	State of California - Department of Justice - Attorney General's Office - Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Attention: Prop 65 Coordinator, 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000, Oakland, CA 94612			
FORM (03-01)		RCEMENT FILING - Health	lay Street, Suite 2000, Oal and Safety Code section 2 SETTLEMENT	
-	··· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		nental Filing Corrected F	ling
Please	print or type required information			
PARTIES TO THE ACTION	DEFENDANT(S) INVOLVED IN SETTLEMENT			
	COURT DOCKET NUMBER		COURTNAME	
CASE INFO	SHORT CASE NAME			
	INJUNCTIVE RELIEF			
REPORT INFO	PAYMENT: CIVIL PENALTY P	AYMENT: ATTORNEYS FEES	PAYMENT: OTHER	e Only
REPOR	SUBMITTED TO COURT? COURT, REPO	RENTRY OF JUDGMENT BY ORT OF ENTRY OF JUDGMENT MITTED TO ATTORNEY GENERA	DATE SETTLEMENT SIGNED	Internal Use Only
	COPY OF SET	TLEMENT MUS	T BE ATTACHED	
	NAME OF CONTACT			1
۳ 0	ORGANIZATION			TELEPHONE NUMBER
FILER INFO	ADDRESS			FAX NUMBER
	СПҮ	STATE ZIP 91406	E-MAIL ADDRESS	

FILING INSTRUCTIONS: This form can be completed online and printed. If electronic filing is not available, mail the completed form with a copy of the settlement to the attention of the Prop 65 Coordinator at the address shown above. If you need additional space to complete this form please use an attachment.

1								
1	Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq. (SBN 268104)							
2	Thomas G. Adams, Esq., Of Counsel (SBN 2748 GREENBAUM LAW FIRM	08)						
3	7120 Hayvenhurst Avenue, Suite 320 Van Nuys, CA 91406							
4	Telephone: (818) 809-2199							
5	Facsimile:(424) 243-7689Email:dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com							
6	Attorney for Plaintiff SHEFA LMV, INC.							
7		IE STATE OF CALIFORNIA						
8	SOLENOR COOKT OF T	IL STATE OF CALIFORNIA						
9	COUNTY OF	LOS ANGELES						
10								
11	SHEFA LMV, INC.,) Case No. 21STCV20352						
12	Plaintiff,)						
13	VS.) [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT) AS TO AMAZON.COM, INC.						
14	AMAZON.COM, INC.; and DOES 1 through 100, Inclusive,) AS TO AMAZON.COM, INC.						
15	Defendants.) Action Filed: June 1, 2021						
16)						
17)						
18								
19								
20								
21								
22								
23								
24								
25								
26								
27								
28								
		ENT JUDGMENT AS TO						
		MAZON.COM, INC.						

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This consent judgment ("**Consent Judgment**") is entered into by and between plaintiff Shefa LMV, Inc. ("**Shefa**" or "**Plaintiff**") and Amazon.com, Inc. ("**Defendant**," with Shefa and **Defendant** individually referred to as a "**Party**" and collectively as the "**Parties**.")

1.2 Plaintiff

Shefa is a public benefit, non-profit corporation that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Settling Defendant

Defendant employs ten (10) or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* ("**Proposition 65**").

1.4 Products Covered

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are plastic crossbody and messenger bag products that allegedly contain Diisononyl Phthalate ("DINP") and were sold in California on the website www.amazon.com, including, but not limited to, Clear Cross Body Messenger Bag, UPC X0015UTBWX and ASIN B011P46CLK (collectively, the "**Covered Products**").

1.5

General Allegations

Shefa alleges that Defendant, at times relevant to the complaint, manufactures, imports, sells, or distributes, for sale in the state of California, the Covered Products without first providing a clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65. DINP (CAS # 67701-26-2) is a chemical listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the state to cause cancer.

On December 12, 2019, Shefa served Defendant and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a Sixty-Day Notice of Violation (the "**First Notice**") alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products expose users to DINP.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

On March 7, 2020, Plaintiff purchased the Covered Products on amazon.com. On April 6, 2020, Shefa served Defendant and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a Sixty-Day Notice of Violation (together with the First Notice, the "**Notices**") alleging that as a retailer, Defendant violated Proposition 65 when it failed to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Covered Products expose users to DINP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notices.

1.6 Complaint

On June 1, 2021, Shefa filed the instant complaint in the Superior Court in and for the County of Los Angeles against Defendant alleging violations of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, based on exposures to DINP contained in the Covered Products sold in the State of California (the "**Complaint**").

1.7 No Admission

Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notices and Complaint and maintains that all the products it has manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law; the same being specifically denied by Defendant. This section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Defendant's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.8

Consent to Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles, the Defendant agrees that it employs or has employed ten or more persons during time periods relevant to the Complaint and that this Court has jurisdiction over the Parties to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65.

1			Effective Date
2	For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date the		
3	Consent Judgment is approved and entered by the Court.		
4	2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF		
5	2.	.1 W	arning Standards on Covered Products
6	(a	ı) De	efendant agrees, promises, and represents that, within 90 days of the Effective
7	Date, to t	he exten	t it ships or sells Covered Products in California, Defendant will either:
8		1)	provide the Section 2.1(b) warning on each Covered Product's online product
9			page on amazon.com by (A) Defendant applying the Section 2.1(b) warning
10			itself, or (B) Defendant instructing vendors and third-party sellers of the Covered
11			Products to fulfill their existing contractual obligation by providing the Section
12			2.1(b) warning on each Covered Product's online product page on amazon.com
13			and Defendant confirming prompt placement of the Section 2.1(b) warning on
14			each Covered Product's online product page on amazon.com; or
15		2)	cease offering the Covered Products without a Section 2.1(b) warning for sale in
16			California on amazon.com.
17	(b) Th	e warnings required by Section 2.1(a) shall be provided in a conspicuous and
18	prominen	nt manne	r such that they will be likely to be read or seen by the consumer prior to or at the
19	time of th	ne sale or	r purchase. The warning set forth below shall be required for each Covered
20	Product:		
21		1)	the text, "WARNING This product can expose you to chemicals, including
22			Diisononyl Phthalate (DINP), which is known to the State of California to
23			cause cancer. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov."
24			accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black
25			exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized
26			to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted
27			on or about August 30, 2016; or
28			4
			4 [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT AMAZON COM INC
			DEFENDANT AMAZON.COM, INC.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

2) the text, **"WARNING Cancer - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov."** accompanied by and placed to the right of a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline sized to be no smaller than the word, "WARNING" as provided by regulations adopted on or about August 30, 2016.

The triangular warning symbol specified in Section 2.1(b)(1) and 2.1(b)(2) shall be in yellow with a black exclamation mark; *provided however*, the symbol may be printed in black and white if the Covered Product label is not printed using the color yellow.

(c) Amazon shall notify in writing all vendors and third-party sellers of the Covered Products of the legal requirement to provide the Section 2.1(b) warning statement for each Covered Product online, and that the California Attorney General requires that vendors and third-party sellers of the Covered Products that are subject to Proposition 65 also apply the Section 2.1(b) warning statement, or a Proposition 65 compliant warning, directly on the packaging of the Covered Products. Amazon shall not be responsible or liable for failures of any vendors or third-party sellers of the Covered Products to fulfill their independent Proposition 65 obligations.

(d) To the extent that the product information for any of the Covered Products appears in a foreign language (e.g., if a potential purchaser chooses to review amazon.com's website in Spanish, using amazon.com's translation feature), the Proposition 65 warning shall appear in the same foreign language.

(e) The Parties agree that placement of the Section 2.1 warnings set forth above on each Covered Product's online product page on amazon.com shall constitute compliance by Amazon with Proposition 65 with respect to any Covered Products.

//

2.2 Covered Products in the Stream of Commerce.

Any Covered Products that have been manufactured, distributed, shipped, or sold prior to ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, shall not be subject to the requirements of Sections 2.1 or 2.2.

2.3 Notice to Cure

To the extent Shefa identifies any Covered Product on amazon.com in the future which it believes is not in compliance with this Consent Judgment, Shefa agrees to advise Amazon of such alleged breach in the manner set forth in Section 7, and provide Amazon with 20 business days (calculated from the date notice is provided) to cure any alleged violation of this Consent Judgment (the "Notice to Cure"). Such Notice to Cure shall contain information sufficient for Amazon to identify the Covered Product, including but not limited to the ASIN for such product, a screenshot of the Covered Product's online listing on amazon.com, and an explanation as to why Shefa believes it is a Covered Product and not in compliance.

Shefa shall not be entitled to seek or recover any civil penalties, and Shefa and its counsel shall not be entitled to recovery or reimbursement of attorney's fees and/or costs, or any other available remedies arising from or related to any Notices to Cure, provided Amazon timely remedies the alleged non-compliance within 20 business days of receiving the Notice to Cure by Amazon (1) adding a Section 2.1(b) warning on the amazon.com online product page for the Covered Product, or (2) delisting the Covered Product from amazon.com, or (3) ceasing to offer the Covered Product for sale in California.

If Amazon provides notice to Shefa that it has so remedied the alleged non-compliance within 20 business days of receiving the Notice to Cure, Amazon shall not be deemed in breach or violation of this Consent Judgment in any respect.

3.

MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Payment from Defendant. Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, and Defendant's receipt of a current W-9 form from the Greenbaum Law Firm, whichever is later, Defendant shall make the Total Settlement Payment of \$16,500.00.

0 [PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANT AMAZON.COM, INC.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

26

3.2 Allocation of Payments. The Total Settlement Payment shall be paid in three (3) separate checks made payable and allocated as follows, or made in a single electronic transfer made payable to the "Greenbaum Law Firm" using banking information provided by Plaintiff's counsel, in which case Plaintiff's counsel shall send the allocated portions of the civil penalty to OEHHA and Shefa as follows:

3.2.1 Civil Penalty. Defendant shall pay \$2,000.00 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). The civil penalty shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to Shefa and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$1,500.00 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. If sent by mail, this payment shall be delivered to the Greenbaum Law Firm, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

The Shefa portion of the civil penalty payment in the amount of \$500.00 shall be made payable to Shefa LMV, Inc. and associated with taxpayer identification number 81-0907002. If sent by mail, this payment shall be delivered to the Greenbaum Law Firm, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

3.2.2 Attorney's Fees and Costs. A reimbursement of Shefa's attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$14,500.00 payable to the "Greenbaum Law Firm," and associated with taxpayer identification number 46-4580172. If sent by mail, this payment shall be delivered to the Greenbaum Law Firm, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave, Suite 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406.

22

4.

CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 Public Release

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Shefa acting on behalf of itself and each of its past, current, and future agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, and in a representative capacity in the public interest under Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, and Defendant and its past, current, and future and any and all direct and indirect

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, directors, officers, managers, shareholders, members, employees, agents, attorneys, and the predecessors, successors, or assigns of each of them (collectively "**Releasees**"), arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, any and all alleged or actual violations of Proposition 65 based on a failure to warn of alleged exposures to DINP from Covered Products manufactured, supplied, sold, or distributed for sale prior to the Effective Date. The release in this Section 4.1 applies to all Covered Products that were manufactured, supplied, sold, or distributed for sale prior to the Effective Date. This release does not apply to any vendors or third-party sellers of the Covered Products.

Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 by Defendant and the Releasees with respect to DINP in Covered Products manufactured, sold, or distributed on and after the Effective Date.

4.2 Shefa's Individual Release of Claims

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, Shefa, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and releases all claims that it may have against Defendant and Releasees, including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses, including, without limitation, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 for unwarned exposures to DINP from Covered Products manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale prior to the Effective Date. The releases in Section 4.2 are provided in Shefa's individual capacity and are not releases on behalf of the public.

4.3

Release of Unknown Claims

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts contained in the Notices, or alleged in the Complaint, relating to the Covered Products, will hereafter be discovered or developed. Shefa, on behalf of itself only, acknowledges that this Consent Judgment is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims through and including the Effective Date,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

including all rights of action therefor. Shefa acknowledges that the claims released in Sections 4.1
and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless Shefa intends to release such claims, and in
doing so waives California Civil Code § 1542, which reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Shefa understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code § 1542 is that, even if Shefa suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to, the Covered Products, Shefa will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Defendant or any of the Releasees.

5. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective unless and until it is approved and entered by the Court.

6. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by amendment or reason of law generally, and/or as to the Covered Products, and/or any of the alleged violations set forth in the Notices or Complaints, then Defendant may seek modification of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Section 11 below. None of the terms of this Consent Judgment shall have any application to Covered Products sold outside of the State of California. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve Amazon from its obligation to comply with any other applicable state or federal law or regulation.

The Parties agree that if OEHHA changes any of its applicable regulations, including its warning regulations, then Amazon may either conform with the revised regulations or continue to

conf	form with the terms provided in this Consent Judg	ment if the new implementing regulations so
allov	Ν.	
7.	NOTICE	
	Unless specified herein, all correspondence an	d notices required to or that may be provided
purs	uant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing	and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-
class	s, registered or certified mail, return receipt reque	sted; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier on
any l	Party by the other at the following addresses:	
Т	o Defendant:	To Shefa:
A 4 S V C D D 7 L	Amazon.com, Inc. Amazon Legal Department -10 Terry Avenue N Seattle, WA 98109 With a copy to: Gregory Doll, Esq. DOLL AMIR & ELEY LLP 25 S. Figueroa St., Suite 3275 Los Angeles CA 90017 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in v	
	hich all notices and other communications shall b	
8.	COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE AND PD	
	This Consent Judgment may be executed in co	
	ument format (PDF) signature, each of which shal	
	n taken together, shall constitute one and the sam	
9.	COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFE	
	Plaintiff agrees to comply with the reporting f	orm requirements referenced in California
Heal	th & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).	
10.	POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES	
	The Parties acknowledge that, pursuant to Cal	ifornia Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f),
	10	

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Shefa is obligated to file a noticed motion to obtain judicial approval of this Consent Judgment. Upon the Parties' execution of this Consent Judgment, Shefa promptly shall proceed to submit this Consent Judgment to the Court with a motion seeking Court approval.

11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may only be modified by a written instrument executed by the Parties to be bound thereby, and after approval by the Court upon a noticed motion, or upon a successful motion of any Party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon. Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to modify the Consent Judgment. Any motion to modify shall be served on all Parties and the Office of the Attorney General.

12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party hereto. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties. For the avoidance of doubt, the Parties agree that the prior version of this consent judgment executed by the Parties in February 2024 is void, unenforceable, and of no effect and no Party shall attempt to enforce it or use it against the other Party for any purpose.

13. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

If Shefa determines at a future date that an alleged violation of this Consent Judgment has occurred, Shefa shall provide notice to Defendant. Prior to bringing any action to enforce any requirement of this Consent Judgment, the party alleging a violation of this Consent Judgment shall provide the other party with written notice of the grounds for such allegation together with all supporting information as well as a complete demand for the relief sought. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding the basis for the allegation to resolve the matter informally, including

providing the party alleged to be in violation with a reasonable opportunity of at least thirty (30)days to cure any alleged violation. Should such attempt at informal resolution fail, the party alleginga violation may file its lawsuit seeking the proposed relief.

14. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

Date: Jul 8, 2024	By: <u>WF</u> By: <u>Visroel Schechet (Jul 8. 2024 21:38 PDT)</u> PLAINTIFF SHEFA LMV, INC.
AGREED TO:	
Date:July 9, 2024	By: DocuSigned by: By: Defendant AMAZON.COM, INC
	12

[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT

Please note that on _____, 2024 at ____am/pm, Plaintiff Shefa LMV Inc.'s ("Plaintiff") Motion for Court Approval of Settlement Agreement and Entry of Consent Judgment as to Defendant Amazon.com, Inc. came for hearing before this Court in Department 39, the Honorable Stephen I. Goorvitch presiding. Counsel for Plaintiff did [not] appear; counsel for Defendant did [not] appear.

After full consideration of the points and authorities and related pleadings submitted, the Court GRANTED Plaintiff's Motion pursuant to and in accordance with Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(f)(4). The Court reviewed the above Settlement Agreement and makes the following findings pursuant to Health & Safety Code \$25249.7(f)(4):

a. The injunctive relief required by the Settlement Agreement complies with Health & Safety Code § 25249.7;

b. The reimbursement of fees and costs to be paid pursuant to the Settlement Agreement is reasonable under California law; and

c. The civil penalty amount to be paid pursuant to Settlement Agreement is reasonable.

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED.

Date

Judge of the Superior Court