1	Brian Gaffney (State Bar No. 168778) LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY APC	
2		
3	446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310 Pacifica, CA 94044 Telephone: (650) 219 3187	
4	Email: brian@gaffneylegal.com	
5	Fredric Evenson (State Bar No. 198059) ECOLOGY LAW CENTER	
6	P.O. Box 1000	
7	Santa Cruz, California 95061 Telephone: (831) 454-8216	
	Email: evenson@ecologylaw.com	
8		
9	Counsel for Plaintiff ECOLOGICAL RIGHTS FOUNDATION	
10		
11	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE S COUNTY OF SAN	
12	ECOLOGICAL RIGHTS FOUNDATION,	Case No. CGC-20-582924
13	Plaintiff,	Cuse 110. CGC 20 302724
14	V.	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
15	MONOPRICE, INC., and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive	AS TO MONOPRICE, INC.
16	Defendente	
17	Defendants.	
18 -		
19	1. INTRODUCTION	

On April 3, 2020, the Ecological Rights Foundation ("ERF") acting on behalf of itself and the general public, filed a First Amended Complaint for civil penalties and injunctive relief ("Complaint") in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-19-580009 against defendant MONOPRICE, INC. (also referred to herein as "MONOPRICE" or "Defendant"). The Complaint alleges, among other things, that Defendant violated provisions of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65") by failing to give clear and reasonable warnings to those residents of California who use filaments incorporating a styrene monomer including acrylonitrile-butadiene-

28

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

styrene (ABS) filaments, polycarbonate ABS (PC-ABS) filaments and high impact polystyrene (HIPS) filaments in the operation of 3d printers or 3d pens, and 3D printers intended to be used with filaments incorporating a styrene monomer. The Complaint further alleges that use of such products expose people to Styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. The Complaint was based upon 60-Day Notice of Violation letters ("60-Day Notices"), sent by ERF to MONOPRICE, the California Attorney General, all District Attorneys, and all City Attorneys with populations exceeding 750,000.

For purposes of this settlement and Consent Judgment, "Covered Products" means (1) the following MONOPRICE filaments that the Complaint alleges incorporate a styrene monomer: ABS filaments, PC-ABS filaments and HIPS filaments which are sold, offered for sale or distributed by MONOPRICE in California for use in 3d printing, and (2) MONOPRICE 3D printers that can be used with filaments incorporating a styrene monomer.

Defendant is a business that employs more than ten persons, and manufactures, distributes, and sells Covered Products. The Complaint alleges that Covered Products that Defendant distributes, markets and sells - when heated in the operation of 3d printers or 3d pens - release Styrene into the air. The Complaint further alleges that people using the Covered Products, and others standing in the same room, inhale styrene in the normal course of use. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.8, Styrene is a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. ERF alleges that Covered Products that are manufactured, distributed or sold by Defendant for use in California require a warning under Proposition 65, pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, ERF and MONOPRICE (each a "Party" and collectively, the "Parties") stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over MONOPRICE, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full settlement and resolution of the allegations contained in the Complaint.

1.2 This Consent Judgment resolves claims that are denied and disputed. The parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full and final settlement of any and all claims

alleged in the Complaint between the parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. This Consent Judgment shall not constitute an admission with respect to any material allegation of the Complaint, each and every allegation of which MONOPRICE denies, nor may this Consent Judgment, or compliance with it, be used as evidence of any wrongdoing, misconduct, culpability or liability on the part of MONOPRICE.

1.3 The term "Effective Date" means the date that this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Warnings on Covered Products

(a) Within 45 days of the Effective Date, for all Covered Products manufactured, distributed or offered for sale in California, MONOPRICE shall include the following warning statements for filaments and 3D printers:

▲ WARNING: This Filament - when used in the operation of 3D Printers or 3D Pens - can expose you and others in the same room to styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer. www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

ALWAYS OPERATE THIS PRODUCT IN A WELL-VENTILATED AREA.

▲ WARNING: Operation of this product with filaments that include a styrene monomer (ABS / HIPS / PC-ABS) can expose you and others in the same room to styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.

www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

ALWAYS OPERATE THIS PRODUCT IN A WELL-VENTILATED AREA.

(b) MONOPRICE shall affix the Section 2.1(a) warning on the Covered Products or their packaging. MONOPRICE shall also ensure that the Section 2.1(a) warning statement is included in any online material promoting the Covered Products which may be viewed by consumers in California - on each Covered Products' display page or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning statement to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase (to the extent Covered Products are made available online by MONOPRICE or its authorized distributor(s). The warnings shall be displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render them likely to be read and understood by an ordinary

individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. Warnings may be contained in the same section of the instruction booklets that contain other safety warnings concerning the use of the Covered Products. The type size of the warning must be legible, and no smaller than any other warning provided with the Covered Products, and in no case less than twelve (12) point font.

The words "WARNING" and "ALWAYS USE THIS PRODUCT IN A WELL-VENTILATED AREA" shall be in upper case letters and bold as in the above warnings in this paragraph. The warning symbol to the left of the word "WARNING" must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline.

2.2 Notice to Downstream Releasees and Retailers

No later than 14 days following the Effective Date, MONOPRICE shall provide notice to all its distributors, wholesalers, direct customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees that sold Covered Products in California during the past three years ("Downstream Releasees and Retailers") as follows:

This is to inform you that your California sales inventory may include the below MONOPRICE products which may expose users to Styrene, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.

Part No.	Description
10545	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Black
10546	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool White
10547	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Red
10548	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool Black
10549	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool White
10550	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool Red
11040	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Blue
11042	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Bright Orange
11046	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool Blue
11047	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool Bright Green
11048	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 3MM 1kg/spool Bright Orange
11548	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Crystal Clear
11549	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Ultra Violet
11550	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Fluorescent Yellow
11776	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Gray
11777	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Pink
12297	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Gold

1	Part No.	Description
1	12298	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM 1kg/spool Silver
2	12301	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament HIPS Dissolvable 1.75MM 1kg/spool White
	14370	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Natural
3	14371	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Peak Green
4	14372	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Pine Green
	14373	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Magenta
5	14374	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Light Blue
6	14375	Monoprice Premium 3D Printer Filament ABS 1.75MM .5kg/Spool Brown
0	15841	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Black
7	15842	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm White
	15843	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Natural
8	15844	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Blue
9	15845	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Red
	15846	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Peak Green
10	15847	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Gray
11	15848	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 1kg 1.75mm Black
11	15849	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 1kg 1.75mm White
12	15850	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 1kg 3mm Black
12	15851	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 1kg 3mm White
13	16206	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Yellow
14	16207	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Orange
	16208	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Pink
15	16209	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Purple
16	16210	Monoprice MP Select ABS Plus+ Premium 3D Filament 0.5kg 1.75mm Silver
10	12050	
17	13860	Monoprice Maker Select 3D Printer v2
18	15365	Monoprice MP Select Mini 3D Printer V2 White
10	15710	Monoprice Maker Ultimate 3D Printer - MK11 DirectDrive Extruder / 24V Power System
19	15711	Monoprice Maker Select Plus 3D Printer
20	21666	Monoprice MP Mini Delta 3D Printer
20	21711	Monoprice MP Select Mini 3D Printer V2 Black MP Fully Enclosed 150 3D Printer Ultra Quiet Assisted Leveling Easy Wi-Fi Touchscreen
21	30525	(Inventor II)
	30526	MP Fully Enclosed Dual Extruder 3D Printer Easy Wi-Fi Touchscreen Camera (Inventor I)
22	30320	MP Fully Enclosed 300 3D Printer Easy Wi-Fi Touch Screen Large Build Size Assisted
23	30527	Leveling (Guider II)
23		Monoprice MP Delta Pro 3D Printer 32-bit ARM Processor Auto Level Silent Drive
24	30993	Touchscreen Fully Assembled
25		Monoprice MP Select Mini Pro 3D Printer Aluminum with Auto Leveling Heated
25	33012	Removable Bed Touch Screen and Wi-Fi
26	22020	Monoprice MP Voxel 3D Printer, Fully Enclosed, Easy Wi-Fi, Touchscreen, 8GB On-Board
	33820	Memory, Polar Cloud Enabled MR10 200v200mm 2D Printer Magnetic Heated Build Plate, Resume Brint Function
27	34437	MP10 300x300mm 3D Printer Magnetic Heated Build Plate Resume Print Function Assisted Leveling and Touchscreen
28	34438	MP10 Mini 200x200mm 3D Printer. Magnetic Heated Build Plate, Resume Printing
20	34430	wii 10 wiiii 2007200iiiii 30 Fiiillei. Wagnetic Heateu bullu Flate, nesullie Fiiillillig

2
_
3
4

5

7 8 9

6

10 11

13

12

15

14

17

16

18 19

20 21

22 23

24 25

26 27

28

Part No.	Description	
	Function, Assisted Leveling, and Touchscreen	
Monoprice MP Voxel 3D Printer Fully Enclosed Assisted Level Easy Wi-Fi Touchscreen		
35880	8GB On-Board Memory BLACK	
	Monoprice MP Voxel 3D Printer Fully Enclosed Assisted Level Easy Wi-Fi Touch Screen	
35881	8GB On-Board Memory WHITE	

The notice provided by MONOPRICE pursuant to this section shall also instruct the Downstream Releasees and Retailers that, unless the Covered Products already bear a Proposition 65-compliant warning, they must attach stick on labels to the front of Covered Products in the inventory of the Downstream Releasees and Retailers, and instruct that the Section 2.1(a) warning statement is included in any online material by Downstream Distributors and Retailers promoting Covered Products which may be viewed by consumers in California.

The stick-on labels provided by MONOPRICE shall comply with Sections 2.1(a) and 2.1(b) above. MONOPRICE shall provide such stick-on labels in sufficient quantity and for sufficient duration to meet the inventory needs of each Downstream Releasee and Retailer.

3. **SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS**

Civil Penalties and Payments In Lieu of Penalties

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(2), MONOPRICE shall pay \$6,000 in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount paid to Ecological Rights Foundation. Defendant will provide these payments in two checks for the following amounts made payable to: 1) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$4,500.00 and 2) "Ecological Rights Foundation" in the amount of \$1,500.00.

The payments to OEHHA and Ecological Rights Foundation shall be sent no later than 10 days after the Effective Date. All payments shall be sent via USPS certified mail, return receipt requested, to the following addresses:

All payments to Ecological Rights Foundation shall be delivered to:

_

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

1)

14 15

16

- 0

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

2425

26

27

28

Fredric Evenson 109 Quarry Lane Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The payment to OEHHA shall be delivered to:

Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment P.O. Box 4010 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

3.2 Attorneys' Fees and Litigation Costs

MONOPRICE shall reimburse ERF's counsel for \$64,000 in ERF's fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to MONOPRICE's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. The payment shall be made payable to "Brian Gaffney Attorney Client Trust Account" and sent no later than fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date via USPS certified mail, return receipt requested, to the following address:

LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNEY, A Professional Corporation 446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310 Pacifica, California 94044

4. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

4.1 Release of MONOPRICE

ERF acting on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees (all of whom, collectively, are defined as the "ERF Releasors"), releases MONOPRICE, and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, marketplaces directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys and each entity to whom MONOPRICE directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees and all other upstream and downstream entities in the distribution chain, and the predecessors, successors, and assigns of any of them (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims raised in the 60-Day Notices and in the Complaint through the Effective Date based on alleged failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings about alleged exposures to Styrene from use of the Covered

Products. This settlement is a full, final and binding resolution of all claims that were or could have been asserted against MONOPRICE, and/or the Releasees based on the 60-Day Notices alleging failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings in connection with alleged exposures to Styrene contained in the Covered Products.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payment to be made pursuant to Section 3 above, the ERF Releasors provide a release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands against MONOPRICE and/or any of the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, limited to and arising out of claims that were or could have been asserted against MONOPRICE and/or the Releasees based on the 60-Day Notices for failure to provide warnings for the alleged exposure to Styrene from use of the Covered Products.

4.2 **MONOPRICE's Release of ERF**

MONOPRICE, on behalf of itself and the Releasees, hereby waives any and all claims against ERF and the ERF Releasors for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by ERF and/or its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Covered Products.

4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. ERF on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and MONOPRICE, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 above may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A general release does not extend to claims that the creditor or releasing

5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17 18

19

21

20

23

22

24 25

26

27

28

party does not know or suspect to exist in his or her favor at the time of executing the release, and that if known by him or her, would have materially affected his or her settlement with the debtor or released party.

ERF and MONOPRICE each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

5. ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT

5 1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the parties hereto. Notwithstanding section 4. 1 supra, the parties may, by noticed motion or order to show cause before the Superior Court of San Francisco County, giving the notice required by law, enforce the terms and conditions contained herein. In the event that a dispute arises with respect to any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment, the Parties shall meet and confer within 10 days after either Party receives written notice of an alleged violation of this Agreement. In any proceeding brought by either party to enforce this Consent Judgment, such party may seek whatever fines, costs, penalties or remedies as may be provided by law for any violation of Proposition 65 or this Consent Judgment.

6. MODIFICATION OF JUDGMENT

This Consent Judgment may be modified only upon written agreement of the parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon, or upon motion of any party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.

7. TERMINATION AND RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement and enforce the terms this Consent Judgment.

8. **AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE**

Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.

9. SERVICE ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

9.1 ERF shall serve a copy of this Consent Judgment, signed by both parties, on the California Attorney General on behalf of the parties so that the Attorney General may review this

Consent Judgment prior to its submittal to the Court for approval. No sooner than forty five (45) days after the Attorney General has received the aforementioned copy of this Consent Judgment, and in the absence of any written objection by the Attorney General to the terms of this Consent Judgment, the parties may then submit it to the Court for approval.

10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

10.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the parties.

11. GOVERNING LAW

11.1 The validity, construction and performance of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California, without reference to any conflicts of law provisions of California law.

12. EXECUTION AND COUNTERPARTS

12.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document.

13. COURT APPROVAL

13.1 If this Consent Judgment is not approved by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect, and cannot be used in any proceeding for any purpose.

14. NOTICES

- 14.1 In the event that a dispute arises with respect to any of the provisions of this Agreement, the Parties shall meet and confer within 14 days after either Party receives written notice of an alleged violation of this Agreement.
- 14.2 Any notices or payments due under this Consent Judgment shall be sent by USPS certified mail, return receipt requested.

1		If to Ecological Rights Foundation:	Fredric Evenson Ecology Law Center
2			P.O. Box 1000
3		With a copy to:	Santa Cruz, CA 95061
4	1	LAW OFFICES OF BRIAN GAFFNE	EY, A Professional Corporation
5		446 Old County Road, Suite 100-310 Pacifica, California 94044	
6		If to MONOPRICE, INC.:	Bernard Luthi
7			Monoprice, Inc.
8			1 Pointe Drive #400 Brea, CA 92821
9			
10		With a copy to:	Linda Liu
11			Knobbe Martens Olson & Bear, LLP 2040 Main St., 14 th Floor
12			Irvine, CA 92614
13			
14		Any party, from time to time, may spe	cify in writing to the other party a change of
15	//		
16	//		
17	//		
18	//		
19	//		
20			
21	//		
22	//		
23	//		
24	//		
25			
26	//		
27	//		
28			

	address to which all notices and other commu	nications shall be sent.
1	1 IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
2	2	
3	3 DATED: <u>January 14, 2021</u>	ECOLOGICAL RIGHTS FOUNDATION
4	4	Ecological Rights Foundation BY: James Kanjut EXEC. DIR.
5	5	BY: James Jampet EXEC. DIR.
6	6	JAMES LAMPORT, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
7	7 DATED:	MONOPRICE, INC.
8	8	By:
9	9	Its:
10	0	
11	IT IS SO ORDERED ADJUDGED AND DECRI	EED·
12	Z DATED	
13		
14	JUI	OGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
15		
16 17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25	5	
26	6	
27	7	

CONSENT JUDGMENT - CGC-20-582924

1	address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.		
2	IT IS SO STIPULATED:		
3	DATED: ECOLOGICAL RIGHTS FOUNDATION		
5	By:		
6	ITS:		
7			
8	DATED: 1/20/2021 MONOPRICE, INC.		
9	BK: MUTA		
10	17s: C = 0		
11	118.		
12			
13	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:		
14	DATED:		
15	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
16	JODGE OF THE BOT ERROR COOK!		
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
10			