| 1 | | |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | SUPERIOR COURT OF THE S | TATE OF CALIFORNIA |
| 9 | FOR THE COUNTY (| OF ALAMEDA |
| 10 | | LG N DG 16 020022 |
| 11 | CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, | Case No. RG 16-829822 |
| 12 | Plaintiff, | |
| 13 | v. | [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. |
| 14 | ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC., et al., | AS TO ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. |
| 15 | Defendants. | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 Document Prepared | - 1 - | |
| ON RECYCLED PAPER | CONSENT JUDGMENT – ACH FOOD COMP | ANIES, INC. – CASE NO. RG 16-829822 |

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The Parties to this Consent Judgment are the Center For Environmental Health ("CEH"), a California non-profit corporation, and ACH Food Companies, Inc. ("Defendant"). CEH and Defendant (the "Parties") enter into this Consent Judgment to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against Defendant as set forth in the operative complaint ("Complaint") in the above-captioned matter. This Consent Judgment covers the lead content of Indian pastes and sauces containing ginger ("Covered Products"), including but not limited to those listed on Exhibit 1 attached hereto, that are sold, distributed or offered for sale by Defendant in the State of California. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products include chutney, pickle and relish products, as well as meal kits supplied by Defendant that include Indian sauces and pastes as components.
- 1.2 On June 14, 2016, CEH provided a 60-day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000 and to Defendant, alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 by exposing persons to lead and lead compounds ("Lead") contained in Covered Products without first providing a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning.
- 1.3 Defendant is a corporation or other business entity that distributes, sells or offers for sale Covered Products that are sold in the State of California.
- 1.4 On September 2, 2016, CEH filed the Complaint in the above-captioned matter, naming Defendant as a defendant in the action.
- 1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the

Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant.

1.6 Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising and resolving issues disputed in this Action.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

- 2.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the Reformulation Date for each Covered Product set forth below, Defendant shall not purchase, manufacture, ship, or sell Covered Products that will be sold or offered for sale in California that contain a concentration of more than the Reformulation Level set forth below in parts per billion ("ppb") Lead by weight, such concentration to be determined by use of a test performed by an accredited laboratory using inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS) equipment with a level of detection of no greater than 50% of the Reformulation Level that meets standard laboratory QA/QC requirements.
- 2.1.1 For Covered Products that are Indian sauce products, including but not limited to those identified as such on Exhibit 1 ("Sauce Products"), the Reformulation Level shall be 25 ppb. As set forth in Section 2.2, no Sauce Product may have a suggested serving size exceeding one-quarter cup or 70 grams (g).
- 2.1.2 For Covered Products that are Indian paste products, including but not limited to those identified as such on Exhibit 1 ("Paste Products"), the Reformulation Level shall be 100 ppb. As set forth in Section 2.2, no Paste Product may have a suggested serving size exceeding one (1) tablespoon or 18 g. Covered Products that contain both Sauce Products and

DCUMET PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

Paste Products (i.e., Patak's 3 Simple Steps meal kits) shall be deemed compliant if the Non-Sauce Product and Sauce Product components comply with their respective reformulation levels.

- 2.1.3 For Covered Products that are Indian pickle relish and chutney products, including but not limited to those identified as such on Exhibit 1 ("Relish Products"), the Reformulation Level shall be 60 ppb. As set forth in Section 2.2, no Relish Product may have a suggested serving size exceeding one (1) tablespoon or 21 g.
 - 2.1.4 The Reformulation Date for a Covered Product shall be:
- 2.1.4.1 For Covered Products not listed on Exhibit 1 and Covered Products identified on Exhibit 1 as Category A Covered Products the Reformulation Date shall be the date this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court (the "Effective Date").
- 2.1.4.2 For Covered Products identified on Exhibit 1 as Category B

 Covered Products the Reformulation Date shall be the date one year after this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court (the "Effective Date").
- 2.1.4.3 For Covered Products identified on Exhibit 1 as Category C Covered Products the Reformulation Date shall be the date eighteen months after this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court (the "Effective Date").
- 2.2 **Serving Size Modifications**. Defendant shall modify the Nutrition Facts Panel on the Covered Products and all other references to the serving size of the Covered Products as set forth in this Section. For Sauce Products, the suggested serving size shall be one-quarter (1/4) cup and no greater than 70 grams. For Paste Products, the suggested serving size shall be one (1) tablespoon and no greater than 18 grams. For Relish Products, the suggested serving size shall be one (1) tablespoon and no greater than 21 grams. Any recommended preparations or recipes on the labels or other printed marketing or promotional materials for the Covered Products designed and produced after the Effective Date, or on internet, digital or other non-print marketing or promotional materials for the Covered Products that are produced by on behalf of Defendant after October 8, 2018, shall reflect ingredient quantities reasonably consistent with and not more than

2.3

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

3. **ENFORCEMENT**

3.1 **General Enforcement Provisions**. CEH may, by motion or application for an order to show cause before this Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent Judgment. Any action to enforce alleged violations of Section 2.1 by Defendant shall be brought exclusively pursuant to this Section 3, and be subject to the meet and confer requirement of Section 3.2.4 if applicable.

125% of the suggested serving size. The Parties agree that a paste product recipe calling for four

continue to take, or cause to be taken, good faith and commercially reasonable efforts to further

reduce the Lead content of its Covered Products such that the Sauce and Relish Products have a

consistent Lead content of 8 ppb or less and that the Paste Products have a consistent Lead

content of 28 ppb or less. These efforts shall include, at a minimum, efforts to further adjust

recipes and formulas that will reduce Lead content in Covered Products and attempts to secure

Covered Product ingredients such as ginger with lower Lead content. Within fifteen (15) days of

the Effective Date, and annually thereafter for two more years, Defendant shall submit to CEH a

this paragraph. If Defendant has test results demonstrating to CEH's reasonable satisfaction that

all of its Covered Products have a consistent Lead content of 8 ppb or less for Sauce Products and

Relish Products and 28 ppb or less for Paste Products and it provides such documentation to

CEH, or if CEH and Defendant otherwise agree in writing, then Defendant need not submit any

written report of the activities it has undertaken to effectuate its good faith commitment under

Good Faith Commitment to Pursue Further Lead Reduction. Defendant shall

tablespoons that makes three to four servings complies with this requirement.

3.2 **Enforcement of Reformulation Commitment.**

subsequent annual reports to CEH pursuant to this paragraph.

3.2.1 Notice of Violation. In the event that CEH identifies a Covered Product for which CEH has laboratory test results showing that the Covered Product has a Lead level exceeding of the Reformulation Level, CEH may issue a Notice of Violation pursuant to this Section.

3.2.2 <u>Service of Notice of Violation and Supporting Documentation.</u>

3.2.2.1 A Notice of Violation issued pursuant to Section 3.2.1 shall be sent to the person(s) identified in Section 7.2 to receive notices for Defendant, and must be served within sixty (60) days of the date the Covered Products at issue were purchased or otherwise acquired by CEH, provided, however, that CEH may have up to an additional sixty (60) days to send the Notice of Violation if, notwithstanding CEH's good faith efforts, the test data required by Section 3.2.2.2 below cannot be obtained by CEH from its laboratory before expiration of the initial sixty (60) day period.

3.2.2.2 The Notice of Violation shall, at a minimum, set forth: (a) the date the alleged violation was observed; (b) the location at which the Covered Products were offered for sale; (c) a description of the Covered Products giving rise to the alleged violation, including the name and address of the retail entity from which the sample was obtained and if available information that identifies the product lot; and (d) all test data obtained by CEH regarding the Covered Products.

- 3.2.3 <u>Notice of Election of Response</u>. No more than thirty (30) days after service of a Notice of Violation, Defendant shall provide written notice to CEH whether it elects to contest the allegations contained in a Notice of Violation ("Notice of Election"). Failure to provide a Notice of Election within thirty (30) days of service of a Notice of Violation shall be deemed an election to contest the Notice of Violation.
- 3.2.3.1 If a Notice of Violation is contested, the Notice of Election shall include all then-available documentary evidence regarding the alleged violation, including all test data, if any is available. If Defendant or CEH later acquires additional test or other data regarding the alleged violation, it shall notify the other party and promptly provide all such data or information to the party.
- 3.2.4 <u>Meet and Confer.</u> If a Notice of Violation is contested, CEH and Defendant shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve their dispute. Within thirty (30) days of serving a Notice of Election contesting a Notice of Violation, Defendant may withdraw the

original Notice of Election contesting the violation and serve a new Notice of Election to not contest the violation, provided, however, that, in this circumstance, Defendant shall pay \$2,500 in addition to any payment required under this Consent Judgment. At any time, CEH may withdraw a Notice of Violation, in which case for purposes of this Section 3.2 the result shall be as if CEH never issued any such Notice of Violation. If no informal resolution of a Notice of Violation results within thirty (30) days of a Notice of Election to contest, CEH may file an enforcement motion or application pursuant to Section 3.1. In any such proceeding, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, attorneys' fees or other remedies are provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment.

3.2.5 <u>Non-Contested Notices</u>. If Defendant elects to not contest the allegations in a Notice of Violation, it shall undertake corrective action(s) and make payments, if any, as set forth below.

3.2.5.1 Defendant shall include in its Notice of Election a detailed description with supporting documentation of the corrective action(s) that it has undertaken or proposes to undertake to address the alleged violation. Any such correction shall, at a minimum, provide reasonable assurance that all Covered Products having the same lot number as that of the Covered Product identified in CEH's Notice of Violation (the "Noticed Covered Product") will not be thereafter sold or offered for sale to California consumers, that the Noticed Covered Products are removed from the California market and that Defendant has sent instructions to any of the stores and/or customers that offer the Noticed Covered Products for sale to cease offering the Noticed Covered Products for sale to California consumers and to either return all such Noticed Covered Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy such Noticed Covered Products. Defendant shall keep and make available to CEH for inspection and copying records any correspondence regarding the market withdrawal and destruction of the Noticed Covered Products. If there is a dispute over the corrective action, Defendant and CEH shall meet and confer before seeking any remedy in court. In no case shall CEH issue more than one Notice of Violation per manufacturing lot of a type of Covered Product.

3.2.5.2 Defendant may be excused from the recall obligation described in Section 3.2.5.1 (but not the monetary payments, if any, required by this Section 3) if Defendant produces all test results from the same lot as that of the Noticed Covered Product and:

- A. There a minimum of five test results;
- B. No single test result is more than 125% greater than the applicable Reformulation Level; and
- C. The arithmetic average of all test results is below the applicable Reformulation Level.
- 3.2.5.3 If the Notice of Violation is the first, second, third or fourth Notice of Violation received by Defendant under Section 3.2.1 that was not successfully contested or withdrawn, then Defendant shall pay \$10,000 for each Notice of Violation. If Defendant has received more than four (4) Notices of Violation under Section 3.2.1 that were not successfully contested or withdrawn, then Defendant shall pay \$15,000 for each Notice of Violation. If Defendant produces with its Notice of Election test data for the Covered Product that: (i) was conducted in the year prior to the date CEH purchased the Covered Product that is the subject of the Notice of Violation; (ii) was conducted on the Covered Product that was the subject of the Notice of Violation; and (iii) demonstrates Lead levels below the Reformulation Level, then any payment under this Section shall be reduced by fifty percent (50%).
- 3.2.6 <u>Payments</u>. Any payments under Section 3.2 shall be made by check payable to the "Lexington Law Group" and shall be paid within thirty (30) days of service of a Notice of Election triggering a payment and which shall be used as reimbursement for costs for investigating, preparing, sending and prosecuting Notices of Violation, and to reimburse attorneys' fees and costs incurred in connection with these activities.
- 3.3 **Repeat Violations.** If Defendant has received four (4) or more Notices of Violation concerning the same type (as identified by the same UPC code) of Covered Product that were not successfully contested or withdrawn in any twelve (12) month period then, at CEH's option, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, attorneys' fees or other remedies

that are provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment. Prior to seeking such relief, CEH shall meet and confer with Defendant for at least thirty (30) days to determine if Defendant and CEH can agree on measures that Defendant can undertake to prevent future violations.

- 4.1 **Payments by Defendant.** On or before five (5) days after the entry of this Consent Judgment, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$345,000 as a settlement payment as further set forth in this Section
- 4.2 **Allocation of Payments.** The total settlement amount for Defendant shall be paid in four (4) separate checks in the amounts specified below and delivered as set forth below. Any failure by Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late fee to be paid by Defendant in the amount of \$100 for each day the full payment is not received after the applicable payment due date set forth in Section 4.1. The late fees required under this Section shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys' fees, in an enforcement proceeding brought pursuant to Section 3 of this Consent Judgment. The funds paid by Defendant shall be allocated as set forth below between the following categories and made payable as follows:
- 4.2.1 A civil penalty in the amount of \$62,800 pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(b). The civil penalty payment shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code \$25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty payment for \$47,100 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Attn: Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment

27

P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Attn: Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street, MS #19B Sacramento, CA 95814

The CEH portion of the civil penalty payment for \$15,700 shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

4.2.2 An Additional Settlement Payment ("ASP") to CEH in the amount of \$47,100 pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3204. CEH intends to restrict use of the ASPs received from the Consent Judgment to CEH's Toxics in Food Fund and to use such funds to support CEH programs and activities that seek to educate the public about lead and other toxic chemicals in food, to work with the food industry and agriculture interests to reduce exposure to lead and other toxic chemicals in food, and to thereby reduce the public health impacts and risks of exposure to lead and other toxic chemicals in food sold in California. CEH shall obtain and maintain adequate records to document that ASPs are spent on these activities and CEH agrees to provide such documentation to the Attorney General within thirty days of any request from the Attorney General. The payment pursuant to this Section shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

4.2.3 A reimbursement of a portion of CEH's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs in the total amount of \$235,100. The attorneys' fees and cost reimbursement check shall be made payable to the Lexington Law Group and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3317175. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

4.2.4 To summarize, Defendant shall deliver checks made out to the payees and in the amounts set forth below:

| Payee | Type | Amount | Deliver To |
|---------------------------------|--------------|-----------|-------------------------|
| ОЕННА | Penalty | \$47,100 | OEHHA per Section 4.2.1 |
| Center For Environmental Health | Penalty | \$15,700 | LLG |
| Center For Environmental Health | ASP | \$47,100 | LLG |
| Lexington Law Group | Fee and Cost | \$235,100 | LLG |

5. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION

- 5.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this Court upon motion and in accordance with law.
- 5.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to modify the Consent Judgment.

6. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE

- 6.1 Provided that Defendant complies in full with its obligations under Section 4 hereof, this Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH on behalf of itself and the public interest and Defendant and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, agents, shareholders, successors, assigns, and attorneys ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities to which Defendant distributes or sells Covered Products, such as distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, licensors and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any violation of Proposition 65 based on failure to warn about alleged exposure to Lead contained in Covered Products listed on Exhibit A that were sold, distributed or offered for sale by Defendant prior to the Effective Date.
 - 6.2 Provided that Defendant complies in full with its obligations under Section 4 hereof,

| 1 | CEH, for itself, its agents, successors and assigns, releases, waives and forever discharges any | | |
|----|--|--|--|
| 2 | and all claims against Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Downstream Defendant Releasees | | |
| 3 | arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that | | |
| 4 | have been or could have been asserted by CEH individually or in the public interest regarding the | | |
| 5 | failure to warn about exposure to Lead arising in connection with Covered Products listed on | | |
| 6 | Exhibit A that were manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant prior to the Effective Date. | | |
| 7 | 6.3 Provided that Defendant complies in full with its obligations under Section 4 | | |
| 8 | hereof, compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and Defendant | | |
| 9 | Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant, Defendant Releasees | | |
| 10 | and Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about Lead in | | |
| 11 | Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant after the Effective Date. | | |
| 12 | 7. PROVISION OF NOTICE | | |
| 13 | 7.1 When CEH is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the | | |
| 14 | notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to: | | |
| 15 | Eric S. Somers | | |
| 16 | Lexington Law Group 503 Divisadero Street | | |
| 17 | San Francisco, CA 94117 esomers@lexlawgroup.com | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | 7.2 When Defendant is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, th | | |
| 20 | notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to: | | |
| 21 | William F. Tarantino Eric Robben, Esq. | | |
| 22 | Morrison & Foerster LLP Senior Corporate Counsel 425 Market Street, Suite 3300 Associated British Foods NA | | |
| 23 | San Francisco 94105-2482 One Parkview Plaza, Suite 500 | | |
| 24 | wtarantino@mofo.com Oakbrook Terrace, IL 60181 ERobben@abfamericas.com | | |
| 25 | Any Party may modify the person and/or address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending the | | |
| 26 | other Party notice by first class and electronic mail. | | |
| 27 | other Larry hotice by first class and electronic man. | | |
| 28 | | | |

8. COURT APPROVAL

- 8.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective upon the date signed by CEH and Defendant, whichever is later, provided however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Settling Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.
- 8.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.

9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION

9.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

10. ATTORNEYS' FEES

- 10.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs unless the unsuccessful Party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure §§2016.010, *et seq*.
- 10.2 Notwithstanding Section 10.1, a Party who prevails in a contested enforcement action brought pursuant to Section 3 may seek an award of attorneys' fees pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure §1021.5 against a Party that acted with substantial justification. The Party seeking such an award shall bear the burden of meeting all of the elements of §1021.5, and this provision shall not be construed as altering any procedural or substantive requirements for obtaining such an award.
- 10.3 Nothing in this Section 10 shall preclude a party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

11.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding

of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein. There are no warranties, representations or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation, modification, waiver or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

12.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT

13.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.

14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS

14.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim against an entity that is not Defendant on terms that are different than those contained in this Consent Judgment.

| 1 | 15. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS | | |
|------------|---|--|--|
| 2 | 15.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by | | |
| 3 | means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to | | |
| 4 | constitute one document. | | |
| 5 | | | |
| 6 | IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED | | |
| 7 | AND DECREED | | |
| 8 | | | |
| 9 | Dated: Judge of the Superior Court | | |
| 10 | rauge of the superior court | | |
| 11 | | | |
| 12 | | | |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | | | |
| 15 | | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | | | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | | | |
| 28 ARED | - 15 - | | |

| 1 | IT IS SO STIPULATED: | |
|----------|--------------------------|--|
| 2 | CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL | |
| 3 | HEALTH | |
| 4 | 01: | |
| 5 | Van | |
| 6 | Signature | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | CHARLIZ PISARRO | |
| 10 | Printed Name | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | AGGOCIATE DIVECTOR | |
| 13 | Title | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 20 | Signature | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | Printed Name | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | Title | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |

- 16 -

CONSENT JUDGMENT – ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. – CASE NO. RG 16-829822

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

| 1 | IT IS SO STIPULATED: | |
|----------|--------------------------|--------|
| 2 | CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL | |
| 3 | HEALTH | |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | Signature | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | | |
| 10 | Printed Name | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | Title | |
| 14 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | Signature | |
| 20 | Signature | |
| 21 | IMAD BAZZI | |
| 22 | Printed Name | |
| 23 | C€o | |
| 24 | Title | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | - 16 - |

CONSENT JUDGMENT - ACH FOOD COMPANIES, INC. - CASE NO. RG 16-829822

EXHIBIT 1

Sauce Products By Category

| Product | Category | UPC Code |
|--------------------------------|----------|-------------|
| Sauce | | |
| Korma | A | 6927607032 |
| Korma 3 Simple Steps* | A | |
| Mild Curry | A | 6927607036 |
| Mango Chicken | A | 6927607035 |
| Tikka Masala Spicy Curry | A | 6927670067 |
| Tikka Masala Curry | A | 69274032511 |
| Tikka Masala 3 Simple Steps* | A | |
| Rogan Josh | A | 6927607033 |
| Jalfrezi | В | 6927607010 |
| Jalfrezi Spicy Curry | В | 6927670069 |
| Butter Chicken 3 Simple Steps* | С | |
| Butter Chicken Spicy Curry | С | 6927616996 |
| Butter Chicken | С | 6927607037 |
| Dopiaza | C | 6927607005 |
| Vindaloo Spicy Curry | C | 6927670071 |

^{*} As set forth in Section 2.1.2, 3 Simple Steps products are deemed compliant to the extent their respective Sauce and Non-Sauce components comply with the associated reformulation levels for each identified component.

Paste Products By Category

| Product | Category | UPC Code |
|---------------------------|----------|-------------|
| Tandoori Paste (Marinade) | A | 69276032153 |
| Tikka Masala Curry Paste | A | 69276032207 |
| Biryani Paste | A | 69276032405 |
| Madras Curry Paste | В | 69276032450 |
| Rogan Josh Paste | В | 69276201535 |
| Vindaloo Curry Paste | С | 69276032108 |
| Butter Chicken Paste | С | 69276169958 |
| Hot Curry Paste | C | 69276032009 |
| Mild Curry Paste | С | 69276032054 |

EXHIBIT 1

Relish Products By Category

| Product | Category | UPC Code |
|---------------------|----------|-------------|
| Mango Pickle | A | 69276012056 |
| Hot Mango Pickle | A | 69276012001 |
| Lime Pickle | A | 69276012155 |
| Hot Lime Pickle | A | 69276012100 |
| Hot Chile Pickle | A | 69276012209 |
| Hot Mixed Pickle | A | 69276012254 |
| Garlic Pickle | A | 69276012407 |
| Brinjal Pickle | A | 69276012605 |
| Sweet Mango Chutney | A | 69276020037 |
| Hot Mango Chutney | A | 69276020235 |
| Major Grey Chutney | A | 69276020136 |