

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

### 1. INTRODUCTION

**1.1 The Parties.** This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Precila Balabbo (“Balabbo”) and E.S. Originals, Inc. (“E.S. Originals”). Together, Balabbo and E.S. Originals are collectively referred to as the “Parties.” Balabbo is an individual who resides in the State of California, and it is her position that she seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Balabbo alleges that E.S. Originals is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

**1.2 General Allegations.** Balabbo alleges that E.S. Originals has exposed individuals to the chemical di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) from its sales of Juicy Couture boots without first providing users and consumers of the product with a clear and reasonable health hazard exposure warning as required pursuant to Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.

**1.3 Product Description.** The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are Juicy Couture boots (the “Products”) that have been imported, distributed, offered for sale and/or sold in California by E.S. Originals.

**1.4 Notice of Violation.** On December 10, 2021 Balabbo served ABG Juicy Couture, LLC, the TJX Companies, Inc., Coach Services, Inc., and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq.” (collectively, the “Notices”). The Notices provided E.S. Originals and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that E.S. Originals was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn California consumers and customers that use of the Products will expose them to DEHP. E.S. Originals was subsequently identified as the manufacturer and supplier of the products in the Notice and entered into negotiations with Balabbo as indemnitor ABG Juicy Couture, LLC, the TJX Companies, Inc., and Coach Services, Inc. to resolve Balabbo’s claims

concerning exposure to DEHP from use of the Products. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

**1.5 No Admission.** E.S. Originals denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by E.S. Originals of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by E.S. Originals of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by E.S. Originals. However, this § 1.5 shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notices, E.S. Originals maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.



**1.6 Effective Date.** For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term “Effective Date” shall mean the date this Agreement is last executed by all of the Parties.

## **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: WARNINGS**

**2.1 Reformulation of Products.** As of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Products that E.S. Originals directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either: (a) be Reformulated Products pursuant to § 2.2, below; or (b) be labeled with a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to §§ 2.3, below. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a “Reformulated Product” is a Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in § 2.2, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 2.3 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product.

**2.2 Reformulation Standard.** “Reformulated Products” shall mean Products that contain concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DEHP when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining the phthalate content in a solid substance.

**2.3 Warning Language.** Commencing on the Effective Date, E.S. Originals may ensure that Products are labeled with a clear and reasonable warning that will be affixed to the packaging and labeling of the Products using either of the following warnings:

- (1)  **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including DEHP, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov)
- (2)  **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm – [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov)

If E.S. Originals sells Covered Products via an internet website to customers located in California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if one of the warnings appears either: (1) on the same web page on which a Covered Product is displayed and/or described; (2) on the same page as the price for the Covered Product; or (3) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process.

Where required, E.S. Originals shall provide Proposition 65 warnings on the Products via the use of electronic warning system using the language as set forth above in this subsection.

If E.S. Originals uses either of the above warning statements to effectuate its compliance, it shall also include a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline. Where the label is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the text of the warning, in a size no smaller than the height of the word “WARNING.”

The requirements for warnings, set forth above, are imposed pursuant to the terms of this Settlement Agreement. The Parties recognize that these are not the exclusive methods of providing a warning under Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations.

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment or another authorized agency promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting warning text and/or methods of transmission different than those set forth above, or legislation is enacted by the California legislature, United States Congress or voters with such requirements or permission, E.S.

Originals shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement.

If Proposition 65 warnings for DEHP should no longer be required, E.S. Originals shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement.

**3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)**

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, E.S. Originals shall pay \$2,000.00 as a Civil Penalty in accordance with this Section. The Civil Penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the Penalty remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Penalty remitted to Balabbo. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

**3.1 Civil Penalty.** Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date, E.S. Originals shall issue two (2) separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$1,500.00; and to (b) “Brodsky & Smith in Trust for Balabbo” in the amount of \$500.00. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

**3.2 Payment Procedures.**

**(a) Issuance of Payments.** Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Balabbo, pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
Brodsky & Smith  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line “Prop 65 Penalties”) at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010

Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

(b) **Copy of Payments to OEHHA.** E.S. Originals agrees to provide Balabbo's counsel with a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Balabbo, to be delivered to the address provided in § 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(c) **Tax Documentation.** E.S. Originals agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and Balabbo agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) "Precila Balabbo" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided within five (5) days after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties;

(ii) "Brodsky & Smith" (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

#### **4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The Parties acknowledge that Balabbo and her counsel offered to reach preliminary agreement on the material terms of this dispute before reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them. The Parties thereafter reached an accord on the compensation due to Balabbo and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Under these legal principles, E.S. Originals shall reimburse Balabbo's counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to E.S.

Originals's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, E.S. Originals shall issue a check payable to "Brodsky & Smith" in the amount of \$21,000.00 for delivery to the address identified in § 3.2(a)(i), above.

## **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

**5.1 Release of E.S. Originals and Downstream Customers and Entities.** This Settlement Agreement is a full, final and binding resolution between Balabbo, acting on her own behalf, and E.S. Originals, of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by Balabbo or on behalf of her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assigns ("Releasers") for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to DEHP from use of the Products, and Releasers hereby release any such claims against E.S. Originals and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, shareholders, marketplaces, directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, successors and assignees, and each entity to whom E.S. Originals directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products, including but not limited to, licensors, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, including but not limited to E.S. Originals, Inc., The TJX Companies, Inc., ABG Juicy Couture, LLC and each of their respective subsidiaries, affiliates and parents, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date for the Products.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to §§ 3 and 4 above, Balabbo, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby covenants not to sue and waives any right to institute, participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that she may have, including without limitation, all actions and causes of action in law and in equity, all obligations, expenses (including without limitation all attorneys' fees, expert fees, and investigation fees, and costs), damages, losses, liabilities and demands against any of the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to the chemical DEHP from use of the Products.

**5.2 E.S. Originals's Release of Balabbo.** E.S. Originals, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Balabbo, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Balabbo and/or her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to the Products.

**5.3 California Civil Code § 1542.** It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notices and relating to the Products will develop or be discovered. Balabbo on behalf of herself only, on one hand, and E.S. Originals, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in §§ 5.1 and 5.2, above, may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Balabbo and E.S. Originals each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

**5.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65.** The Parties agree that compliance by E.S. Originals with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to DEHP from use of the Products.

**5.5. Public Benefit.** It is E.S. Originals's understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by E.S. Originals under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of E.S. Originals that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to E.S. Originals

failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to DEHP prior to use of the Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that E.S. Originals is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

**6. SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the Settlement Agreement being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Settlement Agreement.

**7. GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable or limited by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, E.S. Originals shall provide written notice to Balabbo of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, a Product is so affected.

**8. NOTICES**

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For E.S. Originals:

Matthew S. Kenefick  
Jeffer Mangels Butler & Mitchell LLP  
2 Embarcadero Center, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
MKenefick@JMBM.com



For Balabbo:

Evan J. Smith  
Brodsky & Smith  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Either party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, DocuSign or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

Balabbo agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

**11. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

**12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

**13. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 4/6/2022 \_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Precila Balabbo

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
E.S. Originals, Inc.

DocuSigned by:  
*Richard Bacall*  
AFF41A98D77A4BD...

For Balabbo:

Evan J. Smith  
Brodsky & Smith  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Either party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, DocuSign or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

Balabbo agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

**11. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

**12. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

**13. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:**


**AGREED TO:**

Date:

2/21/22

Date:

\_\_\_\_\_

By:   
Precila Balabbo

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
E.S. Originals, Inc.