1	Noam Glick (SBN 251582)		
2	225 Broadway, Suite 1900		
3	San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 382-3400 Fax: (619) 393-0154		
4	Email: noam@glicklawgroup.com		
5	NICHOLAS & TOMASEVIC, LLP Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444)		
6	Jake Schulte (SBN 293777) 225 Broadway, Suite 1900		
7	San Diego, California 92101 Tel: (619) 325-0492		
8	Email: cnicholas@nicholaslaw.org Email: jschulte@nicholaslaw.org		
9	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
10	Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.		
11	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
12			
13	ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH	Case No. RG20077146	
14	ADVOCATES, INC.,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT	
15	Plaintiff,	(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. and	
16	v.	Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)	
17	VICENZI S.p.A., an Italian Corporation, and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,	Z.	
18	Defendants.		
19			
20		_	
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., ("EHA"), on the one hand, and Vicenzi S.p.A. ("Defendant" or "Vicenzi") on the other hand, with EHA and Vicenzi each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively referred to as the "Parties."

1.2 Plaintiff

EHA is an organization residing in California, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Vicenzi employs ten or more individuals and is a "person in the course of doing business" for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.4 General Allegations

EHA alleges that Vicenzi manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale puff pastry with butter that contains acrylamide. EHA further alleges that Vicenzi does so without providing a sufficient warning as required by Proposition 65 and related Regulations. Pursuant to Proposition 65, acrylamide is listed as a chemical known to cause cancer and reproductive harm.

1.5 Notice of Violation

On August 13, 2020, EHA served Vicenzi, Cost Plus World Market, Vicenzi USA, Inc., the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65. The notice alleged that Vicenzi violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to acrylamide contained in its "Matilde Vicenzi Puff Pastry with Butter (Ciambelline Al Burro)".

On February 17, 2021, EHA served Vicenzi, the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a second 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65. The second notice alleged that Vicenzi violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to acrylamide contained in its "Matilde

Vicenzi Puff Pastry with Butter (Millefogile d'Italia Classiche)" and other puff pastries with butter.

No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

1.6 Products Description

The products EHA alleges to be in violation that are covered by this Consent Judgment are "Matilde Vicenzi Puff Pastry with Butter (Ciambelline Al Burro)" and "Matilde Vicenzi Puff Pastry with Butter (Millefogile d'Italia Classiche)" and any other puff pastries with butter manufactured or sold by Vicenzi that allegedly contain acrylamide and are imported, sold, shipped, delivered or distributed for sale to consumers in California by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1) ("Products"), whether sold under the Vicenzi brand, any other brand, or some other private label at all grocery, retail, and other locations and sales channels, including on the Internet.

1.7 Complaint

On October 16, 2020, EHA filed a Complaint against Vicenzi for the alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the August notice ("Complaint"). The Court hereby deems the Complaint amended to include the allegations permissible pursuant to the second notice of February 17, 2021.

1.8 No Admission

Vicenzi denies the material factual and legal allegations of the Notice and Complaint and maintains that all of the products it has manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Vicenzi's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Vicenzi as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the

County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" means the date on which notice of entry of this Consent Judgment is served on Vicenzi. Due to the fact that the Products are subject to other regulatory requirements and any reformulation must ensure compliance with these other applicable regulatory requirements, the Compliance Date is the date that is six (6) months after the Effective Date.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION OF PRODUCTS OR WARNINGS

2.1 Reformulation of Products

Any Products that are manufactured or sold by or for Vicenzi on and after the Compliance Date that are thereafter sold or distributed for sale in California by Vicenzi shall not exceed 100 parts per billion ("ppb") acrylamide on average, as set forth in this Section 2. As used in this Section 2.1, "distributed for sale in California" means to directly ship a Product into California or to sell a Product to a distributor that Vicenzi knows will sell the Product in California.

2.2 Testing

- (a) Compliance with the average level shall be determined using LC-MS/MS (Liquid Chromatograph-Mass Spectrometry), GC/MS/MS (Gas Chromatography/Mass Spectrometry), or any other testing method agreed upon by the Parties. Any testing for purposes of Section 2.1 shall be performed by any laboratory accredited by the State of California, a federal agency, or a recognized accrediting organization.
- (b) The Average Level is determined by randomly selecting and testing, over no less than a ten-day period, one sample from at least five lots (or from as many lots as are available, if fewer than five) and a maximum of ten lots of Products produced at locations that supply such Products to California ("Sampling Data"). The mean and standard deviation shall be calculated using the Sampling Data. Any data points that are more than three standard deviations outside the mean shall be discarded

once, and the mean and standard deviation recalculated using the remaining data points. The arithmetic mean determined in accordance with this procedure shall be deemed the "Average Level."

(c) For at least three consecutive years after the Compliance Date, Vicenzi shall arrange for testing under Section 2.2. The testing shall be a least once per year, with the first testing occurring prior to the Compliance Date. No further testing shall be required unless Vicenzi materially modifies the ingredients or cooking process of a Product, at which point testing shall recommence on an annual basis for at least three years.

2.3 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Products

Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, the Products that are manufactured on or prior to the Compliance Date shall be subject to release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligation of Vicenzi, or any Releasees (if applicable), do not apply to these Products manufactured on or prior to the Compliance Date.

2.4 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For Products that contain acrylamide in an average concentration exceeding the ppb level set forth in Section 2.1 above, and which are manufactured and packaged for distribution, for authorized sale or use in California on or after the Compliance Date, Vicenzi shall provide one of the following Proposition 65 warnings:

1) WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including Acrylamide, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

2) WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.cs.gov

The word "WARNING" shall be displayed in all capital letters and bold print. This warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the packaging of the Products, or on a placard, shelf tag, or sign provided that the statement is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. If the warning statement is displayed on the Products' label, it must be set off from other

26

27

28

Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Vicenzi agrees to provide EHA's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to EHA.

Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required. Relevant information is set out below:

- "Glick Law Group" (EIN: 47-1838518) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i);
- "Nicholas & Tomasevic" (EIN: 46-3474065) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and
- "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA
 95814.

3.3 Attorney's Fees and Costs

The portion of the settlement attributable to attorney's fees and costs (\$52,000.00) shall be paid to EHA's counsel, who are entitled to attorney's fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Vicenzi's attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

Vicenzi shall provide its payment to EHA's counsel in two checks, divided equally, payable to Glick Law Group, PC (\$26,000.00) and Nicholas & Tomasevic, (\$26,000.00) respectively. The addresses for these two entities are:

Noam Glick Glick Law Group 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

Craig Nicholas Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

3.4 Timing

The above-mentioned checks will be issued within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date.

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 EHA's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims

For any claim or violation arising under Proposition 65 alleging a failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Vicenzi prior to the Compliance Date, EHA, acting for the general public, releases Vicenzi of any and all liability. This includes Vicenzi's owners, parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownerships, its directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Vicenzi directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesales, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees, (collectively, the "Releasees"). Releasees include Vicenzi, its parent, and all subsidiaries and affiliates thereof and their respective employees, agents, and assigns that sell Vicenzi's Products. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to acrylamide from Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Vicenzi after the Effective Date. This Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution of all claims that were or could have been asserted against Vicenzi or Releasees for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposure to acrylamide contained in Products.

4.2 EHA's Individual Release of Claims

EHA, in its individual capacity, also waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action, and discharges and releases all claims against all Releasees, including Vicenzi, under Proposition 65 or any statutory or common law from the alleged failure to provide warnings for any exposures to acrylamide, or for causing any exposures to acrylamide, in the Products manufactured, purchased, distributed, or sold by Defendant. This release in this Section 4.2 is effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorney's fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of every nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected. EHA acknowledges that it is familiar with Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO

EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

EHA understands and acknowledges the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code section 1542.

4.3 Vicenzi's Release of EHA

Vicenzi, on its own behalf, and on behalf of its affiliated Releasees as well as its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it, in this matter or with respect to the Products.

5. <u>COURT APPROVAL</u>

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

6. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California as applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, then Vicenzi may provide written notice to EHA of any asserted change, and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

8. NOTICE

Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier to the following addresses:

If to Vicenzi:

If to EHA:

Gary M. Roberts Dentons US LLP 601 South Figueroa Street, STE 2500 Los Angeles, CA 90017 Jake Schulte Nicholas & Tomasevic, LLP 225 Broadway, 19th Floor San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

EHA agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which motion EHA shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually employ their best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval, responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing before the Court if so requested.

11. MODIFICATION

- 11.1 **Modification**. This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.
- 11.2 **Notice; Meet and Confer.** Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgement shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with the other Party prior to filing a motion to modify the Consent Judgement.

- 11.3 Change in Proposition 65. If Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations (including but not limited to the published "no significant risk level" for acrylamide set forth at Cal. Code Regs., tit 27, section 25705, subdivision (c)(2) or any "alternative risk level" adopted by regulation or court decision) are changed from their terms as they exist on the date of entry of this Consent Judgement, or if OEHHA takes some other final regulatory action that determines that warnings for acrylamide are not required or modifies the standard for warnings for acrylamide, then Vicenzi may seek to modify this Consent Judgement.
- 11.4 Other Court Decisions. If a final decision of a court determines that warnings for acrylamide exposures or that enforcement of Proposition 65 claims for acrylamide exposures are preempted or otherwise unlawful or unconstitutional, then Vicenzi may move to modify this Consent Judgement to conform to such ruling in order to avoid unfair, inconsistent, or anti-competitive results.
- agency of the federal government, including, but not limited to, the U.S. Food and Drug

 Administration, states through any guidance, regulation or legally binding act that federal law has

 preemptive effect on any of the requirements of this Consent Judgement, then this Consent

 Judgement may be modified in accordance with the procedure for noticed motions set forth in Section

 11.1 to bring it into compliance with or avoid conflict with federal law.
- 11.6 Scientific Studies. If an agency of the federal government, including, but not limited to the U.S. Food and Drug Administration, states through any guidance, regulation, or other legally binding act, following a review of scientific studies and following public notice and comment, a cancer potency estimate for acrylamide that equates to a no significant risk level higher than 0.2 micrograms per day, then Vicenzi shall be entitled to seek a modification of this Consent Judgement.
- 11.7 Before filing any motion to modify the Consent Judgement, Vicenzi shall provide written notice to EHA to initiate the meet and confer procedure in Section 11.2. If the Parties do not agree on the proposed modification during informal meet and confer efforts, Vicenzi may file a motion to modify the Consent Judgment within sixty (60) days of the date of the written notice that Vicenzi provides to EHA under this Section 11.

7

11 12

10

13 14

15 16

17 18

19 20

21

22 23

25 26

24

27

28

Any modifications to this Consent Judgment provided herein shall have no effect on 11.8 Vicenzi's financial obligations as contained in this Agreement.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION 12.

This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment. Notwithstanding the provisions of Section 11, nothing in this Consent Judgment limits or affects the Court's authority to modify this Consent Judgment as provided by law.

13. **AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES 14.

Prior to bringing any motion or order to show cause to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, a Party seeking to enforce the Consent Judgment shall provide the other Party written notice of the alleged violation. The Parties shall meet and confer in an effort to try to reach agreement on an appropriate cure for the alleged violation. EHA shall not bring an enforcement action or institute a judicial proceeding if Vicenzi demonstrates it has complied with the requirements of Section 2. Vicenzi is entitled to designate such information as confidential.

In the event that meet and confer efforts are unsuccessful, the Party alleging a violation may initiate a judicial proceeding to enforce this Consent Judgment no earlier than 60 days after issuing the written notice specified in this Section 14. In the event that a Party initiates such a judicial proceeding, the prevailing Party shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

15. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.

1	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
2	Date: February 23, 2021.	Date: 23 TEBRUARY, 2021
3	Lialy	
4	By:ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH	By: MRS. GIULIANA VICENZI VICENZI S.p.A
5	ADVOCATES, INC.	
6		VICENZI S.p.A.
7		Via Forte Garofolo n. 1 015 8262800 - Fax 045.8262870 37057 5 GIOYANNI LUPATOTO (VR) Cod Fisc. e Part IN A.: 96/27320231
8	IT IS SO ORDERED.	Cod Fisc. e Part IN A. 1 69 27 320231
9	TI IS SO SILEZINE.	
10	Date:	
11		JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
12	116468700	
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18 19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		