

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,)
a non-profit corporation,)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
v.)
)
ROSS STORES, INC., *et al.*,)
)
Defendants.)

Case No. RG 18-923611
**[PROPOSED] CONSENT
JUDGMENT AS TO R&M
RICHARDS, INC.**

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into by Plaintiff Center for Environmental Health, a California non-profit corporation (“CEH”) and Defendant R&M Richards, Inc. (“Defendant”), to settle certain claims asserted by CEH against Defendant as set forth in the operative complaint in the matter entitled *Center for Environmental Health v. Ross Stores, Inc., et al.*, Alameda County Superior Court Case No. RG 18-923611.

1.2 On November 20, 2018, CEH served a Notice of Violation under Proposition 65 alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 (California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *et seq.*) by exposing persons to cadmium contained in jewelry, including but not limited to jewelry

1 sold with clothing, without first providing a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to Proposition
2 65. On February 15, 2019, CEH amended the operative complaint in this litigation to name R&M
3 Richards, Inc. as a defendant.

4 1.3 Defendant is a corporation that manufactures, distributes and/or sells Covered
5 Products (as defined herein) that are sold in the State of California.

6 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, CEH and Defendant (the “Parties”)
7 stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the
8 Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that
9 venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this
10 Consent Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised
11 in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products
12 manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant.

13 1.5 CEH and Defendant enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final
14 settlement of all claims that were raised in the Complaint, or which could have been raised in the
15 Complaint, arising out of the facts or conduct related to Defendant alleged therein. By execution
16 of this Consent Judgment and agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any facts
17 or conclusions of law including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law suggesting or
18 demonstrating any violations of Proposition 65 relating to cadmium in jewelry. Nothing in this
19 Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion
20 of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with the Consent Judgment
21 constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of
22 law, or violation of law. Defendant denies the material, factual and legal allegations in CEH’s
23 Complaint and expressly denies any wrong doing whatsoever. Nothing in this Consent Judgment
24 shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in
25 this or any other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of
26 negotiation and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling,
27 compromising, and resolving issues disputed in this action.

28

1 **2. DEFINITIONS**

2 2.1 The term “Cadmium Limit” means a concentration of 0.01 percent (100 parts per
3 million (“ppm”)) by weight cadmium in any component of a Covered Product, or in any material
4 used in a Covered Product.

5 2.2 The term “Covered Product” means jewelry, including but not limited to
6 necklaces, whether sold individually or as part of a set with a piece of clothing.

7 2.3 The term “Effective Date” means the date of entry of this Consent Judgment.

8 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

9 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** Defendant shall comply with the
10 following requirements to achieve expeditious reformulation of the Covered Products to reduce or
11 eliminate exposures to cadmium arising from the Covered Products:

12 3.1.1 **Specification Compliance Date.** To the extent it has not already done
13 so, no more than 30 days after the Effective Date, Defendant shall provide the Cadmium Limit to
14 each of its suppliers of Covered Products and Covered Product components and shall instruct each
15 such supplier to only deliver Covered Products and Covered Product components that are below
16 the Cadmium Limit.

17 3.1.2 **Reformulation Date.** As of the Effective Date, Defendant shall not
18 manufacture, purchase, import, supply, sell or offer to sell any: (i) Covered Product that exceeds
19 the Cadmium Limit; or (ii) any Covered Product that contains a component that exceeds the
20 Cadmium Limit.

21 3.2 **Market Withdrawal of Covered Products.** To the extent not already done, on
22 or before the Effective Date, Defendant shall have: (i) ceased shipping the following specific
23 products (“Recall Products”):

- 24 • R & M Richards Silver Brooch with Crystals (Sold with R & M Richards Dress in Black)
25 Style No. 9429, UPC No. 8-82191-82199-8, Ross SKU No. 400182398603;
26 to stores and/or customers in California, (ii) withdrawn the Recall Product from the market in
27 California, and (iii) if the Recall Products were not withdrawn from sale in California prior to the
28 Effective Date, sent instructions to any of its stores and/or customers that offer the Recall Products

1 for sale in California to cease offering the Recall Products for sale and to either return all Recall
2 Products to Defendant for destruction, or to directly destroy the Recall Products. Any destruction
3 of the Recall Products shall be in compliance with all applicable laws. Defendant shall maintain
4 electronic or written records demonstrating its compliance with its obligations under this Section
5 and provide those to CEH with a report of the number of Recall Products returned or destroyed
6 within ninety days of the Effective Date.

7 **4. ENFORCEMENT**

8 4.1 **General Enforcement Provisions.** CEH may, by motion or application for an
9 order to show cause before this Court, enforce the terms and conditions contained in this Consent
10 Judgment. Any action to enforce alleged violations of this Consent Judgment with respect to the
11 Cadmium Limit by Defendant shall be brought exclusively pursuant to this Section 4.

12 4.2 **Enforcement of Materials Violation.**

13 4.2.1 **Notice of Violation.** In the event that, at any time following the Effective
14 Date, CEH identifies one or more Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by
15 Defendant that CEH believes in good faith exceed the Cadmium Limit, CEH may issue a Notice
16 of Violation pursuant to this Section.

17 4.2.2 **Service of Notice of Violation and Supporting Documentation.**

18 4.2.2.1 The Notice of Violation shall be sent to the person(s) identified in
19 Section 8 to receive notices for Defendant, and must be served within 75 days of the date the
20 Covered Product at issue was purchased or otherwise acquired by CEH, provided, however, that:
21 (i) CEH may have up to an additional 45 days to provide Defendant with the test data required by
22 Section 4.2.2.3 below if it has not yet obtained it from its laboratory; and (ii) CEH may serve a
23 subsequent Notice of Violation to a supplier of a Covered Product identified in a previous Notice
24 of Violation so long as: (a) the identity of the supplier cannot be discerned from the labeling of the
25 Covered Product; and (b) the Notice of Violation to the supplier is served within 75 days of the
26 date the supplier is identified in writing to CEH by Defendant.

27 4.2.2.2 The Notice of Violation shall, at a minimum, set forth for each
28 Covered Product: (a) the date the alleged violation was observed, (b) the location at which the

1 Covered Product was offered for sale, (c) a description of the Covered Product giving rise to the
2 alleged violation, and (d) all test data obtained by CEH regarding the Covered Product and
3 supporting documentation sufficient for validation of the test results. Such Notice of Violation
4 shall be based upon total acid digest test data from an independent laboratory. Wipe, swipe, and
5 swab testing are not sufficient to support a Notice of Violation.

6 **4.2.3 Notice of Election of Response.** No more than 30 days after service of a
7 Notice of Violation, Defendant shall provide written notice to CEH whether it elects to contest the
8 allegations contained in a Notice of Violation (“Notice of Election”). Failure to provide a Notice
9 of Election within 30 days of service of a Notice of Violation shall be deemed an election to
10 contest the Notice of Violation.

11 **4.2.3.1** If a Notice of Violation is contested, the Notice of Election shall
12 include all then-available documentary evidence regarding the alleged violation, including all test
13 data, if any. If Defendant or CEH later acquires additional test or other data regarding the alleged
14 violation, it shall notify the other party and promptly provide all such data or information to the
15 party.

16 **4.2.4 Meet and Confer.** If a Notice of Violation is contested, CEH and
17 Defendant shall meet and confer to attempt to resolve their dispute. Within 30 days of serving a
18 Notice of Election contesting a Notice of Violation, and if no enforcement motion or application
19 has been filed by CEH pursuant to Section 4.1, Defendant may withdraw the original Notice of
20 Election contesting the violation and serve a new Notice of Election conceding the violation,
21 provided however that Defendant shall pay \$4,000 in addition to any payment required under
22 Section 4.2.7. At any time, CEH may withdraw a Notice of Violation, in which case for purposes
23 of this Section 4 the result shall be as if CEH never issued any such Notice of Violation. If no
24 informal resolution of a Notice of Violation results within 30 days of a Notice of Election to
25 contest, CEH may file an enforcement motion or application pursuant to Section 4.1. In any such
26 proceeding, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties attorneys’ fees or remedies are
27 provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment.

28 **4.2.5 Non-Contested Matters.** If Defendant elects not to contest the

1 allegations in a Notice of Violation, it shall undertake corrective action pursuant to Section 4.2.6
2 and shall make any payments required by Section 4.2.7.

3 **4.2.6 Corrective Action in Non-Contested Matters.** If Defendant elects not to
4 contest the allegation, it shall include in its Notice of Election a detailed description with
5 supporting documentation of the corrective action that it has undertaken or proposes to undertake
6 to address the alleged violation. Any such correction shall, at a minimum, provide reasonable
7 assurance that the Covered Product will no longer be offered for sale in California. Corrective
8 action must include instructions to Defendant’s customers that offer the Covered Product for sale
9 to consumers to cease offering the Covered Product(s) identified in the Notice of Violation for sale
10 in California as soon as practicable. The Notice of Election shall also include the name, address,
11 telephone number, and other contact information, of Defendant’s supplier(s) of each Covered
12 Product or Covered Product component identified in the Notice of Violation. Defendant shall
13 make available to CEH for inspection and copying records and correspondence regarding the
14 corrective action. If there is a dispute over the corrective action, the Parties shall meet and confer
15 pursuant to Section 4.2.4 before seeking any remedy in court.

16 **4.2.7 Payments in Non-Contested Matters.** In addition to the corrective
17 action, Defendant shall be required to make a payment as reimbursement for costs for
18 investigating, preparing, sending and prosecuting Notices of Violation, and to reimburse
19 attorneys’ fees and costs incurred in connection with these activities, as specified below:

20 **4.2.7.1** If Defendant serves a Notice of Election not to contest the
21 allegations in the instant Notice of Violation, it shall be required to make a payment of \$5,000.
22 This payment shall, however, be reduced to \$2,500 if Defendant produces with its Notice of
23 Election test data showing that the Covered Product that is the subject of the Notice of Violation
24 did not exceed the Cadmium Limit. For purposes of this Section 4.2.7.1 only, “test data” shall
25 mean total cadmium by acid digest performed by an accredited laboratory on the same Covered
26 Product that is the subject of the Notice of Violation. For purposes of this Section, the “same
27 Covered Product” must be a Covered Product that has a label attached that demonstrates that the
28

1 Covered Product was produced at the same factory and on the same production date as that
2 indicated on the label of the Covered Product tested by CEH that supports the Notice of Violation.

3 4.2.7.2 The payment shall be made by check payable to the Lexington Law
4 Group and shall be paid within 15 days of service of a Notice of Election triggering a payment.

5 4.2.8 **Repeat Violations.** If Defendant has received three or more Notices of
6 Violation that were not successfully contested or withdrawn in any 12-month period then, at
7 CEH's option, CEH may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties, attorneys' fees or other remedies
8 that are provided by law for failure to comply with the Consent Judgment. Prior to seeking such
9 relief, CEH shall meet and confer with Defendant for a period not to exceed 30 days (unless
10 extended by mutual agreement) to determine if the parties can agree on measures Defendant can
11 undertake to prevent future violations.

12 **5. PAYMENTS**

13 5.1 **Payments by Defendant.** On or before five (5) days after the entry of this
14 Consent Judgment, Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$30,000 as a settlement payment
15 ("Settlement Payment") as further set forth in this Section.

16 5.2 **Allocation of Payments.** The total Settlement Payment shall be paid in five (5)
17 separate checks in the amounts specified below and delivered as set forth below. Any failure by
18 Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be subject to a stipulated late fee to be
19 paid by Defendant in the amount of \$100 for each day the full payment is not received after the
20 applicable payment due date set forth in Section 5.1. The late fees required under this Section
21 shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys' fees, in an enforcement proceeding
22 brought pursuant to Section 4 of this Consent Judgment. The Settlement Payment paid by
23 Defendant shall be allocated as set forth below between the following categories and made
24 payable as follows:

25 5.2.1 Defendant shall pay \$3,984 as a civil penalty ("Civil Penalty") pursuant
26 to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). The Civil Penalty payment shall be apportioned in
27 accordance with Health & Safety Code §25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of
28 California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHHA")). Accordingly,

1 Defendant shall pay the OEHHA portion of the Civil Penalty payment for \$2,989 by check made
2 payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This
3 payment shall be delivered as follows:

4 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

5 Attn: Mike Gyurics
6 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
7 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
8 P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B
9 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

10 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

11 Attn: Mike Gyurics
12 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
13 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
14 1001 I Street, MS #19B
15 Sacramento, CA 95814

16 Defendant shall pay the CEH portion of the Civil Penalty payment for \$995 by check made
17 payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification
18 number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero
19 Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

20 5.2.2 Defendant shall pay \$2,988 as an Additional Settlement Payment
21 (“ASP”) to CEH pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b), and California Code of
22 Regulations, Title 11, § 3204. CEH intends to place these funds in CEH’s Toxics and Youth Fund
23 and use them to support CEH programs and activities that seek to educate the public about
24 cadmium and other toxic chemicals in consumer products that are marketed to youth, work with
25 industries that market products to youth to reduce exposure to cadmium and other toxic chemicals,
26 and thereby reduce the public health impacts and risks of exposure to cadmium and other toxic
27 chemicals in consumer products that are marketed to youth in California. CEH shall obtain and
28 maintain adequate records to document that ASPs are spent on these activities and CEH agrees to
provide such documentation to the Attorney General within thirty days of any request from the
Attorney General. The payment pursuant to this Section shall be made payable to the Center for
Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. This

1 payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA
2 94117.

3 5.2.3 Defendant shall pay \$23,028 as a reimbursement of a portion of CEH's
4 reasonable attorneys' fees and costs (including but not limited to expert and investigative costs).
5 The attorneys' fees and cost reimbursement shall be made in two separate checks as follows: (a)
6 \$19,342 payable to the Lexington Law Group and associated with taxpayer identification number
7 94-3317175; and (b) \$3,686 payable to the Center For Environmental Health and associated with
8 taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. Both of these payments shall be delivered to
9 Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

10 5.2.4 To summarize, Defendant shall deliver checks made out to the payees
11 and in the amounts set forth below:

12 Payee	Type	Amount	Deliver To
13 OEHHA	Penalty	\$2,989	OEHHA per Section 5.2.1
14 Center For Environmental Health	Penalty	\$995	LLG
15 Center For Environmental Health	ASP	\$2,988	LLG
16 Lexington Law Group	Fee and Cost	\$19,342	LLG
17 Center For Environmental Health	Fee and Cost	\$3,686	LLG

19 5.2.5 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Enforcement of Judgments Law
20 and Code of Civil Procedure § 780.160, in the event that Settling Defendant does not comply fully
21 with its payment obligations under this Section 5, in addition to any other enforcement mechanism
22 available to CEH, CEH may seek an order requiring Settling Defendant to submit to a debtor's
23 examination in the Alameda County Superior Court. In the event that Settling Defendant fails to
24 submit to any such debtor's examination ordered by the Court, CEH may seek an order holding
25 Settling Defendant in contempt of Court.

26 6. MODIFICATION AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION

27 6.1 **Modification.** This Consent Judgment may be modified from time to time by
28

1 express written agreement of the Parties with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this
2 Court upon motion and in accordance with law.

3 6.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment
4 shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to
5 modify the Consent Judgment.

6 **7. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

7 7.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CEH and
8 Defendant and Defendant’s parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners,
9 sister companies and their successors and assigns (“Defendant Releasees”), and all entities to
10 whom they distribute or sell Covered Products including, but not limited to, distributors,
11 wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (“Downstream
12 Defendant Releasees”), of any violation of Proposition 65 that have been or could have been
13 asserted in the public interest against Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream
14 Defendant Releasees, regarding the failure to warn about exposure to cadmium arising in
15 connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant prior to the
16 Effective Date.

17 7.2 CEH, for itself and acting on behalf of the public interest pursuant to Health &
18 Safety Code § 25249.7(d), releases, waives, and forever discharges any and all claims against
19 Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Defendant Releasees arising from any violation
20 of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that have been or could have been
21 asserted in the public interest regarding the failure to warn about exposure to cadmium arising in
22 connection with Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant prior to the
23 Effective Date.

24 7.3 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant and the
25 Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant, the Defendant
26 Releasees and the Downstream Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn
27 about cadmium in Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant after the
28 Effective Date.

1 **8. PROVISION OF NOTICE**

2 8.1 When any Party is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the
3 notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail as follows:

4 8.1.1 **Notices to Defendant.** The person for Defendant to receive Notice
5 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be:

6 Jeffrey F. Allen
7 Bond, Schoeneck & King PLLC
8 350 Linden Oaks
9 Rochester, NY 14625
10 jeffreyallen@bsk.com

11 Thomas R. Smith
12 Bond, Schoeneck & King PLLC
13 One Lincoln Center
14 Syracuse, NY 13202
15 smithtr@bsk.com

16 8.1.2 **Notices to Plaintiff.** The person for CEH to receive Notices pursuant to
17 this Consent Judgment shall be:

18 Eric S. Somers
19 Lexington Law Group
20 503 Divisadero Street
21 San Francisco, CA 94117
22 esomers@lexlawgroup.com

23 8.2 Any Party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by
24 sending the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.

25 **9. COURT APPROVAL**

26 9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective on the Effective Date, provided
27 however, that CEH shall prepare and file a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and
28 Defendant shall support approval of such Motion.

 9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or
effect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any
purpose.

1 **10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION**

2 10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of
3 California.

4 **11. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

5 11.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding
6 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions,
7 negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein
8 and therein. There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties
9 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied,
10 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party
11 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise,
12 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically
13 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the
14 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation,
15 modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in
16 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent
17 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof
18 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

19 **12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

20 12.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement, enforce or modify
21 the Consent Judgment.

22 **13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT**

23 13.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully
24 authorized by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into
25 and execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that
26 Party.

27 **14. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

28 14.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim

1 against any other entity on terms that are different than those contained in this Consent Judgment.

2 **15. SUCCESSORS AND ASSIGNS**

3 This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon CEH and Settling Defendant,
4 and their respective divisions, subdivisions, and subsidiaries, and the successors or assigns of any
5 of them.

6 **16. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

7 16.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and
8 by means of facsimile, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

9 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED,
10 AND DECREED**

11

12 Dated:

Judge of the Superior Court of the State of California

13

14 **IT IS SO STIPULATED:**

15

16

Dated: 11/21, 2019

CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

17

18

Michael Green

19

20

Michael Green

21

Printed Name

22

23

CEO

24

Title

25

26

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Dated: 11/11, 2019

DEFENDANT R&M RICHARDS, INC.



Richard DeLano

Printed Name

President

Title