

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352)  
2 Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113)  
3 BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC  
4 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
5 Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
6 Telephone: (877) 534-2590  
7 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

EMA BELL,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE BEAUTY COLLECTIVE, LLC,

Defendant.

Case No.: RG17882217

**CONSENT JUDGMENT**

Judge: Paul D. Herbert

Dept.: 20

Hearing Date: May 25, 2018

Hearing Time: 3:00 PM

Reservation #: R-1940025

1           **1. INTRODUCTION**

2           **1.1 The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Ema Bell  
3 acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Bell”) and The Beauty Collective, LLC,  
4 (hereinafter “Beauty Collective”), with Bell and Beauty Collective collectively referred to as the  
5 “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Bell is an individual residing in California who seeks to  
6 promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or  
7 eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Bell alleges that Beauty  
8 Collective is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health  
9 & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

10           **1.2 Allegations and Representations.** Bell alleges that Beauty Collective has exposed  
11 individuals to Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (“DEHP”) from cosmetic bags without providing clear  
12 and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65. DEHP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical  
13 known to the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity and cancer.

14           **1.3 Notices of Violation/Complaint.** On or about August 17, 2017, Bell served Beauty  
15 Collective and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled “60-Day Notice of  
16 Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that Beauty  
17 Collective was in violation of Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that the  
18 cosmetic bags exposed users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is  
19 diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On November 13, 2017, Bell filed a  
20 complaint in the matter as captioned above (“Complaint”).

21           **1.4** For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
22 jurisdiction over Beauty Collective as to the allegations contained in the complaint filed in this  
23 matter, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to  
24 approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding  
25 resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts  
26 alleged therein and/or in the Notice.

1           1.5     Beauty Collective denies the material allegations contained in Bell's Notice and  
2     Complaint and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment  
3     shall be construed as an admission by Beauty Collective of any fact, finding, issue of law, or  
4     violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an  
5     admission by Beauty Collective of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law,  
6     such being specifically denied by Beauty Collective. However, this Section shall not diminish or  
7     otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Beauty Collective under this Consent  
8     Judgment.

9     **2.     DEFINITIONS**

10           2.1     **Covered Products.** The term "Covered Products" means cosmetic bags that have  
11     been distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Beauty Collective, and that contain  
12     any of the following chemicals: DEHP, Di-isodecyl phthalate (DIDP); Diisononyl Phthalate  
13     (DINP); Butyl benzyl phthalate (BBP), Di-n-hexyl Phthalate (DnHP) and Di-n-butyl Phthalate  
14     (DBP) ("Listed Phthalates").

15           2.2     **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is  
16     entered as a Judgment of the Court.

17     **3.     INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

18           3.1     Commencing ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, Beauty Collective shall not  
19     manufacture or purchase for sale in California any Covered Product that contains more than 1,000  
20     parts per million Listed Phthalates, unless the Covered Product is accompanied by either of the  
21     following warning(s), or any other warning message that complies with 27 Cal. Code Regs. § 25603  
22     (effective August 30, 2018):

23           "WARNING: This product contains a chemical known to the State of California to cause  
24     cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm."

25           Or

26           "WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including Di(2-ethylhexyl)  
27     phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth  
28

defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to  
www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.”

3.2 The warning provided pursuant to Section 3.1 shall be affixed to or printed on the Covered Product’s packaging or labeling. The warning shall be prominently affixed to or printed on the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet and displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use.

#### **4. MONETARY TERMS: PAYMENT OF THE CIVIL PENALTY AND REIMBURSEMENT OF ATTORNEYS FEES AND COSTS**

4.1 **Attorney Fees.** Beauty Collective shall pay \$21,000.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC (“Brodsky Smith”) as complete reimbursement for Plaintiff Bell’s attorneys’ fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Beauty Collective’s attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

4.2 **Civil Penalty.** Beauty Collective shall pay a Civil Penalty of \$2,000.00 pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the remaining 25% of the Civil Penalty remitted to Bell, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

4.3 **Method of Payment.** Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Beauty Collective shall make a wire transfer payment to Brodsky & Smith, LLC in the amount of \$23,000.00 as full and final satisfaction of all monies due and owing pursuant to this Consent Judgment. Payment owed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following wire payment address:

Bank of America, N.A.  
100 West 33<sup>rd</sup> Street  
New York, NY 10001  
ABA Routing No. 026009593  
[International Banks can use SWIFT- BIC: BOFAUS3N]  
Account Name: Merrill Lynch

Account No. 6550113516  
Ref: For Final Credit 870-07119 Brodsky & Smith, LLC

4.3.1 Within fourteen (14) business days of the Effective Date, Brodsky & Smith, LLC shall issue two separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500.00; and (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Bell" in the amount of \$500.00. Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010  
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

## **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Bell acting in the public interest, and Beauty Collective and its parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members, including but not limited to The TJX Companies, Inc. and each of its subsidiaries and affiliates ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to Listed Phthalates from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice, with respect to any Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Beauty Collective prior to the Effective

1 Date. Compliance with the terms of this consent judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition  
2 65 with regard to the Covered Products.

3         5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Bell, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents,  
4 representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and not in her representative capacity,  
5 hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action  
6 and releases any Beauty Collective, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees  
7 from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations,  
8 debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and  
9 attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,  
10 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising  
11 from Covered Products manufactured distributed or sold by Beauty Collective or Defendant  
12 Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Bell hereby  
13 specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which she now has, or in the future may have,  
14 conferred by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides  
15 as follows:

16             A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE  
17 CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS FAVOR  
18 AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY  
19 HIM MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS SETTLEMENT WITH  
20 THE DEBTOR.

21         5.3 Beauty Collective waives any and all claims against Bell, her attorneys and other  
22 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been  
23 taken or made) by Bell and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of  
24 investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,  
25 and/or with respect to Covered Products.

## 26 **6. INTEGRATION**

27         6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and  
28 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been

merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

**7. GOVERNING LAW**

7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then Beauty Collective shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

**8. NOTICES**

8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; (ii) overnight courier; or (iii) electronic mail on any party by the other party at the following addresses:

For Beauty Collective:

Tim Cunningham  
CEO  
The Beauty Collective LLC  
PO Box 31605, Auckland 0741 New Zealand  
tim@qvs.co.nz

With a copy to:

Jeffrey Margulies  
Norton Rose Fulbright US LLP  
555 South Flower St.  
Forty First Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
jeff.margulies@nortonrosefulbright.com

And

For Bell:

Evan Smith  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
2 Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004  
esmith@brodskysmith.com

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to

1 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

2 **9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

3 9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of  
4 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and  
5 the same document.

6 **10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**  
7 **APPROVAL**

8 10.1 Bell agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health & Safety  
9 Code §25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and  
10 Beauty Collective agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

11 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the  
12 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case,  
13 the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within  
14 30-days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

15 10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an  
16 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent  
17 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on  
18 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

19 **11. MODIFICATION**

20 11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties  
21 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

22 **12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

23 12.1 A party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent  
24 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs unless  
25 the unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent  
26 Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil  
27 Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure Section 2016, et seq.  
28



1 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
2 pursuant to law.

3 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

4 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

7 14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
8 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
9 document and certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
10 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
11 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

12  
13 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

14  
15 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 14 February 2018

16 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
17 EMA BELL

By:   
BEAUTY COLLECTIVE LLC

18  
19 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

20  
21 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court

1 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
2 pursuant to law.

3 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

4 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
5 Consent Judgment.

6 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

7 14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
8 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
9 document and certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
10 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
11 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

12  
13 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

14  
15 Date: 4/5/18

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

16 By: 

By: \_\_\_\_\_

17 EMMA BELL

BEAUTY COLLECTIVE, LLC

18  
19 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

20  
21 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court