1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE S	TATE OF CALIFORNIA
9	FOR THE COUNTY O	
10	FOR THE COUNTY O	
11	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,	Case No. CGC-21-590599
12	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS TO PDX
13	v.	AROMATICS LLC
14	PDX AROMATICS LLC, et al.,	
15	Defendants.	
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28 Document Prepared on Recycled Paper	-1-	
EN INCICLED I ATEK	CONSENT JUDGMENT – PI	DX AROMATICS

1.

INTRODUCTION

2 The Parties to this Consent Judgment are the Center For Environmental Health 1.1 3 ("CEH"), a California non-profit corporation, and PDX Aromatics LLC ("Settling Defendant"). 4 CEH and Settling Defendant (the "Parties") enter into this Consent Judgment to settle certain 5 claims asserted by CEH against Settling Defendant as set forth in the operative complaint 6 ("Complaint") in the above-captioned matter. This Consent Judgment covers the lead content of 7 kratom (mitragyna speciosa) powder, including teas and capsules, that is sold by Settling 8 Defendant and then offered for retail sale to residents of the State of California ("Covered 9 Products").

1.2 On December 4, 2020, CEH provided a 60-day Notice of Violation of Proposition
 65 to the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every county in California, the
 City Attorneys of every California city with a population greater than 750,000 and to Settling
 Defendant, alleging that Settling Defendant violated Proposition 65 by exposing persons to lead
 and lead compounds ("Lead") contained in Covered Products without first providing a clear and
 reasonable Proposition 65 warning.

16 1.3 Settling Defendant is a corporation or other entity that manufactures, distributes,
17 sells or offers for sale Covered Products that are sold in the State of California or has done so in
18 the past.

19 1.4 On March 24, 2021, CEH filed the Complaint in the above-captioned matter
20 naming Settling Defendant.

1.5 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court
has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal
jurisdiction over Settling Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in
the County of San Francisco and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent
Judgment as a full and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the
Complaint based on the facts alleged therein with respect to Covered Products manufactured,
distributed and/or sold by Settling Defendant.

1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment is or shall be construed as an admission by the 1.6 2 Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with 3 the Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, 4 conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall 5 prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument or defense the Parties may have in any 6 other pending or future legal proceedings. This Consent Judgment is the product of negotiation 7 and compromise and is accepted by the Parties solely for purposes of settling, compromising and 8 resolving issues disputed in this action.

9

2. **DEFINITIONS**

10 11 2.1 The "Effective Date" is the date of entry of this Consent Judgment by the Court.
2.2 The "Lead Level" shall mean a concentration level of no more than 100 parts per billion ("ppb") Lead by weight.

13

3.

12

INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

14 3.1 Reformulation of Covered Products. Commencing on June 1, 2022 (the
15 "Compliance Date"), Settling Defendant shall not purchase, manufacture, ship, sell, or offer for
16 sale Covered Products that will be sold or offered for sale to California consumers that exceed the
17 Lead Level.

3.2 Interim Warning Requirement for Covered Products. A Covered Product
purchased, manufactured, shipped, sold or offered for sale by Settling Defendant after the
Effective Date and prior to the Compliance Date, shall not be sold or offered for sale to California
consumers that contains Lead in a concentration exceeding the Lead Level, unless Settling
Defendant provides a Clear and Reasonable Warning as further specified in Section 3.4.

3.3 Permanent Warning Option for Covered Products. A Covered Product
purchased, manufactured, shipped, sold or offered for sale by Settling Defendant after the
Compliance Date may, as an alternative to Reformulation of Covered Products set forth in
Section 3.1, be sold or offered for sale to California consumers with a Clear and Reasonable
Warning as further specified in Section 3.4. If Settling Defendant elects to avail itself of the

-3-

Permanent Warning Option provided by this Section 3.3, on or before the Compliance Date
 Settling Defendant shall provide written notice to CEH of its election under this section, and
 Settling Defendant concurrently shall make the additional payment specified in Section 5.2.4
 below.

5 3.4 Clear and Reasonable Warning. The warning required by Section 3.2 and
6 Section 3.3 for Covered Products shall include the following:

3.4.1 Warning Language:

WARNING:

7

8

9

10

11

Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <u>www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food</u>.

12 3.4.2 Placement of Warning Language. The warning language set forth in 13 Section 3.4.1 must be displayed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, 14 statements, designs or devices as to render the warning likely to be read and understood by an 15 ordinary consumer under customary conditions of purchase and use. The warning language shall 16 appear on the container's label, set off from other surrounding information or enclosed in a text 17 box. If the product's label contains other warnings or nutritional information in a language other 18 than English, the warning language set forth in Section 3.4.1 must also be displayed on the label 19 in that language in addition to English.

20 3.4.3 Internet Sales. With respect to internet sales of Covered Products, the 21 warning language set forth in Section 3.4.1 must be prominently displayed in such a manner that 22 it is likely to be read and understood as being applicable to the Covered Product being sold prior 23 to the authorization of or actual payment by the purchaser. The warning statement shall be 24 displayed before a consumer commits to purchasing the Covered Product by providing the 25 warning on the product display or checkout page. If the warning is displayed on the checkout 26 page, the warning shall include a checkbox that requires a California consumer to acknowledge 27 the warning prior to purchase. For purposes of this section, the warning language is not

prominently displayed if the customer must search for the warning language in the general
 content of Settling Defendant's website or if a reasonable consumer cannot determine the specific
 Covered Product to which the warning applies. If the product display or checkout page contains
 other warnings or nutritional information in a language other than English, the warning language
 set forth in Section 3.4.1 must also be displayed in that language in addition to English.

6

4.

ENFORCEMENT

7 4.1 **Enforcement Procedures.** This Court shall have exclusive jurisdiction over all 8 matters regarding enforcement of the Consent Judgment. Prior to bringing any motion or order to 9 show cause to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, a Party seeking to enforce shall 10 provide the violating party thirty (30) days advanced written notice of the alleged violation. The 11 Parties shall meet and confer during such thirty (30) day period in an effort to try to reach 12 agreement on an appropriate cure for the alleged violation. After such thirty (30) day period, the 13 Party seeking to enforce may, by new action, motion or order to show cause before the Superior 14 Court of San Francisco, seek to enforce Proposition 65 or the terms and conditions contained in 15 this Consent Judgment.

16

5. **PAYMENTS**

17 5.1 Payments by Settling Defendant. On or before ten (10) days after the Effective
18 Date, Settling Defendant shall pay the total sum of \$50,000 as a settlement payment as further set
19 forth in this Section.

20 5.2Allocation of Payments. The total settlement amount for Settling Defendant shall 21 be paid in five (5) separate checks in the amounts specified below and delivered as set forth 22 below. Any failure by Settling Defendant to comply with the payment terms herein shall be 23 subject to a stipulated late fee to be paid by Settling Defendant in the amount of \$100 for each 24 day the full payment is not received after the applicable payment due date set forth in Section 5.1. 25 The late fees required under this Section shall be recoverable, together with reasonable attorneys' 26 fees, in an enforcement proceeding brought pursuant to Section 4 of this Consent Judgment. The 27 funds paid by Settling Defendant shall be allocated as set forth below between the following

28 Document Prepared on Recycled Paper

1 categories and made payable as follows: 2 5.2.1 \$6,730 as a civil penalty pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). 3 The civil penalty payment shall be apportioned in accordance with Health & Safety Code 4 §25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health 5 Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of the civil penalty payment for \$5,047.50 shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with taxpayer 6 7 identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows: 8 For United States Postal Service Delivery: Attn: Mike Gyurics 9 **Fiscal Operations Branch Chief** Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 10 P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B Sacramento, CA 95812-4010 11 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery: 12 Attn: Mike Gyurics **Fiscal Operations Branch Chief** 13 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street, MS #19B 14 Sacramento, CA 95814 15 The CEH portion of the civil penalty payment for \$1,682.50 shall be made 16 payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification 17 number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero 18 Street, San Francisco, CA 94117. 19 5.2.2 \$5,045 as an Additional Settlement Payment ("ASP") to CEH pursuant to 20 Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b), and California Code of Regulations, Title 11, §3204. CEH 21 intends to place these funds in CEH's Toxics in Food Fund and will use the funds to support CEH 22 programs and activities that seek to educate the public about toxic chemicals in food, to work 23 with the food industry and agriculture interests to reduce exposure to toxic chemicals in food and 24 to thereby reduce the public health impacts and risks of exposure to Lead and other toxic 25 chemicals in food sold in California. CEH shall obtain and maintain adequate records to 26 document that ASPs are spent on these activities and CEH agrees to provide such documentation 27 to the Attorney General within thirty days of any request from the Attorney General. The 28 -6payment pursuant to this Section shall be made payable to the Center for Environmental Health
 and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered
 to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.

5.2.3 Settling Defendant shall pay \$38,225 as a reimbursement of a portion of
CEH's reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. The attorneys' fees and cost reimbursement shall be
made in two separate checks as follows: (a) \$33,725 payable to the Lexington Law Group and
associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3317175; and (b) \$4,500 payable to the Center
For Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification number 94-3251981. Both
of these payments shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San
Francisco, CA 94117.

11 5.2.4If, on or before the Compliance Date, Settling Defendant has availed 12 itself of the Permanent Warning Option provided for by Section 3.3, Settling Defendant shall 13 make an additional payment of \$50,000 as a civil penalty, concurrently with its written notice as 14 provided in Section 3.3. This additional civil penalty payment shall be apportioned in accordance 15 with Health & Safety Code § 25249.12 (25% to CEH and 75% to the State of California's Office 16 of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA")). Accordingly, the OEHHA portion of 17 the civil penalty payment for \$37,500 shall be made payable to OEHHA, associated with taxpayer 18 identification number 68-0284486, and sent to the OEHHA address set forth in section 5.2.1 19 above. The CEH portion of the additional civil penalty payment for \$12,500 shall be made 20 payable to the Center for Environmental Health and associated with taxpayer identification 21 number 94-3251981. This payment shall be delivered to Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero 22 Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 within 10 business days of the Compliance Date 23 5.2.5 To summarize, as non-contingent settlement payments Settling Defendant 24 shall deliver checks made out to the payees in the amounts set forth below:

26	Payee	Туре	Amount	Deliver To
27	ОЕННА	Penalty	\$5,047.50	OEHHA per Section 5.2.1

25

-7-

1	Center For Environmental Health	Penalty	\$1,682.50	LLG
2	Center For Environmental Health	ASP	\$5,045	LLG
3	Lexington Law Group	Fee and Cost	\$33,725	LLG
4	Center For Environmental Health	Fee and Cost	\$4,500	LLG
5	5.3 Failure to Comply With Payment Obligations. Notwithstanding the provisions			
6	of the Enforcement of Judgments La	w and California	Code of Civil I	Procedure § 708.160, in the
7	event that Settling Defendant does n	ot comply fully w	vith its payment	t obligations under Section 5
8	in addition to any other enforcement	mechanism avai	lable to CEH, C	EH may obtain an order
9	requiring Settling Defendant to subn	nit to a debtor exa	m. In the even	t that Settling Defendant
10	fails to submit to any such debtor exam ordered by the Court, CEH may seek an order holding			
11	Settling Defendant in contempt of Court.			
12	6. MODIFICATION AND DI	SPUTE RESOL	UTION	
13	6.1 Modification. This C	Consent Judgmen	t may be modif	ied from time to time by
14	express written agreement of the Parties, with the approval of the Court, or by an order of this			
15	Court upon motion and in accordance with law.			
16	6.2 Notice; Meet and Confer. Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment			
17	shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with all affected Parties prior to filing a motion to			
18	modify the Consent Judgment.			
19	7. CLAIMS COVERED AND	RELEASE		
20	7.1 Provided that Settling	Defendant comp	olies in full with	its obligations under
21	Section 5, this Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between CEH on behalf or			
22	itself and the public interest and Settling Defendant and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities			
23	that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, agents, shareholders,			
24	successors, assigns, and attorneys ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities to which Settling			
25	Defendant distributes or sells Covered	ed Products, such	as distributors,	, wholesalers, customers,
26	retailers, franchisees, licensors and li	retailers, franchisees, licensors and licensees ("Downstream Defendant Releasees"), of any		
27				
28		-8-		

1	violation of Proposition 65 based on failure to warn about alleged exposure to Lead contained in
2	Covered Products that were sold by Settling Defendant prior to the Effective Date.
3	7.2 Provided that Settling Defendant complies in full with its obligations under
4	Section 5, CEH, for itself, its agents, successors and assigns, releases, waives and forever
5	discharges any and all claims against Settling Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Downstream
6	Defendant Releasees arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or
7	common law claims that have been or could have been asserted by CEH regarding the failure to
8	warn about exposure to Lead contained in Covered Products sold by Settling Defendant prior to
9	the Effective Date.
10	7.3 Provided that Settling Defendant complies in full with its obligations under
11	Section 5 hereof, compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment by Settling Defendant,
12	Defendant Releasees and Downstream Defendant Releasees shall constitute compliance with
13	Proposition 65 by Settling Defendant, Defendant Releasees and Downstream Defendant
14	Releasees with respect to any alleged failure to warn about Lead in Covered Products sold by
15	Settling Defendant after the Effective Date.
16	8. PROVISION OF NOTICE
17	8.1 When CEH is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent Judgment, the
18	notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:
19	Ryan Berghoff
20	Howard Hirsch Lexington Law Group
21	503 Divisadero Street San Francisco, CA 94117
22	rberghoff@lexlawgroup.com hhirsch@lexlawgroup.com
23	8.2 When Settling Defendant is entitled to receive any notice under this Consent
24	Judgment, the notice shall be sent by first class and electronic mail to:
25	Todd Harrison
26	Venable LLP
27	600 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20001
28 IPARED	-9-

	taharrison@venable.com	
	Any Party may modify the person and/or address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending	
the other Party notice by first class and electronic mail.		
9. COURT APPROVAL		
	9.1 This Consent Judgment shall become effective upon the date signed by CEH and	
Settlir	ng Defendant, whichever is later, provided however, that CEH shall prepare and file a	
Motio	on for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Settling Defendant shall support approval of	
such l	Motion.	
	9.2 If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no further force	
or effe	ect and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any	
purpo	ose other than to allow the Court to determine if there was a material breach of Section 9.1.	
10.	GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION	
	10.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of	
Califo	ornia.	
11.	ATTORNEYS' FEES	
	11.1 Should CEH prevail on any motion, application for an order to show cause, or	
other	proceeding to enforce a violation of this Consent Judgment, CEH shall be entitled to its	
reason	nable attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of such motion or application. Should	
Settlir	ng Defendants prevail on any motion application for an order to show cause, or other	
proce	eding, Settling Defendants may be awarded their reasonable attorneys' fees and costs as a	
result	of such motion or application upon a finding by the Court that CEH's prosecution of the	
motio	on or application lacked substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment,	
the term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery		
Act of	f 1986, Code of Civil Procedure §§ 2016, et seq.	
	11.2 Nothing in this Section 11 shall preclude a party from seeking an award of	
sancti	ions pursuant to law.	
12.	ENTIRE AGREEMENT	
	12.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding -10-	
	CONSENT HIDGMENT DDY ADOMATICS	

1 of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, 2 negotiations, commitments or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein 3 and therein. There are no warranties, representations or other agreements between the Parties 4 except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, 5 other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party 6 hereto. No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, 7 shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically 8 contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the 9 Parties hereto only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein. No supplementation, 10 modification, waiver or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be binding unless executed in 11 writing by the Party to be bound thereby. No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent 12 Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a waiver of any of the other provisions hereof 13 whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver constitute a continuing waiver.

14

13. SUCCESSORS AND ASSIGNS

15 13.1 This Consent Judgment shall apply to and be binding upon CEH and Settling
16 Defendant, and their respective divisions, subdivisions and subsidiaries, and the successors or
17 assigns of any of them.

18 14. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

19 14.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the20 Consent Judgment.

21

15. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE TO CONSENT JUDGMENT

15.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized
by the Party he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to enter into and
execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.

25 16. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS

16.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude CEH from resolving any claim
against an entity that is not Settling Defendant on terms that are different than those contained in

1	this Consent Judgment.		
2	17. EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS		
3	17.1 The stipulations to this Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by		
4	means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to		
5	constitute one document.		
6			
7	IT IS SO ODDEDED AD HIDCED		
8	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED		
9			
9 10	Dated:		
	Judge of the Superior Court		
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28	-12-		

DOCUMENT PREPARED ON RECYCLED PAPER

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
2	Mov 21	
3	Dated: <u>May 21</u> , 2021	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
4		
6		Michael (
7		Signature
8		Michael Creen
9		Michael Green Printed Name
10		
11		CEO Title
12		The
13	Dated:, 2021	
14	Dated, 2021	PDX AROMATICS LLC
15		
16		Signature
17		
18		Printed Name
19		
20		Title
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28 Document Prepared	CONSENT HIDS	-13- MENT – PDX AROMATICS
ON RECYCLED PAPER	CONSENT JUDO	

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
2		
3	Dated:, 2021	CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL
4		HEALTH
5		
6		
7		Signature
8		
9		Printed Name
10		
11		Title
12		The
13	Dated: ^{5/17/2021} , 2021	
14	Dated, 2021	PDX AROMATICS LLC
15		Jeff Stratton
16		Signature
17		Jeff Stratton
18		Printed Name
19		T mice i vane
20		Managing Director
20 21		Title
21		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28 Document Prepared	CONSENT HIDGA	-13- IENT – PDX AROMATICS – CASE NO. RG
ON RECYCLED PAPER	CONSENT JODOMENT - TDA AROMATICS - CASE NO. RO	