

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)  
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC.  
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
Tel: (877) 534-2590  
Fax: (310) 247-0160

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

GABRIEL ESPINOSA,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
DO-ALL TRAPS, LLC, et al.,  
Defendant.

Case No.: RG17885033  
**CONSENT JUDGMENT**  
Judge: Sandra Bean  
Dept.: 301  
Hearing Date: July 30, 2018  
Hearing Time: 3:00 PM  
Reservation #: R-1969357

1           **1. INTRODUCTION**

2           1.1     **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Gabriel  
3 Espinosa acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Espinosa”) and Do-All Traps, LLC  
4 (“Do-All Traps” or “Defendant”) with Espinosa and Defendant collectively referred to as the  
5 “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Espinosa is an individual residing in California that seeks  
6 to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or  
7 eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Do-All Traps is alleged to be a  
8 person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code  
9 §§ 25249.6 et seq.

10           1.2     **Allegations and Representations.** Espinosa alleges that Defendant has exposed  
11 individuals to Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) from Youth Passive Muffs without providing  
12 clear and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65. DEHP is listed under Proposition 65 as a  
13 chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.

14           1.3     **Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about August 9, 2017, Espinosa served Do-  
15 All Traps, Big 5. Corp. and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day  
16 Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that  
17 Defendant was in violation of Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that  
18 Youth Passive Muffs exposed users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is  
19 diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On December 7, 2017, Espinosa filed a  
20 complaint (the “Complaint”) in the matter<sup>1</sup>.

21           1.4     For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
22 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Complaint filed in this matter, that  
23 venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter,  
24 and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all  
25 claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein  
26 and/or in the Notice.

27 \_\_\_\_\_  
28           <sup>1</sup> On May 11, 2018, defendant Big 5. Corp. was dismissed from the action.

1           1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in Espinosa’s Notice and  
2 Complaint and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment  
3 shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of  
4 law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission  
5 by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being  
6 specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the  
7 obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

8 **2. DEFINITIONS**

9           2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means Youth Passive Muffs that  
10 are manufactured, distributed and/or offered for sale in California by Do-All Traps.

11           2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date this Consent Judgment is  
12 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

13 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

14           3.1 As of the date this Consent Judgment is signed by both Parties, Do-All Traps shall  
15 not manufacture or order from any supplier any Covered Products intended for retail sale in  
16 California that contains DEHP on any component to which consumers are exposed in excess of  
17 0.1% (1,000 ppm) (hereinafter “Reformulated Products”) unless the Covered Product is  
18 accompanied by a warning that complies with Article 6 of Title 27 of the California Code of  
19 Regulations. Covered Products sold by Do-All Traps before the date this Consent Judgment is  
20 signed by both Parties may sell through without a warning even if not Reformulated Products. Until  
21 August 30, 2018, the warning shall consist of either:

22           (a) The statement: “WARNING: This product contains a chemical known to the State  
23 of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.”; or

24           (b) (1) A symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle  
25 with a bold black outline to the left of the word “warning” in bold all capital letters, followed  
26 by the statement “This product can expose you to chemicals including Di(2-  
27 ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and  
28

1 birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information, go to  
2 www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.”; or (2) a warning consisting of a symbol that is a black  
3 exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline to the left of the  
4 word “warning” in bold all capital letters, followed by the statement “Cancer and  
5 Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.”<sup>2</sup>

6 For Covered Products manufactured on and after August 30, 2018, the warning set forth in Section  
7 3.1(b) shall be used.

8 3.2 The warning provided pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be affixed to or printed on the  
9 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or  
10 automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared  
11 with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an  
12 ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained  
13 in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety  
14 warnings, if any, concerning the use of the product and shall be at least the same size as those other  
15 safety warnings.

16 **4. MONETARY TERMS**

17 4.1 **Civil Penalty.** Do-All Traps shall pay a Civil Penalty of \$3,000.00 pursuant to  
18 Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health  
19 & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California’s Office of  
20 Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the Civil Penalty  
21 remitted to Espinosa, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

22 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Do-All Traps shall issue two  
23 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$2,250.00; and  
24 (b) “Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Espinosa” in the amount of \$750.00. Payment owed to  
25 Espinosa pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:  
26

27 <sup>2</sup> The triangular symbol need only be in yellow where the sign, label, shelf tag or other  
28 transmission format is being printed in color for purposes of other language, symbols or designs.

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
2 Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
3 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
4 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

5 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly  
6 to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

7 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

8 Mike Gyurics  
9 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
10 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
11 P.O. Box 4010  
12 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

13 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

14 Mike Gyurics  
15 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
16 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
17 1001 I Street  
18 Sacramento, CA 95814

19 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC at the  
20 address set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

21 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Do-All Traps shall pay  
22 \$33,000.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") as complete reimbursement for Plaintiff  
23 Espinosa's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to  
24 Do-All Traps' attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement  
25 in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

26 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

27 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Espinosa  
28 acting on his own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Do-All Traps, and its parents,  
shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents,  
attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their  
predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they  
obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but  
not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, donees, licensors,

1 licensees retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members, including but not limited to Big 5 Corp.  
2 and its parents, shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives,  
3 agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates,  
4 and their predecessors, successors and assigns (“Downstream Releasees”), of all claims for  
5 violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to DEHP from Covered Products as set forth in the  
6 Notice, with respect to any Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Do-All Traps  
7 prior to the Effective Date. This Consent Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other  
8 person or entity, whether purporting to act in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be  
9 permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 that was  
10 alleged in the Complaint, or that could have been brought pursuant to the Notice against Do-All  
11 Traps or its Downstream Releasees of the Product including but not limited to (“Proposition 65  
12 Claims”). Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with  
13 Proposition 65 with regard to the Covered Products.

14           5.2     In addition to the foregoing, Espinosa, on behalf of himself, his past and current  
15 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative  
16 capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of  
17 legal action and releases Do-All Traps, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees from any  
18 and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts,  
19 contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and  
20 attorneys’ fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,  
21 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising  
22 from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Do-All Traps, Defendant Releasees  
23 or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,  
24 Espinosa hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which she now has, or in the  
25 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code,  
26 which provides as follows:

27           A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE  
28           CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER

1 FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF  
2 KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS  
3 SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

4 5.3 Do-All Traps waives any and all claims against Espinosa, his attorneys and other  
5 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been  
6 taken or made) by Espinosa and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of  
7 investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,  
8 and/or with respect to Covered Products.

8 **6. INTEGRATION**

9 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and  
10 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been  
11 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist  
12 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

13 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

14 7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
15 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or  
16 is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then  
17 Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and  
18 to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

19 **8. NOTICES**

20 8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided  
21 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-  
22 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any Party  
23 by the other Party at the following addresses:

24 For Defendant:

25 Bruce Nye, Attorney of Counsel  
26 Scali Rasmussen  
27 1901 Harrison Street, 14th Floor  
28 Oakland, CA 94612

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

And

For Espinosa:

Evan Smith  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
Beverly Hills, CA 90212

Any Party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT APPROVAL**

10.1 Espinosa agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment. Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

**11. MODIFICATION**

11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

**13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

**14. AUTHORIZATION**

14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date:

5/11/18

Date:

By:

GABRIEL ESPINOSA

By:

DO-ALL TRAPS, LLC

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

Dated:

Judge of Superior Court

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

**13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

**14. AUTHORIZATION**

14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.


**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 5-29-2018

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
GABRIEL ESPINOSA

By:  Steve Curnutte, CRO  
DO-ALL TRAPS, LLC

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court