1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	GLICK LAW GROUP, P.C. Noam Glick (SBN 251582) 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 382-3400 Fax: (619) 393-0154 Email: noam@glicklawgroup.com NICHOLAS & TOMASEVIC, LLP. Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444) Jake Schulte (SBN 293777) 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 325-0492 Fax: (619) 325-0492 Fax: (619) 325-0496 Email: cnicholas@nicholaslaw.org Email: jschulte@nicholaslaw.org		
11	Kim Embry		
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
13	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
14	KIM EMBRY, an individual,	Case No. RG19030015	
15 16	Plaintiff, v.	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC	
17		(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
17 18	PITA PIT BAKERY, INC., a California corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 <i>et seq.</i> and Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)	
	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation,		
18	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100,		
18 19	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		
18 19 20	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100,		
18 19 20 21	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		
 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		
 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		
 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		
 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 	corporation, SURGE GLOBAL BAKERIES HOLDINGS LLC., a Delaware corporation, ATLAS MARKET, a California corporation, BREADMASTERS ARA-Z, INC., a California corporation, and DOES 2 through 100, inclusive,		

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

1.

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Kim Embry, ("Plaintiff" or "Embry"), on the one hand, and Surge Global Bakeries Holdings LLC ("Defendant" or "Surge"), on the other hand, with Embry and Surge each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively referred to as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

Embry is an individual residing in California and acting in the interest of the general public. She seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Surge employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 **General Allegations**

Embry alleges that Surge manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale pita bread that contains acrylamide when toasted or grilled to a golden brown. Embry further alleges Surge instructs customers to, and reasonably anticipates that customers will, toast or grill its pita bread prior to consumption. Despite knowledge of same, Embry alleges that Surge manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale its pita bread without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65 and related Regulations.

1.5 **Notices of Violation**

On various dates, including but not limited to January 11, 2019, December 4, 2020, and December 11, 2020, Embry served Surge, Atlas World Fresh Market, and/or TA Distributors, as well as the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies, with 60-Day Notices of Violation of Proposition 65. ("Notices") The Notices alleged that one or more Defendants violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of exposures to 27 acrylamide contained in the Covered Products.

On January 11, 2019, Embry issued her original 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Notice") to Surge and Atlas World Fresh Market. On December 4, 2020, Embry issued an Amended 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Amended Notice") adding TA Distributors. On December 11, 2020, Embry issued a Second Amended 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Second Amended Notice") to correct the manufacturer to Surge.

No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice, Amended Notice, or Second Amended Notice (hereinafter, the "Notices").

1.5 "Covered Products" Description

"Covered Products" as used in this Consent Judgment is defined as, and expressly limited to, Plain Brick Oven Pita Bread that contains acrylamide, when toasted or grilled to a golden brown, and that is manufactured, sold, imported, or distributed for sale in California by Surge.

1.6 Complaint

On August 1, 2019, Embry filed a Complaint against Surge, and other Defendants, for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notices ("Complaint").

1.7 No Admission

Surge denies the material factual and legal allegations of the Notices and Complaint and maintains that all of the products it has manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Surge maintains that it has had sufficient Proposition 65 warnings for the Covered Products since in or around January 1, 2019. Surge states that it is entering into this settlement / Consent Judgment primarily because of the situation prior to that date. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Surge's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.8 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Surge as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6. In the event a Party brings a motion to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing Party (i.e., the Party that successfully brings or defends against said motion) is entitled to recover its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

1.9 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment, as discussed in Section 5.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS

2.1 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

Commencing on the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Surge agrees to only manufacture for sale, purchase for sale, import for sale, or distribute for sale into California Covered Products that are sold with a warning as provided for in Section 2.2.

2.2

General Warning Requirements

For Covered Products which are manufactured and packaged for distribution for authorized sale or use in California on or after the Effective Date, Surge shall provide one of the following Proposition 65 warnings:

21	Option 1:			
22	WARNING : This product can expose you to chemicals including Acrylamide, which is known to the State of			
23	California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to			
24	www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.			
25	Option 2:			
26	WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.cs.gov			
27	The word "WARNING" shall be displayed in all capital letters and bold print. This warning			
28	statement shall be prominently displayed on the packaging of the Covered Products, or on a placard,			
4				

shelf tag, or sign provided that the statement is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. If the warning statement is displayed on the Covered Products' label, it must be set off from other surrounding information. The same warning shall be posted on any websites, under the exclusive control of Surge, where Covered Products are sold into California

2.3

3 Sell-Through Period

Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, Covered Products that are manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date shall be subject to release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligation of Surge, or any Releasees (if applicable), do not apply to Covered Products manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

3.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Settlement Amount

Surge shall pay fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000.00) in settlement and total satisfaction of all the claims referred to in the Notices, the Complaint, and this Consent Judgment. This includes civil penalties in the amount of five thousand dollars (\$5,000.00) pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b) and attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of forty-five thousand dollars (\$45,000.00) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

3.2 Civil Penalty

The portion of the settlement attributable to civil penalties shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty paid to Embry individually.

All payments owed to Embry shall be delivered to the following address:

Noam Glick Glick Law Group, PC 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

1	All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to OEHHA		
2	(Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:		
3	For United States Postal Service Delivery:		
4	Mike Gyurics		
5	Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment		
6	P.O. Box 4010 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010		
7	For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:		
8	Mike Gyurics		
9	Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment		
10	1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814		
11	Surge agrees to provide Embry's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA,		
12	simultaneous with its penalty payments to Embry.		
13	Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as		
14	required. Relevant information is set out below:		
15	• "Glick Law Group" (EIN: 47-1838518) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);		
16	• "Nicholas & Tomasevic" (EIN: 46-3474065) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);		
17	and		
18	• "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA		
19 20	95814.		
20	3.3 Attorneys' Fees and Costs		
21	The portion of the settlement attributable to attorney's fees and costs shall be paid to Embry's		
22	counsel, who are entitled to attorney's fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not		
23 24	limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Surge's attention, as well as		
24 25	litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.		
23 26	Surge shall provide their payment to Embry's counsel in two checks, divided equally, payable		
20 27	to Glick Law Group, PC (\$22,500) and Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP (\$22,500) respectively. The		
28	addresses for these two entities are:		

4.

Noam Glick Glick Law Group 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

Craig Nicholas Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

3.4 Timing

The above-mentioned checks will be issued within fourteen (14) of the Effective Date.

CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 Embry's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

For any claim or violation arising under Proposition 65 alleging a failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Surge prior to the Effective Date, Embry, acting for the general public, releases Surge of any and all liability. This includes Surge's owners, parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownerships, its directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Surge directly or indirectly distributes or sells Covered Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesales, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees, (collectively, the "Releasees"). Releasees include defendants, their parents, and all subsidiaries and affiliates thereof and their respective employees, agents, and assigns that sell Covered Products. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Surge after the Effective Date. This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution of all claims that were or could have been asserted against Surge and/or Releasees for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposure to acrylamide contained in Covered Products.

4.2 Embry's Individual Release of Claims

Embry, in her individual capacity, also provides a release to Surge and/or Releasees, which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorney's fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of every nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to acrylamide in Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Surge before the Effective Date.

4.3

3 Surge's Release of Embry

Surge on its own behalf, and on behalf of Releasees as well as its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Embry and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Embry and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against them, in this matter or with respect to Covered Products.

5. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

6. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. <u>GOVERNING LAW</u>

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California as applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, then Surge may

1

2

provide written notice to Embry of any asserted change, and shall have no further injunctive
 obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered
 Products are so affected.

8. <u>NOTICE</u>

4

5

6

7

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

8 If to Surge: If to Embry: 9 George C. Salmas Noam Glick Michael Hambly Glick Law Group, PC 10 The Food Lawyers 225 Broadway, 19th Floor 1880 Century Park East San Diego, CA 92101 11 Suite 611 Los Angeles, CA 90067 12

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

19 **10.**

<u>POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES</u>

Embry agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion Embry shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

12. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

13. <u>GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES</u>

If a dispute arises with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, or by telephone, and/or in writing and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be filed in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand.

[Rest of page intentionally left blank]

3

4

5

6

7

8

14.

ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

9	Date: 02/11/2021	Date: 2 - 2 4 - 2021
10	N.C. Once	
11	By:	By:
12	Kim Embry	Surge Global Bakeries Holdings LLC
13		1-1sh Aghasi
14		
15	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
16		
17	Date:	-
18		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
l	I	11