

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Ema Bell and Helen of Troy, L.P.

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Ema Bell (“Bell”) and Helen of Troy, L.P. (“Helen of Troy”). Together, Bell and Helen of Troy are collectively referred to as the “Parties.” Bell is an individual who resides in the State of California, and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Helen of Troy is considered a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code section 25249.6, et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations

Bell alleges that Helen of Troy has imported, distributed, and/or sold in the State of California vinyl storage bags associated with hair rollers, including but not limited to those associated with UPC No. 0 97954510266 (the “Products”), without requisite Proposition 65 warnings. Bell further alleges that such warnings are required because the Products contain the chemicals Diisononyl Phthalate (“DINP”) and/or di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (“DEHP”). DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical that is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects and other reproductive harm; DINP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

1.3 Notice of Violation(s)

On or about October 13, 2017, Bell served Helen of Troy, Ulta Salon Cosmetics & Fragrances, Inc., and Ulta Beauty (the Ulta entities collectively referred to hereinafter as “Ulta”), and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled “Notice of Violation of

California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, *et seq.*” (“Notice”). The Notice provided Helen of Troy and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Helen of Troy was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to provide Proposition 65 warnings to consumers that the Products exposed consumers in California to DINP and/or DEHP. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.4 No Admission

Helen of Troy denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all of its products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws, including Proposition 65. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Helen of Troy of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Helen of Troy of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Helen of Troy. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

1.5 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term “Effective Date” shall mean the date that this Settlement Agreement is signed by both parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation of the Products

Commencing on the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Helen of Troy shall only manufacture, import, or otherwise source or distribute for authorized sale in California, Reformulated Products as defined pursuant to Section 2.2 below or Products that are labeled with a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning pursuant to Section 2.3 below. Products to which

Helen of Troy has taken title prior to the Effective Date are exempted from the foregoing obligation and may be offered for sale in California and sold through by downstream distributors, dealers, and retailers, including but not limited to Ulta, with or without Proposition 65 warnings as previously packaged and received.

2.2 Reformulation Standard

“Reformulated Products” shall mean Products that contain less than or equal to 1,000 parts per million (“ppm”) each of DEHP, DBP, BBP, DnHP, DIDP, and DINP when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or equivalent testing methodologies authorized by government agencies for the detection of phthalate chemicals in consumer products.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

Commencing on the Effective Date, Helen of Troy shall, for all Products it distributes or sells and which are authorized by it for sale in California that are not Reformulated Products, affix a warning to the consumer-facing packaging or directly on each Product that states:

WARNING: This product contains chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer, and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

Or

WARNING: This product contains phthalate chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

Or

WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals, including DINP and DEHP, which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

The last warning statement shown above shall be used for any non-Reformulated Products manufactured after July 31, 2018, in which event it shall be preceded by a symbol consisting of a

yellow equilateral triangle outlined in bolded black and into which a bolded black exclamation point is inserted. (If yellow is not otherwise used on the Product's packaging, the triangle need not be yellow.)

Regardless of which warning statement is utilized, it shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions prior to purchase or use.

3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

3.1 In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Helen of Troy shall pay a total of \$2,000.00 in civil penalties pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) in accordance with this Section. This penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(l) and (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Bell. More specifically, within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Helen of Troy shall issue two separate checks for the civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,500.00 and with the memo line on the check indicating "Prop 65 Penalties- Bell v. Helen of Troy/DINP" (Helen of Troy may reference OEHHA's Tax Identification Number of 68-0284486 for this check); and (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Bell" in the amount of \$500.00 (for which Bell shall provide Helen of Troy a completed IRS Form W-9 with a tax identification number within two days following the Effective Date, if not beforehand). These checks shall be delivered as follows:

- (a) The check to Bell shall be delivered to the following address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire
Brodsky & Smith, LLC

Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

- (b) The check for OEHHA shall be delivered to one of the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

or

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Helen of Troy further agrees to provide Bell's counsel with a copy of its check payable to OEHHA along with its penalty payment to Bell.

4. **REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The Parties acknowledge that Bell and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of this Settlement Agreement had been mutually agreed upon. Bell then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Bell and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this Settlement Agreement. Under these legal principles, Helen of Troy shall reimburse Bell's counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and

bringing this matter to Helen of Troy's attention, and negotiating a settlement thereof. Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Helen of Troy shall issue a check payable to "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" in the amount of \$18,000.00 for delivery to the following address:

Evan Smith, Esquire
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
Two Bala Plaza, Ste. 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

To facilitate timely payment, within two days following the Effective Date, if not beforehand, Brodsky & Smith LLC shall provide Helen of Troy with a completed IRS Form W-9 with its tax identification number.

5. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 **Release of Helen of Troy and Downstream Retailers and Entities**

Bell, acting on her own behalf, releases Helen of Troy, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Helen of Troy directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products, including, but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, marketplace hosts, retailers (including, but not limited to Ulta), and their respective parents, affiliates, and subsidiaries, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on the failure to warn about alleged exposures to DINP and/or DEHP in the Products as distributed or sold by Helen of Troy prior to the Effective Date.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Section(s) 3 and 4 above, Bell, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, provides a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and

demands against Helen of Troy or the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of Proposition 65 or otherwise, with respect to the Products. In this regard Bell acknowledges that she is familiar with Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Bell is, in this regard, therefore expressly waiving and relinquishing any and all rights and benefits which she may have under, or which may be conferred on her by the provisions of, California Civil Code § 1542, as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that she may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

5.2 Helen of Troy's Release of Bell

Helen of Troy, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Bell, her attorneys, and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Bell and/or her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Products.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to DINP, DEHP or the Products, Helen of Troy shall provide written notice to Bell of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

8. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For Helen of Troy:

William J. Bass
Wbass@hotus.com
Helen of Troy
One Helen of Troy Plaza
El Paso, TX 79912

With a copy to:

Robert Falk
RFalk@mofa.com
Morrison & Foerster LLP
425 Market Street, 32 Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105

For Bell:

Evan J. Smith
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Bell agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

12. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained in this Settlement Agreement.


AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 12/1/17

By: 
Emma Bell

Date: Jan 10, 2018

By: 
Helen of Troy, L.P. by:
Helen of Troy Nevada
Corporation, General
Partner