

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

### 1. INTRODUCTION

**1.1 The Parties.** This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Gabriel Espinoza (“Espinoza”) and Consumer Value Products, Inc. (“Consumer Value”). Together, Espinoza and Consumer Value are collectively referred to as the “Parties.” Espinoza is an individual who resides in the State of California, and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Espinoza alleges that Consumer Value is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

**1.2 General Allegations.** Espinoza alleges that Consumer Value has exposed individuals to the chemical chromium (hexavalent compounds) (“chromium (VI)”) from its sales of Work Fare leather cuff gloves without first providing users and consumers of the product with a clear and reasonable health hazard exposure warning as required pursuant to Proposition 65. Chromium (VI) is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and adverse developmental effects in both males and females.

**1.3 Product Description.** The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are leather gloves, an example of which is “Work Fare leather cuff gloves” (the “Products”) that have been imported, distributed, offered for sale and/or sold in California by Consumer Value.

**1.4 Notice of Violation.** On February 18, 2020, Espinoza served Consumer Value, Salado Sales, Inc., Chevron Stations, Inc. and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled “Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, *et seq.*” (the “Notice”). The Notice provided Consumer Value and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Consumer Value was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn California consumers and customers that use of the Products will expose them to chromium (VI). To the Parties’s knowledge, no public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT


**1.5 No Admission.** Consumer Value denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with Proposition 65. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Consumer Value of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Consumer Value of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Consumer Value. However, this § 1.5 shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Consumer Value maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.

**1.6 Effective Date.** For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term “Effective Date” shall mean the date: a) this Agreement is last executed by the Parties; and b) Espinoza has provided Consumer Value with all applicable W-9 tax identification documents pursuant to Section 3.2(c), below.

## 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS


**2.1 Clear and Reasonable Warning.** Within ninety (90) days of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 2.1 and 2.2 must be provided for all Products that Consumer Value manufacturers, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California. There shall be no obligation for Consumer Value to provide an exposure warning for Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date. The warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 2.1(a) or (b), respectively:

(a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

 **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including chromium (hexavalent compounds), which are known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

(b) **Alternative Warning:** Consumer Value may, but is not required to, use the alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 2.1(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

 **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

**2.2** A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 2.2 must print the word “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Products does not use the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the Products’ packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. The warning may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings.

If Consumer Value sells Products via an internet website to customers located in California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if the foregoing warning appears either: (a) on the same web page on which a Product is displayed and/or described; (b) on the same page as the price for the Product; (c) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process or (d) by use of the word **WARNING** with a hyperlink to a warning under section 2.1(a) or (b) pursuant to California Code of Regulations title 27 section 25602(b). Alternatively, a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow or white equilateral triangle may appear adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, price, or checkout listing of the Product, if the warning statement appears elsewhere on the same web page in a manner that clearly associates it with the product(s) to which the warning applies.

**2.3 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** The Parties agree that Consumer Value shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Settlement Agreement by either adhering to §§ 2.1 and 2.2 of this Settlement Agreement or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) after the Effective Date.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

**3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)**

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Consumer Value shall pay two thousand dollars (\$2,000.00) as a Civil Penalty in accordance with this Section. The Civil Penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the Penalty remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Penalty remitted to Espinoza. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below. For all amounts due and owing that are not received within the payment times set forth below, Consumer Value shall pay a late civil penalty payment fee equal to \$100/day to be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(c)(1) and (d).

**3.1 Civil Penalty.** Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, Consumer Value shall issue two separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of one thousand five hundred dollars (\$1,500.00); and to (b) “Brodsky & Smith, LLC in Trust for Espinoza” in the amount of five hundred dollars (\$500.00). The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

**3.2 Payment Procedures.**

(a) **Issuance of Payments.** Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Espinoza, pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line “Prop 65 Penalties”) at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

(b) **Copy of Payments to OEHHA.** Consumer Value agrees to provide Espinoza's counsel with a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Espinoza, to be delivered to the address provided in § 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(c) **Tax Documentation.** Consumer Value agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and Espinoza agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) "Gabriel Espinoza" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided within five (5) days after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties;

(ii) "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

#### 4. **REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The Parties acknowledge that Espinoza and his counsel offered to reach preliminary agreement on the material terms of this dispute before reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them. The Parties thereafter reached an accord on the compensation due to Espinoza and his counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Under these legal principles, Consumer Value shall reimburse Espinoza's counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

Consumer Value's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Consumer Value shall issue a check payable to "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" in the amount of twenty-three thousand dollars (\$23,000.00) for delivery to the address identified in § 3.2(a)(i), above.

### 5. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

**5.1 Release of Consumer Value and Downstream Customers and Entities.** This Settlement Agreement is a full, final and binding resolution between Espinoza, acting on his own behalf, and Consumer Value, of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by Espinoza or on behalf of his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assigns ("Releasers") for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to chromium (VI) contained in the Products, and Releasers hereby release any such claims against Consumer Value and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, shareholders, marketplaces, directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, successors and assignees, and each entity to whom Consumer Value directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products, including but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, including but not limited to: a) Salado Sales, Inc. and b) Chevron Stations, Inc., and its respective subsidiaries, affiliates and parents, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to §§ 3 and 4 above, Espinoza, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby covenants not to sue and waives any right to institute, participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that he may have, including without limitation, all actions and causes of action in law and in equity, all obligations, expenses (including without limitation all attorneys' fees, expert fees, and investigation fees, and costs), damages, losses, liabilities and demands against any of the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to the chemical chromium (VI) in the Products.

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

**5.2 Consumer Value's Release of Espinoza.** Consumer Value, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Espinoza, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Espinoza and/or his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Products.

**5.3 California Civil Code § 1542.** It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Products will develop or be discovered. Espinoza on behalf of himself only, on one hand, and Consumer Value, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in §§ 5.1 and 5.2, above, may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Espinoza and Consumer Value each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

**5.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65.** The Parties agree that compliance by Consumer Value with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to chromium (VI) from use of the Products. The Parties agree that after the Effective Date, should compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to chromium (VI) in the Products be governed by operation of law (*i.e.*, Court Order regarding chromium (VI) in leather products, or other regulatory exemption) Consumer Value may choose to comply with such operation of law and such action would not be a breach or violation of this Settlement Agreement.

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

**5.5. Public Benefit.** It is the Parties' understanding that the commitments agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Consumer Value under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the Parties' intent that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Consumer Value's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to chromium (VI) prior to use of the Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Consumer Value is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

### **6. SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the Settlement Agreement being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Settlement Agreement.

### **7. GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable or limited by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, Consumer Value shall provide written notice to Espinoza of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, a Product is so affected.

### **8. NOTICES**

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class



SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

(registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For Consumer Value:

Todd O. Maiden  
Reed Smith LLP  
101 Second Street, Suite 1800  
San Francisco, CA, 94105

For Espinoza:

Evan J. Smith  
Brodsky & Smith, LLC  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 510  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Either party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

Espinoza agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

**11. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

**12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

**13. AUTHORIZATION**

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: 7/30/2020

Date: 9/18/2020

By:   
Gabriel Espinoza

By:   
Consumer Value Products, Inc.