State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting

FORM JUS 1501 (03-01)

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612 PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)

REPORT OF SETTLEMENT

Please	print or type required information	Original Filing O S	Supplemental Filin	g Corrected Filing		
PARTIES TO THE ACTION	PLAINTIFF(S) Shefa LMV Inc. DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN SETTLEMEN Weiman Produts LLC	Т				
шо	COURT DOCKET NUMBER BC650959		COURT NAM	Engeles County	Superior Court	
CASE	SHORT CASE NAME Shefa v. 3M Company	7	l			
REPORT INFO	SUBMITTED TO COURT? COURT, R Yes O No MUST BE	PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS F \$16,000 TEER ENTRY OF JUDGMENT EPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGG SUBMITTED TO ATTORNEY OF TERMENT N	BY DATES MENT GENERAL	EETTLEMENT SIGNED /25/2017	For Internal Use Only	
FILER	NAMEOFCONTACT Daniel N. Greenbaum					
	ORGANIZATION Law Office of Danie	el Greenbaum			TELEPHONE NUMBER (818) 809-2199	
	ADDRESS 7120 Hayvenhurst Av	ve., Suite 32	0		FAX NUMBER (424 243-7698	
	Van Nuys	STATE ZIP CA 91406	E-MA dg	ILADDRESS reenbaum@greer	nbaumlawfirm.com	

FILING INSTRUCTIONS: This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the settlement to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

1	LAW OFFICE OF DANIEL N. GREENBAUM Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. (268104) The Hathaway Building 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320 Van Nuys, California 91406					
2						
3	Telephone: 818-809-2199 Fax: 424-243-7689					
4	Email: dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com					
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff SHEFA LMV, INC.					
6						
7	LEWIS BRISBOIS BISGAARD & SMITH, LLP Paul Desrochers, Esq. (214855)					
8	333 Bush Street, Suite 1100 San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: 415-362-2580					
9						
10	Fax: 415-434-0882 Email: Paul.Desrochers@lewisbrisbois.com					
11	Attorneys for Defendant WEIMAN PRODUCTS LLC					
12						
13	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
14	FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES					
15	SHEFA LMV, INC.,) Case No.: BC650959				
16	Plaintiff,) Assigned to the Hon. Marc Marmaro				
17		Department 37				
18	VS.	(PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENTBETWEEN PLAINTIFF SHEFA LMV,				
19	3M COMPANY, et. al.,) INC. AND DEFENDANT WEIMAN) PRODUCTS				
20	Defendant.))				
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
	EDDODOCEDI CONCENE VID CAMENE					

the requisite Proposition 65 warnings.

- 2.6 Lead and lead compounds (the "Listed Chemical") are listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.
- 2.7 The Notice alleges that Defendant's conduct violates Health & Safety Code \$25249.6, the warning provision of Proposition 65.
- 2.8 On February 17, 2017, Plaintiff filed the action entitled *Shefa LMV, Inc. vs.* 3M Company, et al., Case No. BC650959, alleging violations of Proposition 65 (the "Action").
- 2.9 Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint, and maintain that all products sold, distributed, or offered for sale in California have been and are in compliance with all laws, including, without limitation, Proposition 65. Defendant specifically denies that the Covered Product causes an exposure to lead above the safe harbor value when the Covered Product is used for its intended purpose and denies that it is legally obligated to provide warnings for the Covered Product for exposures resulting from the use of the Covered Product.
- 2.10 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment to resolve all Proposition 65 claims concerning the Covered Products.
- 2.11 By executing this Consent Judgment, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions or law.
- 2.12 It is the Parties' intent that nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.
- 2.13 Upon approval of this Consent Judgment, the Parties waive their respective rights to a hearing or a trial on the allegations of the Complaint.
 - 2.14 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right,

remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in any other or future legal proceedings, except as provided in this Consent Judgment.

3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF -- PRODUCT LABELING

- 3.1 Except for Covered Products for which current Proposition 65 safe harbor warnings already are provided, Weiman shall provide warnings (as described in Paragraph 3.4 of this Consent Judgment) on the Covered Product and its label produced 120 days after the Effective Date. Weiman may, at its sole discretion, implement the warning text and/or methods of transmission set forth in Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Sections 25602 and 25603, for the Covered Product as adopted on August 30, 2016 (formally effective on August 30, 2018).
- 3.2 Each warning required by Section 3.1 shall be prominently placed upon a product's label or other labeling or displayed at the retail outlet with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices in the label, labeling or display as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use.
- 3.3 Each warning required by Section 3.1 shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which specific Covered Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.
- 3.4 **Product Labeling.** Any of the following warning statements shall be applied to the Products:
 - a. "AWARNING: This product can expose you to lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov."
 - b. "WARNING: Always wear gloves while using this product to avoid skin exposure. Wash your hands after use."
 - c. "WARNING: Polishing items, such as brass or pewter, may cause the

release of chemicals which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm."

3.5 Defendant may, but shall not be required to, add specific chemicals to the above warning unless the Attorney General advises that the inclusion of such chemicals would render the warning misleading or constitute over warning.

4. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS

- **4.1** On or before twenty (20) business days after the Effective Date, Defendant shall make the Total Settlement Payment of \$18,500.00 by delivering checks payable to "Shefa LMV, Inc." and "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum" as set forth below to counsel for Shefa.
 - 4.2 The funds paid by Defendant shall be allocated as follows:
 - 4.2.1 Civil Penalty. A civil penalty in the amount of \$2,500.00 payable to "Shefa LMV, Inc.," pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), with such money to be apportioned and distributed by Shefa in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 as follows: 25% to Shefa and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment.
 - **4.2.2 Attorneys' fees and Costs.** A reimbursement of Shefa's attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$16,000.00 payable to the "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum."

5. ENFORCEMENT

Plaintiff, by motion or application for an order to show cause before the Los Angeles County Superior Court, may enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3 above, Plaintiff shall provide the Defendant with Notice of Violation and a copy of any test results, which purportedly support Plaintiff's Notice of Violation. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for Plaintiff's anticipated motion or application to resolve the matter informally, including providing Settling Defendant a reasonable opportunity of at least

8

11 12

13 14

> 15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

2425

26

27

thirty (30) days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempt at informal resolution fail, Plaintiff may file its enforcement motion or application. The prevailing party on any motion to enforce this Consent Judgment shall be entitled to its reasonable attorney's fees and costs incurred because of such motion or application.

6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

- 6.1 Full and Binding Resolution. This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiff on behalf of itself, and in its representative capacity, its past and current attorneys, agents, representatives, successors, assigns, and in the public interest pursuant to California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(d), on the one hand, and Defendant, and its parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, affiliates, directors, officers, employees, attorneys, and any and all successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), all entities to whom Defendant and/or Defendant Releasees directly or indirectly distribute or sell or have in the past directly or indirectly distributed or sold Covered Products, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, marketplace hosts, and Defendant's and Defendant Releasees' licensors and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), on the other hand, regarding any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted in the Notice and/or Complaint against Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Downstream Defendant Releasees, with respect to the alleged failure to warn about any Covered Products, and/or the use of any Covered Products, manufactured, shipped, distributed or sold by Defendant, Defendant Releasees and/or Downstream Defendant Releasees before Weiman's production of Covered Products and labels in compliance with Paragraph 3.1 herein..
- **6.2** Compliance. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from the use of the Covered Product.
 - 6.3 Individual Release. In further consideration of the promises and agreements

herein contained, the injunctive relief commitments set forth in Section 3, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Section 4, Plaintiff, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, including but not limited to Daniel Greenbaum, Esq., successors, and/or assignees and *not* in its representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed, or contingent (collectively "Claims") that were brought or could have been brought against Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Defendant Downstream Releasees in the Notice and/or Complaint based on claims arising under Proposition 65with respect to Listed Chemicals in the Covered Product or exposures otherwise resulting from the use of the Covered Product, as such claims relate to the alleged failure to warn under California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 or arise under any other statutory or common law.

6.4 General Release. In furtherance of the foregoing, Plaintiff on its own behalf and *not* in its representative capacity, hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have respecting the Covered Product, conferred upon it with respect to claims involving Covered Product by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

By executing this Consent Judgment, Plaintiff understands and acknowledges that the

significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code Section 1542 is that even if Plaintiff suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or directly related to or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Product, including but not limited any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to lead or lead compounds from the Covered Product, Plaintiff will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Defendant Downstream Releasees, and the successors and assigns of any of them, who may manufacture, use, maintain, distribute, retail, or sell the Covered Product. Furthermore, Plaintiff acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such claim and any other claims related to the Action which may exist as of the date of this release pertaining to the Covered Product listed in the Notice but which Plaintiff does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect its decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether the lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

- 6.5 Defendant Release. On behalf of itself and Defendant Releasees, Defendant waives all rights to institute any form of action against Plaintiff, its attorneys, consultants, and representatives for all actions taken or statements made in the course of this Action prior to the date of the execution of this Consent Judgment.
- 6.6 Liability for Covered Products that were manufactured and/or distributed for retail sale in California before Weiman's production of Covered Products and labels in compliance with Paragraph 3.1 herein, shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to Section 6 of this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Covered Product were, or are in the future, sold to consumers.

7. MODIFICATION

- 7.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this Court upon motion and in accordance with law.
 - 7.2 A Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall attempt in good faith

to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to modify the Consent Judgment.

8. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

- **8.1** This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein.
- **8.2** No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto.
- 8.3 No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby.
- **8.4** No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

9. GOVERNING LAW AND APPLICATION

- 9.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and shall apply only to Covered Product that are sold or offered for sale in the State of California.
- 9.2 In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or if any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are rendered inapplicable or no longer required as a result of any such repeal or preemption or rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally as to the Covered Product, then Defendant shall notify Plaintiff and its counsel and may have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Product are so affected.
- 9.3 This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon the Parties and their divisions, subdivisions, and subsidiaries, and the Parties' successors and assigns.
 - 9.4 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of

26

27

The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile and/or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

14. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(t)

Plaintiff agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

15. COURT APPROVAL

- **15.1** This Consent Judgment shall become effective upon entry by the Court.
- 15.2 Plaintiff shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Defendant shall support entry of this Consent Judgment.
- 15.3 If the Court does not enter this Consent Judgment, it shall be of no force or effect and shall never be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose other than to allow the Court to determine if there was a material breach of the previous section.

16. AUTHORIZATION

Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the party represented and legally bind that party.

17. REQUEST FOR FINDINGS, APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AND ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 17.1 This Consent Judgment came before this Court upon the request of the Parties.
- 17.2 The Parties request the Court to review this Consent Judgment and to make the following findings pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4):
 - 1. The injunctive relief required by the Consent Judgment complies with Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7;
 - 2. The reimbursement of fees and costs to be paid pursuant to the