

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352)
2 Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113)
3 BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC
4 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
5 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
6 Telephone: (877) 534-2590
7 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

ANTHONY FERREIRO,
Plaintiff,
v.
THE WEBSTAIRANT STORE, INC.,
Defendant.

Case No.: RG19005659
CONSENT JUDGMENT
Judge: Julia Spain
Dept.: 520
Hearing Date: July 18, 2019
Hearing Time: 2:00 PM
Reservation #: R-2081890

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony
3 Ferreiro acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Ferreiro”) and The Webstaurant Store,
4 Inc. (“The Webstaurant Store” or “Defendant”) with Ferreiro and Defendant collectively referred
5 to as the “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Ferreiro is an individual residing in California
6 who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by
7 reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. The Webstaurant
8 Store is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal.
9 Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

10 1.2 **Allegations and Representations.** Ferreiro alleges that Defendant has exposed
11 individuals to bisphenol A (BPA) from Webstaurant Store measuring cups without providing clear
12 and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65. BPA is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical
13 known to the State of California to cause reproductive toxicity.

14 1.3 **Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about May 14, 2018, Ferreiro served The
15 Webstaurant Store and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled “60-Day
16 Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that
17 Defendant was in violation of Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that The
18 Webstaurant Store measuring cups exposed users in California to BPA. No public enforcer has
19 brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On February 5, 2019,
20 Ferreiro filed a complaint in the matter against The Webstaurant Store (the “Complaint” or
21 “Action”).

22 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has
23 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Action, that venue is proper in the
24 County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the
25 enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which
26 were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notice.
27

1 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in the Notice and the Action
2 and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be
3 construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor
4 shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by
5 Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically
6 denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations,
7 responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

8 **2. DEFINITIONS**

9 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means The Webstaurant Store
10 measuring cups that are manufactured, distributed and/or offered for sale in California by The
11 Webstaurant Store.

12 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date this Consent Judgment is
13 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

14 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF; WARNINGS**

15 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is
16 signed by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that The Webstaurant Store
17 directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either: (a) be
18 Reformulated Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable
19 exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 and 3.4, below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a
20 “Reformulated Product” is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in §
21 3.2 below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated
22 Product.

23 3.2 **Reformulation Standard.** “Reformulated Products” shall mean Covered Products
24 that that are BPA-Free when analyzed pursuant to ATS 367 Rev. 0 by LC/MS/MS or other
25 methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining BPA
26 migration from a polycarbonate food or drinkware item.

1 3.3 **Clear and Reasonable Warning.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is signed
2 by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in
3 this §§ 3.3 and 3.4 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers,
4 imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There
5 shall be no obligation for Defendant to provide a warning for Covered Products that enter the stream
6 of commerce prior to the date this Consent Judgment is signed by both Parties. The warning shall
7 consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.3(a) or (b), respectively:

8 (a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

9 ⚠ **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including bisphenol A
10 (BPA), which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other
11 reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

12 (b) **Alternative Warning:** The Webstaurant Store may, but is not required to, use the
13 alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

14 ⚠ **WARNING:** Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

15 3.4 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word
16 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to
17 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral
18 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use
19 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller
20 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the
21 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or
22 automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared
23 with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an
24 ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained
25 in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety
26 warnings, if any, concerning the use of the product and shall be at least the same size as those other
27 safety warnings.
28

1 If The Webstaurant Store sells Covered Products via an internet website to customers
2 located in California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if the foregoing
3 warning appears either: (a) on the same web page on which a Covered Product is displayed and/or
4 described; (b) on the same page as the price for the Covered Product; or (c) on one or more web
5 pages displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process. Alternatively, a
6 symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow or white equilateral triangle may appear
7 adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, price, or checkout listing of the
8 Covered Product, if the warning statement appears elsewhere on the same web page in a manner
9 that clearly associates it with the product(s) to which the warning applies

10 3.5 **Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in
11 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent
12 Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by OEHHA after the Effective Date.

13 **4. MONETARY TERMS**

14 4.1 **Civil Penalty.** The Webstaurant Store shall pay \$9,000.00 as a Civil Penalty
15 pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California
16 Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of the Civil Penalty remitted to the State of California's
17 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the
18 Civil Penalty remitted to Ferreiro, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

19 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, The Webstaurant Store shall
20 issue two separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of
21 \$6,750.00; and to (b) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Ferreiro" in the amount of \$2,250.00.
22 Payment owed to Ferreiro pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment
23 address:

24 Evan J. Smith, Esquire
25 Brodsky & Smith, LLC
26 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510
27 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

28 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly
to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

1 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

2 Mike Gyurics
3 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
4 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
5 P.O. Box 4010
6 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

7 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

8 Mike Gyurics
9 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
10 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
11 1001 I Street
12 Sacramento, CA 95814

13 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC at the address
14 set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

15 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, The Webstaurant Store
16 shall pay \$34,500.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") as complete reimbursement for
17 Plaintiff Ferreiro's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this
18 matter to The Webstaurant Store's attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial
19 approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

20 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

21 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro
22 acting in the public interest, and The Webstaurant Store, and its parents, shareholders, divisions,
23 subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their predecessors,
24 successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to
25 whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to
26 The Webstaurant Store, Inc., manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers,
27 licensors, licensees, retailers, marketplace hosts, franchisees, and cooperative members
28 ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on
exposure to BPA from Covered Products, with respect to any Covered Product manufactured,
distributed, or sold by The Webstaurant Store prior to the Effective Date. Compliance with the

1 terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to the
2 Covered Products.

3 5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro, on behalf of himself, his past and current
4 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative
5 capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of
6 legal action and releases any The Webstaurant Store, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream
7 Defendant Releasees from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights,
8 suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses,
9 costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity,
10 fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65
11 related to or arising from Covered Products manufactured distributed or sold by The Webstaurant
12 Store or Defendant Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,
13 Ferreiro hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which he now has, or in the
14 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code,
15 which provides as follows:

16 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE
17 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO
18 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE
19 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE
20 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE
21 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

22 5.3 The Webstaurant Store waives any and all claims against Ferreiro, his attorneys and
23 other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have
24 been taken or made) by Ferreiro and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course
25 of investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,
26 and/or with respect to Covered Products.

27 **6. INTEGRATION**

28 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and
any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been

1 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist
2 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

3 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

4 7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of
5 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or
6 is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then
7 Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and
8 to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

9 **8. NOTICES**

10 8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided
11 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-
12 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party
13 by the other party at the following addresses:

14 For Defendant:

15 Dionne Heard, Esq.
16 Clark Associates, Inc.
17 2205 Old Philadelphia Pike
Lancaster, PA 17602

18 And

19 For Ferreiro:

20 Evan Smith
21 Brodsky & Smith, LLC
2 Bala Plaza, Suite 510
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

22 Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to
23 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

24 **9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

25 9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of
26 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and
27 the same document.

28

1 **10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**
2 **APPROVAL**

3 10.1 Ferreiro agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &
4 Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment
5 and Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

6 10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the
7 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case,
8 the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within
9 30 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

10 10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an
11 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent
12 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on
13 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

14 **11. MODIFICATION**

15 11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties
16 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

17 **12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

18 12.1 A party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent
19 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs unless
20 the unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent
21 Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil
22 Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure § 2016, et seq.

1
2 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions
3 pursuant to law.

4 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

5 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the
6 Consent Judgment.

7 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

8 14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of
9 their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of
10 this document and certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to
11 execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party.
12 Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

13 **AGREED TO:**

AGREED TO:

14
15 Date: 5/30/19
16 By: Anthony Ferreiro
17 ANTHONY FERREIRO

15 Date: 5/22/19
16 By: [Signature]
17 THE WEBSTAR AUNT STORE, INC.

18
19 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

20
21 Dated: _____

22 Judge of Superior Court