	I .		
1	Reuben Yeroushalmi (SBN 193981) YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI		
2	An Association of Independent Law Corporation	ons	
3	9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W Beverly Hills, California 90212		
4	Telephone: 310.623.1926 Facsimile: 310.623.1930		
5			
6	Attorneys for Plaintiff, Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc.		
7	CANDED OF THE OF THE	HE CHAPPE OF CALLEODNIA	
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
9	COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES		
10	CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC.,	CASE NO. 22STCV20457	
11	in the public interest,		
12	Plaintiff,	CONSENT JUDGMENT [PROPOSED]	
13	v.	Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.	
14	THE TJX COMPANIES, INC., a Delaware		
15	Corporation;   URBAN EXPRESSIONS, INC., a California		
16	Corporation MAX Q, LTD., a United Kingdom		
17	Corporation		
18	And DOES 1-30 Defendants.		
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24	1. INTRODUCTION	at an	
25	1.1 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiff, CONSUMER		
26	ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. (referred to as "CAG") acting on behalf of itself and in the interest		
27			
28			
		A /1 (C) \	

CONSENT JUDGMENT [PROPOSED]

of the public, and specially appearing defendant, MAX Q LTD., (hereinafter referred to as "Defendant"), with each a Party to the action collectively referred to as "Parties."

#### 1.2 Defendant and Products

- 1.2.1 CAG alleges that Defendant is a corporation which employs ten or more persons and is subject to jurisdiction under California law, in the Courts of California. For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, Defendant is deemed a person in the course of doing business in California, and subject to the provisions of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et. seq. ("Proposition 65"). If this Consent Judgment is not entered and does not become final and non-appealable, Defendant withdraws such stipulation and its consent herein. The Parties acknowledge that Defendant is specially appearing herein and through its counsel and itself, making a limited appearance only, and among other things Defendant denies employing ten or more employees.
- 1.2.2 Defendant was, a manufacturer, distributor, or promoter of Cumin Powder identified as "Sultans of Spice"; "Cumin Powder"; "Traditional Indian Spices"; "Net Wt. 5.29 oz (150g)"; "LG4221"; "D54 S137098 C1277 T6 AX70 0521"; "UPC 5 060413 384635" (Hereinafter referred to as the "Covered Products")

#### 1.3 Listed Chemicals

1.3.1 Inorganic Arsenic Oxides (hereinafter Arsenic) are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 1.4 Notices of Violation

- 1.4.1 On or about October 29, 2021, CAG served Defendant and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" (hereinafter "Notice 1") that provided the Defendant with notice of alleged violations of Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 for failing to warn individuals in California of exposures to Arsenic contained in Cumin Powder sold and/or distributed by Defendant. No other public enforcer has commenced or diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.
  - 1.4.3 Notice 1 is referred to as the "Notice"



## 1.5 Complaint

1.5.1 On June 22, 2022, CAG filed a complaint for civil penalties and injunctive relief ("Complaint") in Los Angeles Superior Court, Case No. 22STCV20457, and on March 23, 2023 named Defendant as a Doe Defendant. The Complaint alleges, among other things, that Defendant violated Proposition 65 by failing to give clear and reasonable warnings of exposure to Arsenic from Covered Products.

#### 1.6 Consent to Jurisdiction

1.6.1 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violations contained in the Complaint and personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles and that this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full settlement and resolution of the allegations contained in cause of action one of the Complaint and of all claims which were or could have been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on the facts alleged therein or arising therefrom or related thereto.

#### 1.7 No Admission

1.7.1 This Consent Judgment resolves claims that are denied and disputed. The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment pursuant to a full and final settlement of any and all claims between the Parties for the purpose of avoiding prolonged litigation. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by the Parties of any material allegation of in the Notice or the Complaint (each and every allegation of which Defendant denies), or of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law or violation of law, including without limitation, any admission concerning any alleged or actual violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory, regulatory, common law, or equitable doctrine, including but not limited to the meaning of the terms "knowingly and intentionally expose" or "clear and reasonable warning" as used in Health and Safety Code section 25249.6. Nothing in this Consent Judgment, nor compliance with its terms, shall constitute or be construed as an admission by the Parties of any fact, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, or of fault, wrongdoing, or liability by any Defendant, its

officers, directors, employees, or parent, subsidiary or affiliated corporations, or be offered or admitted as evidence in any administrative or judicial proceeding or litigation in any court, agency, or forum. Furthermore, nothing in this Consent Judgment shall prejudice, waive or impair any right, remedy, argument, or defense the Parties may have in any other or future legal proceeding, except as expressly provided in this Consent Judgment. Without limiting the foregoing, the Parties restate the limitations of Defendant's status so stipulated in Section 1.2.2, above.

## 2. **DEFINITIONS**

- 2.1 "Covered Products" means products specifically identified in Paragraph 1.2.2 sold or supplied by Defendant.
- 2.2 "Effective Date" means the date that this Consent Judgment is approved by the Court.
  - 2.3 "Arsenic" means Inorganic Arsenic Oxides.

# 3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF / REFORMULATION / CLEAR AND REASONABLE WARNINGS.

3.1 For any Covered Products that exceeds 15 parts per billion ("ppb") of Arsenic that are placed into the stream of commerce in California after the Effective Date, Defendant must provide a Proposition 65 compliant warning for the Covered Products as set forth below. Any warning provided pursuant to this section shall be affixed to the packaging of, or directly on, the Covered Products, and be prominently placed with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. The warning must be set off from other surrounding information, enclosed in a box. Where the packaging of the Covered Product includes consumer information as defined by California Code of Regulations title 27 §25600.1(c) in a language other than English, the warning must also be provided in that language in addition to English. Should Defendant sell or distribute any Covered Product through the



internet the warning will be posted in the manner provided for with respect to internet sales, as provided for in 27 CCR sections 25601 and 25602, as they may be subsequently amended.

The Parties agree that the following warning language shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged Arsenic in the Covered Products placed into the stream of commerce by Defendant after the Effective Date:

**WARNING:** Consuming this product can expose you to Inorganic Arsenic, a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <a href="https://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food">www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food</a>.

- 3.2 For any Covered Products still existing in the Defendant's inventory as of the Effective Date, Defendant shall place a Proposition 65 compliant warning on them, unless the Covered Products does not exceed their respective levels of Arsenic. Any warning provided pursuant to this section shall comply with the warning requirements under Section 3.2 above.
- 3.3 For any Covered Product which includes consumer information in a language other than English and where the Defendant uses a consumer product sign or label to provide a warning, the warning must also be provided in that foreign language in addition to English.
- 3.5 Changes in the law and regulations applicable to Prop 65 occurring after this date shall be incorporated into the terms of this Consent Judgment.

#### 4. SETTLEMENT PAYMENT

- 4.1 **Payment and Due Date**: Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall pay a total of one hundred thirty thousand dollars (\$130,000) in full and complete settlement of any and claims for civil penalties, damages, attorneys' fees, expert fees or any other claim for costs, expenses, or monetary relief of any kind for claims that were, or could have been, asserted in the Notices or Complaint identified, as follows:
- 4.1.1 **Civil Penalty**: Defendant shall issue separate checks totaling twenty-five thousand seven hundred and twenty dollars (\$25,720) as penalties pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.12, the two separate checks as allocated in 4.1.1(a) immediately below:



4

10

1314

1516

17 18

19

2021

2223

24

25

26

27

28

- (a) Defendant will issue a check made payable to the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") in the amount of nineteen thousand two hundred and ninety dollars (\$19,290) representing 75% of the total penalty and Defendant will issue a separate check to CAG in the amount of six thousand four hundred and thirty dollars (\$6,430) representing 25% of the total penalty; and
- (b) Separate 1099s shall be issued for each of the above payments:

  Defendant will issue a 1099 to OEHHA, P.O. Box 4010, Sacramento, CA 95184 (EIN: 68-0284486). Defendant will also issue a 1099 to CAG c/o Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi, 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W, Beverly Hills, California 90212.
- Additional Settlement Payments: Defendant shall make a separate 4.1.2 payment, in the amount of nineteen thousand two hundred and eighty dollars (\$19,280) as an additional settlement payment to "Consumer Advocacy Group, Inc." pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b) and California Code of Regulations, Title 11 § 3203(d). Defendant will issue a separate check to CAG for the Additional Settlement Payment. CAG will use this portion of the total Settlement Payment as follows, eighty percent (80%) for fees of investigation, purchasing and testing for Proposition 65 listed chemicals in various products, and for expert fees for evaluating exposures through various mediums, including but not limited to consumer product, occupational, and environmental exposures to Proposition 65 listed chemicals, and the cost of hiring consulting and retaining experts who assist with the extensive scientific analysis necessary for those files in litigation and to offset the costs of future litigation enforcing Proposition 65 but excluding attorney fees; twenty percent (20%) for administrative costs incurred during investigation and litigation to reduce the public's exposure to Proposition 65 listed chemicals by notifying those persons and/or entities believed to be responsible for such exposures and attempting to persuade those persons and/or entities to reformulate their products or the source of exposure to completely eliminate or lower the level of Proposition 65 listed chemicals including but not limited to costs of documentation and tracking of products investigated, storage of products, website enhancement and maintenance, computer and software

maintenance, investigative equipment, CAG's member's time for work done on investigations, office supplies, mailing supplies and postage. Within 30 days of a request from the Attorney General, CAG shall provide to the Attorney General copies of documentation demonstrating how the above funds have been spent. CAG shall be solely responsible for ensuring the proper expenditure of such additional settlement payment.

- 4.1.3 **Reimbursement of Attorney's Fees and Costs:** Defendant shall pay eighty-five thousand dollars (\$85,000) to "Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi" as complete reimbursement for any and all reasonable investigation fees and costs, attorneys' fees, and any other costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Defendant's attention, litigating, negotiating a settlement in the public interest, and seeking and obtaining court approval of this Consent Judgment.
- 4.2 Other than the payment to OEHHA described above, all payments referenced in paragraphs 4.1.1, 4.1.2, and 4.1.3 above, shall be delivered to: Reuben Yeroushalmi, Yeroushalmi & Yeroushalmi, 9100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 240W, Beverly Hills, CA 90212. The payment to OEHHA shall be delivered to Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, Attn: Mike Gyurics, 1001 I Street, Mail Stop 12-B, Sacramento, California 95812. Concurrently with payment to OEHHA, Defendant shall provide CAG with written confirmation that the payment to OEHHA was delivered.

#### 5. MATTERS COVERED BY THIS CONSENT JUDGMENT

5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between CAG on behalf of itself and in the public interest and Defendant for failure to provide Proposition 65 warning of exposure to Arsenic from the Covered Products as set forth in the Notice, and fully resolves all claims that have been or could have been asserted against Defendant in this action up through the Effective Date for failure to provide Proposition 65 warnings for the Covered Products regarding Arsenic. CAG, on behalf of itself and in the public interest, hereby discharges Defendant, and their respective officers, directors, insurers, employees, parents, shareholders, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, affiliates, sister companies, predecessors and their



successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees") and all customers, retailers, downstream wholesalers, market place hosts, franchisees, cooperative members, licensees and downstream entities in the distribution chain of the Covered Products to whom Defendant directly or indirectly distributed or sold Covered Products, and the predecessors, successors and assigns of any of them, and all of their respective officers, directors, shareholders, members, managers, employees, agents only as to Covered Products sold by the Defendant (collectively, "Downstream Releasees"), for all Covered Products placed into the stream of commerce up through the Effective Date for alleged or actual violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to Arsenic from the Covered Products. Defendant's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed to constitute compliance with Proposition 65 regarding alleged exposures to Arsenic from the Covered Products. Nothing in this Section affects CAG's right to commence or prosecute an action under Proposition 65 against any person other than Defendant Releasees or Downstream Releasees after the Effective Date. Downstream Releasees includes the TJX Companies, Inc.

5.2 CAG on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "Claims"), against the Defendant Releasees and Downstream Releasees, arising from any actual or alleged violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the failure to warn about exposure Arsenic from the Covered Products. In furtherance of the foregoing, as to alleged exposures to Arsenic from the Covered Products, CAG on behalf of itself only, hereby waives any and all rights and benefits which it now has, or in the future may have, conferred upon it with respect to Claims arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the failure to warn about

exposure to Arsenic from the Covered Products by virtue of the provisions of section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

CAG understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of California Civil Code section 1542 is that even if CAG suffers future damages arising out of or resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, Claims arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Arsenic from the Covered Products, including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to Arsenic from the Covered Products, CAG will not be able to make any claim for those damages against Defendant Releasees and Downstream Releasees. Furthermore, CAG acknowledges that it intends these consequences for any such Claims arising from any violation of Proposition 65 or any other statutory or common law regarding the failure to warn about exposure to Arsenic from Covered Products as may exist as of the date of this release but which CAG does not know exist, and which, if known, would materially affect their decision to enter into this Consent Judgment, regardless of whether their lack of knowledge is the result of ignorance, oversight, error, negligence, or any other cause.

#### 6. ENTRY OF CONSENT JUDGMENT

- 6.1 CAG shall file a motion seeking approval of this Consent Judgment pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f). Upon entry of the Consent Judgment, CAG and Defendant waive their respective rights to a hearing or trial on the allegations of the Complaint.
- 6.2 The Parties shall make all reasonable efforts possible to have the Consent Judgment approved by the Court.
- 6.3 If this Consent Judgment is not approved in full by the Court, (a) this Consent Judgment and any and all prior agreements between the Parties merged herein shall terminate



and become null and void, and the actions shall revert to the status that existed prior to the execution date of this Consent Judgment; (b) no term of this Consent Judgment or any draft thereof, or of the negotiation, documentation, or other part or aspect of the Parties' settlement discussions, shall have any effect, nor shall any such matter be admissible in evidence for any purpose in this Action, or in any other proceeding; and (c) the Parties agree to meet and confer to determine whether to modify the terms of the Consent Judgment and to resubmit it for approval.

## 7. MODIFICATION OF JUDGMENT

- 7.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only upon written agreement of the Parties and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court thereon, or upon motion of any party as provided by law and upon entry of a modified Consent Judgment by the Court.
- 7.2 Any Party seeking to modify this Consent Judgment shall attempt in good faith to meet and confer with the other Party prior to filing a motion to modify the Consent Judgment.

#### 8. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

- 8.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement and enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment under Code of Civil Procedure § 664.6.
- 8.2 In any proceeding brought by either Party to enforce this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be entitled to recover its reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

#### 9. DUTIES LIMITED TO CALIFORNIA

9.1 This Consent Judgment shall have no effect on Covered Products sold by Defendant outside the State of California.

#### 10. SERVICE ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

10.1 CAG shall serve a copy of this Consent Judgment, signed by the Parties, on the California Attorney General so that the Attorney General may review this Consent Judgment prior to its approval by the Court. No sooner than forty-five (45) days after the Attorney General has received the aforementioned copy of this Consent Judgment, and in the absence of any written objection by the Attorney General to the terms of this Consent Judgment, may the Court approve this Consent Judgment.

## 11. ATTORNEY FEES

11.1 Except as specifically provided in Section 4.1.3 and 8.2, each Party shall bear its own costs and attorney fees in connection with this action.

#### 12. GOVERNING LAW

- 12.1 The validity, construction and performance of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California, without reference to any conflicts of law provisions of California law.
- 12.2 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is amended, repealed, preempted, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or if any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment are rendered inapplicable or are no longer required as a result of any such amendment, repeal or preemption, or rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally as to the Covered Products, then any Defendant subject to this Consent Judgment may provide written notice to CAG of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered Products are so affected. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be interpreted to relieve a Defendant from any obligation to comply with any pertinent state or federal law or regulation.
- 12.3 The Parties, including their counsel, have participated in the preparation of this Consent Judgment and this Consent Judgment is the result of the joint efforts of the Parties. This Consent Judgment was subject to revision and modification by the Parties and has been accepted and approved as to its final form by all Parties and their counsel. Accordingly, any uncertainty or ambiguity existing in this Consent Judgment shall not be interpreted against any Party as a result of the manner of the preparation of this Consent Judgment. Each Party to this Consent Judgment agrees that any statute or rule of construction providing that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting Party should not be employed in the interpretation of this Consent Judgment and, in this regard, the Parties hereby waive California Civil Code § 1654.



#### 13. EXECUTION AND COUNTERPARTS

13.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by means of facsimile or portable document format (pdf), which taken together shall be deemed to constitute one document and have the same force and effect as original signatures.

## 14. NOTICES

14.1 Any notices under this Consent Judgment shall be by First-Class Mail or E-mail.

If to CAG:

Reuben Yeroushalmi YEROUSHALMI & YEROUSHALMI 9100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 240W Beverly Hills, CA 90212 (310) 623-1926 Email: reuben@yeroushalmi.com

If to Specially Appearing Defendant.:

Michael A. Sherman STUBBS ALDERTON & MARKILES, LLP 15260 Ventura Blvd., 20th FL, Sherman Oaks, CA 91403 818.444.4528 Email: masherman@stubbsalderton.com

#### 15. AUTHORITY TO STIPULATE

15.1 Each signatory to this Consent Judgment certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into this Consent Judgment and to execute it on behalf of the party represented and legally to bind that party.

AGREED TO:	AGREED TO:
Date:, 2023	Date: May 4, , 2023
Name:	Name: CohiH (ITTINS Title: M)

12

1	CONSUMER ADVOCACY GROUP, INC. MAX Q, LTD., Specially Appearing
2	
3	IT IS SO ORDERED.
4	
5	Date:
6	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	E Company of the Comp
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	34
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	8
28	
- 1	