

Caspar Jivalagian, Esq., State Bar No.: 282818
Vache Thomassian, Esq., State Bar No.: 289053
Tro Krikorian, Esq., State Bar No.: 317183
KJT LAW GROUP, LLP
230 N. Maryland Avenue, Suite 306
Glendale, California 91206
Telephone: 818-507-8525
Facsimile: 818-507-8588

Attorneys for Plaintiff,
BERJ PARSEGHIAN

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

BERJ PARSEGHIAN,

Plaintiff,

v.

LesserEvil LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability
Company; Whole Foods Market California, Inc.,
a California Corporation; and DOES 1 through
100, inclusive,

Defendant.

Case No.: 22STCV02705

**[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT AS
TO LESSEREVIL LLC**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et. seq.* and
Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)

KJTLAWGROUP_{LLP}
Jivalagian | Thomassian

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 The Parties**

3 This [Proposed] Consent Judgment is hereby entered into by and between Berj Parseghian,
4 acting on behalf of the public interest (hereinafter "Parseghian") and LESSEREVIL LLC. (hereinafter
5 "LESSEREVIL" or "Defendant"). Collectively Parseghian and LESSEREVIL shall be referred to
6 hereafter as the "Parties" and each of them as a "Party." Parseghian is an individual residing in
7 California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human
8 health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Defendant
9 employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of
10 Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

11 **1.2 Allegations and Representations**

12 Parseghian alleges that Defendant has offered for sale in the State of California and has sold in
13 California, products, which contain lead, and that such sales have not been accompanied by
14 Proposition 65 warnings. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of
15 California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. Defendant denies the
16 allegations and contends that there is no exposure and no violation under Proposition 65 for an
17 alleged failure to warn.

18 **1.3 Covered Products Description**

19 The products that are covered by this Consent Judgment are identified as Lesser Evil – Power
20 Curls. All such items shall be referred to herein as the "Covered Products."

21 **1.4 Notices of Violation/Complaint**

22 1.4.1 On or about August 17, 2021, Parseghian served LESSEREVIL and various public
23 enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" pursuant to Health &
24 Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the "Notice"), alleging that LESSEREVIL was in violation of Proposition 65
25 for failing to warn consumers and customers that one of the Covered Products exposed users in
26 California to lead. No public enforcer diligently prosecuted the claims threatened in the Notice within
27 sixty days plus service time relative to the provision of the Notice to them by Parseghian.
28

1.4.2 On January 24, 2022, Parseghian, acting in the interest of the general public in the State of California, filed a complaint in the Superior Court of Los Angeles County alleging violations of Health & Safety Code §25249.6 (the "Complaint") based on the alleged failure to warn of exposures to lead contained in Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Defendant.

1.5 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Consent Judgment is entered as a judgment of the Court.

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "Execution Date" shall mean the date this Consent Judgment is signed by all parties in Clause 16 below.

2. STIPULATION TO JURISDICTION/NO ADMISSION

For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the complaint filed in this matter, that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on the facts alleged therein and/or in the Notice.

Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Defendant, including, but not limited to, any admission related to exposure of failure to warn. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS, REFORMULATION AND TESTING

3.1 Beginning ninety (90) days after the Effective Date, LESSEREVIL shall be permanently enjoined from manufacturing for sale in the State of California, "Distributing into the State of California," or directly selling in the State of California, any Covered Products that expose a

1 person to a daily lead exposure level of more than 0.5 micrograms of lead per day, unless the label of
2 the Covered Product contains a Proposition 65 compliant warning, as required by any Proposition 65
3 law or regulation effective on or after the Effective Date, as set forth in Section 3.2.

4 **3.1.1** As used in this Consent Judgment, the term "Distributing into the State of California"
5 shall mean to directly ship a Covered Product into California for sale in California or to sell a
6 Covered Product to a distributor that LESSEREVIL knows or has reason to know will sell the
7 Covered Product in California. The injunctive relief in Section 3 does not apply to any Covered
8 Product that has left the possession, and is no longer under the control of LESSEREVIL prior to the
9 Effective Date and all claims as to such Covered Products are released in this Consent Judgment.

10 **3.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings**

11 If LESSEREVIL is required to provide a warning pursuant to Section 3.1, one of the following
12 warnings must be utilized ("Warning"):

13 **Option 1:**

14 **WARNING:** Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including lead,
15 which is known to the State of California to cause [cancer and], birth defects or other
16 reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

17 **Option 2:**

18 **WARNING:** [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

19 LESSEREVIL shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the Warning if LESSEREVIL has reason
20 to believe that the "Daily Lead Exposure Level" is greater than 15 micrograms of lead or if
21 LESSEREVIL has reason to believe that another Proposition 65 chemical is present which may
22 require a cancer warning.

23 The Warning shall be securely affixed to or printed upon the label of each Covered Product
24 and it must be set off from other surrounding information. In addition, for any Covered Product sold
25 over the internet, the Warning shall appear on the checkout page in full text or through a clearly
26 marked hyperlink using the word "**WARNING**" in all capital and bold letters when a California
27
28

1 delivery address is indicated for any purchase of any Covered Product. If a hyperlink is used, the
2 hyperlink must go directly to a page prominently displaying either the Option 1 Warning or the
3 Option 2 Warning without content that detracts from the Warning. An asterisk or other identifying
4 method must be utilized to identify which products on the checkout page are subject to the Warning.

5 The Warning shall be at least the same size as the largest of any other health or safety
6 warnings also appearing on the website or on the label and the word **"WARNING"** shall be in all
7 capital letters and in bold print. No statements intended to or likely to have the effect of diminishing
8 the impact of the Warning on the average lay person shall accompany the Warning. Further, no
9 statements may accompany the Warning that state or imply that the source of the listed chemical has
10 an impact on or results in a less harmful effect of the listed chemical. For the Option 2 Warning, a
11 symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black
12 outline shall be placed to the left of the text of the Warning, in a size no smaller than the height of the
13 word **"WARNING."**

14 LESSEREVIL must display the above Warning with such conspicuousness, as compared with
15 other words, statements or designs on the label, or on its website, if applicable, to render the Warning
16 likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase
17 or use of the product.

18 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term "label" means a display of written, printed or
19 graphic material that is printed on or affixed to a Covered Product or its immediate container or
20 wrapper.

21 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, when LESSEREVIL is required to provide a warning
22 for a Covered Product pursuant to Section 3.1, LESSEREVIL may satisfy the warning requirement
23 by providing the required information in compliance with 27 C.C.R. § 25600.2 (2020) to any business
24 that is subject to Proposition 65 to which it is selling or transferring the Covered Product.

25 **4. PAYMENTS PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(b)**

26 With regard to all claims that have been raised or which could be raised with respect to failure
27 to warn pursuant to Proposition 65 with regard to lead in the Covered Products, Defendant shall pay
28

a civil penalty of seven thousand five hundred dollars (\$7,500.00) pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health & Safety Code § 25192, with 75% of these funds remitted to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Parseghian, as provided by California Health & Safety Code § 25249.12(d) and the instructions directly below.

Defendant shall issue two separate checks for the penalty payment: (a) one check made payable to "OEHHA" (tax identification number: 68-0284486) in an amount representing 75% of the total penalty (i.e., \$5,625.00 and (b) one check in an amount representing 25% of the total penalty (i.e., \$1,875.00) made payable directly to Parseghian. Defendant shall mail these payments within ten (10) business days following the Effective Date, at which time such payments shall be mailed to the following addresses respectively:

All payments owed to Plaintiff shall be delivered to the following payment address:

KJT LAW GROUP LLP

230 N. Maryland Avenue, Suite 306

Glendale, CA 91206

All payments owed to OEHHA shall be delivered directly to OEHHA at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Senior Accounting Officer -- MS 19-B
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA. 95812-0410

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

1 **5. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

2 The parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Parseghian and her counsel under
3 the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles,
4 Defendant shall reimburse Parseghian's counsel for fees and costs, incurred as a result of
5 investigating, bringing this matter to Defendant attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public
6 interest. Defendant shall pay Parseghian's counsel forty seven thousand five hundred dollars
7 (\$47,500.00) for all attorneys' fees, expert and investigation fees and related costs associated with this
8 matter and the Notice. Defendant shall mail a check payable to "KJT Law Group, LLP" via certified
9 mail to the address for Parseghian's counsel referenced above within ten (10) business days following
10 the Effective Date. Other than the payment required hereunder, each side is to bear its own
11 attorneys' fees and costs.

12 **6. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

13 **6.1 Parseghian's Release of Defendant, Releasees, and Downstream Releasees**

14 As to those matters raised in the Complaint and in the Notice of Violation, Parseghian, on
15 behalf of himself, and on behalf of the public interest, hereby waives and releases any and all claims
16 against Defendant its parent companies, corporate affiliates, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors
17 and assigns (collectively "Releasees") and each of its distributors, wholesalers, licensors, licensees,
18 auctioneers, retailers, franchisees, dealers, customers, owners, purchasers, users (collectively
19 "Downstream Releasees") and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives,
20 shareholders, agents, and employees, and sister and parent entities for injunctive relief or damages,
21 penalties, fines, sanctions, mitigation, fees (including fees of attorneys, experts, and others), costs,
22 expenses, or any other sum incurred or claimed, for the alleged failure of Defendant, Releasees or
23 Downstream Releasees to provide clear, accurate and reasonable warnings under Proposition 65
24 about exposure to lead arising from the sale, distribution, or use of any Covered Products sold,
25 manufactured or distributed by Defendant, Releasees or Downstream Releasees in California.
26 Compliance with the Consent Judgment by Defendant or a Releasee shall constitute compliance with
27 Proposition 65 by that Defendant, Releasee, or Downstream Releasee with respect to the presence of
28

1 lead in the Covered Products. Plaintiff agrees that any and all claims in the Complaint are resolved
2 with prejudice by this Consent Judgment.

3 In addition to the foregoing, Parseghian, on behalf of himself, his past and current agents,
4 representatives, attorneys, and successors and/or assignees, and not in his representative capacity,
5 hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and
6 releases any other Claims that she could make against Defendant, Releasees or Downstream
7 Releasees with respect to violations of Proposition 65 based upon the Covered Products. With
8 respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph, Parseghian hereby specifically waives
9 any and all rights and benefits which he now has, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the
10 provisions of Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

11 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE
12 CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS FAVOR
13 AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY
14 HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER
15 SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

16 6.2 Defendant's Release of Parseghian

17 Defendant waives any and all claims against Parseghian, his attorneys and other
18 representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken
19 or made) by Parseghian and his attorneys and other representatives, in the course of investigating
20 claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against them in this matter, and/or with
21 respect to the Covered Products.

22 7. SEVERABILITY AND MERGER

23 If, subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any of the provisions of this
24 document are held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions
25 remaining shall not be adversely affected.

26 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all
27 prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it.
28 No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made
by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

1 **8. GOVERNING LAW**

2 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California
3 and apply within the State of California. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment
4 resolves any issue, now or in the future, as to the requirements of Proposition 65 with respect to
5 alleged exposures to lead arising from the Covered Products. In the event that Proposition 65 is
6 repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Covered
7 Products, then Defendant shall provide written notice to Parseghian of any asserted change in the law,
8 and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the
9 extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

10 **9. NOTICES**

11 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to
12 this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class,
13 (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party by the
14 other party at the following addresses:

15 For LesserEvil LLC:

16 David Kwasniewski, Esq.
17 Robert Petraglia, Esq.
18 **BRAUNHAGEY & BORDEN LLP**
19 351 California St 10th floor,
20 San Francisco, CA 94104
21 Telephone: 415-599-0210
22 Email: Petraglia@braunhagey.com

23 and

24 For Parseghian:

25 Tro Krikorian, Esq.
26 **KJT LAW GROUP, LLP**
27 230 N. Maryland Ave. Suite 306
28 Glendale, CA 91206
 Phone: 818-507-8528
 Fax: 818-507-8588

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. DRAFTING

The terms of this Consent Judgment have been reviewed by the respective counsel for each Party prior to its signing, and each Party has had an opportunity to fully discuss the terms and conditions with legal counsel. The Parties agree that, in any subsequent interpretation and construction of this Consent Judgment, no inference, assumption, or presumption shall be drawn, and no provision of this Consent Judgment shall be construed against any Party, based on the fact that one of the Parties and/or one of the Parties' legal counsel prepared and/or drafted all or any portion of the Consent Judgment. It is conclusively presumed that all of the Parties participated equally in the preparation and drafting of this Consent Judgment.

11. COUNTERPARTS; EMAIL OR FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by email or facsimile, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

12. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT APPROVAL

Parseghian agrees to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment and Defendants shall support approval of such Motion.

This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved and entered by the Court within twelve months after it has been fully executed by the Parties.

13. MODIFICATION

13.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

13.2 Change in Proposition 65. If (1) Proposition 65 or its implementing regulations (including but not limited to the safe harbor “no significant risk level” and “maximum allowable dose level” for lead or any “alternative risk level” adopted by regulation or California Supreme

1 Court decision) are changed from their terms as they exist on the date of entry of this Consent
2 Judgment in a manner that impacts the “Daily Lead Exposure Level” or (2) after entry of this
3 Consent Judgment, OEHHA takes some other final regulatory action for products similar to the
4 Covered Products and such final regulatory action impacts the “Daily Lead Exposure Level” or (3)
5 after entry of this Consent Judgment, OEHHA adopts a regulation that eliminates the requirement
6 for warnings for lead for the Covered Products, then this consent judgment shall be deemed
7 automatically modified to incorporate the modified “Daily Lead Exposure Level” and/or warning
8 requirements.

9 **13.3** In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or otherwise invalidated, by
10 regulation or California or United States Supreme Court case law, and as a result of such repeal or
11 invalidation the Covered Products are no longer subject to Proposition 65, then the Defendants
12 shall have no further obligations as to the injunctive terms pursuant to this Consent Judgment
13 with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected.

14 **14. ATTORNEY’S FEES**

15 A party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent Judgment
16 shall be required to pay the prevailing party’s reasonable attorney’s fees and costs unless the
17 unsuccessful party has acted with substantial justification. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the
18 term substantial justification shall carry the same meaning as used in the Civil Discovery Act of 1986,
19 Code of Civil Procedure Section 2016, et seq.

20 **15. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

21 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent
22 Judgment.

23 **16. AUTHORIZATION**

24 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the Party
25 he or she represents to stipulate to this Consent Judgment.

1 **STIPULATED AND AGREED TO:**

2 Date: 9/16/2022

3 By: DocuSigned by:
4 BERJ PARSEGHIAN
5 17B4A0E5087E404...

6 **BERJ PARSEGHIAN**

Date: September 15, 2022

By: Andrew Strife

Andrew Strife, CFO

[print name]

LESSEREVIL LLC

7 **APPROVED AS TO FORM:**

8 Date: 9/19/2022

9 By: DocuSigned by:
10 TRO KRIKORIAN
11 D911CF9328F0472...

12 **TRO KRIKORIAN, ESQ.**
13 **ATTORNEY FOR PLAINTIFF,**
14 **BERJ PARSEGHIAN**

Date: September 15, 2022

By: DAVID KWASNIEWSKI

15 **DAVID KWASNIEWSKI, ESQ.**
16 **ATTORNEY FOR DEFENDANT,**
17 **LESSEREVIL LLC**

18 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:**

19 Dated: _____

20 _____
21 Judge of the Superior Court

KJT LAW GROUP LLP
Investigation Technology