	II	
1	WILLIAM GROUP, PU	
2	Noam Glick (SBN 251582) 225 Broadway, Suite 2100	
3	101. (017) 302-3400	
4		
5	NICHOLAS & TOMASEVIC, LLP Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444)	
6	Jake Schulte (SBN 293777) 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diago, Colifornia 02101	
7	San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 325-0492	
8	Email: cnicholas@nicholaslaw.org Email: jschulte@nicholaslaw.org	
9	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
10	Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.	
11	SUDEDIOD COURT OF T	
12		
13	IN AND FOR THE (COUNTY OF ALAMEDA
14	ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH	Case No. RG21101826
15	ADVOCATES, INC., a California corporation,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT
16	Plaintiff,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq.
17	v.	and Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)
18	FALCON TRADING COMPANY dba	
19	"SUNRIDGE FARMS", a California corporation, BRISTOL FARMS, a	
20	California corporation, and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,	
21	Defendants.	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	-	
		The state of the s

CONSENT JUDGMENT

541969.2

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., ("EHA" or "Plaintiff") and Falcon Trading Company dba "Sunridge Farms" ("Defendant" or "FTC") with EHA and FTC each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively referred to as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

EHA is a corporation organized in the state of California, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

FTC employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

EHA alleges that FTC manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale Cinnamon Vanilla Almonds that contain acrylamide. EHA further alleges that FTC does so without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65 and related Regulations. Pursuant to Proposition 65, acrylamide is listed as a chemical known to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm.

1.5 Notices of Violation

On or around September 23, 2020, EHA served Bristol Farms, the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Initial Notice"). The Initial Notice alleged that Bristol Farms had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to acrylamide contained in Cinnamon Vanilla

Almonds.

On or around January 7, 2021, EHA served FTC, Bristol Farms, the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with an Amended 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Amended Notice"). The Amended Notice corrected the manufacturer to FTC.

1.6 Product Description

The products covered by this Consent Judgment are Cinnamon Vanilla Almonds manufactured or processed by FTC that allegedly contain acrylamide and are imported, sold, shipped, delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers in California by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1) ("Covered Products").

1.7 State of the Pleadings

On or around June 14, 2021, EHA filed a Complaint against FTC for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notices ("Complaint").

1.8 No Admission

FTC denies the material factual and legal allegations of the Notices and Complaint and maintains that all of the Covered Products it has manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect FTC's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over FTC as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the

provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which the Court grants the motion for approval of this Consent Judgment, as discussed in Section 5.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation of the Covered Products

Except as otherwise provided herein, any Covered Products that are manufactured by FTC on and after the Effective Date that FTC sells in California or distributes for sale in California shall not exceed 225 parts per billion ("ppb") for acrylamide, using tests performed by a laboratory accredited by the State of California, a federal agency, or a nationally recognized accrediting organization, using LC-MS/MS (Liquid Chromatograph-Mass Spectrometry), unless such Covered Products comply with the warning requirements of Section 2.2. As used in this Section 2, "distributed for sale in California" means to directly ship Covered Products into California or to sell Covered Products to a distributor FTC know will sell Covered Products in California.

2.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For Covered Products that contain acrylamide in a concentration exceeding the 225 ppb level set forth in section 2.1 above, and which are manufactured and packaged for distribution for authorized sale or use in California on or after the Effective Date, FTC shall provide one of the following warning statements.

Option 1:

WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals, including Acrylamide, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

Option 2:

WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm –

www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

This warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the Covered Products, on the packing of the Covered Products, or on a placard, shelf tag, or sign provided that the statement is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. If the warning statement is displayed on the Covered Products' packaging, it must be in a type size no smaller than the largest type size used for other consumer information on the product. In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Products' packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. The same warning shall be posted on any websites under the exclusive control of FTC where Covered Products are sold into California. FTC shall instruct any third-party website to which it sells its Covered Products to include the same warning as a condition of selling the Covered Products.

2.3 Sell-Through Period

Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, the Covered Products that are manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date shall be subject to release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligation of FTC, or any Releasees (if applicable), do not apply to these Covered Products manufactured on or prior to the Effective Date.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Settlement Amount

FTC shall pay fifty-five thousand dollars (\$55,000.00) in settlement and total satisfaction of all the claims referred to in the Notices, the Complaint, and this Consent Judgment. This includes civil penalties in the amount of five thousand dollars (\$5,000.00) pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b) and attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000.00) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

3.2 Civil Penalty

The portion of the settlement attributable to civil penalties shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty paid to EHA individually.

All payments owed to EHA shall be delivered to the following address:

Environmental Health Advocates

225 Broadway, Suite 2100

San Diego, CA 92101

All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Federal Express 2-Day Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

FTC agrees to provide EHA's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to EHA.

Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required. Relevant information is set out below:

- "Glick Law Group" (EIN: 47-1838518) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);
- "Nicholas & Tomasevic" (EIN: 46-3474065) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and
 - "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA

1

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

1213

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2223

24

25

2627

28

3.3 Attorney's Fees and Costs

The portion of the settlement attributable to attorneys' fees and costs shall be paid to EHA's counsel, who are entitled to attorneys' fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to FTC's attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

FTC shall provide their payment to EHA's counsel in two checks, divided equally, payable to Glick Law Group, PC for twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000.00) and Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP for twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000.00) respectively. The addresses for these two entities are:

Noam Glick Glick Law Group 225 Broadway, Suite 2100 San Diego, CA 92101

Craig Nicholas Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

3.4 Timing

The above-mentioned checks will be issued within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date.

4. <u>CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED</u>

4.1 EHA's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Plaintiff acting on its own behalf and in the public interest releases FTC and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, its directors, officers, principals, agents, employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, predecessors, successors, and assigns ("Defendant Entities"), each entity to whom Defendant directly or indirectly distributes, ships, or sells the Covered Products including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, and retailers (including but not limited to Bristol Farms) franchisees, franchisors, cooperative members, suppliers, licensees, and licensors, and all of the foregoing entities' owners, directors, officers, agents, principals, employees, attorneys,

insurers, accountants, representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns (collectively referred to as the "Releasees") from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on exposure to acrylamide from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to acrylamide from Covered Products as set forth in the Notices. This release does not extend to any third-party retailers selling the product on a website who, after receiving instruction from FTC to include a warning as set forth above in section 2.2, do not include such a warning.

4.2 EHA's Individual Release of Claims

EHA, in its individual capacity, also provides a release to FTC and/or Releasees, which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of every nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to acrylamide in Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by FTC before the Effective Date.

4.3 FTC's Release of EHA

FTC on its own behalf, and on behalf of Releasees as well as its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against them, in this matter or with respect to the Covered Products.

5. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

6. **SEVERABILITY**

2.7

Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California as applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, then FTC may provide written notice to EHA of any asserted change, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

In the event the California Office of Health Hazard Assessment adopts a regulation or safe use determination, or issues an interpretive guideline that exempts Covered Products from meeting the requirements of Proposition 65; or if acrylamide cases are permanently enjoined by a court of competent jurisdiction; or if Proposition 65 is determined to be preempted by federal law or a burden on First Amendment rights with respect to acrylamide in Covered Products or Covered Products substantially similar to Covered Products, then FTC shall be relieved of its obligation to comply with Section 2 herein.

8. <u>ENFORCEMENT</u>

In any action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

9. NOTICE

Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

If to FTC:
Michael Hambly
Salmas Law
The Food Lawyers

If to EHA:
Noam Glick
Glick Law Group
225 Broadway, Suite 2100

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which notices and other communications shall be sent.

COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

EHA agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion EHA shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any thirdparty may make, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

12. **MODIFICATION**

This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

13. **AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES 14.

If a dispute arises with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, or by

Ţ	telephone, and/or in writing and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No		
2	action or motion may be filed in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the		
3	dispute beforehand.		
4	15. ENTIRE AGREEMENT		
5	This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of		
6	the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions,		
7	negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or		
8	otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any		
9	Party. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be		
10	deemed to exist or to bind any Party.		
11			
12	AGREED TO:		
13			
14	Date: 03/21/2022 Date: 3-24-2022		
15			
16	By: ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH By: MORTON COHEN, FALCON		
17	ADVOCATES, INC. ADVOCATES, INC. TRADING COMPANY dba "SUNRIDGE FARMS"		
18	SUINCIDGE FARIVIS		
19	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
20			
21			
22	DATE: JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
23	JODGE OF THE SOFERIOR COOK!		
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	11		