1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	LEXINGTON LAW GROUP Mark N. Todzo, State Bar No. 168389 Abigail Blodgett, State Bar No. 278813 503 Divisadero Street San Francisco, CA 94117 Telephone: (415) 913-7800 Facsimile: (415) 759-4112 mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com ablodgett@lexlawgroup.com Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE FOR THE COUNT CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, Plaintiff,	
14 15	V.	JUDGMENT AS TO AMERICANVAPOR INC. AND THE ARTISAN
16	SPACE JAM JUICE LLC, et al.,) VAPOR COMPANY LLC
17	Defendants.))
18		,))
19		
20	1 INTRODUCTION	
21	1. INTRODUCTION 1.1 This Consent Is demont is entered into by Plaintiff Content for Environmental	
22	1.1. This Consent Judgment is entered into by Plaintiff Center for Environmental Health, a non-profit corporation ("CEH"), and Defendants American Vapor Inc. and The Artisan	
23	Vapor Company LLC (collectively referred to herein as "Settling Defendants") to settle claims	
24	asserted by CEH against Settling Defendants as set forth in the operative Complaint in the matter	
25	Center for Environmental Health v. Space Jam Juice LLC, et al., Alameda County Superior Court	
26	Case No. RG 15-770932 (the "Action"). CEH and Settling Defendants are referred to	
27	collectively as the "Parties."	
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-1	_

- 1.2. On February 27, 2015, CEH served 60-Day Notices of Violation (the "February 27, 2015 Notices") relating to the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65") on Settling Defendant American Vapor Inc., the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in State of California with a population greater than 750,000. The February 27, 2015 Notices allege violations of Proposition 65 with respect to the presence of nicotine in electronic cigarette devices designed for use with nicotine-containing liquids and nicotine-containing liquids used in such devices (the "Products") manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant American Vapor Inc.
- 1.3. On September 2, 2015, CEH served four additional 60-Day Notices of Violation (the "September 2, 2015 Notices") on Settling Defendant American Vapor Inc. and the requisite public enforcers alleging additional violations with regards to the Products. Specifically, the September 2, 2015 Notices allege that Settling Defendant American Vapor Inc.'s Products expose users to formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, both of which are produced when the Products are used in their intended fashion.
- 1.4. On February 18, 2016, CEH served 60-Day Notices of Violation (the "February 18, 2016 Notices") on Settling Defendant The Artisan Vapor Company LLC and the requisite public enforcers alleging additional violations with regards to the Products. Specifically, the February 18, 2016 Notices allege that Settling Defendant The Artisan Vapor Company LLC's Products expose users to nicotine, formaldehyde, and acetaldehyde. The February 27, 2015 Notices, September 2, 2015 Notices, and February 18, 2016 Notices shall collectively be referred to as the "Notices."
- 1.5. On May 19, 2015, CEH filed the Action, naming Settling Defendant American Vapor Inc. as a defendant. On or around April 29, 2016, CEH amended the operative Complaint to add Settling Defendant as a defendant in the Action. Upon entry of this Consent Judgment, the Complaint shall be deemed amended to include the allegations of the September 2, 2015 and February 18, 2016 Notices.

- **1.6.** Solely for purposes of this Consent Judgment, the Parties agree that each Settling Defendant is a corporation that employs ten (10) or more persons and that manufactures, distributes, and/or sells Covered Products (as defined herein) in the State of California or has done so in the past.
- 1.7. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that: (i) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Notices and Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendants as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; (ii) venue is proper in the County of Alameda; and (iii) this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged in the Notice and Complaint with respect to Products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendants.
- 1.8. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint arising out of the facts or conduct related to Settling Defendants alleged therein and in the Notices. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Settling Defendants deny the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notices and Complaint and expressly deny any wrongdoing whatsoever. Except as specifically provided herein, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense any of the Parties may have in this or any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in the Action.

2. **DEFINITIONS**

2.1. "Covered Products" means "Covered Liquid Products" and "Covered Device Products."

- **2.2.** "Covered Liquid Products" means liquids that are designed for use with electronic cigarette devices, also known as tanks and vape pens, that are manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendants in California.
- **2.3.** "Covered Device Products" means electronic cigarette devices, also known as tanks and vape pens, which contain nicotine or are designed and intended for use with nicotine-containing liquid, that are manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendants in California.
 - **2.4.** "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court enters this Consent Judgment.

3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

3.1. Clear and Reasonable Warnings for Nicotine-Containing Covered Liquid Products. As of the Effective Date, no nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product may be manufactured for sale, distributed or sold in California unless such nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product has a clear and reasonable warning on the outer label of the product. The warning shall state the following:

WARNING: Use of this product will expose you to nicotine, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm, and formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to cause cancer.

The warning shall not be preceded by, surrounded by, or include any additional words or phrases that contradict, obfuscate, or otherwise undermine the warning. The warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer label of a nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product, the warning required herein shall be separated from the other warnings by a line that is at least the same height as a line of text on the label. For internet, catalog, or any other sale where the consumer is not physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the nicotine-containing

Covered Liquid Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

3.1.1. Warnings for Nicotine-Containing Covered Liquid Products in the Stream of Commerce. In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.1, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendants shall provide warning instructions by certified mail to each of their California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendants reasonably believes has remaining inventory of Covered Liquid Products as of the Effective Date. The warning instructions shall instruct Settling Defendants' California retailers or distributors to comply with warning requirements consistent with Section 3.1 herein.

3.2. Clear and Reasonable Warnings for Non-Nicotine-Containing Covered
Liquid Products. As of the Effective Date, no non-nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product
may be manufactured for sale, distributed or sold in California unless such non-nicotinecontaining Covered Liquid Product has a clear and reasonable warning on the outer label of the
product. The warning shall state the following:

WARNING: Use of this product will expose you to formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer.

The warning shall not be preceded by, surrounded by, or include any additional words or phrases that contradict, obfuscate, or otherwise undermine the warning. The warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the non-nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer label of a nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product, the

3.2.1. Warnings for Non-Nicotine-Containing Covered Liquid Products in the Stream of Commerce. In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for non-nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.2, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendants shall provide warning instructions by certified mail to each of their California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendants reasonably believes has remaining inventory of Covered Liquid Products as of the Effective Date. The warning instructions shall instruct Settling Defendants' California retailers or distributors to comply with warning requirements consistent with Section 3.2 herein.

3.3. Clear and Reasonable Warnings for Covered Device Products. As of the Effective Date, no Covered Device Product may be manufactured for sale, distributed or sold in California unless such Covered Device Product has a clear and reasonable warning on the outer packaging of the product. For Covered Device Products that contain nicotine, the warning shall state the following:

WARNING: Use of this product will expose you to nicotine, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm, and formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to cause cancer.

28
DOCUMENT PREPARED
ON RECYCLED PAPER

28
DOCUMENT PREPARED
ON RECYCLED PAPER

For Covered Device Products that do not contain nicotine, but are designed for use with nicotinecontaining products, the warning shall state the following:

WARNING: Use of this product with nicotine-containing liquid will expose you to nicotine, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm, and formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to cause cancer.

The warning shall not be preceded by, surrounded by, or include any additional words or phrases that contradict, obfuscate, or otherwise undermine the warning. The warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the outer packaging of the Covered Device Product with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer label of a nicotine-containing Covered Liquid Product, the warning required herein shall be separated from the other warnings by a line that is at least the same height as a line of text on the label. For internet, catalog, or any other sale where the consumer is not physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the Covered Device Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Device Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

3.3.1. Warnings for Covered Device Products in the Stream of Commerce.

In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for Covered Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.3, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendants shall provide warning instructions by certified mail to each of their California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendants reasonably believes has remaining inventory of Covered Device Products as of the Effective Date. The warning instructions shall be consistent with Section 3.3 herein.

15

16

13

17

18

19 20

21 22

23

24 25

26

27

chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendants' Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund. This payment in lieu of civil penalty shall be paid in one (1) check on the date set forth in Exhibit A and shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health.

- 4.1.3. \$17,975 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. This amount shall be divided into two checks: (1) a check for \$15,925 shall be made payable to Lexington Law Group; and (2) a check for \$2,050 shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health. These amounts shall be paid in one (1) check made payable to the Center for Environmental Health and two (2) separate checks made payable to the Lexington Law Group on the dates set forth in Exhibit A.
- **4.1.4.** The payments required under Sections 4.1.1-4.1.3 shall be delivered on or before the dates set forth in Exhibit A. All checks shall be delivered to Mark Todzo at Lexington Law Group at the address set forth in Section 8.1.2.
- **4.1.5.** In the event that Settling Defendants elect not to certify their compliance with one or more of the optional provisions in Section 3.4 in accordance with that Section, within one hundred and eighty (180) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendants must jointly and severally make an additional payment for each provision not certified, as follows: (i) \$2,000 if Settling Defendants elect to not participate in Section 3.4.1; (ii) \$2,000 if Settling Defendants elect to not participate in Section 3.4.2; (iii) \$2,000 if Settling Defendants elect to not participate in Section 3.4.3; and (iv) \$2,000 if Settling Defendants elect to not participate in Section 3.4.4. Each of these payments shall be paid in two (2) separate checks, each payable to the Center for Environmental Health, to be allocated as follows:
 - 4.1.5.1. Forty percent (40%) shall constitute a civil penalty pursuant to

ON RECYCLED PAPER

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment).

4.1.5.2. Sixty percent (60%) shall constitute a payment in lieu of civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendants' Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund.

5. ENFORCEMENT OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

5.1. CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Superior Court of Alameda County, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3 above, CEH shall provide Settling Defendants with a Notice of Violation and a copy of any test results which purportedly support CEH's Notice of Violation. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for CEH's anticipated motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including providing Settling Defendants a reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, CEH may file its enforcement motion or application. The prevailing party on any motion to enforce this Consent Judgment shall be entitled to its reasonable attorney's fees and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application. This Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties.

Document Prepared

ON RECYCLED PAPER

6. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

6.1. This Consent Judgment may only be modified by written agreement of CEH and Settling Defendants, or upon motion of CEH or Settling Defendants as provided by law.

7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

- 7.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH acting in the public interest and Settling Defendants and Settling Defendants' parents, officers, directors, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, and their respective successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees") and all entities to whom they distribute or sell or have distributed or sold Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of all claims alleged in the Complaints arising from any violation of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been asserted in the public interest against Settling Defendants and Downstream Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposures to nicotine, formaldehyde, and/or acetaldehyde in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendants prior to the Effective Date.
- 7.2. CEH, for itself and on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7, releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims alleged in the Complaints against Settling Defendants and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been asserted regarding the failure to warn about exposures to nicotine, formaldehyde, and/or acetaldehyde in connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendants prior to the Effective Date.
- 7.3. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Settling Defendants and the Downstream Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Settling Defendant and Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about nicotine, formaldehyde, and/or acetaldehyde in Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendant after the Effective Date.

28
DOCUMENT PREPARED
ON RECYCLED PAPER

11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

- 11.1. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of CEH and Settling Defendants with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein.
- 11.2. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between CEH and Settling Defendants except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto.
- 11.3. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein.
- **11.4.** No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby.
- 11.5. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

12.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT

13.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and to legally bind that Party.

-14-

1	14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS		
2	14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim		
3	against another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment.		
4	15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS		
5	15.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by		
6	means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.		
7	TT IC CO CTIDIT ATED.		
8	IT IS SO STIPULATED:		
9	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH		
10	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH		
11			
12			
13	Charlie Pizarro Associate Director		
14			
15	AMERICAN VAPOR INC.		
16			
17 18			
19	Signature		
20			
21	Printed Name		
22			
23			
24	Title		
25			
26			
27			
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-15-		

NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS 14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim against another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment. **EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS** 15.1. The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document. IT IS SO STIPULATED: CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH Charlie Pizarro Associate Director 14 AMERICAN VAPOR INC. 16 18 Signature 19 20 Printed Name 22 23 Title 24 25

1	ARTISAN VAPOR COMPANY LLC
2	
3	C Jahr
4	Signature
5	Signature
6	UMAIR KAIMKHANI Printed Name
7	Printed Name
8	DIRECTOR
9	Title
10	
1 1	
12	IT IS SO ORDERED:
13	
14	Dated: . 2016
15	Dated:, 2016 Judge of the Superior Court
16	
16	
17	
17	
17 18 19	
17 18 19 20	
17 18 19 20 21	
17 18 19 20 21 22	
17 18 19 20 21 22 23	
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	

1			
2	EXHIBIT A Settlement Payments and Allocations		
3			
4	Total Settlement Payment:	\$28,500	
5	Payment 1: Total \$10,250 - Due 10 Days After the Effective Date		
6	Payment 1 Allocations:		
7	Civil Penalty:	\$1,010	
8	Payment in Lieu of Civil Penalty: Attorneys' Fees and Costs to CEH:	\$1,515 \$2,050	
9	Attorneys' Fees and Costs to LLG:	\$5,675	
10	Payment 2: Total \$10,250 - Due 60 Days After the Effective Date		
11	Payment 2 Allocations:		
12	Attorneys' Fees and Costs to LLG:	\$10,250	
13	Payment 3: Total \$8,000 (may be waived pursua	nt to Section 4.1.5) - Due 180 Days After the	
14	Effective Date		
15	Payment 3 Allocations:		
16	Waivable Civil Penalty:	\$3,200 total, or \$800 for each election made	
17	Waivable Payment in Lieu of Civil Penalty:		
18		made under Sections 3.4.1, 3.4.2, 3.4.3, or 3.4.4	
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26 27			
28			
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-1	7-	