SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN APS&EE, LLC, ARROWHEAD BRASS & PLUMBING, LLC, AND FERGUSON ENTERPRISES, LLC

1. <u>RECITALS</u>

1.1 The Parties

1.1.1 This Settlement Agreement ("Agreement") is entered into by and between Arrowhead Brass & Plumbing, LLC ("Arrowhead") and Ferguson Enterprises, LLC ("Ferguson"), on the one hand, and APS&EE, LLC ("APS&EE"), on the other hand (each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties"). Arrowhead and Ferguson shall collectively be referred to as the "Defendants."

1.1.2 APS&EE is an organization based in California with an interest in protecting the environment, improving human health and the health of ecosystems, and supporting environmentally sound practices, which includes promoting awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals and reducing exposure to hazardous substances found in consumer products.

1.1.3 APS&EE alleges that Defendants are each a person in the course of doing business as the term is defined in California *Health & Safety Code* section 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.2 Allegations

1.2.1 APS&EE alleges that Defendants sold Log Lighter Valves, including but not limited to 258 1/2 FIP, 6-9004346258-5 (hereinafter the "Products") in the State of California causing users in California to be exposed to hazardous levels of Lead without providing "clear and reasonable warnings", in violation of Proposition 65. Lead is listed as known to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.2.2 On August 30, 2022, APS&EE sent a Sixty-Day Notice of Violation (the "Notice"), along with a Certificate of Merit, to Defendants and the various public enforcement agencies regarding the alleged violation of Proposition 65 with respect to the Products.

1.3 No Admissions

Defendants deny all allegations in APS&EE's Notice and maintain that the Products have been, and are, in compliance with all laws, and that Defendants have not violated Proposition 65. This Agreement shall not be construed as an admission of liability by Defendants but to the contrary as a compromise of claims that are expressly contested and denied. However, nothing in this section shall affect the Parties' obligations, duties, and responsibilities under this Agreement.

1.4 Compromise

The Parties enter into this Agreement in order to resolve the controversy described above in a manner consistent with prior Proposition 65 settlements and consent judgments that were entered in the public interest and to avoid prolonged and costly litigation between them.

1.5 Effective Date

The "Effective Date" shall be the date upon which a complete and fully executed copy of the Agreement is delivered to each Party or its counsel.

2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF</u>

2.1 Reformulation Standard

As of the Effective Date, Defendants shall not manufacture, distribute, sell, offer for sale, or cause to have the Products sold in California unless (a) the Product contains no more than 100 parts per million (0.01%) of Lead ("Reformulated Product"), or (b) the Product is accompanied by a clear and reasonable warning as described below in Section 2.2.

2.2 Proposition 65 Warnings

2.2.1 For any Products that are not Reformulated Products, such Products shall be accompanied by a clear and reasonable warning. Defendants shall

provide a warning statement substantially similar to the following:

"WARNING: This product can expose you to Lead which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to <u>www.P65Warnings.ca.gov</u>."

The warning shall be accompanied by a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline. Where the label for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the text of the warning, in a size no smaller than the height of the word "WARNING". Alternatively, the warning may be an on-product warning that complies with Title 27, California Code of Regulations § 25603(b) and (c). To the extent the warning statement used is clear and reasonable in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations § 25600 *et seq.* (and as those regulations may hereafter be amended), it will be deemed substantially similar to the warning statement provided above.

2.2.2 The Products shall carry said warning directly on each unit, label, shelf tag, or package, with such conspicuousness as compared with other words, statements or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary consumer prior to sale. The warning shall be able to withstand reasonable wear and tear where it is offered for sale such that the warning does not rub away or otherwise become illegible. If the warning is provided on a shelf tag, it shall follow the appropriate methods and content for shelf tags as described in 27 CCR section 25600, *et seq.* A Product that is sold by Defendants on the internet to persons located in California shall also provide the warning message by a clearly marked hyperlink on the product display page, or otherwise prominently displayed to the purchaser before the purchaser completes his or her purchase of the Product. For Products that Defendants provide for a downstream entity to sell on the internet, Defendants shall include an instruction that the entity comply with the warning requirements of this section.

3. <u>PAYMENTS</u>

3.1 Civil Penalty Pursuant To Proposition 65

In settlement of all claims referred to in this Agreement, Defendants shall collectively pay a total civil penalty of one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) to be apportioned in accordance with *Health and Safety Code* section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% (\$750.00) for State of California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining 25% (\$250.00) for APS&EE.

Defendants shall issue these payments collectively as part of the total payment described below in Section 3.2 via wire transfer to Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak. After receipt of the wire transfer, Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak shall be responsible for forwarding the respective payments to OEHHA and APS&EE.

3.2 Reimbursement Of APS&EE's Fees And Costs

Defendants shall reimburse APS&EE's reasonable experts' and attorneys' fees and costs incurred in prosecuting the instant action, for all work performed through execution of this Agreement, in the collective amount of thirteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$13,500.00). Accordingly, Defendants shall collectively remit total payment via wire transfer to Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak in the amount of fourteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$14,500.00), which includes the civil penalty described in Section 3.1, within five (5) business days of the Effective Date. Wire instructions have been exchanged between the Parties' counsel.

4. <u>RELEASES</u>

4.1 APS&EE's Release Of Defendants and Downstream Entities

APS&EE, acting in its individual capacity, in consideration of the promises and monetary payments contained herein, hereby releases Ferguson and Arrowhead, and each of their respective parents, subsidiaries, shareholders, directors, members, officers, employees, attorneys, successors and assignees, as well as their downstream distributors, retailers, and franchisees (collectively "Released Parties"), from any alleged Proposition 65 violation claims asserted in APS&EE's Notice regarding failure to warn about Lead

4 of 7

Settlement Agreement Between APS&EE, LLC, Arrowhead Brass & Plumbing, LLC, And Ferguson Enterprises, LLC exposure from the Products that Defendants have sold or caused to be sold in California before and up to the Effective Date.

4.2 Defendants' Release Of APS&EE

Defendants, by this Agreement, waive all rights to institute any form of legal action against APS&EE, its shareholders, directors, members, officers, employees, attorneys, experts, successors and assignees for actions or statements made or undertaken, whether in the course of investigating claims or seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against Defendants in this matter. If any Released Party should institute any such action, then APS&EE's release of said Released Party in this Agreement shall be rendered void and unenforceable.

4.3 Waiver Of Unknown Claims

Each of the Parties acknowledges that it is familiar with Section 1542 of California Civil Code which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Products will develop or be discovered. APS&EE on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Ferguson and Arrowhead, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in §§ 4.1 and 4.2, above, may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims.

The Parties acknowledge that each may subsequently discover facts in addition to, or different from, those that it believes to be true with respect to the claims released

5 of 7 Settlement Agreement Between APS&EE, LLC, Arrowhead Brass & Plumbing, LLC, And Ferguson Enterprises, LLC herein. The Parties agree that this Agreement and the releases contained herein as between APS&EE on the one hand and the Defendants collectively on the other shall be and remain effective in all respects notwithstanding the discovery of such additional or different facts.

5. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

Should any part or provision of this Agreement for any reason be declared by a Court to be invalid, void or unenforceable, the remaining portions and provisions shall continue in full force and effect.

6. <u>GOVERNING LAW</u>

The terms of this Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

7. <u>NOTICE</u>

All correspondence and notice required to be provided under this Agreement shall be in writing and delivered personally or sent by first class or certified mail addressed as follows:

TO FERGUSON: Brenda Radmacher, Esq. Akerman LLP 601 West Fifth Street, Suite 300 Los Angeles, CA 90071	TO APS&EE: Lucas T. Novak, Esq. Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak 8335 W Sunset Blvd., Suite 217 Los Angeles, CA 90069
TO ARROWHEAD: Jason Caruso, Esq. Newmeyer & Dillion LLP 895 Dove Street, 2nd Floor Newport Beach, CA 92660	

8. <u>COUNTERPARTS</u>

This Agreement may be executed in counterparts, each of which shall be deemed

an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute the same document.

Execution and delivery of this Agreement by e-mail, facsimile, or other electronic means shall constitute legal and binding execution and delivery. Any photocopy of the executed Agreement shall have the same force and effect as the originals.

9. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties. Each Party has read, understood, and agrees to all of the terms and conditions of this Agreement. Each Party warrants to the other that it is free to enter into this Agreement and is not subject to any conflicting obligation that will or might prevent or interfere with the execution or performance of this Agreement by said Party.

AGREED TO:

Date:

By:

4.9, 23 Authorized Representative of APS&EE, LLC

AGREED TO:

Date:

April 4, 2023

3/22/2

By:

Authorized Representative of Arrowhead Brass & Plumbing, LLC

AGREED TO:

Date:

By:

Authorized Representative of Ferguson Enterprises, LLC

7 of 7 Settlement Agreement Between APS&EE, LLC, Arrowhead Brass & Plumbing, LLC, And Ferguson Enterprises, LLC

69376722,1