

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,	)	Case No. RG 17-851466
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	<b>[PROPOSED] CONSENT</b>
	)	<b>JUDGMENT AS TO SMART &amp;</b>
v.	)	<b>FINAL STORES LLC</b>
	)	
RESER’S FINE FOODS, INC., <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	
	)	
	)	

**1. DEFINITIONS**

1.1 The “Complaint” means the operative First Amended Complaint in the above-captioned matter.

1.2 “Covered Products” means hash brown potato products, including but not limited to hash browns, hash brown patties, tater tots, and tater puffs sold to Settling Defendant by Mr. Dee’s, Inc. or its affiliates or successors. An initial list of the Covered Products is attached as Exhibit A hereto.

1.3 “Effective Date” means the date on which notice of entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court is served upon Settling Defendant.

1       **2.     INTRODUCTION**

2           2.1     The Parties to this Consent Judgment are the Center for Environmental Health, a  
3 California non-profit corporation (“CEH”), on the one hand, and Smart & Final Stores LLC  
4 (“Settling Defendant”), on the other hand. CEH and Settling Defendant (the “Parties”) enter into  
5 this Consent Judgment to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against Settling Defendant as set  
6 forth in the Complaint.

7           2.2     On or about January 12, 2017, CEH provided a 60-day Notice of Violation of  
8 Proposition 65 (the “Notice”) to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every  
9 county in California, the City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than  
10 750,000, and to Settling Defendant, alleging that Settling Defendant violated Proposition 65 by  
11 exposing persons in California to acrylamide contained in Covered Products without first  
12 providing a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning.

13          2.3     Settling Defendant is a corporation or other business entity that manufactures,  
14 distributes, sells, or offers for sale Covered Products that are sold in the State of California or has  
15 done so at times relevant to the Complaint.

16          2.4     On March 2, 2017, CEH filed the initial complaint in the above-captioned matter.  
17 On April 6, 2017, CEH filed the Complaint, naming Settling Defendant.

18          2.5     For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court  
19 has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal  
20 jurisdiction over Settling Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in  
21 the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent  
22 Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the  
23 Complaint based on the facts alleged therein and in the Notice with respect to Covered Products  
24 manufactured, distributed, and/or sold by Settling Defendant.

25          2.6     Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission against  
26 interest by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall  
27 compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission against interest  
28

1 by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Nothing in this  
2 Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense the  
3 Parties may have in any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the  
4 product of negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of  
5 settling, compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this action.

6 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

7 **3.1 Reformulation of Covered Products.** Upon the Effective Date, Settling  
8 Defendant shall not purchase, manufacture, ship, sell, or offer for sale Covered Products that will  
9 be sold or offered for sale in California that exceed the following acrylamide concentration levels,  
10 such concentration to be determined by use of a test performed by an accredited laboratory using  
11 either GC/MS (Gas Chromatograph/Mass Spectrometry), LC-MS/MS (Liquid Chromatograph-  
12 Mass Spectrometry), or any other testing method agreed upon by the Parties:

13 **3.1.1** The average acrylamide concentration of Covered Products as used per  
14 cooking instructions, shall not exceed, on average, 350 parts per billion (“ppb”) by weight (the  
15 “Average Level”). The Average Level is determined by randomly selecting at least 5 samples  
16 from 5 different lots of Covered Products (or the maximum number of lots available for testing if  
17 less than 5) during a testing period of at least 60 days.

18 **3.1.2** The acrylamide concentration of any individual unit, as used per cooking  
19 instructions, shall not exceed 500 ppb by weight (the “Unit Level”).

20 **4. ENFORCEMENT**

21 **4.1 General Enforcement Provisions.** CEH may, by motion or application for an  
22 order to show cause before this Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent  
23 Judgment. Any action to enforce alleged violations of Section 3.1 by Settling Defendant shall be  
24 brought exclusively pursuant to this Section 4, and be subject to the meet and confer requirement  
25 of Section 4.2.4 if applicable.

1           **4.2    Enforcement of Reformulation Commitment.**

2           4.2.1   Notice of Violation. In the event that CEH purchases a Covered Product in  
3 California that was sold or offered for sale by Settling Defendant with a best-by or sell-by (or  
4 equivalent) date more than 6 months after the Effective Date, and for which CEH has laboratory  
5 test results showing that the Covered Product exceeds the applicable Unit Level, CEH may issue  
6 a Notice of Violation pursuant to this Section.

7           4.2.2   Service of Notice of Violation and Supporting Documentation.

8           4.2.2.1   The Notice of Violation shall be sent to the person(s) identified  
9 in Section 8.2 to receive notices for Settling Defendant, and must be served within sixty (60) days  
10 of the later of the date the Covered Product at issue was purchased or otherwise acquired by CEH  
11 or the date that CEH can reasonably determine that the Covered Product at issue was  
12 manufactured, shipped, sold, or offered for sale by Settling Defendant, provided, however, that  
13 CEH may have up to an additional sixty (60) days to send the Notice of Violation if,  
14 notwithstanding CEH’s good faith efforts, the test data required by Section 4.2.2.2 below cannot  
15 be obtained by CEH from its laboratory before expiration of the initial sixty (60) day period.

16           4.2.2.2   The Notice of Violation shall, at a minimum, set forth: (a) the  
17 date the Covered Product was purchased; (b) the location at which the Covered Product was  
18 purchased; (c) a description of the Covered Product giving rise to the alleged violation, including  
19 the name and address of the retail entity from which the sample was obtained and pictures of the  
20 product packaging from all sides, which identifies the product lot; and (d) all test data obtained by  
21 CEH regarding the Covered Product and supporting documentation sufficient for validation of the  
22 test results, including any laboratory reports, quality assurance reports, and quality control reports  
23 associated with testing of the Covered Product.

24           4.2.3   Notice of Election of Response. No more than thirty (30) days after  
25 effectuation of service of a Notice of Violation, Settling Defendant shall provide written notice to  
26 CEH whether it elects to contest the allegations contained in a Notice of Violation (“Notice of  
27 Election”). Failure to provide a Notice of Election within thirty (30) days of effectuation of  
28

1 service of a Notice of Violation shall be deemed an election to contest the Notice of Violation.  
2 Upon notice to CEH, Settling Defendant may have up to an additional sixty (60) days to elect if,  
3 notwithstanding Settling Defendant's good faith efforts, Settling Defendant is unable to verify  
4 the test data provided by CEH before expiration of the initial thirty (30) day period.

5 4.2.3.1 If a Notice of Violation is contested, the Notice of Election shall  
6 include all documents upon which Settling Defendant is relying to contest the alleged violation,  
7 including all available test data. If Settling Defendant or CEH later acquires additional test or  
8 other data regarding the alleged violation during the meet and confer period described in Section  
9 4.2.4, it shall notify the other Party and promptly provide all such data or information to the Party  
10 unless either the Notice of Violation or Notice of Election has been withdrawn.

11 4.2.4 Meet and Confer. If a Notice of Violation is contested, CEH and Settling  
12 Defendant shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve their dispute. Within thirty (30) days of  
13 serving a Notice of Election contesting a Notice of Violation, Settling Defendant may withdraw  
14 the original Notice of Election contesting the violation and serve a new Notice of Election to not  
15 contest the violation, provided, however, that, in this circumstance, Settling Defendant shall pay  
16 \$2,500 in addition to any other payment required under this Consent Judgment. At any time,  
17 CEH may withdraw a Notice of Violation, in which case for purposes of this Section 4.2 the  
18 result shall be as if CEH never issued any such Notice of Violation. If no informal resolution of a  
19 Notice of Violation results within thirty (30) days of a Notice of Election to contest, CEH may  
20 file an enforcement motion or application pursuant to Section 4.1. In any such proceeding, CEH  
21 may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, attorneys' fees, or other remedies are provided by law  
22 for an alleged failure to comply with the Consent Judgment.

23 4.2.5 Non-Contested Notices. If Settling Defendant elects to not contest the  
24 allegations in a Notice of Violation, it shall undertake corrective action(s) and make payments, if  
25 any, as set forth below.

26 4.2.5.1 Settling Defendant shall include in its Notice of Election a  
27 detailed description with supporting documentation of the corrective action(s) that it has  
28

1 undertaken or proposes to undertake to address the alleged violation. Any such correction shall,  
2 at a minimum, provide reasonable assurance that all Covered Products having the same lot  
3 number as that of the Covered Product identified in CEH's Notice of Violation (the "Noticed  
4 Covered Products") will not be thereafter sold in California or offered for sale to California  
5 customers by Settling Defendant, and that Settling Defendant has sent instructions to any retailers  
6 or customers that offer the Noticed Covered Products for sale to cease offering the Noticed  
7 Covered Products for sale to California consumers and to return all such Noticed Covered  
8 Products to Settling Defendant. Settling Defendant shall keep for a period of one year and make  
9 available to CEH upon reasonable notice (which shall not exceed more than one request per year)  
10 for inspection and copying records of any correspondence regarding the foregoing. If there is a  
11 dispute over the corrective action, Settling Defendant and CEH shall meet and confer before  
12 seeking any remedy in court. In no case shall CEH issue more than one Notice of Violation per  
13 manufacturing lot of a type of Covered Product, nor shall CEH issue more than two Notices of  
14 Violation in the first calendar year following the Effective Date.

15                   4.2.5.2     If the Notice of Violation is the first, second, third, or fourth  
16 Notice of Violation received by Settling Defendant under Section 4.2.1 that was not successfully  
17 contested or withdrawn, then Settling Defendant shall pay \$15,000 for each Notice of Violation.  
18 If Settling Defendant has received more than four (4) Notices of Violation under Section 4.2.1  
19 that were not successfully contested or withdrawn, then Settling Defendant shall pay \$25,000 for  
20 each Notice of Violation. If Settling Defendant produces with its Notice of Election test data for  
21 the Covered Product that: (i) was conducted prior to the date CEH gave Notice of Violation;  
22 (ii) was conducted on the same type of Covered Product; and (iii) demonstrates acrylamide levels  
23 below the applicable Unit Level, then any payment under this Section shall be reduced by 100  
24 percent (100%) for the first Notice of Violation, by seventy-five percent (75%) for the second  
25 Notice of Violation, and by fifty percent (50%) for any subsequent Notice of Violation. In no  
26 case shall Settling Defendant be obligated to pay more than \$100,000 for all Notices of Violation  
27  
28

1 not successfully contested or withdrawn in any calendar year irrespective of the total number of  
2 Notices of Violation issued.

3 4.2.6 Payments. Any payments under Section 4.2 shall be made by check  
4 payable to the “Lexington Law Group” and shall be paid within thirty (30) days of service of a  
5 Notice of Election triggering a payment and shall be used as reimbursement for costs for  
6 investigating, preparing, sending, and prosecuting Notices of Violation, and to reimburse  
7 attorneys’ fees and costs incurred in connection with these activities.

8 4.3 **Repeat Violations**. If Settling Defendant has received four (4) or more Notices of  
9 Violation concerning the same type of Covered Product that were not successfully contested or  
10 withdrawn in any two (2) year period then, at CEH’s option, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs,  
11 penalties, attorneys’ fees, or other remedies that are provided by law for failure to comply with  
12 the Consent Judgment. Prior to seeking such relief, CEH shall meet and confer with Settling  
13 Defendant for at least thirty (30) days to determine if Settling Defendant and CEH can agree on  
14 measures that Settling Defendant can undertake to prevent future alleged violations.

15 **5. PAYMENTS**

16 5.1 **Payments by Settling Defendant**. Within ten (10) calendar days of the Effective  
17 Date, Settling Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$66,250 as a settlement payment as further set  
18 forth in this Section.

19 5.2 **Allocation of Payments**. The total settlement amount shall be paid in five (5)  
20 separate checks in the amounts specified below and delivered as set forth below. Any failure by  
21 Settling Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late  
22 fee to be paid by Settling Defendant to CEH in the amount of \$100 for each day the full payment  
23 is not received after the payment due date set forth in Section 5.1. The late fees required under  
24 this Section shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys’ fees, in an enforcement  
25 proceeding brought pursuant to Section 4 of this Consent Judgment. The funds paid by Settling  
26 Defendant shall be allocated as set forth below between the following categories and made  
27 payable as follows:  
28

1                   5.2.1   \$8,800 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b).  
2   The civil penalty payment shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code  
3   § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California’s Office of Environmental Health  
4   Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty  
5   payment for \$6,600 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification  
6   number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

7                                 For United States Postal Service Delivery:  
8                                                 Attn: Mike Gyurics  
9                                                 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
10                                                Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
11                                                P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B  
12                                                Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

13                                 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:  
14                                                 Attn: Mike Gyurics  
15                                                 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
16                                                 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
17                                                 1001 I Street, MS #19B  
18                                                 Sacramento, CA 95814

19                   The CEH portion of the civil penalty payment for \$2,200 shall be made payable to  
20   the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-  
21   3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San  
22   Francisco, CA 94117.

23                   5.2.2   \$6,600 as an Additional Settlement Payment (“ASP”) to CEH pursuant to  
24   Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, § 3204. CEH  
25   intends to restrict use of the ASPs received from this Consent Judgment to the following  
26   purposes: the funds will be placed in CEH’s Toxics in Food Fund and used to support CEH  
27   programs and activities that seek to educate the public about acrylamide and other toxic  
28   chemicals in food, to work with the food industry and agriculture interests to reduce exposure to  
acrylamide and other toxic chemicals in food, and to thereby reduce the public health impacts and  
risks of exposure to acrylamide and other toxic chemicals in food sold in California. CEH shall



1 obtain and maintain adequate records to document that ASPs are spent on these activities and  
2 CEH agrees to provide such documentation to the Attorney General within thirty (30) days of any  
3 request from the Attorney General. The payment pursuant to this Section shall be made payable  
4 to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-  
5 3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San  
6 Francisco, CA 94117.

7           5.2.3 \$50,850 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH’s reasonable attorneys’  
8 fees and costs. The attorneys’ fees and cost reimbursement shall be made in two separate checks  
9 as follows: (a) \$43,065 payable to the Lexington Law Group and associated with taxpayer  
10 identification number 94-3317175; and (b) \$7,785 payable to the Center for Environmental  
11 Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. These payments shall be  
12 delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

## 13 **6. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

14           6.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by  
15 express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court and prior notice to the  
16 Attorney General’s Office, or by an order of this Court upon motion and prior notice to the  
17 Attorney General’s Office and in accordance with law.

18           6.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment  
19 shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with the other Party prior to filing a motion to  
20 modify the Consent Judgment.

## 21 **7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

22           7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH on  
23 behalf of itself and the public interest and Settling Defendant and its parents, subsidiaries,  
24 affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, agents,  
25 shareholders, successors, assigns, and attorneys (“Defendant Releasees”), and all entities to which  
26 Settling Defendant directly or indirectly distributes or sells Covered Products, including but not  
27 limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, licensors, and licensees  
28

1 (“Downstream Defendant Releasees”), of any violation of Proposition 65 based on failure to warn  
2 about alleged exposure to acrylamide contained in Covered Products that were sold, distributed,  
3 or offered for sale by Settling Defendant prior to the Effective Date.

4 7.2 CEH, for itself, its agents, successors and assigns, releases, waives, and forever  
5 discharges any and all claims against Settling Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream  
6 Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or  
7 common law claims that have been or could have been asserted by CEH individually or in the  
8 public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to acrylamide arising in connection  
9 with Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Settling Defendant prior to the  
10 Effective Date.

11 7.3 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Settling Defendant shall  
12 constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Settling Defendant, Defendant Releasees and  
13 Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about acrylamide in  
14 Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Settling Defendant after the Effective  
15 Date.

16 **8. PROVISION OF NOTICE**

17 8.1 When CEH is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the  
18 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

19 Howard Hirsch  
20 Lexington Law Group  
21 503 Divisadero Street  
22 San Francisco, CA 94117  
hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com

23 8.2 When Settling Defendant is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent  
24 Judgment, the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:

1 Gary M. Roberts  
2 Dentons US LLP  
3 601 South Figueroa Street, Suite 2500  
4 Los Angeles, CA 90017-5704  
5 gary.roberts@dentons.com

6 with a Copy to  
7 General Counsel  
8 Smart & Final Stores, LLC  
9 600 Citadel Drive  
10 Commerce, CA 90040

11 Any Party may modify the person and/or address to whom the notice is to be sent by  
12 sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

13 **9. COURT APPROVAL**

14 9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective upon the date it is entered as an  
15 order of the Court. CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment  
16 and Settling Defendant shall support entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court.

17 9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or  
18 effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any  
19 purpose other than to allow the Court to determine if there was a material breach of Section 9.1.

20 **10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION**

21 10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
22 California.

23 **11. ATTORNEYS' FEES**

24 11.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action, motion, or application  
25 arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing Party's reasonable  
26 attorneys' fees and costs.

27 11.2 Nothing in this Section 11 shall preclude a party from seeking an award of  
28 sanctions pursuant to law.

**12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

12.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding  
of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,

1 negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein  
2 and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties  
3 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied,  
4 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party  
5 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise,  
6 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically  
7 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the  
8 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation,  
9 modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in  
10 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent  
11 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof  
12 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

13 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

14 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
15 Consent Judgment.

16 **14. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

17 14.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized  
18 by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and  
19 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.

20 **15. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

21 15.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim  
22 against any other entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent  
23 Judgment.

1 **16. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

2 16.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by  
3 means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to  
4 constitute one document.


5  
6 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND**  
7 **DECREED.**

8  
9  
10 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_  
11 Judge of the Superior Court

12  
13 **IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

14 Dated: 27 JUNE, 2018

**CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH**

15  
16   
17 \_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

18 CORNELIE PIZZARO  
19 \_\_\_\_\_  
Printed Name

20 ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR  
21 \_\_\_\_\_  
Title

22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: Jun 27, 2018

SMART & FINAL STORES LLC



Signature

Leland P. Smith

Printed Name

SVP

Title

## EXHIBIT A

Description
Hidden Valley Shredded Hash Browns
Hidden Valley Southern Style Hash Browns
Mr. Dee's Shredded Hash Browns
Mr. Dee's Golden Round Potatoes
Mr. Dee's Southern Style Hash Browns
Mr. Dee's Hash Brown Patties