

1 Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)
2 BRODSKY & SMITH
3 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
4 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
5 Tel: (877) 534-2590
6 Fax: (310) 247-0160

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

8
9 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

11 ANTHONY FERREIRO,
12 Plaintiff,
13 v.
14 PBI GROUP, LLC, PBI GROUP, INC., SUPRE,
15 INC.,
16 Defendants.

Case No.: RG21088866

CONSENT JUDGMENT

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony
3 Ferreiro acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter “Ferreiro”) and PBI Group, LLC (“PBI
4 Group” or “Defendant”) with Ferreiro and Defendant collectively referred to as the “Parties” and
5 each of them as a “Party.” Ferreiro is an individual residing in California that seeks to promote
6 awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating
7 hazardous substances contained in consumer products. PBI Group is alleged to be a person in the
8 course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et
9 seq.

10 1.2 **Allegations and Representations.** Ferreiro alleges that Defendant has exposed
11 individuals to di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) from its sales of are Hempz his kit – cases/bags
12 without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. DEHP is
13 listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and
14 reproductive toxicity.

15 1.3 **Notice of Violation/Complaint.** On or about February 25, 2020, Ferreiro served
16 PBI Group, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of
17 Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Notice”), alleging that Defendant
18 violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Studio Art pencil
19 pouches expose users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently
20 prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On January 26, 2021, Ferreiro filed a complaint (the
21 “Complaint”) in the matter.

22 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has
23 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Complaint filed in this matter, that
24 venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter,
25 and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all
26 claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein
27 and/or in the Notice.
28

1 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in Ferreiro’s Notice and
2 Complaint and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment
3 shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of
4 law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission
5 by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being
6 specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the
7 obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.
8

9 **2. DEFINITIONS**

10 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means are Hempz his kit –
11 cases/bags that are manufactured, distributed and/or offered for sale in California by PBI Group.

12 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date this Consent Judgment is
13 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

14 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

15 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is
16 signed by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that PBI Group directly
17 manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either: (a) be
18 Reformulated Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable
19 exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 and 3.4, below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a
20 “Reformulated Product” is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in §
21 3.2 below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated
22 Product.

23 3.2 **Reformulation Standard.** “Reformulated Products” shall mean Covered Products
24 that contain concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DEHP
25 when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A
26 and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose
27 of determining the phthalate content in a solid substance.
28

1 3.3 **Clear and Reasonable Warning.** As of the date this Consent Judgment is signed
2 by both Parties, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in
3 this §§ 3.3 and 3.4 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers,
4 imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There
5 shall be no obligation for Defendant to provide a warning for Covered Products that enter the stream
6 of commerce prior to the date this Consent Judgment is signed by both Parties. The warning shall
7 consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.3(a) or (b), respectively:

8 (a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

9 ⚠ **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-
10 ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause
11 cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to
www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

12 (b) **Alternative Warning:** PBI Group may, but is not required to, use the alternative
13 short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

14 ⚠ **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

15 3.4 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word
16 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to
17 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral
18 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use
19 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller
20 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The warning shall be affixed to or printed on the
21 Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or
22 automatic process, providing that the warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared
23 with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an
24 ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A warning may be contained
25 in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety
26 warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same size as
27 those other safety warnings.

28

1 In addition to affixing the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** to the Covered Product's
2 packaging or labeling, the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** shall be posted on websites where
3 Samsonico offers Covered Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this
4 Section shall be satisfied if the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**, or a clearly marked hyperlink
5 using the word "**WARNING**," appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently
6 displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this
7 Section, Samsonico shall (a) post the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** on its own website and,
8 if it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers; and (b) if it does not
9 have the ability to post the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** on the websites of its third-party
10 internet sellers, provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California
11 Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Product that have been
12 provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section
13 25600.2 are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning
14 requirements of this Section.

15 **3.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in
16 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent
17 Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office
18 of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") applicable to the product and the
19 exposure at issue after the Effective Date..

20 **4. MONETARY TERMS**

21 **4.1 Civil Penalty.** PBI Group shall pay \$2,500.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to Health
22 and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health &
23 Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the
24 Civil Penalty remitted to Ferreiro, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d).

25 **4.1.1** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, PBI Group shall issue two
26 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,875.00; and
27

28

1 to (b) "Brodsky & Smith in Trust for Ferreiro" in the amount of \$625.00. Payment owed to
2 Ferreiro pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment address:

3 Evan J. Smith, Esquire
4 Brodsky & Smith
5 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805
6 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

7 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly
8 to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

9 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

10 Mike Gyurics
11 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
12 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
13 P.O. Box 4010
14 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

15 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

16 Mike Gyurics
17 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
18 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
19 1001 I Street
20 Sacramento, CA 95814

21 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky & Smith at the address set
22 forth above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

23 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, PBI Group shall pay
24 \$22,500.00 to Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky & Smith") as complete reimbursement for Ferreiro's
25 attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to PBI Group
26 attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public
27 interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

28 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro
acting on his own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and PBI Group, and its parents,
shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents,
attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their

1 predecessors, successors and assigns (“Defendant Releasees”), and all entities from whom they
2 obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but
3 not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees
4 retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members (“Downstream Releasees”), of all claims for
5 violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to DEHP from Covered Products as set forth in the
6 Notice, with respect to any Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by PBI Group prior
7 to the Effective Date. It is the Parties’ intention that this Consent Judgment shall have preclusive
8 effect such that no other actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to act in his, her, or its
9 interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to
10 any violation of Proposition 65 that was alleged in the Complaint, or that could have been brought
11 pursuant to the Notice against PBI Group and/or the Downstream Releasees of the Covered
12 Products (“Proposition 65 Claims”). Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment
13 constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 to exposure to DEHP from use of the Covered Product.

14 5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro, on behalf of himself, his past and current
15 agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and *not* in his representative
16 capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of
17 legal action and releases PBI Group, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees from any
18 and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts,
19 contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and
20 attorneys’ fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,
21 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising
22 from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by PBI Group, Defendant Releasees or
23 Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,
24 Ferreiro hereby specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which he now has, or in the
25 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which
26 provides as follows:

27 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE
28 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO

1 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE
2 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE
3 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE
4 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

5 5.3 PBI Group waives any and all claims against Ferreiro, his attorneys and other
6 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been
7 taken or made) by Ferreiro and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of
8 investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,
9 and/or with respect to Covered Products.

10 **6. INTEGRATION**

11 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and
12 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been
13 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist
14 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

15 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

16 7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of
17 California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or
18 is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then
19 Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and
20 to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

21 **8. NOTICES**

22 8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided
23 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-
24 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party
25 by the other party at the following addresses:

26 For Defendant:

27 Lawrence R. Cagney
28 Krieger & Krieger, A Law Corporation
249 E. Ocean Boulevard, Suite 750
Long Beach, California 90802

And

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

For Ferreiro:

Evan Smith
Brodsky & Smith
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900
Beverly Hills, CA 90212

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT APPROVAL

10.1 Ferreiro agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment. Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

11. MODIFICATION

11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

12. ATTORNEY'S FEES

12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

14. AUTHORIZATION

14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 5/18/23
By: Anthony Ferreira
ANTHONY FERREIRO

Date: 5/18/23
By: [Signature]
PBI GROUP, LLC

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

Dated: _____

Judge of Superior Court