

1 **GLICK LAW GROUP, P.C.**
Noam Glick (SBN 251582)
2 225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, California 92101
3 Tel: (619) 382-3400
Email: noam@glicklawgroup.com

4 **NICHOLAS & TOMASEVIC, LLP.**
5 Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444)
Jake Schulte (SBN 293777)
6 225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, California 92101
7 Tel: (619) 325-0492
Email: cnicholas@nicholaslaw.org
8 Email: jschulte@nicholaslaw.org

9
10 Attorneys for Plaintiff
Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.

11 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
12 **IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA**

13 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
14 ADVOCATES, INC.,

15 Plaintiff,

16 v.

17 THE K MARKET, a California corporation,
18 NEW KUKJE, INC., a California corporation,
and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

19 Defendants.
20

Case No. RG21092923

**[PROPOSED] AMENDED CONSENT
JUDGMENT**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* and
Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 Parties**

3 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.,
4 (“EHA” or “Plaintiff”), on the one hand, and The K Market and New Kukje, Inc. (collectively,
5 “Settling Defendants”), on the other hand, with EHA and Settling Defendants each individually
6 referred to as a “Party” and collectively referred to as the “Parties.”

7 **1.2 Plaintiff**

8 EHA is a corporation organized in the state of California, acting in the interest of the general
9 public. It seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health
10 by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

11 **1.3 Defendant**

12 Settling Defendants employ ten or more individuals and are “person in the course of doing
13 business” for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and
14 Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

15 **1.4 General Allegations**

16 EHA alleges that Settling Defendants manufacture, import, sell, and distribute for sale K-
17 Bakery Almond Crisps and Burdock Crisps that contain Acrylamide. EHA further alleges that Settling
18 Defendants do so without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65
19 and related regulations pursuant to Proposition 65, Acrylamide is listed as a chemical known to cause
20 cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

21 **1.5 Notices of Violation**

22 On or around November 24, 2020, EHA served The K Market, the California Attorney
23 General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of
24 Proposition 65 (“K-Bakery Notice”). The K-Bakery Notice alleged that The K Bakery had violated
25 Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated
26 with exposures to Acrylamide contained in K-Bakery Almond Crisps.

27 On or around February 4, 2021, EHA served Settling Defendants, the California Attorney
28 General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of

1 Proposition 65 (“Amended K-Bakery Notice”). The Amended K-Bakery Notice included New Kukje,
2 Inc.

3 On or around March 18, 2021, EHA served Settling Defendants, Sea World Co., Ltd., Chang-
4 Tuh (L.A.), Inc., the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies
5 with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 (“Burdock Notice”). The Burdock Notice alleged
6 that Settling Defendants had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in
7 California of the health hazards associated with exposures to Acrylamide contained in Burdock Crisps.

8 No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the
9 violations alleged in the K-Bakery Notice, Amended K-Bakery Notice, and Burdock Notice.
10 (hereinafter, the “Notices”).

11 **1.6 Product Description**

12 The products covered by this Consent Judgment are K-Bakery Almond Crisps and Burdock
13 Crisps manufactured or processed by Settling Defendants that allegedly contain Acrylamide and are
14 imported, sold, shipped, delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers in California by Releasees (as
15 defined in section 4.1) (“Covered Products”).

16 **1.7 State of the Pleadings**

17 On or around March 24, 2021, EHA filed a Complaint against for the alleged violations of
18 Proposition 65 that are the subject of the K-Bakery Notice and Amended K-Bakery Notice (“K-
19 Bakery Complaint”).

20 On or around June 18, 2021, EHA filed a Complaint against for the alleged violations of
21 Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Burdock Notice (“Burdock Complaint”).

22 K-Bakery Complaint and Burdock Complaint are collectively referred to as the “Complaints”.

23 **1.8 No Admission**

24 Settling Defendants deny the material factual and legal allegations of the Notices and
25 Complaints and maintain that all of the Covered Products they have manufactured, imported, sold,
26 and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in
27 compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of
28

1 any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this
2 Consent Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law,
3 or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Settling Defendants’
4 obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

5 **1.9 Jurisdiction**

6 For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this
7 Court has jurisdiction over Settling Defendants as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is
8 proper in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the
9 provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section
10 664.6.

11 **1.10 Effective Date**

12 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Effective Date” means the date on which
13 the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment, as discussed in Section 5.

14 **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

15 **2.1 Clear and Reasonable Warnings**

16 As of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable Proposition 65
17 warning as set forth in this §§ 2.1 and 2.2 must be provided for all Covered Products that Settling
18 Defendants manufacture, supply and distribute for sale or use in California.

19 On or after the Effective Date, for Covered Products that are set forth in §§ 2.1, Settling
20 Defendants shall provide one of the following warning statements:

21 **Option 1:**

22 **WARNING:** Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals
23 including Acrylamide, which is known to the State of California to
24 cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more
information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

25 **Option 2:**

26 **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm –
www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

27 This warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the Covered Products, on the
28 packing of the Covered Products, or on a placard, shelf tag, or sign provided that the statement is

1 displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to
2 render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. If the warning
3 statement is displayed on the Covered Products' packaging, it must be in a type size no smaller than
4 the largest type size used for other consumer information on the product. In no case shall a warning
5 statement displayed on the Covered Products' packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point
6 type. The same warning shall be posted on any websites under the exclusive control of Settling
7 Defendants where Covered Products are sold into California. Settling Defendants shall instruct any
8 third-party website to which it sells its Covered Products to include the same warning as a condition
9 of selling the Covered Products.

10 **2.2 Sell-Through Period**

11 Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, the Covered Products that are
12 manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date shall be subject to release of liability pursuant to this
13 Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future,
14 distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligation of Settling Defendants, or any Releasees
15 (if applicable), do not apply to these Covered Products manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date.

16 **3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS**

17 **3.1 Settlement Amount**

18 Settling Defendants shall pay fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000.00) in settlement and total
19 satisfaction of all the claims referred to in the Notices, the Complaints, and this Consent Judgment.
20 This includes civil penalties in the amount of four thousand dollars (\$4,000.00) pursuant to Health
21 and Safety Code section 25249.7(b) and attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of forty-six thousand
22 dollars (\$46,000.00) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

23 **3.2 Civil Penalty**

24 The portion of the settlement attributable to civil penalties shall be allocated according to
25 Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the
26 penalty, three thousand dollars (\$3,000.00), paid to the California Office of Environmental Health
27 Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty, one
28

1 thousand dollars (\$1,000.00), paid to EHA individually. These payments will be sent to the below
2 addresses within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date.

3 All payments owed to EHA shall be delivered to the following address:

4 Environmental Health Advocates
5 225 Broadway, Suite 1900
6 San Diego, CA 92101

7 All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to
8 OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

9 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

10 Mike Gyurics
11 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
12 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
13 P.O. Box 4010
14 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

15 For Federal Express 2-Day Delivery:

16 Mike Gyurics
17 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
18 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
19 1001 I Street
20 Sacramento, CA 95814

21 Settling Defendants agree to provide EHA's counsel with a copy of the check payable to
22 OEHHA, simultaneous with their penalty payments to EHA.

23 Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required.

24 Relevant information is set out below:

- 25 • "Glick Law Group" (EIN: 47-1838518) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);
- 26 • "Nicholas & Tomasevic" (EIN: 46-3474065) at the address provided in Section
27 3.2(a)(i); and
- 28 • "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA
95814.

29 **3.3 Attorneys' Fees and Costs**

30 The portion of the settlement attributable to attorneys' fees and costs, forty-six thousand
31 dollars (\$46,000.00), shall be paid to Glick Law Group, P.C. and Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP

1 (collectively, “EHA’s Counsel”), who are entitled to attorneys’ fees and costs incurred by it in this
2 action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Settling
3 Defendants’ attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

4 Settling Defendants shall provide their payments to EHA’s Counsel in two installments as
5 follows. Payment may be by physical check or by electronic means, including wire transfers, at
6 Settling Defendants’ discretion:

- 7 • The First Installment shall be in the amount of thirty-nine thousand dollars (\$39,000.00),
8 divided equally, in one check for nineteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$19,500.00) payable
9 to “Glick Law Group, PC”, and in one check for nineteen thousand five hundred dollars
10 (\$19,500.00) payable to “Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP”, within ten (10) days of of the
11 Effective Date (“First Installment”).
- 12 • The Second Installment shall be in the amount of seven thousand dollars (\$7,000.00), divided
13 equally, in one check for three thousand five hundred dollars (\$3,500.00) payable to “Glick
14 Law Group, PC”, and in one check for three thousand five hundred dollars (\$3,500.00)
15 payable to “Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP”, within forty (40) days of the Effective Date
16 (“Second Installment”). **If the First Installment is timely made by Settling Defendants or**
17 **their counsel, then EHA and its counsel agree to waive the Second Installment (such that**
18 **the total settlement amount is \$43,000).** The addresses for these two entities are:

19 Noam Glick
20 Glick Law Group
21 225 Broadway, 19th Floor
22 San Diego, CA 92101

23 Craig Nicholas
24 Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP
25 225 Broadway, 19th Floor
26 San Diego, CA 92101

27 4. **CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

28 4.1 **EHA’s Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims**

Plaintiff acting on its own behalf and in the public interest releases Settling Defendants and
their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, their directors, officers,
principals, agents, employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, predecessors, successors, and

1 assigns (“Defendant Entities”), each entity to whom Settling Defendants directly or indirectly
2 distribute, ship, or sell the Covered Products including but not limited to downstream distributors,
3 wholesalers, customers, and retailers, franchisees, franchisors, cooperative members, suppliers,
4 licensees, and licensors, and all of the foregoing entities’ owners, directors, officers, agents, principals,
5 employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns
6 (collectively referred to as the “Releasees”) from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through
7 the Effective Date based on exposure to Acrylamide from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices.
8 Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with
9 respect to exposures to Acrylamide from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices. This release
10 does not extend to any third-party retailers selling the product on a website who, after receiving
11 instruction from Settling Defendants to include a warning as set forth above in section 2.1, do not
12 include such a warning.

13 **4.2 EHA’s Individual Release of Claims**

14 EHA, in its individual capacity, also provides a release to Settling Defendants and/or
15 Releasees, which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions,
16 causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys’ fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and
17 demands of every nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected,
18 arising out of alleged or actual exposures to Acrylamide in Covered Products manufactured, imported,
19 sold, or distributed by Settling Defendants before the Effective Date.

20 **4.3 Settling Defendants’ Release of EHA**

21 Settling Defendants on their own behalf, and on behalf of Releasees as well as their past and
22 current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims
23 against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements
24 made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating
25 claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against them, in this matter or with respect to the
26 Covered Products.

27 **5. COURT APPROVAL**

28 This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and

1 void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties,
2 or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

3 **6. SEVERABILITY**

4 Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is
5 held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely
6 affected.

7 **7. GOVERNING LAW**

8 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California
9 as applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise
10 rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, then Settling
11 Defendants may provide written notice to EHA of any asserted change, and shall have no further
12 injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the
13 Covered Products are so affected.

14 In the event the California Office of Health Hazard Assessment adopts a regulation or safe
15 use determination, or issues an interpretive guideline that exempts Covered Products from meeting
16 the requirements of Proposition 65; or if Acrylamide cases are permanently enjoined by a court of
17 competent jurisdiction; or if Proposition 65 is determined to be preempted by federal law or a burden
18 on First Amendment rights with respect to Acrylamide in Covered Products or Covered Products
19 substantially similar to Covered Products, then Settling Defendants shall be relieved of its obligation
20 to comply with Section 2 herein.

21 **8. ENFORCEMENT**

22 In any action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be
23 entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

24 **9. NOTICE**

25 Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent
26 Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified
27 mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

28 ///

1 If to Settling Defendants:
2 Marc Libarle
3 Law Offices of Marc Libarle
4 1388 Sutter St, Ste 910
5 San Francisco, CA 94109

If to EHA:
Noam Glick
Glick Law Group, PC
225 Broadway, 19th Floor
San Diego, CA 92101

6 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which
7 notices, and other communications shall be sent.

8 **10. COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES**

9 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of
10 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the
11 same document.

12 **11. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES**

13 EHA agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety
14 Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code
15 section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which
16 motion EHA shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to
17 mutually employ their best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this
18 agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For
19 purposes of this Section, “best efforts” shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for
20 approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing
21 before the Court if so requested.

22 **12. MODIFICATION**

23 This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry
24 of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any
25 Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

26 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

27 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they
28 have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

14. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES

If a dispute arises with respect to either Party’s compliance with the terms of this Consent

1 If a dispute arises with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent
2 Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, or by telephone, and/or
3 in writing and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be
4 filed in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand.


5 **15. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

6 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the
7 Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and nay and all prior discussions, negotiations,
8 commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or
9 implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or
10 otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28


AGREED TO:

Date: June 13, 2022

By: 
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
ADVOCATES, INC.

AGREED TO:

Date: 6.13.2022

By: 
THE K MARKET
NEW KUKJE, INC.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date: _____

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT