1 2	GLICK LAW GROUP, PC Noam Glick (SBN 251582) 225 Broadway, Suite 2100 See Diago Collifornia 02101		
3	San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 382-3400 Fax: (619) 393-0154		
4	NICHOLAS & TOMASEVIC, LLP		
5	Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444) Jake Schulte (SBN 293777)		
6 7	225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 325-0492		
8	Attorneys for Plaintff Kim Embry		
9			
10	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
12	KIM EMBRY, an individual,	Case No	
13	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT	
14	v.	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)	
15 16	ZACHARY CONFECTIONS, INC., An Indiana corporation and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive	Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)	
17	Defendants.		
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			

### 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between KIM EMBRY ("Embry") and ZACHARY CONFECTIONS, INC. ("Zachary") with Embry and Zachary each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively referred to as the "Parties."

### 1.2 Plaintiff

Embry is a citizen in the state of California, acting in the interest of the general public. She seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

### 1.3 Defendant

Zachary employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

### 1.4 General Allegations

Embry alleges that Zachary manufactures, packages, labels and sells wholesale Market Pantry Dark Chocolate Covered Almonds to Target Corporation ("Target"), which then sells the product to the public in California. Embry alleges that Market Pantry Dark Chocolate Covered Almonds contain acrylamide. Embry further alleges that Zachary does so without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65 and related Regulations. Pursuant to Proposition 65, acrylamide is listed as a chemical known to cause cancer and reproductive harm.

### 1.5 Notice of Violation

On June 18, 2019, Embry served Target, the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Notice"). On April \_\_\_, 2020, Embry amended the Notice to name Zachary as the manufacturer of Market Pantry Dark Chocolate Covered Almonds. The Amended Notice alleges that Zachary violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to acrylamide contained in its "Market Pantry Dark Chocolate Covered Almonds".

No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

11

16

18 19

21

23

24

25 26

28

27

### 1.6 **Product Description**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, "Product" or "Products" are defined as Market Pantry Dark Chocolate Covered Almonds, including the roasted almonds therein, that allegedly contain acrylamide and are manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed for sale in California by Zachary and Releasees, defined infra.

#### 1.7 **Other Releasees**

This Consent Judgment expressly encompasses all of the subject Products, whether sold under Target's own brand name, or some other private label, at all grocery, retail, and other locations and sales channels in California.

### 1.8 **Complaint**

On , Embry filed a Complaint against Zachary for the alleged violations of Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 that are the subject of the Notice ("Complaint").

#### 1.9 No Admission

Zachary and Releases deny the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and Complaint, and maintain that all of the products they have manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law by Zachary and/or Releasees. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Zachary's and Releasees' obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

#### 1.10 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Zachary as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the

8

9

6

10 11

12

13 14 15

16

17 18

19 20

22

21

23 24

25

26 27

28

County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

#### 1.11 **Effective Date**

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment, as discussed in Section 5.

#### 2. **INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

#### 2.1 Reformulation of the Product

Commencing on the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Zachary shall not manufacture any Product that will be sold or offered for sale in California that exceeds the following acrylamide concentration limits, such concentration to be determined by use of a test performed by an laboratory accredited by the State of California, a federal agency, or a nationally recognized accrediting organization, using LC-MS/MS (Liquid Chromatograph-Mass Spectrometry): the average acrylamide concentration shall not exceed 225 ppb by weight (the "Average Level") for the Products. The Average Level is determined by randomly selecting and testing at least one sample each from five different lots of the Products (or the maximum number of lots available for testing if less than five) during a testing period of at least 60 days.

#### 2.2 **Sell-Through Period**

Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, the Products that were manufactured prior to the Effective Date and six (6) months thereafter shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligations of Zachary, do not apply to these Products manufactured prior to the Effective Date plus six (6) months thereafter ("the Sell-Through Period").

#### MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS 3.

#### 3.1 **Settlement Amount**

Zachary, on behalf of itself and the Releasees shall cause to be paid Sixty Thousand dollars (\$60,000.00) in settlement and total satisfaction of all the claims referred to in the Notice and the Amended Notice, the Complaint, and this Consent Judgment (hereinafter, the "Settlement Amount"). This includes civil penalties in the amount of Six Thousand Dollars (\$6,000) pursuant to Health and

1	Safety Code section 25249.7(b) (hereinafter, the "Proposed Penalties") and attorney's fees and costs in		
2	the amount of Fifty-Four Thousand Dollars (\$54,000) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section		
3	1021.5 (hereinafter, the "Proposed Attorney Fees").		
4	3.2 Civil Penalty		
5	The portion of the settlement attributable to the Proposed Penalties shall be allocated according		
6	to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the		
7	penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), an		
8	the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty paid to Embry.		
9	All payments owed to Embry shall be made payable to the Glick Law Group Client Trus		
10	Account, and shall be delivered to the following address:		
11	Noam Glick		
12	Glick Law Group 225 Broadway, Suite 2100		
13	San Diego, CA 92101  All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to OEHHA		
14	(Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:		
15	For United States Postal Service Delivery:		
16	Mike Gyurics		
17	Fiscal Operations Branch Chief		
18	Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment P.O. Box 4010		
19	Sacramento, CA 95812-4010		
20	For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:		
21	Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief		
22	Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street		
23	Sacramento, CA 95814		
24	Zachary agrees to provide Embry's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA,		
25	simultaneous with its penalty payments to Embry.		
26	The Parties will exchange completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other forms as required. Relevant		
27	information for Glick Law Group and N&T are set out below:		
28	• "Glick Law Group" (EIN: 47-1838518) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);		

25

26

27

28

- "Nicholas & Tomasevic" (EIN: 46-3474065) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and
- "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" at 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

### 3.3 Attorney's Fees and Costs

The Parties acknowledge that Embry and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute by Consent Judgment without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the Consent Judgment had been agreed to. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Embry and the Proposed Attorney Fees due to her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5, for all work performed in this matter. Under these legal principles, the portion of the Consent Judgment attributable to the Proposed Attorney fees shall be paid to Embry's counsel, who are entitled to the Proposed Attorney Fees incurred by them in this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Zachary's attention, as well as negotiating this Consent Judgment in the public interest.

Zachary shall cause to be paid the Proposed Attorney Fees to Embry's counsel in two checks, divided equally, payable to Glick Law Group, PC (\$27,000) and Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP (\$27,000) respectively. The addresses for these two entities are:

Noam Glick Glick Law Group 225 Broadway, Suite 2100 San Diego, CA 92101

Craig Nicholas Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

## 3.4 Timing

The above-mentioned checks will be issued within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date.

### 4. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

## 4.1 Embry's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

For any claim or violation arising under Proposition 65 alleging a failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Zachary and/or Releasees prior to the end of the Sell-Through Period, Embry, acting on her own behalf and in the public interest, releases Zachary of any and all liability. This release includes Zachary's upstream suppliers of the ingredients of the Products, including but not limited to the supplier of the roasted almonds in the Products, and Zachary's parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, its directors, officers, principals, agents, employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, predecessors, successors, and assigns, and each entity to whom Zachary directly or indirectly distributes, ships, or sells the Products, including but not limited to Target, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, other retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"). Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from the Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Zachary after the Effective Date and the Sell-Through Date. This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution of all claims that were or could have been asserted against Zachary and/or Releasees for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to acrylamide contained in the Products.

### 4.2 Embry's Individual Release of Claims

Embry, in her individual capacity, also provides a release to Zachary and Releasees, which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of as well as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorney's fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands by Embry of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to acrylamide in the Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Zachary and the Releasees before the Effective Date and the Sell-Through Date.

## 4.3 Zachary's Release of Embry

Zachary, on its own behalf and on behalf of Releasees, as well as its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Embry and her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Embry

and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it, in this matter or with respect to the Products.

### 4.4 Mutual Release of Known and Unknown Claims

Embry, on behalf of herself and her agents, attorneys, representatives, successors, and assigns, in her respective individual capacity only and not in its representative capacity, and Zachary, each provide a general release of the other including the Releasees herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all claims of any nature, character or kind, known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged violations of Proposition 65 with respect to the Products. Embry and Zachary each acknowledge that they are each familiar with Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

"A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY."

The Parties expressly waive and relinquish any and all rights and benefits that they may have under, or which may be conferred on them by the provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that he may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters. In furtherance of such intention, the release hereby given shall be and remain in effect as a full and complete release notwithstanding the discovery or existence of any such additional or different claims or facts arising out of the released matters. This Section 4 release shall not release any obligations created by this Agreement.

### 5. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved and entered by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

### 6. SEVERABILITY

Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

### 7. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California and apply within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, or if the state of California's No Significant Risk Level (NSRL) for acrylamide is increased by OEHHA or through other legal process to a level greater than or equal to 1.0 mcg/day, then Zachary may provide written notice to Embry of any asserted change, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

### 8. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

For Zachary:	For Embry:

David C. Allen	Noam Glick
Barnes & Thornburg LLP 2029 Century Park East; Suite 300	Glick Law Group, PC 225 Broadway, 21st Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90067-2904	San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

## 9. <u>COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES</u>

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by signature through facsimile or portable document format (PDF), each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

### 10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Embry agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code

section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion Embry shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested. Defendant agrees to cooperate with efforts of Plaintiff's counsel to seek court approval of this Consent Judgment, provide materials requested by the Court in a timely fashion, and refrain from opposing or delaying court approval in any manner.

### 11. MODIFICATION

This Consent Judgment may be modified only by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

[Rest of page intentionally left blank]

### 12. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

1	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
2	Date: 4/23/20	Date: 4/23/2020
3	By:Kim Embry	By: Arone and
5	Kim Embry	<u>GEORGE ANICHIN</u> [print name] Zachary Confections, Inc.
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		