

State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612

FORM JUS 1501
(03-01)

PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)

REPORT OF SETTLEMENT

Please print or type required information

Original Filing Supplemental Filing Corrected Filing

PARTIES TO THE ACTION	PLAINTIFF(S) Shefa LMV Inc.				
	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN SETTLEMENT Magid Glove & Safety Manufacturing Co., Inc.				
CASE INFO	COURT DOCKET NUMBER N/A		COURT NAME N/A		
	SHORT CASE NAME Shefa v. Magid				
REPORT INFO	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF Reformulation and/or Warning Labels				
	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY \$4,000	PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES \$12,500	PAYMENT: OTHER 0.00		
	WILL SETTLEMENT BE SUBMITTED TO COURT? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	IF YES, AFTER ENTRY OF JUDGMENT BY COURT, REPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT MUST BE SUBMITTED TO ATTORNEY GENERAL		DATE SETTLEMENT SIGNED 1 / 20 / 2016	For Internal Use Only
	COPY OF SETTLEMENT MUST BE ATTACHED				
FILER INFO	NAME OF CONTACT Daniel N. Greenbaum				
	ORGANIZATION Law Office of Daniel Greenbaum		TELEPHONE NUMBER (818) 809-2199		
	ADDRESS 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320		FAX NUMBER (424) 243-7698		
	CITY Van Nuys	STATE CA	ZIP 91406	E-MAIL ADDRESS dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com	

FILING INSTRUCTIONS: This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the settlement to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

BETWEEN

SHEFA LMV, INC.

AND

MAGID GLOVE & SAFETY MANUFACTURING CO., LLC

Shefa LMV, INC. (“Shefa”) and Magid Glove & Safety Manufacturing Co., LLC (“Defendant”), (Shefa and Defendant collectively referred to as, the “Parties”) enter into this agreement (“Settlement Agreement”) for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation to settle Shefa's allegations that Defendant violated the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 4 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”). The effective date of this Settlement Agreement shall be the date upon which it is fully executed by all Parties hereto (the “Effective Date”).

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Shefa is a California-based entity that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products.

1.2 Shefa alleges that Defendant manufactures, imports, sells, or distributes for sale in the state of California gloves that contain Diisononyl Phthalate (“DINP”) without first providing a clear and reasonable warning as required by Proposition 65.

1.3 DINP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

JAC

1.4 The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are gloves made with vinyl/PVC manufactured for, or distributed or sold by, Defendant to others, including, but not limited to, Handmaster Supertips Gloves, UPC: 049704011202 (the “Covered Products”).

1.5 On December 20, 2013, the Governor of California added DINP to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity.

1.6 This addition took place more than twelve (12) months before Shefa served its “60-Day Notice of Violation” which is further described below.

1.7 DINP is referred to hereafter as the “Listed Chemical”

1.8 On or about April 21, 2016, Shefa served Defendant, as well as certain relevant public enforcement agencies with a document entitled “60-Day Notice Of Violation” (“Notice”) advising of its intent to sue for violation of Proposition 65 relative to Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical.

1.9 The Notice alleged that Defendant violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn consumers in California that use of Covered Products exposes users to the Listed Chemical.

1.10 To the best of the Parties’ knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the same allegations as in the Notice against Defendant.

1.11 Defendant denies the material, factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that all of the products that it has sold and distributed in California, including the Covered Products, are and have been in compliance with all laws.

1.12 The Parties enter into this Settlement Agreement to settle, as set forth below, disputed claims between the Parties concerning the Parties’ and the Covered Products’ compliance with Proposition 65 (the “Dispute”).

1.13 By execution of this Settlement Agreement, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law, including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law regarding any violation of Proposition 65, or any other statutory, regulatory, common law, or equitable doctrine. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by any Party of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.

1.14 Nothing in this Settlement Agreement, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed, considered, offered, or admitted as evidence of an admission or evidence of fault, wrongdoing, or liability by Defendant, its officers, directors, employees, or parents, subsidiaries or affiliated corporations, in any administrative or judicial proceeding or litigation in any court, agency, or forum.

1.15 Except for the allegations settled and compromised, nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense that Shefa or Defendant may have against one another in any other pending legal proceeding as to allegations unrelated to the Dispute or claims released herein.

2.0 Release

2.1 This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution between Shefa, acting in its individual capacity, and not its representative capacity, on the one hand, and (a) Defendant, and its owners, parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, sister and related companies, employees, shareholders, members, officers, directors, insurers, attorneys, predecessors, successors, and assigns (collectively the "Releasees"), and (b) all entities to whom Releasees directly or indirectly provide, distribute, or sell the Covered Products only, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees,

cooperative members and licensees (“Downstream Releasees”), on the other hand, of any violation(s) or claimed violation(s) of Proposition 65 or any statutory or common law claim that has been, could have been or may in the future be asserted against the Releasees and Downstream Releasees regarding exposing persons to the Listed Chemical and the failure to warn about exposure to the Listed Chemical arising only in connection with the Covered Products manufactured, shipped, and/or otherwise distributed prior to the Effective Date, even if sold by Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date.

2.2 The Covered Products are limited to those placed in the chain of commerce by Defendant, whether sold by Defendant or any Releasee or Downstream Releasee.

2.3 Shefa, its past and current officers, directors, agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives and releases with respect to the Covered Products all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees) (collectively the “Claims”), against Releasees and/or Downstream Releasees that arise under Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that were or could have been asserted in respect of any Covered Products sold up to the Effective Date, including without limitation to the extent that such claims relate to Releasees' and/or Downstream Releasees' alleged exposure of persons to the Listed Chemical contained in the Covered Products or any failure by Releasees and Downstream Releasees to warn about exposures to the Listed Chemical contained in the Covered Products.



2.4 Shefa acknowledges that it is familiar with Section 1542 of Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Shefa, its past and current officers, directors, agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, in its individual and not representative capacity, expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which it may have under, or which may be conferred on it by the provisions of Civil Code § 1542 as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

3.0 Defendant's Duties

3.1 For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "Compliant Products" are defined as those Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical in a concentration less than or equal to 1000 parts per million ("ppm") (0.1%) when analyzed pursuant to a scientifically reliable application of U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or any other scientifically reliable methodology for determining the Listed Chemical content in a substance of the form of the Covered Products herein ("Reformulation Standard"), or those Covered Products exhibiting a warning in compliance with Proposition 65 ("Compliant

AMC

Warning”).

3.2 Defendant represents, agrees and promises to take all practicable efforts to reformulate any Covered Products manufactured after the Effective Date for sale in California to comply with the Reformulation Standard in Section 3.1.

3.3 With respect to existing Covered Products manufactured before reformulation, Defendant agrees, promises, and represents that it will take all practicable efforts to accomplish the following:

- (a) place a Proposition 65 warning on Covered Products shipped ninety (90) days or later after the Effective Date to any entity which Defendant reasonably believes may offer Covered Products for sale in California; or
- (b) notify, no later than ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, Defendant’s customers that Defendant reasonably believes may have retail outlets in California or may ship to retailers or consumers in California, and to whom Defendant shipped Covered Products any time after December 20, 2014 and before Compliant Products are shipped, that Covered Products sold into California are subject to Proposition 65 warning requirements.
- (c) Any notification provided under 3.3(b) above may either request the return or destruction of remaining stock in California, or offer to provide a Proposition 65 warning (such as a shelf sign or product stickers).

3.4 Defendant agrees, promises, and represents that, as of 90 days after the Effective Date, to the extent it ships or sells any Covered Products that have not been reformulated to meet the Reformulation Standard, to any customer it reasonably believes maintains retail outlets in

California or offers Covered Products for sale or shipment into California, it will provide Compliant Warnings with or on such Covered Products in compliance with Proposition 65 and its regulations, as such may be modified from time to time.

3.5 Compliant Warnings shall be provided in such a conspicuously and prominent manner as to be likely to be read and understood by the consumer prior to or at the time of the sale or purchase.

3.6 The Parties agree that either of the following warnings shall constitute a Compliant Warning for the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products:

(a) the text, **"WARNING: This product contains chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm"** as provided by existing regulations; or

(b) the text, **"WARNING This product can expose you to chemicals including DINP, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov."** accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016; or

(c) the text, **"WARNING Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov."** accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations

ABC

adopted on or about August 30, 2016.

3.7 The Parties agree that the specifications for Compliant Warnings in this Settlement Agreement are consistent with Proposition 65 and its regulations as of the date of this Settlement Agreement, and regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016 to become effective August 30, 2018.

3.8 If modifications or amendments to Proposition 65 or its regulations adopted after the Effective Date are inconsistent with, or provide warning specifications or options different from, the specifications in this Settlement Agreement, Defendant may modify the content and delivery methods of its warnings to conform to Proposition 65 or its regulations as modified or amended.

4.0 Payments

4.1 Defendant agrees, to pay a total of \$16,500.00 within fifteen (15) days of the Effective Date by separate checks apportioned as follows:

4.1.1 Attorneys' Fees and Costs: \$12,500.00 of such payment shall be paid to Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum, as Shefa's attorneys, for reasonable investigation fees and costs, attorneys' fees, and any other costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to Defendant's attention. The check shall be delivered to: Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406. By the Effective Date, Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum shall provide Defendant with its EIN.

4.1.2 Penalty: Defendant shall issue two (2) separate checks for a total amount of \$4,000.00 as penalties pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.12: (a)

one check made payable to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) in the amount of \$3,000.00, representing 75% of the total penalty; and (b) one check to Shefa LMV, LLC in the amount of \$1,000.00, representing 25% of the total penalty.

4.1.3 All payments shall be delivered to Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406. Shefa or its counsel shall deliver the OEHHA payment to OEHHA.

4.1.4 Tax Forms: Additionally, two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: The first 1099 shall be issued to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95184 (EIN: 68-0284486) in the amount of \$3,000.00. The second 1099 shall be issued in the amount of \$1,000.00 to Shefa and delivered to: Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406. Shefa shall provide its EIN within 15 days of the Effective Date.

5.0 Authority to Enter Into Settlement Agreement

5.1 Shefa represents that its signatory to this Settlement Agreement has full authority to enter into and legally bind Shefa to this Settlement Agreement.

5.2 Defendant represents that its signatory to this Settlement Agreement has full authority to enter into and legally bind Defendant to this Settlement Agreement.

6.0 Report of the Settlement Agreement to the Office of the Attorney General Of California

6.1 Shefa shall report this Settlement Agreement to the Attorney General's Office within five (5) days of the Parties' execution of this Settlement Agreement.

7.0 Execution in Counterparts and Facsimile

7.1 This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute the same document.

7.2 A facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature shall be as valid as the original.

8.0 Entire Agreement

8.1 This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and all related prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings.

8.2 No other agreements, oral or otherwise, exist to bind any of the Parties.

9.0 Modification of Settlement Agreement

9.1 Any modification to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and signed by the Parties.

10.0 Application of Settlement Agreement

10.1 This Settlement Agreement shall apply to, be binding upon, and inure to the benefit of, Shefa and the Releasees and Downstream Releasees identified in Section 2 above.

11.0 Enforcement of Settlement Agreement

11.1 Any party may file suit before the Superior Court of the County of Alameda, consistent with the terms and conditions set forth in paragraphs 11.2 and 11.3 of this Settlement Agreement, to enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Settlement Agreement. The prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs associated with such enforcement.

11.2 No action to enforce this Settlement Agreement may be commenced or maintained, and no notice of violation related to the Covered Products may be served or filed against Defendant by Shefa, unless the party seeking enforcement or alleging violation notifies the other party of the specific acts alleged to breach this Settlement Agreement at least 90 days before serving or filing any action or Notice of Violation and the entity receiving the notice fails to comply with the requirements set forth in Section 11.3 below. Any notice to Defendant must contain (a) the name of the product, (b) specific dates when the product was sold after the Effective Date in California without meeting the Reformulation Standard or containing a Compliant Warning, (c) the store or other place at which the product was available for sale to consumers, and (d) evidence that the Reformulation Standard was exceeded, and (e) any other evidence or other support for the allegations in the notice.

11.3 Within 30 days of receiving the notice described in Section 11.2, Defendant shall either (1) send the store or other place at which the product was available for sale to the public a letter directing that the offending product be immediately removed from inventory and returned to Defendant, or (2) refute the information provided under Section 11.2. Should the parties be unable to resolve the dispute, any party may seek relief under Section 11.1.

12.0 Notification Requirements

12.1 Any notice required or permitted hereunder shall be effective only if given in writing and delivered in person, certified or registered mail return receipt requested, or traceable overnight delivery service, to the following designees:

For Shefa:

Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.
Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum
7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320
Van Nuys, CA 91406

For Magid Glove & Safety Manufacturing Co., Inc.:

Wendy Manley, Esq.
Wendel, Rosen, Black & Dean LLP
1111 Broadway, 24th Floor
Oakland CA 94607

Any party may change its designee(s) for purposes of notification by providing written notice of such change pursuant to this section.

13.0 SEVERABILITY

13.1 If subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

14.0 GOVERNING LAW

14.1 The Terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

14.2 In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted or otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, any Covered Products that are so affected.

14.3 This Settlement Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon Shefa and Defendant and their respective, divisions, subdivisions, and subsidiaries, successors and assigns.

14.4 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of this Settlement Agreement and this Settlement Agreement is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties.

14.5 This Settlement Agreement was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel.

14.6 Each Party to this Settlement Agreement agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Settlement Agreement and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.

15.0 MODIFICATION

15.1 In the event that any future settlement agreement or court approved consent judgment entered into by the Parties involving another party, sets out a reformulation or compliance standard above that which is found in Section 3.1 above, for the Listed Chemical in substantially similar product, then upon written notice to Shefa, Defendant is entitled to a corresponding modification to the corresponding standard set forth in Section 3.1, with regard to the Covered Products of this Settlement Agreement.

15.2 In the event OEHHA designates a No-Significant Risk Level (“NSRL”) for the Listed Chemical, which Defendant asserts would allow for the Products to contain levels of the Listed Chemical in amounts greater than those set forth above in Section 3.1, Defendant may provide written notice to Shefa of any assertion and the Parties shall confer within 30 days to attempt to agree upon positional modification of this Settlement Agreement. Should such attempts at informal resolution of a modification fail, and in the event Defendant still intends to

change its reformulation obligations, Defendant will provide written notice to Shefa of its intent to adopt a modified compliance standard. Upon receipt of Defendant's notice, Shefa shall have the right to enforce the terms and conditions contained in the Settlement Agreement by motion or any other available remedy at law, with the sole issue to be adjudicated being the technical question of whether the NSRL would allow for a higher Listed Chemical content in the Products than that set forth in Section 3.1.

15.3 In the event that any future settlement agreement or court approved consent judgment entered into by Shefa involving another party, sets out a reformulation or compliance standard below that which is found in Section 3.1 above, for the Listed Chemical in substantially similar products, then upon written notice to Defendant, the Parties shall confer and exercise reasonable efforts to reach agreement on a corresponding modification to the corresponding standard set forth in Section 3.1, with regard to the Covered Products of this Settlement Agreement.

16.0 AUTHORIZATION

16.1 Each signatory to this Settlement Agreement certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Settlement Agreement and to enter into and execute the Settlement Agreement on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party.

16.2 The undersigned have read, understand and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

16.3 Except as explicitly provided herein, each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

DAC

AGREED TO:

Dated: 1/13/2017

SHEFA LMV, Inc.

By: 

Dated: 1/20/17

MAGID GLOVE & SAFETY
MANUFACTURING CO., INC.

By: 