

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

BETWEEN

CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.

AND

NINGBO RAFFINI IMPORT & EXPORT CO., LTD.

Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc. (“CAG”) and Ningbo Raffini Import & Export Co., Ltd. (hereto referred to as “Ningbo”), (CAG and Ningbo collectively referred to as, the “Parties”) enter into this agreement (“Settlement Agreement”) for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation to settle CAG’s allegations that Ningbo violated Proposition 65. Ningbo is a small entity based in China that sold hair rollers. The effective date of this Settlement Agreement shall be the date upon which it is fully executed by all Parties hereto (the “Effective Date”).

**1.0 Introduction**

1.1 CAG is a California-based entity that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer and industrial products.

1.2 Ningbo previously sold, at various times, Hair Rollers including but not limited to “The beautylist self-holding rollers, Set of 9, 2 ½ big curls”; “400176901161”; “Made in China” (referred to throughout as the “Covered Products”). The Covered Products are limited to those sold by Ningbo only.

1.3 CAG alleges that Covered Products contain Diisononyl Phthalate (“DINP”), and that Ningbo did not provide a required warning in compliance with





the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act (*Cal. Health & Safety Code* § 25249.5, *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”)).

1.4 On December 20, 2013, the Governor of California added DINP to the list of chemicals known to the State to cause Cancer. These additions took place more than twenty (20) months before CAG served its “Sixty-Day Notice of Intent To Sue For Violations Of The Safe Drinking Water And Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986” which is further described below.

1.5 DINP is referred to hereafter as the “Listed Chemical”.

1.6 On or about March 28 2019 (Attorney General Notice # 2019-00607), CAG served, Ross Stores Inc., Ross Procurement Inc., Ross Dress for Less, Inc., and DD’s Discounts, and certain relevant public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “Sixty-Day Notice Of Intent To Sue For Violations Of The Safe Drinking Water And Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986” regarding Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical.

1.7 On or about August 29, 2019 (Attorney General Notice # 2019-01680), CAG served Ningbo, and certain relevant public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “Sixty-Day Notice Of Intent To Sue For Violations Of The Safe Drinking Water And Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986” regarding Covered Products containing the Listed Chemical.

1.8 The Sixty-Day Notices (referred to as “Notices”) alleged that Ningbo and the other noticed parties violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn consumers in California that use of Covered Products exposes persons to the Listed Chemical.

1.9 The Parties enter into this Settlement Agreement to settle disputed claims between the Parties as set forth below concerning the Parties' and the Covered Products' compliance with Proposition 65 (the "Dispute").

1.10 By execution of this Settlement Agreement, the Parties do not admit any facts or conclusions of law, including, but not limited to, any facts or conclusions of law regarding any violation of Proposition 65, or any other statutory, regulatory, common law, or equitable doctrine. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed, considered, offered, or admitted as evidence of an admission or evidence of fault, wrongdoing, or liability by Ningbo, its officers, directors, employees, or parents, subsidiaries or affiliated corporations, in any administrative or judicial proceeding or litigation in any court, agency, or forum. Except for the allegations settled and compromised, nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall prejudice, waive, or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense that CAG or Ningbo may have against one another in any other pending legal proceeding as to allegations unrelated to the Dispute or claims released herein.

## **2.0 Release**

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution between CAG, acting in its individual capacity, on the one hand, and (a) Ningbo, and its owners, parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, sister and related companies, employees, shareholders, officers, directors, insurers, attorneys, predecessors, successors, and

assigns (collectively “Releasees”) and (b) all entities to whom Releasees directly or indirectly provide, distribute, or sell the Covered Products, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (“Downstream Releasees”), including Ross Stores, Inc. on the other hand, of any violation(s) or claimed violation(s) of Proposition 65 or any statutory or common law claim that has been, could have been or may in the future be asserted against the Releasees and Downstream Releasees regarding exposing persons to the Listed Chemical and the failure to warn about exposure to the Listed Chemical arising only in connection with the Covered Products manufactured, shipped, and/or otherwise distributed prior to the Effective Date, even if sold by Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date. The Covered Products are limited to those sold by Ningbo.

CAG, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives and releases with respect to the Covered Products all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys’ fees) (collectively “Claims”), against Releasees and/or Downstream Releasees that arise under Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law claims that were or could have been asserted in respect of any Covered Products sold up to the Effective Date, only to the extent that such Claims relate to Releasees’ and/or Downstream Releasees’ alleged exposure of persons to the

Listed Chemical contained in the Covered Products or any failure by Releasees and Downstream Releasees to warn about exposures to the Listed Chemical contained in the Covered Products.

CAG acknowledges that it is familiar with Section 1542 of Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

CAG, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which it may have under, or which may be conferred on it by the provisions of Civil Code § 1542 as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters. The release in this section shall have no force or effect until the full amount of payments set forth in Section 4.0 below are paid in full.

### **3.0 Ningbo's Duties**

3.1 Ningbo agrees, promises, and represents that after the Effective Date Ningbo shall reformulate any Covered Products manufactured after the Effective

Date and offered for sale in California to a point where the level of DINP in the Covered Products does not exceed 0.1% by weight.

3.2 Ningbo agrees, promises, and represents that, as of the Effective Date, to the extent it ships or sells any Covered Products in existing inventory that have not been reformulated, it will provide warnings on such Covered Products that comply with Proposition 65. The warnings shall be provided in such a conspicuously and prominent manner that will assure the message is made available and likely to be read, seen, or heard by the consumer prior to or at the time of the sale or purchase. The Parties agree that product labeling stating that:

**⚠ WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including Diisononyl Phthalate (“DINP”), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products for any Covered Products in existing inventory that had not been reformulated and were distributed and/or sold by Releasees or Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date.

#### **4.0 Payments**

4.1 Ningbo agrees, to pay a total of thirty thousand dollars (\$30,000) within fourteen (14) days from December 2, 2022 by separate wire transfer apportioned as follows:

4.1.1 Penalty: Ningbo shall pay of one thousand dollars (\$1,000) as follows: (a) to the State of California’s Office of Environmental Health

Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) in the amount of seven hundred and fifty dollars, (\$750), representing 75% of the total penalty; and (b) to Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc. in the amount of two hundred and fifty dollars (\$250), representing 25% of the total penalty. Additionally, two separate 1099s shall be issued for the above payments: The first 1099 shall be issued to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010, Attn: Mike Gyurics (EIN: 68-0284486) in the amount of seven hundred and fifty dollars (\$750). The second 1099 shall be issued in the amount of two hundred and fifty dollars (\$250) to CAG and delivered to Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi, 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W, Beverly Hills, CA 90212.

4.1.2 Attorneys' Fees and Costs: twenty-nine thousand dollars (\$29,000) of such payment shall be paid to Adam Gafni, Gafni & Levin LLP.

The total payment shall be made by wire transfer to:

Gafni & Levin LLP Client Trust Account  
Bank Name: Chase Bank, N.A.  
Account Holder: Gafni & Levin LLP  
Account number: 920555161  
Routing number\*: 322271627  
SWIFT CODE:CHASUS33

\*This routing number can only be used for direct deposits and ACH transactions. For wire transfers, please use routing number 021000021.

By the Effective Date, Adam Gafni shall provide Ningbo with its Employer Identification Number.

Authority to Enter Into Settlement Agreement

4.2 CAG represents that its signatory to this Settlement Agreement has full authority to enter into and legally bind CAG to this Settlement Agreement.

4.3 Ningbo represents that its signatory to this Settlement Agreement has full authority to enter into and legally bind Ningbo to this Settlement Agreement.

**5.0 Report of the Settlement Agreement to the Office of the Attorney General Of California**

5.1 CAG shall report this Settlement Agreement to the Attorney General's Office within five (5) days of the Parties' execution of this Settlement Agreement.

**6.0 Execution in Counterparts and Facsimile**

6.1 This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute the same document. A facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature shall be as valid as the original.

**7.0 Entire Agreement**

7.1 This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and all related prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, exist to bind any of the Parties.

**8.0 Modification of Settlement Agreement**



8.1 Any modification to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and signed by the Parties.

**9.0 Application of Settlement Agreement**

9.1 This Settlement Agreement shall apply to, be binding upon, and inure to the benefit of, CAG and the Releasees and Downstream Releasees identified in Section 2 above.

**10.0 Enforcement of Settlement Agreement**

10.1 Notwithstanding the above, CAG may bring an action to enforce any breach of the monetary settlement terms in Section 4.0, above, upon five (5) days written notice by CAG to Vendor of the alleged breach in accordance with the notification requirements set forth in Section 12.0, below. In case of any enforcement action, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs associated with such enforcement.

**11.0 Notification Requirements**

11.1 Any notice required or permitted hereunder shall be effective only if given in writing and delivered in person, certified or registered mail return receipt requested, or traceable overnight delivery service, to the following designees:

For CAG:

Reuben Yeroushalmi, Esq.  
YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI  
9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W  
Beverly Hills, CA 90212

For Ningbo:

Andy Luo  
[jun.luo@dentons.cn](mailto:jun.luo@dentons.cn)  
17F, 18F, IFC Tower  
E, 180 HeJi Street,  
Ningbo, Zhejiang, China

Any party may change its designee(s) for purposes of notification by providing written notice of such change pursuant to this section.

### **13.0 SEVERABILITY**

13.1 If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

### **14.0 GOVERNING LAW**

14.1 The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Listed Chemical and/or the Covered Products, then Ningbo shall provide written notice to CAG of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Title: \_\_\_\_\_

NINGBO RAFFINI IMPORT & EXPORT  
CO., LTD.

Dated: 2022 /12/2

By: Kerry Ge

Printed Name: kerry Ge

Title: Senzor Sales



CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.

Dated: December 2, 2022 By: Michael Marcus  
Printed Name: Michael Marcus  
Title: Director

NINGBO RAFFINI IMPORT & EXPORT  
CO., LTD.

Dated: 2022/12/2  
By: Kerry Ge  
Printed Name: Kerry Ge  
Title: Sensor Sales

