

1 Joseph R. Manning, Jr., Esq. (State Bar No. 223381)

2 **MANNING LAW, APC**
26100 Towne Centre Drive
3 Foothill Ranch, CA 92610
(949) 200-8755 Phone
4 (866) 843-8308 Fax
P65@manninglawoffice.com

5 Attorneys for Plaintiff:
6 CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC.,

7
8
9 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
10 **COUNTY OF ORANGE**
11

13 CALSAFE RESEARCH CENTER, INC., a
14 California non-profit corporation

15 Plaintiff,

16 v.

17 Darbar Investments, Inc., a California
18 corporation; and DOES 1 to 10,

19 Defendants.
20
21
22

Case No.: 30-2022-01287613-CU-TT-CJC

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED CONSENT
JUDGMENT**

1 Plaintiff CalSafe Research Center, Inc. ("Plaintiff"), and Defendant Kundan Distribution , Inc.
2 doing business as Darbar Foods and erroneously served and sued as Darbar Investments, Inc.,
3 ("Defendant") hereby enter into this Stipulated Consent Judgment ("Consent Judgment") as follows:

4 WHEREAS: On or about October 20, 2022, Plaintiff, through Plaintiff's counsel, served a 60
5 Day Notice to Defendant, Darbar Foods, the California Attorney General, the District Attorneys of every
6 County in the State of California, and the City Attorneys for every City in the State of California with a
7 population greater than 750,000 (collectively, "Public Prosecutor(s)") alleging that Defendant violated
8 California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California *Health and Safety*
9 *Code* § 25249.6, *et seq.*, and its implementing regulations (collectively, "Proposition 65") alleging that
10 and that Plaintiff intended to file an enforcement action in the public interest; and

11 WHEREAS: Plaintiff alleges that Defendant manufactured and/or distributed National, Achar
12 Gosht, UPC #620514000237 containing Lead, (collectively the "Covered Products") that were sold or
13 distributed for sale in California and further alleges that those Covered Products expose consumers in the
14 State of California to chemicals including Lead, which are listed by the State of California pursuant to
15 California *Health and Safety Code* § 25249.8; and

16 WHEREAS: Plaintiff further alleges that persons in the State of California were exposed to Lead
17 in Covered Products without being provided the Proposition 65 warning set out at California *Health and*
18 *Safety Code* § 25249.6 and its implementing regulations ("Proposition 65 Warning");

19 WHEREAS: Defendant denies the allegations of the 60 Day Notice, and denies that it has
20 violated Proposition 65 and expressly denies that it has engaged in any wrongdoing whatsoever,

21 WHEREAS: Plaintiff seeks to provide the public with Proposition 65 warnings and believes that
22 this objective is achieved by the actions described in this Consent Judgment; and

23 WHEREAS: Plaintiff and Defendant wish to resolve their differences without the delay and
24 expense of litigation.

25 NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED AND AGREED UPON AS BETWEEN PLAINTIFF
26 ACTING IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST AND DEFENDANT AS FOLLOWS:

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 1.1 On April 12, 2022, Plaintiff served a 60-Day Notice upon Defendant, Darbar Investments, Inc.,
3 and on Public Prosecutors. No Public Prosecutors commenced an enforcement action. No Public
4 Prosecutor having commenced an enforcement action, Plaintiff proceeded to file its Complaint
5 ("Complaint") against Defendant in the present action.

6 1.2 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, Plaintiff alleges that Defendant is a business entity that
7 has employed ten or more persons at all times relevant to this action, and qualifies as a "person in
8 the course of doing business" within the meaning of Proposition 65.

9 1.3 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, Plaintiff and Defendant (the "Parties") stipulate that:
10 1) this Court has jurisdiction over the allegations of violation contained in the Complaint, and
11 personal jurisdiction over Defendant as to the acts alleged in the Complaint; 2) venue is proper in
12 the County of Orange; and 3) this Court has jurisdiction to enter this Consent Judgment as a full
13 and final resolution of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Complaint based on
14 the facts alleged therein with respect to the Covered Products, and of all claims which were or
15 could have been raised by any person or entity based in whole or in part, directly or indirectly, on
16 the facts alleged in the 60-Day Notice, in the present action, or arising therefrom or related
17 thereto, with respect to Covered Products, including any Proposition 65 claim arising out of an
18 exposure to Covered Products (collectively, "Proposition 65 Claims").

19 1.4 The Parties enter into this Consent Judgment as a full and final settlement of the Proposition 65
20 Claims, for the purpose of avoiding prolonged and costly litigation and of resolving the issues
21 raised therein both as to past and future conduct. By execution of this Consent Judgment and
22 agreeing to comply with its terms, the Parties do not admit any fact, conclusion of law, or
23 violation of law, nor shall Defendant's compliance with the Consent Judgment constitute or be
24 construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, conclusion of law, or violation of law.
25 Defendant denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the 60-Day Notices and the
26 Complaint and expressly denies any wrongdoing whatsoever.

1 **2. DEFINITIONS**

2 2.1 "Effective Date" shall mean, with respect to this Consent Judgment, the date the Consent
3 Judgment has been approved and entered by the Court.

4 2.2 "Compliance Date" shall mean ninety (90) days after the Effective Date.

5 2.3 "Covered Products" shall mean, with respect to this Consent Judgment, National Achar Gosht,
6 UPC #620514000237 that are manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by
7 Defendant in California.

8 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

9 3.1 For each Covered Product, Defendant agrees to undertake, or cause to be undertaken on its
10 behalf, either: (a) reformulation of the Covered Product to bring it within the Proposition
11 exemption identified in Section 3.2 below or (b) to provide a warning as prescribed in Sections
12 3.3.-3.4 below. Compliance with Section 3.1 will constitute compliance by Defendant with all
13 requirements of Proposition 65 relating to Lead exposure in the Covered Products.

14 3.2 Proposition 65 Exemption for the Covered Products

15 Covered Products shall be deemed to comply with Proposition 65 and be exempt from any
16 Proposition 65 warning requirements with respect to Lead, if the Covered Product contains no
17 more than 0.5 micrograms of lead per serving, with serving size measured by the serving size
18 specified on the label for the Covered Product.

19 3.3 Warning Option

20 Covered Products that do not meet the warning exemption set forth in Section 3.2, shall be
21 accompanied by a warning as described in Section 3.4 below. This warning requirement shall
22 only be required as to Covered Products that are manufactured, distributed, marketed, sold or
23 shipped for sale to consumers by Defendant in the State of California, after the Compliance Date.,
24 No Proposition 65 warning shall be to Covered Products already in distribution and the stream of
25 commerce. Said Covered Products are hereby deemed to be exempt from a Proposition 65
26 warning with respect to Lead and/or expressly released under this Consent Judgment.

1 3.4 Warning Language

2 Where required to meet the criteria set forth in Section 3.3, Defendant shall provide one of the
3 following warning statements ("Warning"), displayed in a reasonably conspicuous manner:

4 Option (1)

5 **WARNING:** Consuming this product can expose you to
6 chemicals including Lead, which [is] are known to the State of
7 California to cause [cancer and] birth defects or other
8 reproductive harm. For more information go to
9 www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

10 Option (2)

11 **WARNING:** [Cancer and] Reproductive Harm--
12 www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food

13 Defendant shall use the phrase "cancer and" in the warning if Defendant has reason to believe
14 that the daily lead exposure level is greater than 15 micrograms of lead.

15
16 The Warning shall be provided through a warning on the label that is securely affixed to or
17 printed upon the label and complies with the warning content provided in Option 1 or Option 2
18 above. In addition, for any Covered Product sold over the internet by Defendant, the Warning
19 shall appear prior to check-out on the primary product page, or as a pop-up when a California
20 address is input into the shipping instructions, or on the checkout page when a California
21 delivery address is indicated for any purchase of any Covered Product. The Warning may be
22 provided with a conspicuous hyperlink stating "**WARNING**" in all capital and bold letters so
23 long as the hyperlink goes directly to a page prominently displaying the Warning without content
24 that detracts from the Warning. Given Defendant's lack of control over third-party websites, the
25 online warning requirements expressed in this Section apply only to Covered Products sold
26 through Defendant's website. However, Defendant will instruct any third-party website sellers to
27 which it supplies the Cover Product to provide the Warnings as a condition of selling the
28

1 Covered Product. The Warning shall also comply with 27 C.C.R. § 25607.1(c). Specifically,
2 where the product sign, label, or shelf tag used to provide a warning includes consumer
3 information in a language other than English, the warning must also be provided in that language
4 in addition to English. If subsequently enacted changes to Proposition 65 or its implementing
5 regulations require the use of additional or different information on any warning specifically
6 applicable to the Covered Products (the "New Safe Harbor Warning"), the Parties agree that the
7 New Safe Harbor warning may be utilized in place of or in addition to, as applicable, the
8 warnings set forth in this Section.

9 **4. MONETARY RELIEF**

10 4.1 Within 14 business days of the receiving notice that this Consent Judgment has been approved of
11 and entered by the Court, and after receiving taxpayer information from Plaintiff, Defendant shall
12 pay the total sum of \$38,000.00 which includes \$3,800.00 in civil penalties and \$34,200.00 in
13 payment of Plaintiff's costs and reasonable attorney's fees. The \$3,800.00 civil penalty shall be
14 apportioned pursuant to *Health and Safety Code* § 25249.12 (d), with 75%, or \$2,850.00, paid to
15 the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and 25%, or
16 \$950.00, payable to Plaintiff. The Plaintiff's portion of the civil penalty shall be made payable to
17 Manning Law APC, Client Trust and CalSafe Research Center, Inc. and associated with taxpayer
18 identification number 84-4419173. This payment shall be delivered to Manning Law, APC, via
19 wire:

20 Account Name: The Law Offices of Joseph R. Manning

21 Bank Name: J.P. Morgan Chase Bank, N.A.

22 Bank Address: 270 Park Ave. New York, NY. 10017

23 ACH Routing / ABA Number: 322271627

24 Wire Routing / ABA Number: 021000021

25 Swift Code: CHASUS33

26 Account Number: 802922919

27 Memo: Case No. 30-2022-01287613-CU-TT-CJC

1 4.2 The OEHHA portion of the civil penalty shall be made payable to OEHHA and associated with
2 taxpayer identification number 68-0284486. This payment shall be delivered as follows:

3 For United States Postal Service Delivery:
4 Attn: Mike Gyurics
5 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
6 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
7 P.O. Box 4010, MS #19B
8 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

9 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:
10 Attn: Mike Gyurics
11 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
12 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
13 1001 I Street, MS #19B
14 Sacramento, CA 95814

15 Defendant agrees to provide Plaintiff's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA,
16 simultaneous with its penalty payments to Plaintiff. Plaintiff and its counsel will provide
17 completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required. Relevant information is set out
18 below:

- 19 • CalSafe Research Center, Inc, associated with taxpayer identification number 84-
20 4419173, CalSafe Research Center, Inc. 4533 MacArthur Blvd. Ste. 230, Newport
21 Beach, CA 92660.
- 22 • Manning Law, APC, associated with taxpayer identification number 83-0502205,
23 Manning Law, APC, 26100 Towne Centre Drive, Foothill Ranch, CA 92610.

24 4.3 The portion of the settlement attributable to attorney's fees and costs in the amount of \$34,200.00
25 shall be paid to Plaintiff's counsel, who are entitled to attorney's fees and costs incurred by it in
26 this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to
27 Defendant's attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.
28 Within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date, Defendant shall provide its payment to
Plaintiff's counsel via wire pursuant to the wire instructions provided in section 4.1 above.

1 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE
2 CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER
3 FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF
4 KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS
5 OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

6 5.4 Plaintiff understands and acknowledges that the significance and consequence of this waiver of
7 California *Civil Code* § 1542 is that even if Plaintiff suffers future damages arising out of or
8 resulting from, or related directly or indirectly to, in whole or in part, the Covered Products,
9 including but not limited to any exposure to, or failure to warn with respect to exposure to, the
10 Covered Products, Plaintiff will not be able to make any claim for those damages against any of
11 the Released Parties.

12 5.5 Compliance by Defendant with the terms of this Consent Judgment shall constitute compliance
13 with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to Lead in the Covered Products as set forth in the
14 60-Day Notices and/or the Complaint.

15 **6. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 252249.7(f)**

16 6.1 Plaintiff and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in
17 California *Health and Safety Code* § 25249.7(f)

18 **7. PROVISION NOTICE**

19 7.1 When any Party is entitled to receive any notice or writing under this Consent Judgment, the
20 notice or writing shall be sent by first class certified mail with return receipt requested, or by
21 electronic mail, as follows:

22 To Defendant:
23 Whitney Jones Roy, Esq.
24 SheppardMullin
25 333 South Hope Street, 43rd Floor
26 Los Angeles, CA. 90071-1422
27 WRoy@sheppardmullin.com
28

To Plaintiff:
Joseph R. Manning, Jr.
Manning Law, APC
26100 Towne Centre Drive
Foothill Ranch, CA. 92610
P65@manninglawoffice.com

Any party may modify the person and address to whom the notice is to be sent by sending the other Party notice that is transmitted in the manner set forth in section 7.1.

8. COURT APPROVAL

8.1 Upon execution of this Consent Judgment by all Parties, Plaintiff shall prepare and file, at its sole cost and expense, a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment that Defendant shall support. This Consent Judgment shall not become effective until approved and entered by the Court. If this Consent Judgment is not entered by the Court, it shall be of no force or effect, and shall not be introduced into evidence or otherwise used in any proceeding for any purpose.

8.2 This Consent Judgment may apply to and benefit the Parties and their respective officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, parent companies, subsidiaries, divisions, franchisees, licensees, customers, distributors, wholesalers, retailers, predecessors, successors, and assigns. This Consent Judgment shall have no application to any Covered Products that are distributed or sold exclusively outside the State of California and that is not intended for use by California consumers.

9. GOVERNING LAW AND CONSTRUCTION

9.1 The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

10. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

10.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties with respect to the entire subject matter hereof, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations, commitments, or understandings related thereto, if any, are hereby merged herein and therein.

10.2 There are no warranties, representations, or other agreements between the Parties except as expressly set forth herein. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or implied, other than those specifically referred to in this Consent Judgment have been made by any Party hereto.

1 10.3 No other agreements not specifically contained or referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be
2 deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto. Any agreements specifically contained or
3 referenced herein, oral or otherwise, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any of the Parties hereto
4 only to the extent that they are expressly incorporated herein.

5 10.4 No supplementation, modification, waiver, or termination of this Consent Judgment shall be
6 binding unless executed in writing by the Party to be bound thereby, and approved and ordered
7 by the Court.

8 10.5 No waiver of any of the provisions of this Consent Judgment shall be deemed or shall constitute a
9 waiver of any of the other provisions hereof whether or not similar, nor shall such waiver
10 constitute a continuing waiver.

11 **11. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION & ENFORCEMENT**

12 11.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement, enforcer or modify the Consent
13 Judgment. Any alleged breach of the terms of this Consent Judgment must be brought in this
14 Court.

15 11.2 If Plaintiff alleges that any Covered Products fail to comply with this Consent Judgment, then
16 Plaintiff shall inform Defendant in a reasonably prompt manner of its test results and related
17 packaging information, including information sufficient to permit Defendant to identify the
18 Covered Products at issue. The Parties shall first attempt to resolve the matter prior to Plaintiff
19 taking any further legal action.

20 11.3 In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or preempted as to food products, or if lead is deemed
21 to be naturally occurring in the Covered Products and not requiring a warning through a law or
22 regulation, then Plaintiff shall have no further obligation pursuant to this Consent Judgment with
23 respect to, and to the extent that the Covered Products are so affected.

24 **12. NO EFFECT ON OTHER SETTLEMENTS**

25 12.1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall preclude Plaintiff from resolving any claim against
26 another entity on terms that are different from those contained in this Consent Judgment.
27
28

13. **EXECUTION IN COUNTERPARTS**

13.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts, each of which shall be deemed to be an original, and all of which, taken together, shall constitute the same document. Execution of the Consent Judgment by e-mail, facsimile, or other electronic means, shall constitute legal and binding execution and delivery. Any photocopy of the executed Consent Judgment shall have the same force and effect as the original.

14. **AUTHORIZATION**

14.1 The undersigned are authorized to stipulate to, enter into, and execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective parties, and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Consent Judgment.

15. **SEVERABILITY**

15.1 If subsequent to Court approval of this Consent Judgment, any part or provision is declared by a Court to be invalid, void, or unenforceable, the remaining portions of provisions shall continue in full force and effect.

AGREED TO:

CalSafe Research Center, Inc.

Dated: 10/2/2023

By:  _____
4D7E7F1FE86247B...

1 **AGREED TO:**

2 **Kundan Distribution , Inc. doing business as Darbar Foods**

3 Dated:

4

5 By: _____

6

7 IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to *Health & Safety*
8 *Code* § 25249.7(f)(4) and *Code of Civil Procedure* § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered.

9

10 Dated: _____

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 **AGREED TO:**

2 **Kundan Distribution , Inc. doing business as Darbar Foods**

3 Dated: 9/28/2023

4
5 By: 

6
7 IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that, pursuant to *Health & Safety*
8 *Code* § 25249.7(f)(4) and *Code of Civil Procedure* § 664.6, judgment is hereby entered.

9

10 Dated: _____

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28