1 2	Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352) BRODSKY SMITH 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300 Beverly Hills, CA 90212	
3	Tel: (877) 534-2590 Fax: (310) 247-0160 Attorneys for Plaintiff	
4		
5	Thiorneys jor I tunning	
6		
7		
8		
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
10	COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO	
11	ANTHONY FERREIRO,	Case No.: CGC-22-598547
12	Plaintiff,	CONSENT JUDGMENT
13	v,	Judge: Richard B. Ulmer
14	AIDCAS INC. AIDCAS SAFETY ING. UD	Dept.: 302 Hearing Date: October 22, 2024
15 16	AIRGAS, INC., AIRGAS SAFETY, INC., HD SUPPLY, INC., HDS IP HOLDING, LLC, HD SUPPLY HOLDINGS, INC.,	Hearing Time: 9:30 AM Complaint Filed: March 7, 2022
17	Defendent	
18	Defendant.	
19		
20		
21	_	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1. INTRODUCTION

The Parties. This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Anthony Ferreiro ("Ferreiro") and the Estate of Donatus McCoy ("McCoy,") (collectively with Ferreiro, "Plaintiffs") each acting on behalf of the public interest, and Airgas, Inc. and Airgas Safety, Inc. (collectively, "Airgas" or "Defendant") with Plaintiffs and Defendant collectively referred to as the "Parties" and each of them as a "Party." Ferreiro and McCoy are individuals residing in California that seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Plaintiffs allege that Airgas is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

1.2 Allegations and Representations. Plaintiffs allege that Defendant has exposed individuals to bisphenol A (BPA) from its sales of *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159. BPA is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm.

Plaintiffs further allege that Defendant has exposed individuals to di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) from its sales of (a) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (b) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (c) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (d) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986, without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.2.1 BPA and DEHP are collectively referred to herein as, the "Listed Chemicals."

1.3 Notices of Violation/Complaint.

- 1.3.1 On or about March 8, 2021, Ferreiro gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 (the "Ferreiro Notice"), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of the *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159 expose users in California to BPA. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Ferreiro Notice.
- 1.3.2 On August 18, 2021, McCoy gave notice of alleged violation of Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 (collectively, the "McCoy Notices"), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of the (a) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (b) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (c) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (d) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986 expose users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Ferreiro Notices.
- 1.3.3 The Ferreiro Notice and the McCoy Notices are collectively referred to herein as, the "Notices."
- 1.3.4 On March 7, 2022, Ferreiro filed a complaint (the "Complaint") setting forth violations of Proposition 65 for the *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159 as alleged in the March 8, 2021, Notice of Violation.
- 1.3.5 On January 30, 2023, Ferreiro filed a first amended complaint (the "FAC") setting forth violations of Proposition 65 as alleged in the Ferreiro Notices. The FAC also adds McCoy as a plaintiff and sets forth violations of Proposition 65 as alleged in the McCoy Notices.
 - 1.3.6 The Complaint and FAC are collectively referred to herein as, the "Action."
- 1.3.7 Plaintiff Donatus McCoy passed away on or about January 4, 2024. An estate was created and letters of administration were granted to the administrator, Katrina Sanchez, daughter of Donatus McCoy, on or about May 15, 2024 by the Court in the Superior Court of California Los Angeles County. The parties filed herein a stipulation to substitute Plaintiff

Donatus McCoy with that of Plaintiff the Estate of Donatus McCoy on July 10, 2024, which was granted by the Court on July 25, 2024.

- 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Action, that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notices.
- 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in the Notices and the Action and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Defendant. However, this Section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant pursuant to this Consent Judgment.

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term "Covered Products" means (a) *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159,(b) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (c) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (d) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (e) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986 that are distributed and/or offered for sale in California by Airgas.
- 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date this Consent Judgment is entered as a Judgment of the Court.

3. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS AND/OR REFORMULATION</u>

- 2.1 Clear and Reasonable Warning. Commencing within sixty (60) days of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.1 and 3.2 must be provided for all for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product (defined herein). There shall be no obligation for Defendant to provide a warning for Covered Products that enter the stream of commerce prior to, or within 60 days, of the Effective Date. The warning shall consist of either the Warning or Alternative Warning described below in §§ 3.1(a), (b), (c), or (d), respectively:
- (a) **Warning**. The "**Warning**" for *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159 shall consist of the statement:
 - WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals, including bisphenol A (BPA), which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- (b) **Alternative Warning**: With regard to the *Radnor*® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159, Airgas may, but is not required to, use the alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.1(b) ("**Alternative Warning**") as follows:
 - ⚠ WARNING: Reproductive Harm www.P65Warnings.ca Rov.
- (c) The "Warning" for (i) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (ii) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (iii) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (iv) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986, shall consist of the statement:
 - ⚠ WARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.
- (d) **Alternative Warning**: With regard to the (i) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (ii) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (iii) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (iv) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986, Airgas may, but is not required to, use the **Alternative Warning** as follows:

⚠ WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

3.2 A Warning or Alternative Warning provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word "WARNING:" in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to the left of the word "WARNING:" must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the word "WARNING:". The Warning or Alternative Warning shall be affixed to or printed on the Covered Products' packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process, provided that the Warning or Alternative Warning is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. The Warning or Alternative Warning may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings. If consumer information is provided in a foreign language, Airgas shall provide the Warning in the foreign language.

In addition to affixing the Warning or Alternative Warning to the Covered Products' packaging or labeling, the Warning or Alternative Warning shall be posted on websites where Airgas offers Covered Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this Section shall be satisfied if the Warning or Alternative Warning, or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word "WARNING," appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this Section, Airgas shall (a) post the Warning or Alternative Warning on its own website and, if it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers; and (b) if it does not have the ability to post the Warning or Alternative Warning on the websites of its third-party internet sellers, provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Product that have been provided

with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2 after the Effective Date are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning requirements of this Section.

3.3 **DEHP Reformulation Standard.** With regard to California sales of the (i) *Radnor*® Chipping Hammers, UPC# 639890020081, (ii) *Weldmark*® soapstone tools, UPC# 702125002371, (iii) *Tuff-Gard*® safety vests, UPC# 839409003714, and (iv) *Strong Hand*® Locking C-Clamps, UPC# 679352003986, pursuant to this Agreement, in addition to the option to provide a **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**, Airgas may choose to manufacture, import, distribute, sell, or offers for sale in California "DEHP Reformulated Products."

"DEHP Reformulated Products" shall mean Covered Products that contain concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DEHP when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining the phthalate content in a solid substance.

- 3.3.1 No Reformulation Option for Radnor® Safety Glasses. This Agreement does not provide a reformulation option for the Radnor® safety glasses product. Pursuant to §§ 3.1(a), (b) & 3.2 of this Agreement, commencing within 60 days of the Effective Date, Airgas shall provide a Warning or Alternative Warning for California sales of the Radnor® safety glasses, UPC# 639890512159.
- 3.4 Compliance with Warning Regulations. Defendant shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent Judgment or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") applicable to the Covered Product and the exposures at issue after the Effective Date.

28

\$1,250.00; and to "The Estate of Donatus McCoy" in the amount of \$1,250.00 alternatively may be made by wire transfer to the trust account of its counsel Brodsky & Smith.

4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Airgas shall pay \$90,000.00 to Brodsky Smith as complete reimbursement for Plaintiffs' attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Airgas attention, litigating and negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

- 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Ferreiro and McCoy, each acting on their own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Airgas, and its parents, shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees retailers, franchisees, and cooperative members ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to the DEHP and/or BPA from use of the Covered Products as set forth in the Notices, with respect to any Covered Products distributed, or sold by Airgas prior to, or within 60 days, of the Effective Date. It is the Parties' intention that this Consent Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to act in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and/or take any action with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 based on exposure to DEHP and/or BPA that was alleged in the Notices and Action, or that could have been brought pursuant to the Notices against Airgas and/or the Downstream Releasees of the Covered Products ("Proposition 65 Claims").
- 5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Ferreiro and McCoy, each on behalf of themselves, their past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, beneficiaries, heirs, and successors and/or

assignees, and <u>not</u> in their representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases Airgas, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising from exposure to DEHP and/or BPA from use of the Covered Products distributed, or sold by Airgas, Defendant Releasees or Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Ferreiro and McCoy hereby waive any and all rights and benefits which they now have, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

5.3 Airgas waives any and all claims against Plaintiffs, their attorneys and other representatives, based on the filing or prosecution of the Notices and the Action.

6. INTEGRATION

6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

7. GOVERNING LAW

7.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

8. NOTICES

8.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-

11. MODIFICATION

11.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

12. ATTORNEY'S FEES

- 12.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.
- 12.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions pursuant to law.

13. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

13.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

14. **CONFIDENTIALITY**

14.1 Each of the Parties acknowledges and agrees that discussions pertaining to this Agreement constitute confidential settlement communications that shall remain confidential to the extent possible. The Parties agree that such discussions regarding this Agreement should not be disclosed to any third party except: (A) to such other persons wherein disclosure is made to obtain the assistance of the party receiving the disclosure (i.e., lawyers, auditors, accountants, technical consultants, financial consultants, insurers) related to this Agreement; or (B) to enforce the terms of this Agreement.

	15. AUTHORIZATION		
2	Manual Ma	xecute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their	
3	respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this		
4	document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute		
5	the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as		
6	explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.		
7	onpriority provided included and a second and a		
8	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:	
9	ψ_	Date: 1 27 2024	
10	Date:	Date: August 61, 2027	
11	By:ANTHONY FERREIRO	By: X AIRGAS, INC.	
12	ANTHONI FERREIRO	Autoro, iro.	
13			
14			
15	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:	
16	13122 131		
17	Date:	Date: August 27, 2024	
18		6 J. 6	
	Rv	By: West	
19	By:KATRINA SANCHEZ,	By: Watt Saran Airgas Safety, INC.	
19	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF		
19 20	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF		
19 20 21	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF		
19 20 21 22	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF	AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
19 20 21 22 23	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY	AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
19 20 21 22 23 24	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY	AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
19 20 21 22 23 24 25	KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECR	AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	

1	15. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>		
2	15.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their		
3	respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this		
4	document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute		
5	the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as		
6	explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.		
7			
8	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:	
9	Date: 3 34	Date:	
11	By: Anthon Serieur	Ву:	
12	ANTHONY FERREIRO	AIRGAS, INC.	
13			
14			
15			
15 16	AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:	
		_	
16 17	Date:	Date:	
16 17 18	Date:By:	Date:	
16 17 18 19	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF	Date:	
16 17 18 19 20	Date:By:KATRINA SANCHEZ,	Date:	
16 17 18 19 20 21	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF	Date:	
16 17 18 19 20 21	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF	Date:	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF	Date:By:AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY	Date:By:AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY	Date:By:AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECE	Date:By:AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Date: By: KATRINA SANCHEZ, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF DONATUS MCCOY IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECE	Date:By:AIRGAS SAFETY, INC.	