amount shall be divided into two checks: (1) a check for \$18,575 shall be
made payable to Lex	xington Law Group; and (2) a check for \$2,500 shall be made payable to the
Center for Environn	nental Health.

- **4.1.4.** The payments required under Sections 4.1.1-4.1.3 shall be made in four (4) separate checks, all to be delivered within ten (10) days following the Effective Date. The payments required pursuant to Sections 4.1.1 and 4.1.2 shall each be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health. All checks shall be delivered to Mark Todzo at Lexington Law Group at the address set forth in Section 8.1.2.
- **4.1.5.** In the event that Settling Defendant elects not to certify its compliance with one or more of the optional provisions in Section 3.3 in accordance with that Section, within ninety (90) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant must make an additional payment for each provision not certified, as follows: (i) \$4,000 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.1; (ii) \$3,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.2; and (iii) \$3,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.3. Each of these payments shall be paid in two separate checks, each payable to the Center for Environmental Health, to be allocated as follows:
- **4.1.5.1.** Forty percent (40%) shall constitute a civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment).
- **4.1.5.2.** Sixty percent (60%) shall constitute a payment in lieu of civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Amended Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendant's Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community

Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund.

#### 5. ENFORCEMENT OF AMENDED CONSENT JUDGMENT

5.1. CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Superior Court of Alameda County, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Amended Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3 above, CEH shall provide Settling Defendant with a Notice of Violation and a copy of any test results which purportedly support CEH's Notice of Violation. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for CEH's anticipated motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including providing Settling Defendant a reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, CEH may file its enforcement motion or application. The prevailing party on any motion to enforce this Amended Consent Judgment shall be entitled to its reasonable attorney's fees and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application. This Amended Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties.

## 6. MODIFICATION OF AMENDED CONSENT JUDGMENT

**6.1.** This Amended Consent Judgment may only be modified by written agreement of CEH and Settling Defendant, or upon motion of CEH or Settling Defendant as provided by law.

### 7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

**7.1.** This Amended Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH acting in the public interest and Settling Defendant and Settling Defendant's parents, officers, directors, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, and their respective successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees") and all entities to whom they distribute or sell or have distributed or sold Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream Defendant

-11-

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO AVAIL VAPOR, LLC - CASE NO. RG 15-770932

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

1	<b>8.1.2.</b> Notices to Plaintiff. The persons for CEH to receive notices pursuant to
2	this Amended Consent Judgment shall be:
3 4 5 6	Mark Todzo Lexington Law Group 503 Divisadero Street San Francisco, CA 94117 mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com
7	<b>8.2.</b> Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by
8	sending the other Parties notice by first class and electronic mail.
9	9. COURT APPROVAL
10	<b>9.1.</b> This Amended Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date,
11	provided however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Amended
12	Consent Judgment and Settling Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.
13	<b>9.2.</b> If this Amended Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no
14	force or effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for
15	any purpose.
16	10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION
17	<b>10.1.</b> The terms and obligations arising from this Amended Consent Judgment shall be
18	construed and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California.
19	11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT
20	11.1. This Amended Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and
21	understanding of CEH and Settling Defendant with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and
22	any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if
23	any, are hereby merged herein and therein.
24	11.2. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between CEH and
25	Settling Defendant except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise,
26	express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Amended Consent Judgment
27	have been made by any Party hereto.
10	

- 11.3. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein.
- **11.4.** No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Amended Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby.
- 11.5. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Amended Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

## 12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

**12.1.** This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Amended Consent Judgment.

### 13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO AMENDED CONSENT JUDGMENT

**13.1.** Each signatory to this Amended Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Amended Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Amended Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and to legally bind that Party.

### 14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS

**14.1.** Nothing in this Amended Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim against another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Amended Consent Judgment.

#### 15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS

**15.1.** The stipulations to this Amended Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

ON RECYCLED PAPER

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:
2	
3	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
4	
5	
6	Charlie Pizarro
7	Associate Director
8	
9	AVAIL VAPOR, LLC
10	
. 11	
12	Signature
13	
14	Printed Name
15	
16	
17	Title
18	
19	IT IC CO OPPEDED.
20	IT IS SO ORDERED:
21	
22	Dated:, 2015
23	Judge of the Superior Court
24	
25	
26	
27	
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-14-

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO AVAIL VAPOR, LLC – CASE NO. RG 15-770932

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	IT IS SO STIPULATED:
6	
7	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
8	
9	
10	Charlie Pizarro
11	Associate Director
12	AVAIL VAPOR, LLC
13	
14	
15	si de la companya de
16 17	Signature
18	PUSS REGERS 11/30/15
19	Printed Name
20	Coo
21	Title
22	
23	
24	IT IS SO ORDERED:
25	
26	
27	Dated:, 2015
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED	-14-
ON RECYCLED PAPER	CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO AVAIL VAPOR, LLC – CASE NO. RG 15-770932