

**State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting**

**Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612**

FORM JUS 1501  
(03-01)

**PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)**

**REPORT OF SETTLEMENT**

*Please print or type required information*

☐ Original Filing    ☐ Supplemental Filing    ☐ Corrected Filing

<b>PARTIES TO THE ACTION</b>	PLAINTIFF(S)				
	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN SETTLEMENT				
<b>CASE INFO</b>	COURT DOCKET NUMBER			COURT NAME	
	SHORT CASE NAME				
<b>REPORT INFO</b>	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF				
	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY		PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES		PAYMENT: OTHER
	WILL SETTLEMENT BE SUBMITTED TO COURT? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No		IF YES, AFTER ENTRY OF JUDGMENT BY COURT, REPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT MUST BE SUBMITTED TO ATTORNEY GENERAL		DATE SETTLEMENT SIGNED /    /
	<b>COPY OF SETTLEMENT MUST BE ATTACHED</b>				
<b>FILER INFO</b>	NAME OF CONTACT				
	ORGANIZATION			TELEPHONE NUMBER (       )	
	ADDRESS			FAX NUMBER (       )	
	CITY		STATE	ZIP	E-MAIL ADDRESS

**FILING INSTRUCTIONS:** This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the settlement to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

**SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

**BETWEEN**

**SHEFA LMV, INC.**

**AND**

**FAMILY DOLLAR, INC.**

Shefa LMV, Inc. (“Shefa”), on the one hand, and Family Dollar, Inc. and Midwood Brands, LLC (collectively “Defendants”), on the other hand, enter into this agreement (“Settlement Agreement”) for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation to settle Shefa’s allegations that Defendants violated the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”). Shefa and Defendants are referred to as the “Parties.” The effective date of this Settlement Agreement shall be the date upon which it is fully executed by all Parties hereto (the “Effective Date”).

**1.0      Introduction**

1.1      Shefa alleges that it is a California-based entity that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products.

1.2      Shefa alleges that Defendants manufacture, import, sell, or distribute for sale in the State of California jumper cables that contain Di-[2-Ethylhexyl] Phthalate (“DEHP”) without first providing a clear and reasonable warning as required by Proposition 65.

1.3      DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.4 The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are jumper cables manufactured, imported, distributed or sold by or for Defendants, including, but not limited to, 12' 10-Gauge Jumper Cable, SKU #1500102 (the "Covered Products").

1.5 On January 1, 1988, the Governor of California added DEHP to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer.

1.6 On October 24, 2003, the Governor of California added DEHP to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity.

1.7 These additions took place more than twelve (12) months before Shefa served its "60-Day Notice of Violation" which is further described below.

1.8 DEHP is referred to hereinafter as the "Listed Chemical."

1.9 On or about May 8, 2017, Shefa served Defendants, as well as certain relevant public enforcement agencies, with a document entitled "60-Day Notice Of Violation" ("Notice") advising of its intent to sue for violations of Proposition 65 arising from or related to Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical.

1.10 The Notice alleged that Defendants violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn consumers in California that use of Covered Products exposed users to the Listed Chemical.

1.11 To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the same allegations against Defendants.

1.12 Defendants deny the material, factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintain that all of the products that they have sold and distributed in California, including the Covered Products, are and have been in compliance with all laws.

1.13 The Parties enter into this Settlement Agreement to settle disputed claims between the Parties as alleged in the Notice and as set forth below concerning the Parties' and the

Covered Products' compliance with Proposition 65 (the "Dispute").

1.14 By execution of this Settlement Agreement, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law, including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law regarding any violation of Proposition 65, or any other statutory, regulatory, common law, or equitable doctrine. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission against interest by any Party of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.

1.15 Nothing in this Settlement Agreement, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed, considered, offered, or admitted as evidence of an admission against interest or evidence of fault, wrongdoing, or liability by Defendants, their officers, directors, employees, parents, subsidiaries, or affiliated corporations, or any person acting for Defendants, or any direct or indirect customer of Defendants who sold or sells the Covered Products, in any administrative or judicial proceeding or litigation in any court, agency, or forum.

1.16 Except for the allegations settled and compromised, nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense that Shefa or Defendants may have against one another in any other legal proceeding as to allegations unrelated to the Dispute or claims released herein.

## **2.0 Release**

2.1 This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution between Shefa, individually and *not* in its representative capacity, on the one hand, and (a) Defendants, and their owners, parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, sister and related companies, employees, shareholders, members, officers, directors, insurers, agents, attorneys, predecessors, successors, and assigns (collectively the "Releasees"), and (b) all entities to whom Releasees directly or indirectly provide, distribute, or sell the Covered Products, including but not limited to distributors,

wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (“Downstream Releasees”), on the other hand, of any violation(s) or claimed violation(s) of Proposition 65 or any statutory or common law claim that has been, could have been, or may in the future be asserted against the Releasees and/or Downstream Releasees regarding the failure to warn about exposure to the Listed Chemical arising in connection with the Covered Products manufactured, shipped, and/or otherwise distributed prior to the Effective Date, even if sold by Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date. The Parties agree that compliance with the terms of this Settlement Agreement by Defendants shall be deemed to be compliance with Proposition 65 by Releasees and Downstream Releasees with respect to any exposures to the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendants after the Effective Date.

2.2 Shefa, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, but not in its capacity as representative of the public, hereby waives and releases with respect to the Covered Products all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys’ fees) (collectively the “Claims”), against Releasees and/or Downstream Releasees that arise under Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that were or could have been asserted with respect to any Covered Products sold up to the Effective Date.

2.3 Shefa acknowledges that it is familiar with Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Shefa, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, in its individual and *not* representative capacity, expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which it may have under, or which may be conferred on it by the provisions of California Civil Code § 1542, as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

2.4 It is the Parties understanding that the commitments Defendants have agreed to herein, and the actions to be taken by Defendants under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant public benefit to othe general public, as set forth in California Civil Procedure Code section 1021.5 and California Aministrative Code, title 11, section 3201. As such, it is the Parties' intent that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Defendants', Releasees', or any Downstream Releasees' failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to the Listed Chemical with respect to the Covered Products that they have respectively manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute , sell or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant public benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Defendants are in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

### **3.0 Defendants' Duties**

3.1 Commencing on the Effective Date, Defendants shall only sell or offer for sale in California Covered Products that are Compliant Products. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, Compliant Products are (a) Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical in a concentration less than or equal to 1,000 parts per million ("ppm") (0.1%) when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or any other scientifically reliable methodology for determining the Listed Chemical content in a substance of the form of the Covered Products herein ("Reformulation Standard"); or (b) Covered Products exhibiting a warning in compliance with Proposition 65 ("Compliant Warning"). Defendants may rely upon their suppliers' test results in order to determine whether the Covered Products meet the Reformulation Standard.

3.2 Whenever a clear and reasonable warning is required under Section 3.1 for Covered Products offered for sale in the State of California, the warning, as described in Section 3.3, shall be provided in such a conspicuous and prominent manner as to be likely to be read and understood by the consumer prior to or at the time of the purchase or use.

3.3 The Parties agree that any of the following warnings shall constitute a Compliant Warning for the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products:

(a) **⚠ WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals, including DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov); or

(b) **⚠ WARNING:** Reproductive harm-[www.P65warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65warnings.ca.gov)

3.4 In lieu of the preceding warning content and methods set forth above, Defendants may use any warning content and method that complies with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, section 25600 *et seq.*, as amended August 30, 2016 and subsequently thereafter.

#### **4.0 Payments**

4.1 **Payment from Defendants.** Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Defendants shall pay or cause their vendor to make the Total Settlement Payment of \$10,000.00.

4.2 **Allocation of Payments.** The Total Settlement Payment shall be paid in three (3) separate checks made payable and allocated as follows:

4.2.1 **Civil Penalty.** Defendants shall pay or cause their vendor to pay \$2,000.00 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). The civil penalty shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to Shefa and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$1,500.00 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

**For United States Postal Service Delivery:**

Attn: Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B  
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

**For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:**

Attn: Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street, MS #19B  
Sacramento, CA 95814



The Shefa portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$500.00 shall be made payable to Shefa LMV, Inc. and associated with taxpayer identification number 81-0907002. This payment shall be delivered to the Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

4.2.2 **Attorneys' fees and Costs.** A reimbursement of Shefa's attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$8,000.00 payable to the "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum," and associated with taxpayer identification number 46-4580172. This payment shall be delivered to the Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

4.2.3 In the event that Shefa LMV, Inc., OEHHA, or The Law Office Of Daniel N. Greenbaum do not receive their respective portions of the Total Settlement Payment within fifteen (15) business days of the Effective Date, Defendants shall make all payments according to this Section 4.2 no later than ten (10) business days after receiving written notice from The Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum.

4.2.4 **Tax Forms:** Additionally, two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: The first 1099 shall be issued to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95184 (EIN: 68-0284486) in the amount of \$1,500.00. The second 1099 shall be issued in the amount of \$500.00 to Shefa and delivered to: Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

## **5.0 Report of the Settlement Agreement to the Office of the Attorney General**

5.1 Shefa shall report this Settlement Agreement to the Attorney General's Office within five (5) days of the Effective Date.

**6.0 Execution in Counterparts and Facsimile**

6.1 This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute the same document.

6.2 A facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature shall be as valid as the original.

**7.0 Entire Agreement**

7.1 This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and all related prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings.

7.2 No other agreements, oral or otherwise, exist to bind any of the Parties.

**8.0 Modification of Settlement Agreement**

8.1 Any modification to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and signed by the Parties.

**9.0 Application of Settlement Agreement**

9.1 This Settlement Agreement shall apply to, be binding upon, and inure to the benefit of, Shefa and the Releasees and Downstream Releasees as defined in Section 2 above. Defendants' compliance with this Settlement Agreement shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by the Releasees and Downstream Releasees with regard to the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products.

**10.0 Enforcement of Settlement Agreement**

10.1 Any Party may file suit before the Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles, consistent with the terms and conditions set forth in paragraphs 10.2 and 10.3 of this Settlement

Agreement, to enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Settlement Agreement.

10.2 No action to enforce this Settlement Agreement may be commenced or maintained, and no notice of violation related to the Covered Products may be served or filed against Defendants by Shefa, unless the Party seeking enforcement or alleging violation notifies the other Party of the specific acts alleged to breach this Settlement Agreement at least ninety (90) days before serving or filing any action or notice of violation and the entity receiving the notice fails to comply with the requirements set forth in Section 10.3 below. Any notice to Defendants alleging a new violation with respect to a Covered Product which is not subject to the releases of claims herein must contain (a) the name of the product, including SKU if applicable, (b) specific dates when the product was sold after the Effective Date in California without reformulation or a warning, (c) the store or other place at which the product was available for sale to consumers, (d) evidence that the Reformulation Standard was exceeded or warning not provided, and (e) any other evidence or other support for the allegations in the notice.

10.3 Within thirty (30) days (or such additional time as the Parties may mutually agree upon) of receiving the notice described in Section 10.2, Defendants and Shefa shall meet and confer on the alleged violation. If Defendants refute the alleged violation (for example, by establishing the Covered Product is subject to the releases of claims herein or by producing test results documenting the subject Covered Product meets the Reformulation Standard), no further action is necessary. If Shefa establishes the violation, then Defendants shall send the store or other place at which the product was available for sale to the public a letter directing that the subject product be immediately removed from inventory and returned to Defendants. Should the Parties be unable to resolve the dispute, any Party may seek relief under Section 10.1.

## **11.0 Notification Requirements**

11.1 Any notice required or permitted hereunder shall be effective only if given in writing and delivered in person, certified or registered mail return receipt requested, or traceable overnight delivery service, to the following designees:

For Shefa:

Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq.  
Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum  
7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320  
Van Nuys, CA 91406

For Defendants:

Marc Metcalf  
Sr. Counsel, Commercial and General Litigation  
Family Dollar  
500 Volvo Parkway  
Chesapeake, VA 23320

With a copy to:

Peg Carew Toledo  
Arnold & Porter  
Three Embarcadero Center | 10th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-4024

Any Party may change its designee(s) for purposes of notification by providing written notice of such change pursuant to this section.

## **12.0 SEVERABILITY**

12.1 If subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

## **13.0 GOVERNING LAW**

13.1 The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. This Settlement Agreement shall have no

application to Covered Products which are not sold to California consumers.

13.2 In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Defendants shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, any Covered Products that are so affected.

13.3 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of this Settlement Agreement and this Settlement Agreement is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties.

13.4 This Settlement Agreement was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel.

13.5 Each Party to this Settlement Agreement agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Settlement Agreement and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.

#### **14.0 AUTHORIZATION**

14.1 Each signatory to this Settlement Agreement certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Settlement Agreement and to enter into and execute the Settlement Agreement on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party.

14.2 The undersigned have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

14.3 Except as explicitly provided herein, each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

AGREED TO:

Dated: December 20 2018

By:   
SHEFA LMV, INC

Dated: December 20, 2018

By:   
Midwood Brands, LLC

Dated: December 20, 2018

By:   
Family Dollar, Inc.