1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352) BRODSKY SMITH 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900 Beverly Hills, CA 90212 Tel: (877) 534-2590 Fax: (310) 247-0160 Attorneys for Plaintiff	
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	COUNTY OF	ALAMEDA
11	EMA BELL,	Case No.: 21CV002133
12	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
13	v.	Judge: Jeffrey Brand
14 15	ARCHES & HALOS, LLC, BEAUTY PARTNERS, LLC, TARGET CORPORATION,	Dept.: 22 Hearing Date: December 7, 2023
16	Defendants.	Hearing Time: 2:00 PM Reservation #: 903665042784
17		J
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	1	

CONSENT JUDGMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Ema Bell ("Bell" or "Plaintiff") and Arches & Halos, LLC ("Arches & Halos" or "Defendant") with Bell and Defendant collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each of them as a "Party." Plaintiff is an individual residing in California that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Arches & Halos is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.
- 1.2 Allegations and Representations. Bell alleges that Defendant has exposed individuals to diethanolamine (DEA) from its sales of brow mousse without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. DEA is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.
- Defendant, Beauty Partners, LLC, Target Corporation, and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "Notice"). The Notice provided Defendant and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Defendant was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn California consumers and customers that use of the Products (defined herein) will expose them to DEA. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Notice. On November 8, 2021, Bell filed a complaint (the "Complaint") in the matter.
- 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Notice and Complaint filed in this matter, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notice.

1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in the Notice and Action and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term "Covered Products" means Arches & Halos brow mousses that are manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Defendant.
- 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is entered as a Judgment of the Court.

3. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS</u>

- Reformulation of Covered Products. Commencing by or before one hundred eighty (180) days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Defendant manufactures or imports for sale to wholesale or retail businesses, or individuals in California shall either: (a) be a Reformulated Product pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 and 3.4, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product. There shall be no obligation for Arches & Halos to provide a warning for Covered Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to 180 days after the Effective Date whether or not it is a Reformulated Product, and the Section 5 release applies to all such Covered Products.
- 3.2 **DEA Free Reformulation Standard.** "Reformulated Product" shall mean Covered Product with DEA content that is below the Reporting Limit (defined herein) when analyzed pursuant to liquid chromatography/tandem mass spectrometry (LC/MS/MS), inductively coupled mass-spectroscopy (ICP-MS) or other method of analysis utilized by the International Organization

for Standardization (ISO) for qualitative and quantitative screening of cosmetics and cosmetic raw materials.

- 3.2.1 **Reporting Limit**. The Covered Product "Reporting Limit¹" is 20 mg/kg.
- 3.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning. Except for Covered Products already in the stream of commerce, as of 180 days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Arches & Halos must provide a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.3 and 3.4 for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers or imports for sale to wholesale or retail businesses in California that is not a Reformulated Product. The warning shall consist of either the Warning or Alternative Warning described in §§ 3.3(a) or (b), respectively:
 - (a) **Warning**. The "Warning" shall consist of the statement:
 - ⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including diethanolamine (DEA), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- (b) Alternative Warning: Defendant may, but is not required to, use the alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) ("Alternative Warning") as follows:
 - ⚠ WARNING: Cancer www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- 3.4 A Warning or Alternative Warning provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word "WARNING:" in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to the left of the word "WARNING:" must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the word "WARNING:". The Warning or Alternative Warning shall be affixed to or printed on the Covered Product's packaging or labeling, provided that the Warning or Alternative Warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual

¹ The Reporting Limit is the lowest concentration at which DEA can be reported in a sample of a Covered Product by a commercially reasonable accredited testing laboratory employing LC/MS/MS analysis or other method of analysis utilized by the ISO for qualitative and quantitative screening of cosmetics and cosmetic raw materials.

under customary conditions of purchase or use. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings. If consumer information is provided in a foreign language, Defendant shall provide the **Warning** in the foreign language.

In addition to affixing the Warning or Alternative Warning to the Covered Product's packaging or labeling, the Warning or Alternative Warning shall be posted on websites where Arches & Halos offers Covered Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this Section shall be satisfied if the Warning or Alternative Warning, or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word "WARNING," appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this Section, Arches & Halos shall (a) post the Warning or Alternative Warning on its own website and, if it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers; and (b) if it does not have the ability to post the Warning or Alternative Warning on the websites of its third-party internet sellers, provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Product that have been provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2 are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning requirements of this Section.

3.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations. The Parties agree that Defendant shall be deemed in compliance with the warning requirements in this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") applicable to the Covered Product and the exposures at issue after the Effective Date.

4. MONETARY TERMS

4.1 **Civil Penalty.** Defendant shall pay \$3,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health &

5.

8

9

1213

1415

16

1718

19

20

21 22

23

2425

26

27

28

RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiff 5.1 acting on her own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Defendant, and its parents, subsidiaries, shareholders, affiliates and each of their members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, and their predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including Beauty Partners, LLC, Target Corporation, and including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members, ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to DEA from use of Covered Products, including any Covered Products manufactured or imported by Defendant prior to 180 days after the Effective Date without a warning. It is the Parties' intention that this Consent Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to act in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 that was alleged in the Complaint, or that could have been brought pursuant to the Notice against Defendant and/or the Downstream Releasees of the Covered Products ("Proposition 65 Claims"). Defendant's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Arches & Halos as regards exposure to DEA from use of the Covered Products.

5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Plaintiff, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and <u>not</u> in her representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases Defendant, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees, from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising

from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant, Defendant Releasees or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Plaintiff specifically waives any and all rights and benefits she now has, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

5.3 Defendant waives any and all claims against Plaintiff, his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Plaintiff and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this Action, and/or with respect to Covered Products.

6. INTEGRATION

6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

7. GOVERNING LAW

7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. If Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to Covered Products, then Defendant shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, Covered Products are so affected.

8. <u>NOTICES</u>

8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-CONSENT JUDGMENT

2 3 4 5	by the other party at the following addresses: For Defendant: Will Wagner Arnold & Porter Three Embarcadero Center 10th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-4024 Will.Wagner@arnoldporter.com	
4	Will Wagner Arnold & Porter Three Embarcadero Center 10th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-4024	
	Arnold & Porter Three Embarcadero Center 10th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-4024	
5	Three Embarcadero Center 10th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-4024	
ا ا	San Francisco, CA 94111-4024	
6	Will. Wagner@arnoldporter.com	
7		
8	For Plaintiff:	
9	Evan Smith Brodsky Smith 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900 Beverly Hills, CA 90212	
10		
11	Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which	
12	all notices and other communications shall be sent.	
13	9. <u>COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES</u>	
14	9.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or	
15	electronically (such as by PDF), each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when	
16	taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.	
17	10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT	
18	APPROVAL	
19	10.1 Plaintiff agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &	
20	Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.	
21	Defendant agrees it shall not oppose such Motion unless such Motion is materially inconsistent	
22	with the terms of this Consent Judgment.	
23	10.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the	
24	Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the	
25	Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30	
26	days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.	
27		
28	9 CONSENT JUDGMENT	

10.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

11. MODIFICATION AND ENFORCEMENT

- 11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party. Notwithstanding the foregoing, if Plaintiff, the Attorney General, or any public enforcer represented by Brodsky Smith agrees to terms in a judicially entered consent judgment with any manufacturer of substantially similar cosmetics as defined by California Health and Safety Code 109900 which permits a higher level of DEA without requiring an exposure warning, the Parties agree that Defendant shall have the right to move for modification of this Consent Judgment. Plaintiff has the right to oppose any such modification.
- 11.2 If a dispute arises with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment, the Parties shall meet and confer in writing and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be filed in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand, which shall not be less than thirty (30) days. No private enforcer other than Plaintiff may enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment.

12. ATTORNEY'S FEES

- 12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.
- 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

1	14. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>
2	14.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their
3	respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this
4	document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute
5	the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as
6	explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.
7	To be and costs.
8	AGREED TO: AGREED TO:
9 10	Date: 6/21/23
11	By: By:
12	ARCHES & HALOS, LLC
13	
14	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:
15	
16	Dated:
17	Judge of Superior Court
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	11

CONSENT JUDGMENT