1 2 3 4 5	Reuben Yeroushalmi (SBN 193981) Peter T. Sato (SBN 232540) Tiffine E. Malamphy (SBN 312239) YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI An Association of Independent Law Corporations 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W Beverly Hills, CA 90212 Telephone: 310.623.1926 Facsimile: 310.623.1930	
6	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
7	Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc.	
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
9	COUNTY OF MARIN	
10		
11	CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. in the public interest,	Case No. CIV 1600796
12	Plaintiff,	IDDODOCEDI CONCENTE HIDOMENTE
13	VS.	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
14	SPROUTS FARMERS MARKET, INC., a	Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
15	Delaware Corporation; NISHIMOTO TRADING CO., LTD., a California	
16	Corporation; NISHIMOTO CO., LTD., a business entity from unknown; NICO-NICO	
17	NORI, INC., a business entity from unknown; GIMME HEALTH FOODS, LLC, a California	
18	Limited Liability Corporation; and DOES 1-20,	
19	Defendants.	
20		
21	1 INTEROPLICATION	
22	1. INTRODUCTION	
23	1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Plaintiff, CONSUMER	
24	ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. ("Plaintiff" or "CAG") acting on behalf of itself and in the interest of	
25	the public, and Defendant GIMME HEALTH FOODS, INC. (formerly known as GIMME	
26	HEALTH FOODS, LLC) ("GIMME" or "Defendant"), with each a "Party" to the action and	
27	collectively referred to as the "Parties."	
28		
		1
- 1	I	1

**1.2.1** CAG alleges that GIMME is a California corporation which employs ten or more persons. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, GIMME is deemed a person in the course of doing business in California and subject to the provisions of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

- **1.2.2** CAG alleges that GIMME manufactures, causes to be manufactured, sells, and/or distributes certain seaweed products in California.
- 1.2.3 The term "Products" in this Consent Judgment means sushi nori products, seaweed thins snacks, roasted seaweed snacks, and all other seaweed or roasted seaweed products, which are manufactured, distributed or sold by Gimme Health Foods, Inc. or Gimme Health Foods, LLC.

#### 1.3 Listed Chemicals

Cadmium and cadmium compounds ("Cadmium") are listed by the State of California as chemicals known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 1.4 Notices of Violation and Products

- 1.4.1 On or about February 10, 2017, CAG claims it served Defendant and various public enforcement agencies with a document titled "60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue for Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986" ("Original Notice") that provided the recipients with notice of alleged violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn individuals in California of exposures to Cadmium in "Seaweed Products" sold by GIMME in California. The Original Notice specifically named a non-exclusive exemplar product, gimMe<sup>TM</sup> Sushi Nori Wrap n' Roll ("Exemplar Product"). No public enforcer has commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Original Notice. The Exemplar Product and any other Products that contain the term "Sushi Nori" in the product name on the product packaging are referred to herein as the "Covered Products."
- **1.4.2** On or about November 30, 2018, CAG issued a second "60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue for Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986"

("Second Notice") alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by Gimme Health Foods, Inc., Gimme Health Foods, LLC, and a retailer for failing to warn individuals in California of exposures to Cadmium in "Seaweed Products" sold by GIMME in California. The Second Notice specifically named a non-exclusive exemplar product, gimMe<sup>TM</sup> Sushi Nori Roasted Seaweed. No public enforcer has commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Second Notice.

1.4.3 On or about December 12, 2018, CAG issued a third "60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue for Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986" ("Third Notice") alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by Gimme Health Foods, Inc., Gimme Health Foods, LLC, and a retailer for failing to warn individuals in California of exposures to Cadmium in "Seaweed Products" sold by GIMME in California. The Third Notice specifically named a non-exclusive exemplar product, gimMe<sup>TM</sup> Sriracha Almond seaweed thins. No public enforcer has commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Third Notice.

1.4.4 On or about August 21, 2015, CAG issued a "60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue for Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986" alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by Gimme Health Foods, LLC, Gimme Health Foods, Inc. and certain retailers for failing to warn individuals in California of exposure to lead and lead compounds in certain seaweed products sold in California. This notice specifically named a non-exclusive exemplar product, gimMe<sup>TM</sup> organic Roasted Seaweed Snacks - Sesame. No public enforcer commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the notice.

1.4.5 On or about November 6, 2015, CAG issued a "60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue for Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986" alleging violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by Gimme Health Foods, LLC, Gimme Health Foods, Inc. and certain retailers for failing to warn individuals in California of exposure to lead and lead compounds in certain seaweed products sold in California. This notice specifically named a non-exclusive exemplar product, gimMe<sup>TM</sup> organic Roasted Seaweed Snacks - Teriyaki. No public enforcer commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the notice.

the "Notices."

# 1.5 Operative Complaint

On October 19, 2017, CAG filed its Second Amended Complaint ("Complaint") to add Gimme Health Foods, LLC as a defendant in the above-captioned action and alleging claims in the Fourth Cause of Action as to seaweed products that are "Sushi Nori Roasted Seaweed." Upon entry of this Consent Judgment, the Complaint shall be deemed amended *nunc pro tunc* to name Gimme Health Foods, Inc. (formerly known as Gimme Health Foods, LLC) as a defendant to the Fourth Cause of Action in the Complaint.

The notice letters described in this Section 1.4 are referred to collectively as

#### 1.6 Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint, personal jurisdiction over GIMME as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Marin, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full settlement and resolution of the allegations against GIMME contained in the Complaint and the Notices, and of all claims which were or could have been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on the facts alleged therein or arising therefrom or related thereto.

#### 1.7 No Admission

This Consent Judgment resolves claims that GIMME denies and disputes and defenses that CAG denies and disputes. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full and final settlement of any and all claims between the Parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any material allegation in the Notices or the Complaint, or of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law of any kind, including without limitation, any admission concerning any alleged or actual violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, regulatory, common law, or equitable doctrine. Nothing in this Consent Judgment, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties, or give rise to any inference, of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, or of fault, wrongdoing, or liability by

▲ WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

28

The pictogram specified in Option 2 shall be in yellow with a black exclamation mark; provided however, the pictogram may be in white instead of yellow if the Covered Product label does not contain the color yellow.

- **2.3.1** The warning requirements set forth herein are imposed pursuant to the terms of this Consent Judgment and are recognized by the Parties as not being the exclusive manner of providing a warning for the Covered Products. Warnings may be provided as specified in the Proposition 65 regulations for food in effect as of the Effective Date (Title 27, California Code of Regulations, section 25601, *et seq.*) or as such regulations may be amended in the future.
- **2.4** GIMME may move to modify this Consent Judgment to incorporate any naturally occurring allowance for cadmium, inorganic arsenic, or lead that CAG agrees to in a future consent judgment involving seaweed products or that the California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment adopts by regulation that applies to seaweed products. CAG agrees not to oppose any such motion except for good cause shown.

#### 3. SETTLEMENT PAYMENT

- 3.1 Payment and Due Date: Within 30 days of the Effective Date, GIMME shall pay a total of two hundred and sixty-eight thousand dollars (\$268,000.00) in full and complete settlement of any and all claims for civil penalties, damages, attorney's fees, expert fees or any other claim for costs, expenses or monetary relief of any kind for claims that were or could have been asserted in the Notices or Complaint, as set forth below.
- **3.1.1 Civil Penalty**: GIMME shall issue two separate checks totaling twenty-eight thousand five hundred and eighty dollars (\$28,580.00) as follows for alleged civil penalties pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.12:
- (a) GIMME will issue one check made payable to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") in the amount of twenty-one thousand four hundred and thirty-five dollars (\$21,435.00) representing 75% of the total civil penalty and GIMME will issue a second check to CAG in the amount of seven thousand one hundred and forty-five dollars (\$7,145.00) representing 25% of the total civil penalty;

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

(b) Separate 1099s shall be issued for each of the above payments: GIMME will issue a 1099 to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95184 (EIN: 68-0284486) in the amount of \$21,435.00. GIMME will also issue a 1099 to CAG in the amount of \$7,145.00 and deliver it to CAG c/o Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi, 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W,

Beverly Hills, California 90212.

**3.1.2** Additional Settlement Payment: GIMME shall pay twenty-one thousand four hundred and twenty dollars (\$21,420.00) as an additional settlement payment to "Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc." pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11 § 3203(d). CAG will use this payment as follows, eighty five percent (85%) for fees of investigation, purchasing and testing for Proposition 65 Listed Chemicals in various products, and for expert fees for evaluating exposures through various mediums, including but not limited to consumer product, occupational, and environmental exposures to Proposition 65 Listed Chemicals, and the cost of hiring consulting and retaining experts who assist with the extensive scientific analysis necessary for those files in litigation and to offset the costs of future litigation enforcing Proposition 65 but excluding attorney fees; fifteen percent (15%) for administrative costs incurred during investigation and litigation to reduce the public's exposure to Proposition 65 Listed Chemicals by notifying those persons and/or entities believed to be responsible for such exposures and attempting to persuade those persons and/or entities to reformulate their products or the source of exposure to completely eliminate or lower the level of Proposition 65 Listed Chemicals including but not limited to costs of documentation and tracking of products investigated, storage of products, website enhancement and maintenance, computer and software maintenance, investigative equipment, CAG's member's time for work done on investigations, office supplies, mailing supplies and postage. Within 30 days of a request from the Attorney General, CAG shall provide to the Attorney General copies of documentation demonstrating how the above funds have been spent. CAG shall be solely responsible for ensuring the proper expenditure of such additional settlement payment.

**3.1.3 Reimbursement of Attorney Fees and Costs:** GIMME shall pay two hundred and eighteen thousand dollars (\$218,000.00) payable to "Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi" as

6 7

8

9

10 11

13

15

16

4.1

12

17 18

20

19

21

23 24

25

26

27

28

complete reimbursement for any and all reasonable investigation fees and costs, attorneys' fees, expert fees, and any and all other costs and expenses incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to the GIMME's attention, litigating, negotiating a settlement in the public interest, and seeking and obtaining court approval of this Consent Judgment.

**3.1.4** Other than the payment to OEHHA described above, all payments referenced in paragraphs 3.1.1, 3.1.2, and 3.1.3 above, shall be delivered to: Reuben Yeroushalmi, Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi, 9100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 240W, Beverly Hills, CA 90212. The payment to OEHHA shall be delivered to Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, Attn: Mike Gyurics, 1001 I Street, Mail Stop 12-B, Sacramento, California 95812. Concurrently with payment to OEHHA, Defendant shall provide CAG with written confirmation that the payment to OEHHA was delivered.

#### MATTERS COVERED BY THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between, on the one hand, CAG, on behalf of itself and its owners, principals, shareholders, officers, directors, employees, agents, parents, subsidiaries, successors, assigns, investigators, and attorneys (collectively referred to as "CAG Releasors"), and on behalf of the public interest, and, on the other hand, Gimme Health Foods, Inc. and Gimme Health Foods, LLC and their officers, directors, insurers, employees, parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, affiliates, agents, sister companies, and their predecessors, successors, and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and each entity to whom GIMME and any other Defendant Releasees directly or indirectly distribute or sell, or distributed or sold, the Covered Products, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers (including but not limited to Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc., Whole Foods Market, and Whole Foods Market California, Inc.) franchisees, cooperative members, licensees, and the successors and assigns of each of them ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of all claims that have been or could have been asserted for alleged or actual violations of Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations for alleged exposures to Cadmium from the Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by GIMME or any other Defendant Releasees before the Compliance Date. GIMME, Defendant Releasees, and

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Downstream Defendant Releasees are hereafter collectively referred to as the "Released Parties". Nothing in this Section affects CAG's right to commence or prosecute an action under Proposition 65 against any person other than GIMME, Defendant Releasees, or Downstream Defendant Releasees.

- 4.2 CAG, on behalf of itself and the CAG Releasors, and on behalf of the public interest, waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and discharges and releases all claims, actions, causes of action (in law or in equity), suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, expenses, and fees (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorney's fees), and expenses (collectively, "Claims") as to all Released Parties, for violations of Proposition 65 from the alleged failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to Cadmium, or for causing alleged exposures to Cadmium, in Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold before the Compliance Date. Compliance by GIMME with Sections 2.1-2.3 of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed to constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to any Cadmium in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold on or after the Compliance Date.
- 4.3 CAG on behalf of itself and the CAG Releasors only, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and discharges and releases all Claims as to all Released Parties, whether known or unknown or suspected or unsuspected, regarding the Covered Products manufactured, distributed or sold by the Released Parties arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding alleged exposures to, or failure to warn about alleged exposures to, Cadmium, lead and lead compounds, and organic or inorganic arsenic in the Covered Products. With respect to the Claims released in this Section 4.3, CAG, on behalf of itself and the CAG Releasors, waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have, conferred upon it with respect to by virtue of the provisions of section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT

THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

CAG understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

In addition, CAG agrees that the warning requirements of Section 2.3 shall be deemed to be compliant for the claims as to alleged exposures to lead and lead compounds ("Lead") that are covered in a prior settlement agreement between GIMME and CAG dated April 8, 2016 ("Lead Settlement").

## 5. ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT

- 5.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the Parties hereto. The Parties may, by noticed motion or order to show cause before the Superior Court of California, County of Marin, enforce the terms and conditions contained herein. A Party may enforce any of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment only after that Party first provides thirty days' written notice to the Party allegedly failing to comply with the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment and attempts to resolve such Party's failure to comply in an open and good faith manner and follows the procedures set out in this Section 5. For purposes of this section, "lot" shall mean the Universal Product Code Number printed on the packaging of a product, not a number added by a subsequent seller unless GIMME no longer prints a Universal Product Code Number on product packaging, and the best by date printed on the packaging.
- 5.2 Notice of Violation. Prior to bringing any Proposition 65 60-day notice of violation under Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7 as to any Product, or prior to bringing any motion, order to show cause, or other proceeding to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment or the Lead Settlement, CAG shall provide a Notice of Violation ("NOV") to GIMME and follow the enforcement provisions of this Section 5. The enforcement provisions of this Consent Judgment supersede the enforcement provisions of the Lead Settlement with respect to any lead in the Products. The NOV shall include for each of the Products: (a) the name of the Product; (b) specific dates when CAG purchased and tested the samples of the Products; (c) the store or other

If the testing does not establish compliance with the cadmium, lead, or inorganic arsenic standards set in the Consent Judgment or the Lead Settlement, as applicable, GIMME may withdraw its NOE to contest the violation and may serve a new NOE pursuant to Section 5.2.1.

- (c) If GIMME does not withdraw a NOE to contest the NOV, the Parties shall meet and confer for a period of no less than 60 days before CAG may seek relief through a judicial proceeding. In any such proceeding with respect to Products other than Covered Products, GIMME does not waive its right to rebut the standards set in Section 2.1 based on the statutory warning exemption, regulatory safe harbor level, or other applicable defenses to Proposition 65 enforcement, and the terms of this Consent Judgment shall not constitute or be construed as an admission by Gimme, or give rise to any inference against Gimme, as to the appropriate warning standard in that event.
- **5.3** In no case shall CAG issue more than one NOV per Product per year. Provided however, CAG shall not issue any NOV in the first twelve months after the Effective Date.
- 5.4 In the event there is a Contested NOV under Section 5.2.2, in any proceeding brought by either Party to enforce this Consent Judgment or the Lead Settlement, the prevailing Party shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

### 6. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- **6.1** CAG shall promptly prepare and file a motion seeking approval of this Consent Judgment pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f). Upon entry of the Consent Judgment, CAG and GIMME waive their respective rights to a hearing and trial on the allegations in the Notices and Complaint, except as provided in Section 5 of this Consent Judgment.
- 6.2 If this Consent Judgment is not approved in full by the Court: (a) this Consent Judgment and any and all prior agreements between the Parties merged herein shall terminate and become null and void, and the actions shall revert to the status that existed prior to the execution date of this Consent Judgment; (b) no term of this Consent Judgment or any draft thereof, or of the negotiation, documentation, or other part or aspect of the Parties' settlement discussions, shall have any effect, nor shall any such matter be admissible in evidence for any purpose in this

Action, or in any other proceeding; and (c) the Parties agree to meet and confer to determine whether to modify the terms of the Consent Judgment and to resubmit it for approval.

**6.3** Within five days of the Effective Date, CAG shall file a request for dismissal without prejudice of the Fourth Cause of Action of the Complaint as to Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc.

#### 7. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

**7.1** This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement and enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment under Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6. Nothing in this Consent Judgment limits or affects the Court's authority to modify this Consent Judgment as provided by law.

#### 8. SERVICE ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

**8.1** CAG shall serve a copy of this Consent Judgment, signed by both parties, on the California Attorney General so that the Attorney General may review this Consent Judgment prior to its submittal to the Court for approval. No sooner than forty-five (45) days after the Attorney General has received the aforementioned copy of this Consent Judgment, CAG may then submit it to the Court for approval.

#### 9. ATTORNEY FEES

**9.1** Except as specifically provided in Sections 3.1.3 and 5.4, each Party shall bear its own attorneys' fees and costs in connection with the claims resolved in this Consent Judgment.

### 10. GOVERNING LAW

- **10.1** The validity, construction and performance of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California, without reference to any conflicts of law provisions of California law.
- 10.2 In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or if any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are rendered inapplicable or are no longer required as a result of any such repeal or preemption, or rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally as to the Products, then Defendant may provide written notice to CAG of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations

1	13. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE	
2	Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the	
3	Party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the	
4	Party represented and legally to bind that Party.	
5		
6	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
7	Dated: Feb23,2019	PLAINTIFF CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.
8		Signature
9		Signature  Michael Marcus  Printed Name
10		Printed Name
11		Director
12	. ,	Title
13		
14		
15 16	Dated:, 2019	DEFENDANT GIMME HEALTH FOODS, INC. (FORMERLY KNOWN AS GIMME HEALTH FOODS, LLC)
17		1 00Db, Lbc)
18	y	
19		Signature
20		Printed Name
21		
22		Title
23	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
24		
25	Date:	WID OF OF MAIL OF BUILDING COLUMN
26	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT	
27		
28		

#### **AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE** 13.

- 1			
2	Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the		
3	Party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the		
4	Party represented and legally to bind that Party.		
5			
6	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	DI AINMEE CONOLINED ADVOCACY	
7	Dated:, 2019	PLAINTIFF CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.	
8			
9		Signature	
10		Delivated Name	
11		Printed Name	
12		Title	
13			
14	Aura		
15	Dated: [EB ZZ 19], 2019	DEFENDANT GIMME HEALTH FOODS, INC. (FORMERLY KNOWN AS GIMME HEALTH	
16		FOODS, LLC)	
17		Atom H	
18		Signature Stephen Broad	
19 20			
21		Printed Name	
22		CEO Title	
23	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
24			
25	Date:	WIDGE OF THE GUIDEDION COLUMN	
26		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT	
27			
28			