1 2	DANIELLE R. FUGERE (State Bar No. 1z60873) AS YOU SOW Main Post Office P.O. Box 751 Perioder CA 04701		
3	Berkeley, CA 94701 Telephone: (510) 735-8158		
4	Email: <u>DFugere@asyousow.org</u>		
5	Attorney for Plaintiff AS YOU SOW		
6			
7	WILLIS WAGNER (State Bar No. 310900) ARNOLD & PORTER		
8	Three Embarcadero Center 10 th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone (415) 471-3110 Email: Will.Wagner@arnoldporter.com		
9			
10	Attorneys for Defendant		
11	FRONTIER COOPERATIVE		
12			
13	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
14	FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
15			
16	AS YOU SOW,	CASE NO. 22CV017226	
17	Plaintiff,	-	
18	v.	[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT	
19	FRONTIER COOPERATIVE,		
20	Defendant.	Action Filed: September 2, 2022	
21	(4	Action Fried. September 2, 2422	
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT JUDGMENT; CASE NO. 22CV017226		

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Plaintiff As You Sow ("As You Sow" or "Plaintiff") and Defendant Frontier Cooperative ("Frontier" or "Defendant"), to resolve claims raised against Defendant in the Complaint in the above-captioned action. This Consent Judgment shall be effective upon entry. As You Sow and Defendant (collectively "the Parties") agree to the terms and conditions set forth below.

- 1.1. As You Sow is a non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, the promotion of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer rights, environmental education, and corporate accountability. As You Sow is based in Berkeley, California and is incorporated under the laws of the State of California.
- 1.2. Defendant currently produces, distributes, and/or sells spinach products containing lead, including but not limited to, "Frontier Co-Op Spinach Flakes Certified Organic" and "Frontier Co-Op Spinach Powder Certified Organic" (the "Covered Products"). Defendant produces, distributes, and/or sells the Covered Products in retail stores or at physical locations, via catalogues, and/or online through its own website, https://frontiercoop.com (the "Frontier website"), and the internet retail seller Amazon.com, https://www.amazon.com (the "Amazon website").
- 1.3. As You Sow alleges in the Complaint that the Covered Products contain lead.

 Lead is listed by the State of California as known to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (the "Act"), California Health and Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. On August 19, 2020, As You Sow sent a 60-day Notice of Violation (the "Notice") to Defendant and to public enforcers as required by Health and Safety Code section 25249.7, alleging that Defendant violated the Act by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings before exposing persons to lead contained in the Covered Products.
- 1.4. The Parties have agreed to enter into this Consent Judgment to settle Plaintiff's claims with regard to the Covered Products and to avoid prolonged and costly litigation.
- 1.5. Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law.

1	supplement; that is, the Covered Product label must include the term "dietary supplement" or	
2	equivalent, pursuant to the Dietary Supplement Health and Education Act (DSHEA). Each	
3	Covered Product sold as a supplement must either be labeled in quarter, half, or full teaspoon	
4	increments or the product must include a spoon for the applicable serving size set according to	
5	this Section. Should either RACC category be eliminated or modified in the future, Frontier	
6	may use the closest analogous category, subject to thirty day's written notice to As You Sow.	
7	3. JURISDICTION AND VENUE.	
8	3.1. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court	
9	has jurisdiction over the allegations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over	
10	Defendant; venue is proper in Alameda County; the Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent	
11	Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims under the Act up through and including the	
12	Effective Date which were, or could have been, asserted in this action based on the facts	
13	alleged in Plaintiff's Notice and Complaint. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to enforce this	
14	Consent Judgment.	
15	4. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF.	
16	4.1. Beginning no later than the Compliance Date, Defendant shall not produce,	
17	distribute, and/or sell in California any Covered Product containing more than 0.5 micrograms	
18	per Serving of lead without first providing the warning statement as specified in Paragraph 4.3	
19	pursuant to the methods specified in Paragraphs 4.4 - 4.9 below.	
20	4.2. Warning Statement. Beginning no later than the Compliance Date, all Covered	
21	Products produced, distributed, and/or sold by Defendant in the State of California shall use the	
22	following "Warning Statement:"	
23	△ WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including lead,	
24	which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.	
25		
26	Consistent with Title 27, Article 6, § 25603 of the California Code of Regulations, in al	
27	instances where the Warning Statement appears, the warning text shall be displayed in at least	
28	the same type size as the surrounding text for other consumer information concerning the	

27 l

- 4.3. Internet Sales; Frontier Website. Beginning no later than the Compliance Date, Defendant shall ensure that, for all Covered Products sold to customers located in California via the Frontier Website, Defendant shall prominently display the Warning Statement set forth in Paragraph 4.2 to purchasers before completion of purchase(s). The Warning Statement set forth in Paragraph 4.2 shall be displayed (a) using a clearly marked hyperlink with the word "WARNING" on the product display page as set forth in 27 CCR § 25602(b); (b) on the product display page without requiring the purchaser to seek out the warning by scrolling as set forth in 27 CCR § 25602(a)(2); or (c) by prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase as set forth in 27 CCR § 25602(b).
- 4.3.1. Defendants shall not include any information with the Warning Statement that contradicts, obfuscates, or minimizes the meaning of the Warning Statement.
- 4.3.2 Any changes to the text, format, or placement of the statements that do not comply with this Section 4 shall be made only after a written request for approval from Plaintiff. Plaintiff shall respond to such request for approval within thirty days. Any dispute arising with respect to whether Defendant's changes comply with Section 4 of the Consent Judgment shall be subject to the provisions of Section 8 of this Consent Judgment.
- 4.4. Internet Sales; Online Marketplace. Beginning no later than the Effective Date, Defendant shall, for all Covered Products sold to customers located in California via the Amazon Website or any other internet marketplace or retail platform, provide the Warning Statement in Paragraph 4.2, directly on the initial product display page or by hyperlink such that the Warning Statement is visible on the initial product display screen without scrolling on a full screen monitor or by providing the warning otherwise prior to purchase.

- 4.5. Mail Order /Catalogue Sales: If Defendant sells the Covered Products via mail order to customers located in California, Defendant shall prominently display the Warning Statement (set forth in Paragraph 4.2) in the mail order catalogue in compliance with California Code of Regulations, Title 27, Article 6 § 25602(c), either on the same page as a Covered Product is displayed, or on the same page upon which any of the Covered Products' prices are listed, in the same type size as the surrounding, non-heading text. The Warning Statement shall be added no later than in the first print run of the mail order catalogue on or after the Effective Date.
- 4.6. In-Store Retail Sales: If Defendant sells the Covered Products via stores or other physical outlets, Defendant shall prominently affix the Warning Statement (set forth in Paragraph 4.2) on the Covered Product's label.
- 4.6.1. The Warning Statement shall be displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices on the individual labeling of the Covered Products, so as to render the Warning Statement likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase and use.
- 4.7. Other Sales: Should Defendant become aware of any Retailer or retail Seller selling the Covered Products through in-store retail outlets, mail catalogues, and/or the internet without a Warning Statement compliant with Section 4.2, and 4.4.3 if applicable, Defendant shall, in writing, require that the seller comply with all applicable requirements of this Section 4 within sixty (60) days of receiving notice.

1 5. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS.

- 5.1. Civil Penalty: Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall pay \$10,000 in the form of a check made payable to *As You Sow*, as a civil penalty pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b). *As You Sow* shall remit seventy-five percent (75%) of this amount to the State of California pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(b).
- 5.2. Additional Settlement Payment: Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date,

 Defendant shall pay \$7,500 in the form of a check made payable to As You Sow as a payment in

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

lieu of additional civil penalties, with this amount to be used by As You Sow for grants to California 501(c)(3) non-profit organizations and by the As You Sow Environmental Enforcement Fund. These funds shall be used to educate and/or reduce or remediate consumer exposures to lead in California, particularly in consumer products, and to promote enforcement of warnings about, or reductions of lead in, food products sold in California. In deciding among grant proposals that contain the above required nexus, the As You Sow Board of Directors ("Board") also takes into consideration a number of important factors, including: (1) the likelihood of lead reduction, prevention, remediation, or educational benefits to California citizens from the proposal; (2) the budget requirements of the proposed grantee and the alternate funding sources available to it for its project; and, (3) the Board's assessment of the proposed grantee's ability to perform the funded activities. As You Sow shall ensure that all funds will be disbursed and used in accordance with this paragraph, as well as As You Sow's mission statement, articles of incorporation, bylaws, and applicable state and federal laws and regulations. As You Sow shall obtain reports from grantees and maintain adequate records to document that the funds are spent on the activities described in this paragraph, and shall provide to the Attorney General, within thirty days of any request, copies of all documentation demonstrating how such funds have been spent.

5.2.1. The As You Sow Enforcement Fund works to ensure that consumers are receiving the warnings required by law when products they purchase contain listed chemicals. These warnings help consumers make informed decisions about the products they bring into their homes and their families. The Enforcement fund supports research into and investigation of products sold into California, research on toxic chemicals and their health impacts, testing of products likely to contain listed chemicals, consumer education about listed chemicals, legal enforcement actions, and work with companies to reformulate their products to end or significantly reduce consumer exposure to listed chemicals where feasible.

5.2.2. No Party to this Consent Judgment, or independent counsel of record, or spouse or dependent children thereof, has an economic interest in any individual or entity, besides itself that will receive all or part of an Additional Settlement Payment. As a party receiving ASP

funds, As You Sow's in-house counsel may receive some portion of the ASP funds through their fixed salaries, which are not dependent on receipt of ASP funds.

5.3. Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall pay \$32,500 in the form of a check made payable to *As You Sow*, as reimbursement for Plaintiff's attorneys' fees, investigation costs, and other reasonable litigation costs and expenses.

6. PRODUCT TESTING AND REFORMULATION.

- 6.1. The provisions of this section apply only in the event Defendant reformulates any of the Covered Products ("Reformulated Covered Product") to reduce consumer exposure to less than 0.5 micrograms of lead per Serving and seeks to remove the Warning Statement required under Paragraph 4.2. If Defendant provides a warning on a Covered Product, no testing is required for such product and the paragraphs of Paragraph 6 are not applicable.
- 6.2. In the event Defendant reformulates any of the Covered Products by the Compliance Date and/or relies on product testing to substantiate that the Warning Statement is not required, as set forth in Paragraph 6.1, after the Compliance Date, testing for lead content shall be conducted on at least three (3) samples of the Covered Product (in the form intended for sale to the end-user) from two (2) different lots (or from the maximum number of lots available for testing if there are fewer than two (2) lots available). Testing for lead content shall be conducted using EPA Methods 6020, 6020a, AOAC 993.14, AOAC 2015.01, or an equivalent methodology intended to quantify heavy metal content in foods that is accredited by a national or international testing body, via inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry ("ICP-MS"). The sample preparation method must use a microwave- or heat-assisted acid digestion method for the above methods and if appropriate for any other agreed on methodology.

As of the Compliance Date, Defendant shall not produce any Covered Product for sale in California unless they are Reformulated Covered Products pursuant to Section 6.1 above, or unless Defendant provides the Warning Statement as specified in Paragraph 4.2, in compliance with Paragraphs 4.3-4.7. Any dispute as to whether a Reformulated Covered Product complies with Section 6 shall be subject to the provisions of Section 8 of this Agreement.

′

7.1. This Consent Judgment may be modified by written agreement and stipulation of the Parties. If either Party seeks to modify the Consent Judgment, it shall provide written notice to the other Party of the modification sought. The parties shall meet and confer within thirty (30) days of receipt of such meet and confer notice. Neither Party shall unreasonably withhold agreement to any modification requested by the other Party that is based on an amendment to the Act or its supporting regulations or a change in the law. If despite their meet-and-confer efforts, the Parties are unable to reach agreement on a stipulated modification, either Party may file a noticed motion for modification with the Court for good cause shown, provided a copy of the motion is also served on the other Party and the Office of the California Attorney General.

7.2. If the parties reach agreement as to modification of the Consent Judgment, such stipulation shall be reported to the Office of the California Attorney General at least twenty-one (21) days in advance of its submission to the Court for approval.

8. DISPUTE RESOLUTION AND ENFORCEMENT.

- 8.1. Only Plaintiff may attempt to enforce this Consent Judgment. If Plaintiff alleges that Defendant has failed to meet an obligation set forth in this Consent Judgment, Plaintiff shall inform Defendant in a reasonably prompt manner. As long as Defendant cures such alleged violations within thirty (30) days of receipt of the written notice, then there shall be deemed no material violation. For alleged violations that are not cured within thirty days, Plaintiff shall have the right to bring an enforcement motion under this Consent Judgment.
- 8.2. A party who prevails in a contested enforcement motion arising with respect to any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment is entitled to seek recovery of its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred in any such motion or proceeding pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure, including but not limited to § 1021.5, unless the unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery Act of 1986, Code of Civil Procedure. Notwithstanding any language to the contrary in Section 6, or

9. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE.

- 9.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between As You Sow, on behalf of itself and in the public interest, as well as its parents, subsidiaries, officers, directors, employees, agents, insurers, representatives, successors, and assigns ("As You Sow Releasees") and Defendant and its respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, and divisions, and the predecessors, successors, and assigns of any of them (collectively, "Frontier Releasees"). No upstream grower to Defendant is protected by or a party to this agreement except as to the Covered Products released herein.
- 9.2. Plaintiff hereby fully releases and discharges Frontier's Releasees and Defendant's suppliers, and all entities to which Defendant directly or indirectly distributes or sells Covered Products, including but not limited to distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, licensors, and licensees ("Additional Defendant Releasees") from any and all claims, actions, causes of action, suits, demands, liabilities, damages, penalties, fees (including fees of attorneys, experts, and others), costs, and expenses asserted, or that could have been asserted, as to any alleged violation of the Act or its implementing regulations arising from the failure to provide lead warnings required by the Act on Covered Products produced prior to the Effective Date.
- 9.3. Defendant hereby releases As You Sow from, and waives any claims against As You Sow and As You Sow's Releasees for injunctive relief or damages, penalties, fines, sanctions, mitigation, fees (including fees of attorneys, experts and others), costs, expenses, or any other sums or causes incurred or claimed, or which could have been claimed, for matters related to the Notice of Violation or Complaint.

Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Defendant shall constitute compliance with the Act by Defendant, the Frontier Releasees and its Additional

4

5

10

12

14

16

17

18

20

21

22

24

26

27

1	Defendant Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about lead in Covered Product	
2	after the Effective Date.	
3	10. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION.	
4	This Consent Judgment shall be governed by, and construed in accordance with, the	
5	laws of the State of California.	
6	11. COURT APPROVAL.	
7	11.1. Unless otherwise stipulated by the Parties, if the Court fails to approve and order	
8	entry of the Consent Judgment without any alteration, deletion or amendment, this Consent	
9	Judgment shall become null and void upon the election of either Party, and shall not be	
10	introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.	
11	11.2. Defendant agrees not to oppose Court approval of this Consent Judgment.	
12	12. APPLICATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT.	
13	This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon As You Sow and Frontier	
14	and their respective officers, directors, and shareholders and the predecessors, successors or	
15	assigns of each of them.	
16	13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT.	
17	The Parties declare and represent that no promise, inducement or other agreement has	
18	been made conferring any benefit upon any Party except those contained herein and that this	
19	agreement contains the entire agreement pertaining to the subject matter hereof.	
20	14. DURATION OF CONSENT JUDGMENT.	
21	This Consent Judgment shall terminate five years from the Effective Date unless the	
22	term of this Consent Judgment is extended. This Consent Judgment shall be extended only by a	
23	stipulation of the Parties that is entered by the Court.	
24	15. ATTORNEYS' FEES.	
25	Except as specifically provided in this Consent Judgment, each Party shall bear its own	
26	attorneys' fees and costs incurred in connection with the 60-day Notice of Violation and	
27	Plaintiff's Complaint.	
28	16. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE § 25249.7.	

1	16.1. Plaintiff shall comply with the reporting requirements referred to in Health and	
2	Safety Code section 25249.7(f) (and established in Title 11 of the California Code of	
3	Regulations sections 3000-3008), and shall move for approval of this Consent Judgment	
4	pursuant to the terms thereof.	
5	16.2. The Parties shall use their best efforts to support entry of this Consent Judgment.	
6	If the California Attorney General objects to any term in this Consent Judgment, the Parties	
7	shall use their best efforts to resolve the concern in a timely manner, and if possible, prior to the	
8	hearing on the motion to approve this Consent Judgment.	
9	17. PROVISION OF NOTICE.	
10	All correspondence and notices required by this Consent Judgment to the Parties shall be sent to:	
11		
12	Plaintiff As You Sow Danielle FugereAs You Sow	
13	Main Post Office P.O Box 751	
14	Berkeley, CA 94701	
15	Tel.: (510) 735-8158	
16	<u>Defendant Frontier Cooperative</u> Will Wagner	
17	Arnold & Porter	
18		
19	Telephone: (415) 471-3110 Attorney for Defendant Frontier Cooperative	
20		
21	18. EXECUTION AND COUNTERPARTS.	
22	This Consent Judgment may be executed in one or more counterparts and by means of	
23	facsimile or portable document format (.pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to	
24		
25	19. DRAFTING.	
26	The terms of this Consent Judgment have been reviewed by the respective counsel for	
27	each Party prior to its signing, and each Party has had an opportunity to fully discuss the terms	
28		

1	and conditions with legal counsel. The Parties agree that, in any subsequent interpretation an	
2	construction of this Consent Judgment, no inference, assumption, or presumption shall be	
3	drawn, and no provision of this Consent Judgment shall be construed against any Party, based	
4	on the fact that one of the Parties and/or one of the Parties' legal counsel prepared and/or	
5	drafted all or any portion of the Consent Judgment. It is conclusively presumed that all of the	
6	Parties participated equally in the preparation and drafting of this Consent Judgment.	
7	20. AUTHORIZATION.	
8	Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by	
9	the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and	
10	execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party.	
11	The undersigned have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this	
12	Consent Judgment.	
13	APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:	
14		
15	Dated: <u>Sept. 25</u> , 202 3 AS YOU SOW	
16		
17	Les este La	
18	By	
19	DANIELLE R. FUGERE Attorney for Plaintiff	
20	AS YOU SOW	
21		
22	Dated: 9/29/23, 30x3x FRONTIER COOPERATIVE	
23	Die Jahle Might	
24	By WILLIS WAGNER	
25	Arnold & Porter Attorneys for Defendant	
26	FRONTIER COOPERATIVE	
27	SO AGREED:	
28		

240		
1	Dated: _9/11, 2023	AS YOU SOW
2		
3		By: Andrew Behar
4		Title: CEO
5	2023	
6	Dated: $\frac{9}{1}$ $\frac{30}{30}$, $\frac{2022}{200}$	FRONTIER COOPERATIVE
7		By:
8		Name: RAVIN DONALD Title: EVP OF OPERATIONS
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		