

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Ema Bell & Plumbing Technologies, LLC

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Ema Bell ("Bell") and Plumbing Technologies, LLC ("Plumbing Technologies"). Together, Bell and Plumbing Technologies are collectively referred to as the "Parties." Bell is an individual that resides in the State of California, and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.2 General Allegations

Bell alleges that Plumbing Technologies has imported, distributed and/or sold in the State of California soft toilet seats containing the chemical Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) without the requisite Proposition 65 warning.

On January 1, 1988, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer. On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity.

1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are toilet seats imported, distributed, and/or sold in California by Plumbing Technologies, including but not limited to, *UPC No. 813043023307* (the "Covered Products").

1.4 Notice of Violation(s)

On April 15, 2016, Bell served Kmart Corporation ("Kmart"), Plumbing Technologies, and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *et seq.*" (the "Notice"). The Notice provided Plumbing Technologies and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Plumbing Technologies was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, for failing to warn consumers and customers that the Covered

Products exposed users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.5 No Admission

Plumbing Technologies denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Covered Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement is or shall be construed as an admission by Plumbing Technologies of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Plumbing Technologies of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Plumbing Technologies. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Plumbing Technologies maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Covered Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.

1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Settlement Agreement is last executed by the Parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation of Covered Products

Commencing on the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Plumbing Technologies shall only ship, sell, or offer for sale in California, reformulated Covered Products pursuant to Section 2.2 or Covered Products that are labeled with a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Section 2.3. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "Reformulated Covered Products" are Covered Products that meet the standard set forth in Section 2.2 below.

2.2 Reformulation Standard

“Reformulated Covered Products” shall mean Covered Products that contain less than or equal to 1,000 parts per million (“ppm”) of DEHP when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

Commencing on the Effective Date, Plumbing Technologies shall, for all Covered Products it sells or distributes and which is intended for sale in California that are not Reformulated Covered Products, or which Plumbing Technologies has reason to believe will be shipped or sold in California, provide clear and reasonable warnings as set forth in subsections 2.3(a) and (b) below. The warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user is reasonably likely to understand to which specific Covered Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting warning text and/or methods of transmission different than those set forth above, Plumbing Technologies shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement.

(a) Retail Store Sales

(i) Covered Product Labeling. Plumbing Technologies shall affix a warning to the packaging, labeling or directly on each Covered Product sold in California by Plumbing Technologies that states:

[PROPOSITION 65] WARNING:

This product contains chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects, or other reproductive harm.

The bracketed text may, but is not required to, be used.

2.4 Sell-Through Period

Notwithstanding anything else in this Settlement Agreement, Covered Products that were manufactured prior to the Effective Date shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to Section 5 of this Settlement Agreement, without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligations of Plumbing Technologies as set forth in this Settlement Agreement, including but not limited to Section 2, do not apply to the Covered Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date.

3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Plumbing Technologies shall pay a total of \$1,500.00 in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Bell. Each penalty payment shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.2 below.

3.1 Civil Penalty

Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Plumbing Technologies shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,125.00; and (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Bell" in the amount of \$375.00. All penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.2 below.

3.2 Payment Procedures

(a) Issuance of Payments. Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Bell, pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

(b) Copy of Payments to OEHHA. Plumbing Technologies agrees to provide Bell's counsel with a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Bell, to be delivered to the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(C) Tax Documentation. Plumbing Technologies agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) "Ema Bell" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided within ten (10) days after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties;

(ii) “Brodsky & Smith, LLC” (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) “Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment” 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

The Parties acknowledge that Bell and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Bell then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Bell and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Under these legal principles, Plumbing Technologies shall reimburse Bell’s counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to Plumbing Technologies’ attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Plumbing Technologies shall issue a check payable to “Brodsky & Smith, LLC” in the amount of \$16,500.00 for delivery to the following address:

Evan Smith, Esquire
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
Two Bala Plaza, Ste. 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

5.1 Release of Plumbing Technologies, Kmart, and Downstream Customers and Entities

Bell acting on her own behalf, releases Plumbing Technologies, Kmart, and each of their respective affiliates and subsidiaries, parents, directors, officers, agents,

employees, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, successors, and assigns and each entity to whom Plumbing Technologies, and/or Kmart directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, marketplace retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date based on their failure to warn about alleged exposures to the chemical DEHP that is contained in the Covered Products, and was distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Plumbing Technologies, and/or Kmart to customers and consumers in the State of California. This settlement is a full, final and binding resolution of all claims that were or could have been asserted against Plumbing Technologies, Kmart and/or the Releasees for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to DEHP contained in the Covered Products, by Bell or on behalf of her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assigns (collectively, the "Releasers").

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Section(s) 3 and 4 above, Bell, on behalf of herself and the Releasers, hereby covenant not to sue and waive any right to institute, participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and provide a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands against Plumbing Technologies, Kmart and/or the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to the chemical DEHP in the Covered Products.

5.2 Plumbing Technologies' Release of Bell

Plumbing Technologies, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims

against Bell, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Bell and/or her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Covered Products.

5.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. Bell on behalf of herself only, on one hand, and Plumbing Technologies, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 5.1 and 5.2 above may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Bell and Plumbing Technologies each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

5.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65

Compliance by Plumbing Technologies with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to DEHP in the Covered Products as set forth in the Notice.

5.5 Public Benefit

It is Plumbing Technologies' understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Plumbing Technologies under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, section 3201. As such, it is the intent of Plumbing Technologies that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Plumbing Technologies' failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to DEHP with respect to the Covered Products it has distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such distribution or sale within the scope of this Agreement, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Plumbing Technologies is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Product, Plumbing Technologies shall provide written notice to Bell of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Product is so affected.

8. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For Plumbing Technologies:

John H. Shore
Davis & Kuelthau, s.c.
300 North Corporate Drive, Suite 150
Brookfield, WI 53045

For Bell:

Evan J. Smith
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Bell agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

12. AUTHORIZATION


The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 11/16/2016

Date: 11/16/2016

By: 
Ema Bell

By: 
Rlumbing Technologies, LLC