

1 Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)  
2 BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC.  
3 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
4 Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
5 Tel: (877) 534-2590  
6 Fax: (310) 247-0160

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

8  
9 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
10 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

11 ANTHONY FERREIRO,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 HERMAN PEARL COMPANY,

15 Defendant.

Case No.: RG19025700

**CONSENT JUDGMENT**

Judge: Noel Wise

Dept.: 24

Hearing Date: December 5, 2019

Hearing Time: 9:00 AM

Reservation #: R-2123648

1           **1. INTRODUCTION**

2           1.1     **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony  
3           Ferreiro acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Ferreiro”) and Herman Pearl Company  
4           (“Herman Pearl” or “Defendant”) with Ferreiro and Defendant collectively referred to as the  
5           “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Ferreiro is an individual residing in California that seeks  
6           to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or  
7           eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Herman Pearl is alleged to be a  
8           person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code  
9           §§ 25249.6 et seq.

10           1.2     **Allegations and Representations.** Ferreiro alleges that Defendant has exposed  
11           individuals to di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) from its sales of Bone Dry pet mats without  
12           providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. DEHP is listed  
13           under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and  
14           reproductive toxicity.

15           1.3     **Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about August 6, 2018, Ferreiro served  
16           Herman Pearl, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice  
17           of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that  
18           Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Bone  
19           Dry pet mats expose users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently  
20           prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On July 3, 2019, Ferreiro filed a complaint (the  
21           “Complaint”) in the matter.

22           1.4     For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
23           jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Complaint filed in this matter, that  
24           venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter,  
25           and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all  
26           claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein  
27           and/or in the Notice.

1           1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in Ferreiro’s Notice and  
2 Complaint and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment  
3 shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of  
4 law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission  
5 by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being  
6 specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the  
7 obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

8 **2. DEFINITIONS**

9           2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means Bone Dry pet mats that  
10 are manufactured, distributed and/or offered for sale in California by Herman Pearl.

11           2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date this Consent Judgment is  
12 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

13 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

14           3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is  
15 signed by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Herman Pearl directly  
16 manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either: (a) be  
17 Reformulated Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable  
18 exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 and 3.4, below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a  
19 “Reformulated Product” is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in §  
20 3.2 below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated  
21 Product.

22           3.2 **Reformulation Standard.** “Reformulated Products” shall mean Covered Products  
23 that contain concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DEHP  
24 when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A  
25 and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose  
26 of determining the phthalate content in a solid substance.  
27  
28

1           **3.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is signed  
2 by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in  
3 this §§ 3.3 and 3.4 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers,  
4 imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There  
5 shall be no obligation for Defendant to provide a warning for Covered Products that enter the stream  
6 of commerce prior to the date this Consent Judgment is signed by both Parties. The warning shall  
7 comply with Article 6 of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, consisting of either the  
8 **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.3(a) or (b), respectively:

9           (a)     **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

10           ⚠ **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-  
11 ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause  
12 cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to  
[www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

13           (b)     **Alternative Warning:** Herman Pearl may, but is not required to, use the alternative  
14 short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

15           ⚠ **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

16           **3.4 A Warning or Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word  
17 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to  
18 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral  
19 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use  
20 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller  
21 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the  
22 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or  
23 automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared  
24 with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an  
25 ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained  
26 in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety  
27 warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same size as  
28 those other safety warnings.

1 If Herman Pearl sells Covered Products via an internet website to customers located in  
2 California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if the foregoing warning  
3 appears either: (a) on the same web page on which a Covered Product is displayed and/or described;  
4 (b) on the same page as the price for the Covered Product; or (c) on one or more web pages  
5 displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process. Alternatively, a symbol  
6 consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow or white equilateral triangle may appear adjacent  
7 to or immediately following the display, description, price, or checkout listing of the Covered  
8 Product, if the warning statement appears elsewhere on the same web page in a manner that clearly  
9 associates it with the product(s) to which the warning applies.

10 3.5 **Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in  
11 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent  
12 Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California’s Office  
13 of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) after the Effective Date.

14 **4. MONETARY TERMS**

15 4.1 **Civil Penalty.** Herman Pearl shall pay \$1,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to  
16 Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health  
17 & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of  
18 the Civil Penalty remitted to Ferreiro, as provided by California Health & Safety Code  
19 § 25249.12(d).

20 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Herman Pearl shall issue two  
21 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$750.00; and to  
22 (b) “Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Ferreiro” in the amount of \$250.00. Payment owed to  
23 Ferreiro pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

24 Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
25 Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
26 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

27 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly  
28 to OEHHA (Memo Line “Prop 65 Penalties”) at one of the following address(es):

1 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

2 Mike Gyurics  
3 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
4 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
5 P.O. Box 4010  
6 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

7 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

8 Mike Gyurics  
9 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
10 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
11 1001 I Street  
12 Sacramento, CA 95814

13 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith, LLC at the address  
14 set forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

15 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Herman Pearl shall  
16 pay \$15,000.00 to Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") as complete reimbursement for  
17 Ferreiro's attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to  
18 Herman Pearl's attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement  
19 in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

20 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

21 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro  
22 acting on his own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Herman Pearl, and its parents,  
23 shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents,  
24 attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their  
25 predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they  
26 obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but  
27 not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees  
28 retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members, including but not limited to Sierra Trading Post,  
Inc. ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to  
DEHP from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice, with respect to any Covered Products  
manufactured, distributed, or sold by Herman Pearl prior to the Effective Date. This Consent

1 Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other person or entity, whether purporting to act  
2 in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and/or take any action  
3 with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 that was alleged in the Complaint, or that could have  
4 been brought pursuant to the Notice against Herman Pearl and/or the Downstream Releasees of the  
5 Covered Products (“Proposition 65 Claims”). Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment  
6 constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to the Covered Products.

7           5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro, on behalf of himself, his past and current  
8 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative  
9 capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any and all  
10 form of legal action and releases Herman Pearl, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees  
11 from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations,  
12 debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and  
13 attorneys’ fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,  
14 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising  
15 from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Herman Pearl, Defendant Releasees  
16 or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,  
17 Ferreiro hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which he now has, or in the  
18 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which  
19 provides as follows:

20           A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE  
21 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO  
22 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE  
23 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE  
24 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE  
25 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

26           5.3 Herman Pearl waives any and all claims against Ferreiro, his attorneys and other  
27 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been  
28 taken or made) by Ferreiro and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of  
investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,  
and/or with respect to Covered Products.

1           **6. INTEGRATION**

2           6.1     This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and  
3 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been  
4 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist  
5 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

6           **7. GOVERNING LAW**

7           7.1     The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of  
8 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed,  
9 amended, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered  
10 Products, then Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with  
11 respect to, and to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

12           **8. NOTICES**

13           8.1     Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided  
14 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-  
15 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party  
16 by the other party at the following addresses:

17           For Defendant:

18                     James Fowler  
19                     Miller Nash Graham & Dunn LLP  
20                     Pier 70, 2801 Alaskan Way - Suite 300  
21                     Seattle, Washington 98121

22           And

23           For Ferreiro:

24                     Evan Smith  
25                     Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
26                     9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900  
27                     Beverly Hills, CA 90212

28           Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to  
which all notices and other communications shall be sent.



1           **9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

2           9.1     This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of  
3           which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and  
4           the same document.

5           **10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**  
6           **APPROVAL**

7           10.1    Ferreiro agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &  
8           Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.  
9           Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

10          10.2    This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the  
11          Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the  
12          Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30  
13          days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

14          10.3    If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an  
15          appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent  
16          Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on  
17          its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

18          **11. MODIFICATION**

19          11.1    This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties  
20          and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

21          **12. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

22          12.1    A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent  
23          Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

24          12.2    Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
25          pursuant to law.

1 **13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

2 13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
3 Consent Judgment.

4 **14. AUTHORIZATION**

5 14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
6 respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
7 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
8 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
9 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

11 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

12 Date: 10/17/19

Date: 9-18-19

13 By: Anthony Ferreiro  
14 ANTHONY FERREIRO

By: [Signature]  
HERMAN PEARL COMPANY

15  
16  
17 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

18  
19 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

Judge of Superior Court