

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 **Gabriel Espinosa & Ferguson Enterprises, Inc.**

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Gabriel Espinosa ("Espinosa") and Ferguson Enterprises, Inc. ("Ferguson"). Together, Espinosa and Ferguson are collectively referred to as the "Parties." Espinosa is an individual that resides in the State of California, and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Ferguson is considered a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code section 25249.6, et seq. ("Proposition 65").

#### 1.2 **General Allegations**

Espinosa alleges that Ferguson has imported, distributed and/or sold in the State of California the Sink Spray Hose, UPC No. 0 54374 00187 3 (the "Product") without the requisite Proposition 65 warning that the Products contain the chemical Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP). On January 1, 1988, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer. On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause developmental male reproductive toxicity.

#### 1.3 **Notice of Violation(s)**

On June 16, 2015, Espinosa served Ferguson, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled a "Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq." (the "Notice"). The Notice provided Ferguson and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Ferguson was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn consumers and customers that the Product exposed users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

#### **1.4 No Admission**

Ferguson denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Product, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Ferguson of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Ferguson of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Ferguson. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Ferguson maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Product for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65, nor distributed for sale or sold the Product in California in violation of Proposition 65.

#### **1.5 Effective Date**

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean June 10, 2016.

## **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

### **2.1 Reformulation of the Products**

Commencing ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Ferguson shall only ship, sell, or offer for sale in California, reformulated Product pursuant to Section 2.2 or Product that is labeled with a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.3. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "Reformulated Product" is Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth below in section 2.2.

## **2.2 Reformulation Standard**

“Reformulated Product” shall mean Product that contains less than or equal to 1,000 parts per million (“ppm”) of DEHP when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C.

## **2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings**

Commencing ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, Ferguson shall, for all Product it sells or distributes, and which is intended for sale in California or which Ferguson has reason to believe will be shipped or sold in California and that is not a Reformulated Product, provide clear and reasonable warnings as set forth in subsections 2.3(a) and (b) below. The warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase and/or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which specific Products the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

### **(a) Retail Store Sales**

**(i) Product Labeling.** Ferguson shall affix a warning to the packaging, labeling or directly on each Product sold in retail outlets in California by Ferguson that states:

**PROPOSITION 65 WARNING:**

This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

**(ii) Point of Sale Warnings.** Alternatively, Ferguson may provide warning signs at its retail outlets in the form below by posting the warnings in close proximity to the point of display of the Product.

**PROPOSITION 65 WARNING:**

This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

(b) **Mail Order Catalog Warning.** In the event that Ferguson directly sells Product via mail order catalog directly to consumers located in California after the Effective Date that is not a Reformulated Product, Ferguson shall provide a warning for such Product sold via mail order catalog to such California residents. A warning that is given in a mail order catalog shall be in the same type size or larger than the Product description text within the catalog. The following warning shall be provided on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product:

**PROPOSITION 65 WARNING:**

This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

Where it is impracticable to provide the warning on the same page and in the same location as the display and/or description of the Product, Ferguson may utilize a designated symbol to cross reference the applicable warning and shall define the term "designated symbol" with the following language on the inside of the front cover of the catalog or on the same page as any order form for the Products:

**WARNING:** Certain products identified with this symbol ▼ and offered for sale in this catalog contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

The designated symbol must appear on the same page and in close proximity to the display and/or description of the Product. On each page where the designated symbol appears, Ferguson must provide a header or footer directing the consumer to the warning language and definition of the designated symbol.

(c) **Internet Sales Warning.** In the event that Ferguson directly sells Product via the internet directly to consumers located in California after the

Effective Date that is not a Reformulated Product, Ferguson shall provide a warning for such Product sold via the internet to such California residents. However, Ferguson will not be required to provide a warning if the Product is sold by others out of Ferguson's control on the internet. A warning that is given on the internet shall be in the same type size or larger than the Product's description text and shall be given in conjunction with the direct sale of the Product. The warning for any Product sold directly by Ferguson on the internet shall appear either: (a) on the same web page on which the Product is displayed; (b) on the same web page as the order form for the Product; (c) on the same page as the price for the Product; or (d) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser during the checkout process. The Parties acknowledge and agree that Ferguson shall not be responsible for, nor liable in any way for, the labeling of any Product sold by others on the internet. The following warning shall be provided for any Product sold directly by Ferguson on the internet:

**PROPOSITION 65 WARNING:**

This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm.

**2.4 Exception to Warning Requirement**

The warning requirements set forth in Section 2.3 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product.

**3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)**

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Ferguson shall pay a total of \$3,000.00 in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Espinosa. Each penalty payment shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.2 below.

### **3.1 Initial Civil Penalty**

Within seven (7) business days of the Effective Date, Ferguson shall issue two separate checks for the civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$2,250.00; and (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Espinosa" in the amount of \$750.00. All penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.2 below.

### **3.2 Payment Procedures**

(a) **Issuance of Payments.** Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Espinosa, pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010  
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

(b) **Copy of Payments to OEHHA.** Ferguson agrees to provide Espinosa's counsel with a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Espinosa, to be delivered to the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(C) **Tax Documentation.** Ferguson agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) "Gabriel Espinosa" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties;

(ii) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

#### 4. **REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The parties acknowledge that Espinosa and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Espinosa then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Espinosa and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Under these legal principles, Ferguson shall reimburse Espinosa's counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to Ferguson's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Within seven (7)

days of the Effective Date, Ferguson shall issue a check payable to "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" in the amount of \$27,000.00 for delivery to the following address:

Evan Smith, Esquire  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
Two Bala Plaza, Ste. 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

**5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

**5.1 Release of Ferguson and Downstream Retailers and Entities**

Espinosa, acting on his own behalf, releases Ferguson, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys and each entity to whom Ferguson directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products, including but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through ninety (90) days after the Effective Date based on their failure to warn about alleged exposures to the chemical DEHP that is contained in the Product, and was distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Ferguson to retailers, customers and consumers in the State of California.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Section(s) 3 and 4 above, Espinosa, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, provides a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands against Ferguson or the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to the chemical DEHP in the Product.

## **5.2 Ferguson's Release of Espinosa**

Ferguson, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Espinosa, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Espinosa and/or his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Product.

## **6. SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

## **7. GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, Ferguson shall provide written notice to Espinosa of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products is so affected.

## **8. NOTICES**

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For Ferguson:

Brenda K. Radmacher  
WOOD, SMITH, HENNING & BERMAN LLP  
505 N. Brand Blvd., Ste. 1100  
Glendale, CA 91203

For Espinosa:

Evan J. Smith  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004  
877-534-2590

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

Espinosa agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

**11. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

**12. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: 6/18/16

Date: 6/21/2016

By:   
Gabriel Espinosa

By:   
Ferguson Enterprises, Inc.  
DAVID N. MEERER  
ASST. SECRETARY