		•	
1	WILLIAM VERICK, SBN 140972		
2	KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER 1125 Sixteenth Street		
3	Arcata, CA 95521 Telephone: (707) 630-5061		
4	Facsimile: (707) 630-5064 Email: wverick@igc.org		
5	DAVID WILLIAMS, SBN 144479 BRIAN ACREE, SBN 202505		
6	1700 Ygnacio Valley Road, Suite 202 Walnut Creek, CA 94598		
7	Telephone: (510) 847-2356 Facsimile: (925) 332-0352		
8	Email: dhwill7@gmail.com Email: brian@brianacree.com		
9	Attorneys for Plaintiff		
10	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION		
11			
12	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
13	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO		
14			
15	MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION,	No. CGC-21-592209	
16	Plaintiff,	[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT	
17	v.		
18 19	FISKARS LIVING US, LLC and FISKARS BRANDS, INC.		
20	Defendants.		
21			
22	1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>		
23	1.1. This Stipulation and Consent Judgment (the "Consent Judgment") is entered into		
24	to resolve plaintiff MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOUNDATION's ("MEJF's" or		
25	"Plaintiff's") allegations in those certain April 23, 2021 and March 8, 2023 Notice of Intent to		
26	Sue letters ("NOVs" or "Notices") that defendants Fiskars Living US, LLC and Fiskars Brands,		
27	Inc. (collectively hereinafter, "Fiskars" or "Settling Defendants") violated Proposition 65 (Health		
28	& Saf. Code § 25249.6, et seq. or "the Act") by eith	ner importing, manufacturing, distributing,	

CONSENT JUDGMENT

17 18

19

20 21

22 23

24 25

26

27 28

selling, offering for sale or marketing, or some combination thereof in California ("Markets" or "Marketing"), lead-containing crystal glass drinkware and/or food serveware ("Covered Products") without providing clear and reasonable warnings to customers that the Covered Products would expose them to lead, or lead and lead compounds (collectively, "Lead"), chemicals listed as known to the State of California pursuant to the Act to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Plaintiff and Fiskars are hereinafter sometimes referred to collectively as the "Parties." Plaintiff and Fiskars entered into this Consent Judgment to resolve the abovereferenced allegations in the NOVs, in the complaint filed May 27, 2021 and in the operative First Amended Complaint filed June 22, 2021 ("FAC") that Fiskars violated Proposition 65. MEJF asserts it is acting "in the public interest" within the meaning of Proposition 65 in the FAC and for purposes of this Consent Judgment.

- 1.2. Fiskars maintains that it has at all times complied with the warning requirements of Proposition 65. Fiskars expressly maintains that the August 23, 2001 ORDER ENTERING MODIFIED CONSENT JUDGMENT in the case Janet C. Mangini v. Action Industries, Inc., San Francisco Superior Court Consolidated Matters Nos. 932724, 931884, and 938173 ("Mangini Consent Judgment") governs Proposition 65 warnings with respect to its Covered Products, or certain of such products, and that Fiskars has complied with the *Mangini* Consent Judgment. MEJF, however, disputes that Fiskars has complied at all times with Proposition 65 and that the Mangini Consent Judgment governs all, or certain, of Fiskars' Covered Products. The Parties have vigorously disputed these issues. Subsequent discussions and negotiations between the Parties have resulted in an agreement to stipulate to this Consent Judgment and to ask that the Court approve it.
- 1.3. A substantial portion of the crystal glassware that Fiskars Markets in California contains no intentionally added Lead. Covered Products made from crystal glass as defined by categories 3 and/or 4 of Annex I of the European Union's Council Directive 69/493 EEC and that contain no intentionally added Lead as any ingredient in the product shall be referred to herein as "Crystalline." Crystalline may sometimes contain occasional and inadvertent trace amounts of Lead. Crystal glassware that contains intentionally added Lead shall be referred to herein as

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

2021

22

23

2425

26

27

28

"Leaded Crystal."

- 1.4. Mateel represents that it has tested dozens of samples of Crystalline made by or for Fiskars, or its affiliates, or Marketed by Fiskars, and that Crystalline is readily distinguishable from Leaded Crystal based on Lead content. Mateel further represents that the analytical results of these tests provide convincing evidence that Crystalline does not leach Lead into food or beverages stored in or served from it in amounts that would cause Lead exposures that require a Proposition 65 warning. Ten samples of the same Crystalline wine glasses were subjected to a leach test using 4% acetic acid (pH 2.1, which is the pH of common cola drinks) as a leaching solution. Ten additional samples of the same Crystalline were subjected to a leach test using an acetic acid solution with a pH of 3.1, the pH of white wine. The analytical method's detection limit for the analysis on both sets of samples was 0.6 micrograms per liter. Test results for all twenty samples of Crystalline were uniformly non-detect. These results demonstrate that even assuming that Lead was present in the leaching solution just below the 0.6 microgram per liter detection limit, a person would have to drink more than a full bottle of wine to result in an exposure exceeding 0.5 micrograms of Lead, the "safe harbor" Proposition 65 warning standard for exposures to Lead as a reproductive toxicant.
- 1.5. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Covered Products include both Crystalline and Leaded Crystal that are intended to be used for storing or serving food or for beverage consumption.
- 1.6. The Effective Date of this Consent Judgment shall be the date that MEJF serves notice on Fiskars that it is entered as a judgment by the Court.

2. <u>CLEAR AND REASONABLE WARNINGS</u>

2.1. Leaded Crystal

2.1.1. Clear and reasonable warnings that use of Leaded Crystal exposes persons to Lead, chemicals listed as known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm, shall be provided by Fiskars under this Consent Judgment in the manner provided in Paragraphs 2.1.3, 2.1.4. 2.1.5, 2.1.6 and 2.1.7 below. Upon receiving the written agreement of the Attorney General's Office, Fiskars also may provide warnings in an

8

6

5

11 12

13

1415

16

17

18 19

20

21

2223

24

25

26

2728

alternative manner to the requirements of this Paragraph 2.

- 2.1.2. No later than forty five (45) days after the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment, Fiskars, or an entity acting on its behalf, shall at its sole election undertake one of the following three (3) alternatives when Marketing Leaded Crystal, and may change which alternative it elects over time, but must undertake, or continue to undertake, at least one of the alternatives:
 - Mail to the central purchasing office and, if different, also to the a. authorized agent, for all distributors and retail stores with whom it transacts business for sale of Leaded Crystal in California: 1) the letter and Leaded Crystal stickering instructions attached as Exhibit A (incorporated herein by this reference) to this Consent Judgment which shall additionally attach a list of each Leaded Crystal brand name, pattern and Stock Keeping Unit ("SKU") to which the letter is intended to apply; and 2) sheets of sticker/labels ("Sticker Warnings") that, together, contain at least 800 Sticker Warnings. Fiskars shall confirm receipt of the mailings. Each Sticker Warning must meet the content requirements described in 27 Cal. Code Regs. § 25603(b)¹ and the type size requirements described in 27 Cal. Code Regs. § 25601(c). The Sticker Warnings shall be printed in color on Avery Return Address Label No. 5167 label sheets or their functional equivalent. Warning language on the Sticker Warnings must be in 8 point or larger type. Thereafter, Fiskars, or an entity acting on its behalf, shall provide such sheets of Sticker Warnings free of charge, upon request, to any entity with whom Fiskars then or at any time in the future begins to do business by Marketing Leaded Crystal.
 - b. Fiskars may implement the warning terms of the *Mangini* Consent Judgment but, additionally, shall include a supplemental information statement to each person to whom Fiskars provides the *Mangini* Consent Judgment warning identifying the brand names and SKUs of such Covered Products that are Leaded Crystal. Fiskars shall

¹ The following shall be acceptable forms of Sticker Warning: A Birth Defects and Reproductive Harm—www.P65Warnings.ca.gov. Or, alternatively, the text following the yellow triangle could be "Cancer and Reproductive Harm—www.P65Warnings.ca.gov".

include 200 such Sticker Warnings and shall supply additional Sticker Warnings upon request, without charge, to the persons receiving the *Mangini* Consent Judgment warnings. If the person receiving the *Mangini* Consent Judgment warnings is not the authorized agent, a copy also shall be provided to the authorized agent. In all notifications Fiskars shall confirm receipt of the communication.

- c. Fiskars may implement the warning terms of the *Mangini* Consent Judgment, and, additionally, shall either include a statement "Lead," "Lead Crystal," or "Leaded Crystal" printed on, or affixed to, the exterior, consumer ready packaging of Leaded Crystal that are Covered Products, *or* a sticker on each individual unit of such Leaded Crystal that are Covered Products stating either "Lead," "Lead Crystal," or "Leaded Crystal," or some combination of the forgoing, so long as one or another of these forms of notification of Lead in the Covered Products is implemented for all Leaded Crystal that are Covered Products. This option shall apply to Covered Products manufactured forty-five (45) or more days after the Effective Date.
- 2.1.3. Beginning no later than the first year anniversary of the Effective Date, Fiskars, or an entity acting on Fiskars's behalf, shall elect and implement, at least annually, at least one of the three warning alternatives in Section 2.1.2. (except that if Fiskars elects the option in Section 2.1.2.c, then in that case the stickering and/or labeling obligations in Section 2.1.2.c. shall be implemented continuously as Covered Products that are Leaded Crystal are manufactured). Fiskars shall implement the obligations in Section 2.1.5, 2.1.6 and 2.1.7, with the last such election and implementation of these obligations being required by December 31st of the final year Fiskars Markets Leaded Crystal. Once Fiskars no longer Markets Leaded Crystal that are Covered Products, the obligations under this Consent Judgment as to such Leaded Crystal shall terminate as to Fiskars, but Covered Products will continue to be deemed in compliance with Proposition 65 and this Consent Judgment at all times through the time the last of such Covered Products are sold through all relevant supply chains and no further Marketing by any person occurs.
 - 2.1.4. Fiskars, or a person acting on its behalf, shall provide to each of its customers that

Fiskars knows or has reason to believe will sell Fiskars's Leaded Crystal to residents of California by mail warnings in accordance with the applicable terms (including Paragraph 15) of the *Mangini* Consent Judgment.

- 2.1.5. If Fiskars sells its Leaded Crystal by mail order/Internet directly to residents of the State of California, Fiskars, or a person acting on its behalf, shall provide clear and reasonable warnings in accordance with the applicable terms (including Paragraph 16) of the *Mangini* Consent Judgment.
- 2.1.6. If Fiskars transacts business for the commercial use of Leaded Crystal by restaurant suppliers, restaurants or food service establishments in California, Fiskars, or a person acting on its behalf, shall provide clear and reasonable warnings in accordance with the applicable terms (including Paragraph 17) of the *Mangini* Consent Judgment.

2.2. Crystalline

- 2.2.1. Proposition 65 warning are not required by any person for Covered Products that are Crystalline. It is a material term of this Consent Judgment that the Court expressly determine upon its approval of this Consent Judgment that Proposition 65 warnings respecting Lead are not required for Covered Products that are Crystalline, and such determination is a final conclusion of law as to Covered Products that are Crystalline.
- 2.3. If Fiskars has complied with the terms of Paragraph 2.1 above, then Fiskars shall not be found to have violated this Consent Judgment or Proposition 65 where a retail store, distributor, mail order supplier, Internet seller, restaurant supplier, restaurant, winery or any other person required to provide Proposition 65 warnings for Leaded Crystal fails to provide such warnings.
- 2.4. If one of the compliance alternatives elected by Fiskars requires a person downstream in the Covered Product distribution chain to take action with regard to warnings (such as applying stickers to Leaded Crystal) and such person fails in a material respect to take the requested action, that person may not be a beneficiary under this Consent Judgment for a specific Marketed Covered Product where the requested action was not taken (as detailed in Exhibit A). Nothing in this Consent Judgment, however, limits any right, defense, entitlement or

argument that such person may assert as to compliance with Proposition 65, it being expressly recognized that such person could be in compliance with Proposition 65 via an alternative compliance mechanism.

3. MONETARY TERMS

- 3.1. Attorneys' Fees: No later than five (5) business days after the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment, Fiskars shall pay the sum of \$210,000.00 to the "Klamath Environmental Law Center" as complete reimbursement for any and all expenses and attorneys' fees incurred by MEJF in this matter relating to allegations of violations of the Consent Judgment. The reimbursement shall cover all attorneys' fees, investigative fees, testing and expert fees, and all other fees and expenses of any kind incurred by MEJF investigating, bringing this matter to Settling Defendant's attention, negotiating the settlement of the matter, and obtaining court approval of this Amendment.
- 3.2. <u>Civil Penalty</u>: No later than five (5) business days after the Effective Date of this Consent Judgment, Fiskars shall pay the sum of \$35,000.00 in civil penalties. This civil penalty payment shall be divided as follows: \$26,250.00 shall be paid to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment as the State of California's share of the civil penalties assessed in this case; and \$8,750.00 shall be paid to plaintiff, Mateel Environmental Justice Foundation as its share of the civil penalties assessed in this case. The payments required by this Section 3 shall be made by separate checks and shall be delivered to the attention of William Verick, Klamath Environmental Law Center, 1125 Sixteenth Street, Suite 204, Arcata, California 95521. Plaintiff and its counsel shall upon request promptly provide any necessary taxpayer identification information for Fiskars to process the payments due herein.

4. ENFORCEMENT

4.1. The terms of this Consent Judgment are enforceable only by and among the Parties hereto. A prevailing Party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs in connection with any successful motion to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment.

5. MATTERS COVERED BY THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT/PUBLIC RELEASE

5.1. As to those matters alleged in the Notices, Mateel acting on its own behalf and in

 the public interest releases Fiskars, as well as its affiliates, subsidiaries, parents, divisions, suppliers, importers, manufacturers, distributors, licensors, licensees, retailers, and/or customers, and their respective predecessors, successors and assigns (collectively, "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on exposure to Lead in the Covered Products. As to Covered Products, and as to those matters alleged in the Notices, this Consent Judgment is a full, final and binding resolution between Plaintiff, acting on behalf of the public interest, on the one hand, and Fiskars and other Releasees on the other hand, of any actual or alleged violation of Proposition 65 for failure to provide clear, reasonable, and lawful warnings under Proposition 65 of alleged or actual exposure to Lead contained in or otherwise associated with Covered Products Marketed by, for, or on behalf of Fiskars or any other Releasee up through the Effective Date. On and after the Effective Date, as to Covered Products, compliance by Fiskars with the terms of this Consent Judgment resolves any issue, past, present and in the future, concerning compliance by any Releasee with the requirements of Proposition 65, subject to the terms of Section 2.4 and Exhibit A.

6. COMPREHENSIVE AND GLOBAL RELEASE

- 6.1. As to Covered Products, MEJF, for itself, and its agents and attorneys, releases and forever discharges any and all claims against Fiskars and any other Releasee and their past, present, and future affiliates, subsidiaries, parents, divisions, suppliers, importers, manufacturers, distributors, licensors, licensees, retailers, and/or customers, and their respective predecessors, successors and assigns, from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up and through the Effective Date based on exposure to Lead from Covered Products as set forth in the FAC and the Notices. On and after the Effective Date, compliance by Fiskars with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to Lead from Covered Products.
- 6.2. As to Covered Products, this Consent Judgment shall be effective as a full and final accord, satisfaction and release by MEJF on its own behalf (and not on behalf of the public interest) as to Fiskars and its past, present, and future affiliates, subsidiaries, parents, divisions, suppliers, importers, manufacturers, distributors, licensors, licensees, retailers, and/or customers.

and their respective predecessors, successors and assigns, of and from any and all matters hereby released. MEJF, on its own, and on behalf of its agents and attorneys, acknowledges familiarity with and understanding of California Civil Code § 1542, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT IF KNOWN, BY HIM OR HER WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

To the extent that Section 1542 or any similar law or statute may otherwise apply to this Consent Judgment, or the claims released, MEJF hereby waives and relinquishes as to all matters released hereunder all rights and benefits it has, or may have, under Section 1542 or under the laws or common law of any other jurisdiction to the same or similar effect. MEJF further acknowledges on its own behalf (and not on behalf of the public interest) that subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, MEJF may discover claims that were unsuspected at the time this Consent Judgment was executed, and which might have materially affected its decision to execute this Consent Judgment, but nevertheless MEJF on its own behalf (and not on behalf of the public interest) releases Fiskars and its past, present, and future affiliates, subsidiaries, parents, divisions, suppliers, importers, manufacturers, distributors, licensors, licensees, retailers, and/or customers, and their respective predecessors, successors and assigns, from any and all such claims whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, at the time of the execution of this Consent Judgment.

7. <u>MISCELLANEOUS</u>

7.1. This Consent Judgment is entered into to resolve disputed claims concerning Fiskars' compliance with Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission against interest of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law or the Consent Judgment, nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission against interest of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law. This Consent Judgment and/or compliance with its terms may not be used in any proceeding as an admission against interest or evidence of any fact, wrongdoing, violation,

misconduct, culpability, or liability on the part of Fiskars. Fiskars expressly contends that it has at all times complied with Proposition 65, and that all products it sells and/or has sold, including but not limited to the Covered Products, comply with all laws and are completely safe for their intended use.

- 7.2. Joint Preparation. The Parties have jointly participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.
- 7.3. Sole and entire Agreement. This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments and understandings related hereto are merged herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party hereto with respect to the subject matter hereof. No other agreements not specifically referred to herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties with respect to the subject matter hereof. Any modification of this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and subject to Court approval via a noticed motion, including service of a copy of any such proposed modification to the Attorney General. Notice to any Party shall be provided to the person or persons designated below: For Mateel:

For Mateel

William Verick, Esq.
KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER
1125 Sixteenth Street
Arcata, CA 95521
Telephone: (707) 630-5061

Email: wverick@igc.org

28 For Fiskars:

Judith Praitis, Esq.
Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath, LLP
1800 Century Park East, Suite 1500
Los Angeles, California 90067
Telephone: (310) 203-4022

Email: Judith.Praitis@faegredrinker.com

- 7.4. <u>Authority to Stipulate</u>: Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the Party represented and legally to bind that Party.
- 7.5. Execution in Counterparts: This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and/or by facsimile or pdf, which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one original document.
- 7.6. <u>Court Approval</u>: If the Court does not approve this Consent Judgment, it shall be of no force or effect and cannot be used in any proceeding for any purpose. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms hereof.
- 7.7. Application: This Consent Judgment is subject to, and shall be interpreted under, the laws of the State of California, regardless of where any Party has executed it. The obligations of this Consent Judgment to provide warnings under Proposition 65 shall not apply to Covered Products that are not sold in California or are not sold to California consumers. Upon approval by the Court, this Consent Judgment shall be binding on the Parties and their respective successors or assigns.
- 7.8. <u>Final Judgment</u>: Upon approval by the Court this Consent Judgment shall be a final judgment, and compliance herewith by Fiskars shall be deemed to constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with regard to warnings about exposure to Lead in any Covered Products, regardless of the compliance alternative herein Fiskars elects for Leaded Crystal, and also shall constitute a conclusive determination that no Proposition 65 warning for Lead is required for Crystalline.

[SIGNATURES ON NEXT PAGE]

- 1		
1	IT IS SO STIPULATED:	
2		
3		
4	DATED: JUNE 2, 2023	KLAMATH ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CEN
5		all Alexan
6		By: WWW VN VV
7		William Verick MATEEL ENVIRONMENTAL
8		JUSTICE FOUNDATION
9		
10		FISKARS LIVING US, LLC, FISKARS
11 12	DATED T 5 2022	BRANDS, INC.,
13	DATED: June 5,2023	By: L
14		Title: Presiden
15		Title: 1 resigna
16		
17	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AN	ID DECREED:
18		
19	Dated:	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
20		•
21		
22		
23		And the second s
24		
25		in and an area of the second o
26		
27 28		tote .
40		

CONSENT JUDGMENT

EXHIBIT A

Dear Retailer:

Important materials concerning the need to provide court-ordered warnings for certain leaded crystal drinkware and serveware are attached to this letter. This letter only applies to products that are used for serving or storing food or beverages. It does not apply to figurines, vases and other items which are not designed for use with food or beverages. It is very important that you read and follow the instructions enclosed with this letter.

Enclosed are label sheets that in total contain 800 adhesive labels printed with a court-ordered warning (Warning Stickers). These Warning Stickers must be affixed to the Leaded Crystal Drinkware and Serveware products described by brand, pattern and Stock Keeping Unit (SKU) below.

For Leaded Crystal Serveware and Drinkware products that are sold at your business inside packaging such as a bag or box, a Warning Sticker must be affixed to the outside of the packaging of each bag or box. For Leaded Crystal Serveware and Drinkware products that are sold at your business as individual, unpackaged, glasses, flutes, tumblers, decanters, etc., a Warning Sticker must be affixed to each individual glass, flute, tumbler, decanter, etc.

If you do not affix these Warning Stickers to Leaded Crystal Drinkware and Serveware by 3 months after effective date, you risk further legal action by the Attorney General or others, in which monetary penalties could be sought,

You are receiving these materials as part of a court-approved settlement of a legal action brought under "Proposition 65" by a private party. In this legal action the private party claims that certain brands of Leaded Crystal serveware and drinkware contain "lead" and "lead and lead compounds" (collectively, "Lead") which passes into food and drink kept in, or served from, those items in excess of Proposition 65 warning levels. Lead is a chemical listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm, and the private party claims that manufacturers and retailers of these products are legally required to provide consumers with a clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to Lead. Defendants in the case dispute these claims, but agreed to take various actions to settle the case.

The Leaded Crystal drinkware and serveware listed below may be sold legally in California because they comply with international standards for Lead release. They require a warning because the plaintiff in a case asserts that the stricter Lead exposure standards of Proposition 65 mean a warning is required.