1 2 3 4 5 6 7	LEXINGTON LAW GROUP Mark N. Todzo, State Bar No. 168389 Abigail Blodgett, State Bar No. 278813 503 Divisadero Street San Francisco, CA 94117 Telephone: (415) 913-7800 Facsimile: (415) 759-4112 mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com ablodgett@lexlawgroup.com Attorneys for Plaintiff CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH		
8			
9	SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
10	FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
11			
12	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,) Case No. RG 15-794036		
13 14	Plaintiff,) [PROPOSED] CONSENT) JUDGMENT AS TO VAPOR 4 LIFE		
15	v.) HOLDINGS, INC.		
16	TOTALLY WICKED-E LIQUID (USA) INCORPORATED, et al.,		
17	Defendants.		
18)		
19			
20	1. INTRODUCTION		
21	1.1. This Consent Judgment is entered into by Plaintiff Center for Environmental		
22	Health, a non-profit corporation ("CEH"), and Vapor 4 Life Holdings, Inc. ("Settling Defendant")		
23	to settle claims asserted by CEH against Settling Defendant as set forth in the operative		
24	Complaint in the matter Center for Environmental Health v. Totally Wicked-E Liquid (USA)		
25 26	Incorporated, et al., Alameda County Superior Court Case No. RG 15-794036 (the "Action").		
27	CEH and Settling Defendant are referred to collectively as the "Parties."		
28 DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-1-		

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO VAPOR 4 LIFE – CASE NO. RG 15-794036

- 1.2. On September 2, 2015, CEH served three 60-Day Notices of Violation (the "Notices") relating to the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65") on Settling Defendant, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in State of California with a population greater than 750,000. The Notices allege violations of Proposition 65 with regard to exposures to formaldehyde and acetaldehyde resulting from use of Settling Defendant's e-cigarette devices and/or the e-liquids used in such devices (the "Products").
- **1.3.** On November 19, 2015, CEH filed the Action, naming Settling Defendant as a defendant in the Action.
- **1.4.** Settling Defendant is a corporation that employ ten (10) or more persons and that manufactures, distributes, and/or sells Covered Products (as defined herein) in the State of California or has done so in the past.
- 1.5. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that: (i) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Notices and Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; (ii) venue is proper in the County of Alameda; and (iii) this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged in the Notices and Complaint with respect to Covered Products manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant.
- 1.6. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint arising out of the facts or conduct related to Settling Defendant alleged therein and in the Notices. By execution of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law. Settling Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notices and Complaint

ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer label of a Covered Liquid Product, the warning required herein shall be separated from the other warnings by a line that is at least the same height as a line of text on the label. For internet, catalog, or any other sale where the consumer is not physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the Covered Liquid Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Liquid Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

3.1.1. Warnings for Covered Liquid Products in the Stream of Commerce. In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for Covered Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.1, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall provide warning materials by certified mail to each of its California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendant reasonably believes sold Covered Liquid Products prior to the Effective Date. Such warning materials shall include a reasonably sufficient number of stickers in order to permit the retailer or distributor to affix the warning on each Covered Liquid Product such customer has purchased from Settling Defendant. The warning stickers shall contain the warning language set forth in Section 3.1 above. The warning materials shall also include a letter of instruction for the placement of the stickers, and a Notice and Acknowledgment postcard.

3.2. Clear and Reasonable Warnings for Covered Device Products. As of the Effective Date, no Covered Device Product may be manufactured for sale, distributed or sold in California unless such Covered Device Product has a clear and reasonable warning on the outer packaging of the product. For Covered Device Products, the warning shall state the following:

> **WARNING**: Use of this product will expose you to formaldehyde and acetaldehyde, chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer.

> > -4-

27

22

23

24

25

The warning shall not be preceded by, surrounded by, or include any additional words or phrases that contradict, obfuscate, or otherwise undermine the warning. The warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the outer packaging of the Covered Device Product with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. To the extent that other warning statements are included on the outer packaging of a Covered Device Product, the warning required herein shall be separated from the other warnings by a line that is at least the same height as a line of text on the label. For internet, catalog, or any other sale where the consumer is not physically present and cannot see a warning displayed on the Covered Device Product prior to purchase or payment, the warning statement shall be displayed in such a manner that it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Device Product being purchased prior to the authorization of or actual payment. Placement of the warning statement at the bottom of an internet webpage that offers multiple products for sale does not satisfy the requirements of this Section.

3.2.1. Warnings for Covered Device Products in the Stream of Commerce.

In an effort to ensure that consumers receive clear and reasonable warnings in compliance with Proposition 65 for Covered Products that have not been labeled in accordance with Section 3.2, within thirty (30) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant shall provide warning materials by certified mail to each of its California retailers or distributors to whom Settling Defendant reasonably believes sold Covered Device Products prior to the Effective Date. Such warning materials shall include a reasonably sufficient number of stickers in order to permit the retailer or distributor to affix the warning on each Covered Device Product such customer has purchased from Settling Defendant. The warning stickers shall contain the warning language set forth in Section 3.2 above. The warning materials shall also include a letter of instruction for the placement of the stickers, and a Notice and Acknowledgment postcard.

3.3. Optional Additional Injunctive Provisions. In order for Settling Defendant to be eligible for any waiver of the additional civil penalty/payment in lieu of penalty payments set

forth in Section 4.1.5 below, Settling Defendant shall undertake one or more of the additional actions below. If Settling Defendant opts to be bound by this Section, Settling Defendant must provide CEH with a written election stating which optional provision(s) it is agreeing to implement.

- **3.3.1. Product Reformulation.** As of the Effective Date, all Covered Products manufactured for sale in California shall be manufactured such that use of the Covered Products will not produce detectable levels of formaldehyde and acetaldehyde.
- **3.3.2. Product Safety Requirements.** If Settling Defendant opts to participate in Section 3.3.2, Settling Defendant shall make the following changes to the Covered Products to increase the safety of such products:
- **3.3.2.1.** As of the Effective Date, all Covered Liquid Products manufactured for sale in California shall be manufactured with child proof caps in accordance with the standards set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 1700.15(b) and flow restrictions in accordance with the standard set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 1700.15(d).
- **3.3.2.2.** As of the Effective Date, all Covered Products manufactured for sale in California shall be manufactured without diacetyl in the Covered Products.
- **3.3.3. Prohibition on Sales and Advertising to Minors.** If Settling Defendant opts to participate in Section 3.3.3, Settling Defendant shall not sell Covered Products to persons younger than eighteen (18) years of age and shall take reasonable steps to prevent the sale of Covered Products to such persons, including, but not limited to the following measures:
- 3.3.3.1. Settling Defendant shall implement one or more systems for checking the age of persons who purchase Covered Products on the Internet or in person. The system shall include age verification by requiring and checking an official government identification card or verifying through a reputable credit agency the age of anyone who purchases Covered Products on the Internet, or of anyone under twenty-six (26) years old who purchases in person. The system shall be put into place on or before the Effective Date.

Environmental Health Hazard Assessment).

_′	7	_
_	1	_

- **4.1.2.** \$2,100 as a payment in lieu of civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendant's Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund.
- **4.1.3.** \$23,500 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. This amount shall be divided into two checks: (1) a check for \$20,800 shall be made payable to Lexington Law Group; and (2) a check for \$2,700 shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health.
- **4.1.4.** The payments required under Sections 4.1.1-4.1.3 shall be made in four (4) separate checks, all to be delivered within ten (10) days following the Effective Date. The payments required pursuant to Sections 4.1.1 and 4.1.2 shall each be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health. All checks shall be delivered to Mark Todzo at Lexington Law Group at the address set forth in Section 8.1.2.
- **4.1.5.** In the event that Settling Defendant elects to not certify its compliance with one or more of the optional provisions in Section 3.3 in accordance with that Section, within ten (10) days following the Effective Date, Settling Defendant must make an additional payment for each provision not certified, as follows: (i) \$2,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.1; (ii) \$2,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.2; (iii) \$2,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.3; and (iv) \$2,500 if Settling Defendant elects to not participate in Section 3.3.4. Each of these payments shall be paid in two separate checks, each payable to the Center for Environmental Health, to be allocated as follows:
 - **4.1.5.1.** Forty percent (40%) shall constitute a civil penalty pursuant to

accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment).

California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), such money to be apportioned by CEH in

4.1.5.2. Sixty percent (60%) shall constitute a payment in lieu of civil penalty pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3203(b). CEH will use such funds to continue its work educating and protecting people from exposures to toxic chemicals. CEH may also use a portion of such funds to monitor compliance with this Consent Judgment and to purchase and test Settling Defendant's Products to confirm compliance. In addition, as part of its Community Environmental Action and Justice Fund, CEH will use four percent (4%) of such funds to award grants to grassroots environmental justice groups working to educate and protect the public from exposures to toxic chemicals. The method of selection of such groups can be found at the CEH website at www.ceh.org/justicefund.

5. ENFORCEMENT OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

5.1. CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Superior Court of Alameda County, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3 above, CEH shall provide Settling Defendant with a Notice of Violation and a copy of any test results which purportedly support CEH's Notice of Violation. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for CEH's anticipated motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including providing Settling Defendant a reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, CEH may file its enforcement motion or application. The prevailing party on any motion to enforce this Consent Judgment shall be entitled to its reasonable attorney's fees and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application. This Consent Judgment may only be enforced by the Parties.

-9-

6 7

8

9 10

12 13

11

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

6. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment may only be modified by written agreement of CEH and Settling Defendant, or upon motion of CEH or Settling Defendant as provided by law.

7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

- 7.1. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH acting in the public interest and Settling Defendant and Settling Defendant's parents, officers, directors, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, and their respective successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees") and all entities to whom they distribute or sell or have distributed or sold Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of all claims alleged in the Complaint in this Action arising from any violation of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been asserted in the public interest against Settling Defendant and Downstream Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposures to formaldehyde and/or acetaldehyde in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendant prior to the Effective Date.
- 7.2. CEH, for itself, releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims alleged in the Complaint against Settling Defendant and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been asserted regarding the failure to warn about exposures to formaldehyde and/or acetaldehyde in connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendant prior to the Effective Date.
- 7.3. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Settling Defendant and the Downstream Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Settling Defendant and Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about exposures to formaldehyde and/or acetaldehyde from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendant after the Effective Date.

-10-

ON RECYCLED PAPER

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO VAPOR 4 LIFE - CASE NO. RG 15-794036

10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION

The terms and obligations arising from this Consent Judgment shall be construed and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California.

11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

- This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of CEH and Settling Defendant with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein.
- **11.2.** There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between CEH and Settling Defendant except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto.
- **11.3.** No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein.
- **11.4.** No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby.
- **11.5.** No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

12.1. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

26

AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT 1 13. 2 13.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized 3 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and 4 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and to legally bind that Party. 5 NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS 14. 14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim 6 7 against another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment. **EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS** 8 15. 9 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by 10 means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document. 11 IT IS SO STIPULATED: 12 CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH 13 14 15 Charlie Pizarro 16 Associate Director 17 18 VAPOR 4 LIFE HOLDINGS, INC. 19 20 21 22 Signature 23 24 Printed Name 25 26 Title 27 -13-

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

1 13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT 2 13.1. Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized 3 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and to legally bind that Party. 4 5 14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS 14.1. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim 6 7 against another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment. 8 15. **EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS** 9 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by 10 means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document. 11 IT IS SO STIPULATED: 12 CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH 13 14 15 Charlie Pizarro 16 Associate Director 17 18 VAPOR 4 LIFE HOLDINGS, INC. 19 20 21 22 Signature 23 24 Printed Name 25 26 Title 27

1	IT IS SO ORDERED:
2	
3	
4	Dated:, 2016
5	Judge of the Superior Court
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24 25	
25 26	
27	
28	
DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER	-14-

CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO VAPOR 4 LIFE – CASE NO. RG 15-794036