

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Dennis Johnson (“Johnson”) and Pacific Market International, LLC (“PMI”) as indemnitor to Starbucks Corporation,¹ with Johnson and PMI each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as the “Parties.” Johnson is an individual residing in the State of California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. Johnson alleges that PMI is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations

Johnson alleges that PMI manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California, ceramic mugs with exterior designs containing lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm. Johnson alleges that PMI failed to provide the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65 for exposures to lead.

1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are specifically defined as, and limited to, the “*PMI Been There Series Monterey Ceramic Mug*” UPC: 7 62111 44518 6, that are manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California by PMI (hereinafter referred to as “Products”).

¹ Plaintiff’s 60-Day Notice mistakenly identifies Starbucks Coffee International, Inc. as the “Manufacturer/Distributor” of the products at issue. However, Starbucks Corporation is the entity responsible for purchasing and selling the products at issue.

1.4 Notice of Violation

On July 14, 2022, Johnson served Starbucks Coffee International, Inc., Target Corporation, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation, alleging that they violated Proposition 65 when they failed to warn their customers and consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead from the Products. PMI was subsequently identified as the manufacturer/supplier of the Products. No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notices.

1.5 No Admission

PMI denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that all of the products that it has sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by PMI of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by PMI of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by PMI. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect PMI's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean 180 days after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation Standards

"Reformulated Products" are defined as those Products that: (a) contain no more than 90 parts per million ("ppm") lead in any decoration, colored artwork, designs and/or marking on the surface of the Products when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3050B or equivalent methodologies utilized by

federal or state agencies for the purpose of determining lead content in a solid substance; (b) yield no more than 1.0 microgram of lead on any surface sampled and analyzed pursuant to the NIOSH 9100 testing protocol, or yield no more than 0.9 ppm for lead when tested under ASTM C927-99 test method, modified for total immersion with results corrected for internal volume; and (c) yield a result of non-detect (defined as no more than 25 ppm by weight of lead) for any decorations located in the upper 20 millimeters of a Product, i.e., the “Lip-and-Rim” area when analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies 3050B and 6010B, or equivalent methodologies used by state and federal agencies to determine lead content in a solid substance.

If the decoration is tested after it is affixed to the Product, the percentage of the lead by weight must relate only to the decorating materials and must not include any quantity attributable to non-decorating material (e.g., ceramic substrate).

2.2 Reformulation/Warning Commitment


As of the Effective Date, PMI shall not manufacture, import, distribute, sell or offer the Products for sale in the State of California unless they are Reformulated Products pursuant to Section 2.1 or bear a warning pursuant to Section 2.3.

2.3 Warnings

As of the Effective Date, all Products PMI sells and/or distributes for sale in California that do not qualify as Reformulated Products, shall bear a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to this Section. PMI further agrees that the warning will be prominently placed with such conspicuousness when compared with other words, statements, designs or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Products shall contain one of the following statements:

 **WARNING:** Reproductive Harm- www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

OR

 **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(2), and as consideration for the releases contained in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 below, PMI agrees to pay \$5,000 in civil penalties no later than January 13, 2023. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount paid to Johnson. PMI will make its payment in two checks, delivered to the address in Section 3.3, as follows: (1) to “OEHHA” in the amount of \$3,750; and (2) to “Dennis Johnson” in the amount of \$1,250.

3.2 Attorneys’ Fees and Costs

The Parties acknowledge that Johnson and his counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to his counsel, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Shortly after the other settlement terms had been reached, PMI expressed a desire to resolve Johnson’s fees and costs. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Johnson’s counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 for all work performed in this matter. Under these legal principles, on or before January 13, 2023, PMI agrees to pay \$22,500, in the form of a check made payable to “Voorhees & Bailey, LLP,” for all fees and costs incurred investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of PMI’s management, and negotiating a settlement.

3.3 Payment Address

All payments under this Settlement Agreement shall be delivered to the following address:

Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
990 Amarillo Avenue
Palo Alto, CA 94303

3.4 Costs, Expenses, and Attorneys' Fees

Except as expressly set forth above, the Parties shall bear their own costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees related to the Notice.

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 Johnson's Release of Proposition 65 Claims

Johnson acting on his own behalf, and not on behalf of the public, releases PMI, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, agents employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom PMI directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including, but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, and retailers including, but not limited to, Starbucks Corporation, Starbucks Coffee International, Inc. and Target Corporation, their parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, agents employees, attorneys, franchisees, cooperative members, and licensees (collectively, "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date based on unwarned exposures to lead in the Products. This release includes Products manufactured and in the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date, as they have been included in the calculation of the civil penalty payment. The Parties further understand and agree that this Section 4.1 release shall not extend upstream to any entities that manufactured the Products or any component parts thereof, or any distributors or suppliers who sold the Products or any component parts thereof to PMI.

4.2 Johnson's Individual Release of Claims

Johnson in his individual capacity only and not in his representative capacity, provides a release herein to Releasees that shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of Johnson of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to all failure to warn claims and arising out of alleged or actual exposures to any chemicals listed under Proposition 65 including without limitation lead in the Products manufactured, imported, distributed, or sold by PMI prior to the Effective Date. In this regard, Johnson hereby acknowledges that he is familiar with and hereby waives Section 1542 of the California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

The Parties further understand and agree that this Section 4.2 release shall not extend upstream to any entities that manufactured the Products, or any component parts thereof, or any distributors or suppliers who sold the Products, or any component parts thereof to PMI. Nothing in this Section affects Johnson's right to commence or prosecute an action under Proposition 65 against a Releasee that does not involve PMI's Products.

4.3 PMI's Release of Johnson

PMI, on its own behalf, and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Johnson and his attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made by Johnson and his attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

4.4 Public Benefit

It is the Parties' understanding that the commitments PMI has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by PMI under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of the Parties that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to PMI's or Releasees' failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to lead prior to use of the Products PMI has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that PMI is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

5. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

6. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then PMI may provide written notice to Johnson of any asserted change in the law and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

7. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For PMI:

Sung Yang
Vice-President, Legal
2401 Elliott Avenue, 4th Floor
Seattle, WA 98121

For Johnson:

Dennis Johnson
Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
990 Amarillo Avenue
Palo Alto, CA 94303

With a copy to:

Naoki S. Kaneko
Shook, Hardy & Bacon L.L.P.
Jamboree Center
5 Park Plaza, Suite 1600
Irvine, CA 92614
Email: nkaneko@shb.com

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

8. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

9. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Johnson and his attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

10. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

11. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understand, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: **January 11, 2023**

Date: 1/10/2023

By: 
DENNIS JOHNSON

By: 
06DB241B0FA54F5...
PACIFIC MARKET INTERNATIONAL, LLC