State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting

FORM JUS 1501

CITY

Van Nuys

Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612

PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT FILING - Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(e) and (f)  REPORT OF SETTLEMENT							
Please	print or type required information	☑ Original Filing ☐ Supple	emental Filing				
	PLAINTIFF(S)						
	Shefa LMV Inc.						
PARTIES TO THE ACTION	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN SETTLEMEN Odin Fashion, Inc.						
	COURT DOCKET NUMBER 20STCV20651		COURTNAME SUPERIOR COURT OF	Ch les Angeles Co			
CASE	20STCV20651 SHORTCASENAME Shefa LMV, Inc. v. E	lam's Hallmark, e	<u> </u>	cii, 200 imgotos co			
	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF  COMPLIANT PRODUCTS AND WARNINGS						
6	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY	PAYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES	PAYMENT: OTHER	T.			
	\$1,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$0.00	yinO y			
REPORT INFO	SUBMITTED TO COURT? COURT, I	FTER ENTRY OF JUDGMENT BY REPORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT SUBMITTED TO ATTORNEY GENER	DATE SETTLEMENT SIGNED  4 /18/2022	For Internal Use Only			
_	COPY OF SI	For It					
	NAME OF CONTACT			I			
	Daniel N. Greenbau	m		L=, ==,, ===			
ه بی				TELEPHONE NUMBER (818) 809-2199			
FILER	ADDRESS 7120 Havvenhurst Ave., Suite 320			FAX NUMBER (424) 243-7698			

FILING INSTRUCTIONS: This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the settlement to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

E-MAIL ADDRESS

dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com

STATE

CA

ZIP

1	LAW OFFICE OF DANIEL N. GREENBAUM						
2	Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. (SBN 268104) The Hathaway Building						
3	7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320 Van Nuys, CA 91406						
4	Telephone: (818) 809-2199						
5	Facsimile: (424) 243-7689 Email: dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com						
6	Attorney for Plaintiff SHEFA LMV, INC.						
7							
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA						
9	COLINITY OF LOCANCELES						
10	COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES						
11	SHEFA LMV, INC.,	)	Case No. 20STCV20651				
12	Plaintiff,	)					
13	VS.	)	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO ODIN FASHION, INC.				
14	ELAM'S HALLMARK; and DOES 1 through 100, Inclusive;	)	AS TO ODIN FASITION, INC.				
15	Defendant.	)	Action Filed: June 1, 2020				
16		)					
17		)					
18		=					
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							

### 1. INTRODUCTION

# 1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment") is entered into by and between plaintiff Shefa LMV, Inc. ("Shefa" or "Plaintiff") and Odin Fashion, Inc. ("Defendant," with Shefa and Defendant individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties.")

### 1.2 Plaintiff

Shefa is a public benefit, non-profit corporation that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

# 1.3 Settling Defendant

Defendant employs ten (10) or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code §25249.6 et seq. ("**Proposition 65**").

#### 1.4 Products Covered

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are plastic purse bag products manufactured by or for Defendant, imported by or for Defendant, or distributed or sold by or for Defendant, including, but not limited to, Bags x Beauties Michelle Collection Clear and Sequin Clutches that contain DEHP (hereinafter "Clutches"), a Rose Gold Coin Purses TicTok that contain DEHP (hereinafter "coin purse"), and Iridescent Silver Fanny Packs that contain DINP (hereinafter "fanny packs") (collectively, the "Covered Products") for sale within the State of California, without first giving clear and reasonable warning.

# 1.5 General Allegations

Shefa alleges that Defendant manufactures, imports, sells, or distributes, for sale in the state of California, the Covered Products without first providing a clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65. DEHP (CAS # 68515-48-0) is a chemical listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity. DINP (CAS # 28553-12-0) is a chemical listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the state to cause cancer

### 1.6 Notices of Violation

On June 19, 2019, Shefa served Defendant's retailer and the requisite public enforcement agencies with Sixty Day Notices of Violation (the "Notices") alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Clutches expose users to DEHP and the fanny packs expose users to DINP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notices. After learning about the identity of Defendant Odin Fashion, Inc. from Elam's Hallmark, on January 19, 2021, Shefa served Defendant's retailer and the requisite public enforcement agencies with Sixty Day Notices of Violation (the "Notices") alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Clutches expose users to DEHP and the fanny packs expose users to DINP

# 1.7 Complaint

On June 1, 2020, Shefa filed the instant complaint in the Superior Court in and for the County of Los Angeles against Defendant, alleging violations of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, based on exposures to DEHP contained in the Clutches and DINP contained in the Fanny packs sold in the State of California (the "Complaint"). After learning about the identity of Defendant Odin Fashion, Inc. from Elam's Hallmark, on October 5, 2021, Plaintiff filed a DOE Amendment naming Defendant to the instant action.

### 1.8 No Admission

Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notices and Complaint and maintains that all the products it has manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, the same being specifically denied by Defendant. This section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Defendant's obligations, responsibilities,

and duties under this Consent Judgment.

# 1.9 Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles, the Defendant agrees that it employs or has employed ten or more persons during time periods relevant to the Complaint and that this Court has jurisdiction over the Parties to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65.

### 1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date the Consent Judgment is approved and entered by the Court.

# 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: COMPLIANT PRODUCTS AND WARNINGS

#### 2.1 Reformulation Standards

As of the Effective Date, Defendant shall not manufacture for sale in California any Clutches unless the Clutches contain DEHP in concentrations less than or equal to 1000 parts per million ("ppm") when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or any other scientifically reliable methodology for determining the concentration of DEHP in the Clutches. Defendant also shall not manufacture for sale in California any Fanny packs unless the Fanny packs contain DINP in concentrations less than or equal to 1000 parts per million ("ppm") when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or any other scientifically reliable methodology for determining the concentration of DINP in the Fanny packs.

# 2.2 Warning Standards

Defendant agrees, promises, and represents that, as of the Effective Date, to the extent they ship or sell Covered Products that do not meet the reformulation standards set forth above in Section 2.1, Defendant will provide warnings on such Covered Products that comply with

Proposition 65. The warnings shall be provided in a conspicuous and prominent manner such that they will be likely to be read or seen by the consumer prior to or at the time of the sale or purchase.

The Parties agree that the warning set forth below shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to any Covered Products that are not reformulated:

For Clutches,

- a) the text, "WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov." accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016; or
- (b) the text, "WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm www.P65Warnings.ca.gov." accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016.

For Fanny packs,

- (c) the text, "WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including Diisononyl Phthalates (DINP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov." accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016; or
  - (d) the text, "WARNING: Cancer www.P65Warnings.ca.gov." accompanied

by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word,

"WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016.

The triangular warning symbol specified in Section 2.2 shall be in yellow with a black exclamation mark; *provided however*, the symbol may be printed in black and white if the Covered Product label is not printed using the color yellow.

# 2.3 Compliance with Warning Regulations.

Defendant shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to Section 2.2 of this Consent Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment after the Effective Date.

# 2.4 Covered Products in the Stream of Commerce.

Any Covered Products that have been produced, distributed, shipped, or sold by Defendant prior to the Effective Date, shall not be subject to the requirements of Section 2.1 or 2.2.

# 3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

- **3.1 Payment from Defendant**. Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall make the Total Settlement Payment of \$13,000.00.
- **3.2 Allocation of Payments.** The Total Settlement Payment shall be paid in three (3) separate checks made payable and allocated as follows:
- 3.2.1 Civil Penalty. Defendant shall pay \$1,000.00 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). The civil penalty shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to Shefa and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$750.00 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Attn: Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

# For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Attn: Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street, MS #19B Sacramento, CA 95814

The Shefa portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$250.00 shall be made payable to Shefa LMV, Inc. and associated with taxpayer identification number 81-0907002. This payment shall be delivered to the Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

3.2.2 Attorney's Fees and Costs. A reimbursement of Shefa's attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$12,000.00 payable to the "Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum," and associated with taxpayer identification number 46-4580172. This payment shall be delivered to the Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

#### 4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

### 4.1 Public Release

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Shefa and Defendant of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by Shefa, acting on behalf of itself and in a representative capacity in the public interest under Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, against Defendant, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, manufacturers, suppliers, directors, officers, employees, attorneys, and the predecessors, successors, or assigns of each of them, and each entity to whom Defendant directly or indirectly exports, distributes or sells the Covered Products, including, without limitation, distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees, including but not limited to Elam's Hallmark ("Releasees"), based on failure to warn of alleged exposures to DEHP from Clutches and DINP from Fanny packs manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California by Defendant prior to the Effective Date.

The release in this Section 4.1 applies to all Covered Products that Defendant manufactured, distributed, or sold prior to the Effective Date, regardless of the date any other Releasee distributes or sells the Covered Products.

Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant and the Releasees with respect to DEHP in Clutches and DINP in Fanny packs manufactured, sold, or distributed on and after the Effective Date.

# 4.2 Shefa's Individual Release of Claims

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, Shefa, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims that it may have against Defendant and Releasees, including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses, including, without limitation, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees arising under Proposition 65 for unwarned exposures to DEHP in Clutches and DINP in Fanny packs manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale by Defendant prior to the Effective Date. The releases in Section 4.2 are provided in Shefa's individual capacity and are not releases on behalf of the public.

### 4.3 Defendant's Release of Shefa

Defendant, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims that it may have against Shefa and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Shefa and its attorneys and other representatives in the course of investigating the claims set forth in the Complaint or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter.

# 4.4 Release of Unknown Claims

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts contained in the Notices, or alleged in the Complaint, relating to the Covered Products, will hereafter be discovered or developed. Shefa, on behalf of itself only, acknowledges that this Consent Judgment

is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims through and including the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. Shefa acknowledges that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless Shefa intends to release such claims, and in doing so waives California Civil Code § 1542, which reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Shefa understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code § 1542 is that, even if Shefa suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to, the Covered Products, Shefa will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Defendant or any of the Releasees.

### 5. ENFORCEMENT

5.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be enforced exclusively by the Parties hereto. A Party may enforce any of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment only after that Party first provides sixty (60) days' notice to the Party allegedly failing to comply with the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment and attempts to resolve such Party's failure to comply in an open and good faith manner. The provisions of sections 5.2 through 5.3 shall be the exclusive means of enforcing alleged violations of Section 2 of this Consent Judgment.

### **5.2** Notice of Violation

Prior to bringing any proceeding to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, Plaintiff shall provide a written notice of violation ("NOV") to Defendant that includes information sufficient for them to be able to understand and correct the violation, including but not limited to:

(a) the name of the product, (b) specific dates when the product was sold in California, (c) the store, website, or other place at which the product was available for sale to consumers, and (d) any other evidence or other support for the allegations in the notice, including all test data obtained by

Plaintiff regarding the Covered Product.

# **5.3** Notice of Election Response

Within 30 days of receiving an NOV, Defendant shall serve a Notice of Election ("NOE") either contesting or not contesting the NOV.

- 5.3.1 Non-Contested NOV. Plaintiffs shall take no further action regarding the alleged violation against a Defendant that serves a NOE that elects not to contest the NOV and meets one of the following conditions:
- (a) The Covered Product was produced, distributed, shipped, or sold by Defendant for sale in California before the Effective Date, or
- (b) Since receiving the NOV the Defendant has taken corrective action by either (i) taking all steps necessary to bring the sale of the product into compliance under the terms of this Consent Judgment, or (ii) requesting that its customers in California remove the Covered Products identified in the NOV from sale in California and destroy or return the Covered Products to Defendant, or (iii) refute the information provided in Section 5.2.
- **5.3.2 Contested NOV.** If a Defendant serves a NOE electing to contest the NOV, the provisions of this Section 5.3.2 shall apply.
- (a) Defendant may request that the sample(s) of Covered Products tested by Plaintiff be subject to confirmatory testing at an EPA or California-accredited laboratory.
- (b) If the confirmatory testing establishes that the Covered Products do not contain DEHP or DINP, as applicable, in excess of the levels allowed in Section 2.1, above, Plaintiff shall take no further action regarding the alleged violation. If the testing does not establish compliance with Section 2.1, above, Defendant may withdraw its NOE to contest the violation and may serve a new NOE pursuant to Section 5.3.1.
- (c) If Defendant does not withdraw an NOE to contest the NOV or take action under Section 5.3.1, above, the Parties shall meet and confer for a period of no less than 30 days before Plaintiff may take action seeking to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment.

**5.4** In any proceeding brought by either Party to enforce this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

# 6. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court.

### 7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered Products, then Defendant may provide written notice to Shefa of any asserted change in the law, and with the exception of Sections 3.1 and 3.2 above, have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment, with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected. None of the terms of this Consent Judgment shall have any application to Covered Products sold outside of the State of California.

### 8. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

To Defendant:	To Shefa:

Lawrence Lin	Daniel N. Greenbaum
ODIN FASHION, INC.	Law Office of Daniel N. Greenbaum
1239 Broadway, Room 603	7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320
New York NY 10001	Van Nuys, CA 91406

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other Party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

# 9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE AND PDF SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts, and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which,

when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document. 1 10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f) 2 3 Plaintiff agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f). 4 POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES 5 11. 6 The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f), 7 Shefa is obligated to file a noticed motion to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. 8 Upon the Parties' execution of this Consent Judgment, Shefa promptly shall proceed to submit this 9 Consent Judgment to the Court with a motion seeking Court approval. 10 12. **MODIFICATION** This Consent Judgment may only be modified by a written instrument executed by the Party 11 or Parties to be bound thereby, and after approval by the Court upon a noticed motion. Any motion 12 13 to modify shall be served on all Parties and the Office of the Attorney General. 14 15 **13. AUTHORIZATION** 16 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their 17 respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this 18 Consent Judgment. 19 20 AGREED TO: AGREED TO: 21 4/18/2022 Date: 4/18/2022 22 Date: 23 24 25 By: 26 SHEFA LMV, INC. ODIN FASHION, INC. 27 28

1	[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT					
2	Please note that on, 2022 at 8:30am, Plaintiff Shefa LMV Inc.'s					
3	("Plaintiff") Motion for Court Approval of Settlement Agreement and Entry of Consent Judgment					
4	as to Defendant Odin Fashion, Inc. came for hearing before this Court in Department 47, the					
5	Honorable Joel L. Lofton presiding. Counsel for Plaintiff did [not] appear; counsel for Defendant					
$\begin{bmatrix} 6 \\ 7 \end{bmatrix}$	did [not] appear.					
8	After full consideration of the points and authorities and related pleadings submitted, the Court					
9	GRANTED Plaintiff's Motion pursuant to and in accordance with Health & Safety Code					
0	§25249.7(f)(4). The Court reviewed the above Settlement Agreement and makes the following					
1	findings pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f)(4):					
2	a. The injunctive relief required by the Settlement Agreement complies with Health &					
3	Safety Code § 25249.7;					
4	b. The reimbursement of fees and costs to be paid pursuant to the Settlement Agreement					
5	is reasonable under California law; and					
.6	c. The civil penalty amount to be paid pursuant to Settlement Agreement is reasonable.					
17 18 19 20 21	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED.					
22	Date Judge of the Superior Court					
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
28						
	13					