## **SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

## 1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

#### 1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. ("EHA"), on the one hand, and Fitglow Beauty LLC ("Fitglow"), on the other hand, with EHA and Fitglow each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties." EHA is a corporation in the State of California serving in the interest of the general public by seeking to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. EHA alleges that Fitglow is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

## 1.2 General Allegations

In a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 dated March 17, 2023 ("Notice") EHA alleged that Fitglow manufactures, sells, offers for sale and/or distributes for sale in California, powdered face makeup products that contain Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size) ("TiO2") and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. TiO2 is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer.

# 1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are powdered face makeup containing TiO2 ("Covered Products"), that are manufactured, sold, offered for sale and/or distributed for sale in California by Fitglow.

## 1.4 Notice of Violation

EHA served the Notice on Fitglow, the California Attorney General, and certain other public enforcement agencies. The Notice alleged that Fitglow had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to TiO2 contained in Covered Products.

To the best of the parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

#### 1.5 No Admission

Fitglow denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and maintains that all of the products it sold, offered for sale and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Fitglow of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Fitglow of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Fitglow. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Fitglow's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

#### 1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the last date this Settlement Agreement is executed by either of the Parties.

## 2. <u>INJUNCTIVE RELIEF</u>

## 2.1 Reformulation Standard

Except as allowed in section 2.2 (Alternative Standards that Defendant May Use to Comply with this Agreement) below, commencing one year after the Effective Date, Defendant shall not sell any Covered Product that: (1) when measured using air capture, contains greater than 250 respirable-sized unbound TiO2 particles per liter (str/L) of air, or for elongate fibers of TiO2, greater than 75 str/L; or (2) when measured using bulk testing, greater 5.0 X 10<sup>3</sup> respirable-sized TiO2 unbound particles; or (3) when measured using a cascade impactor, contains greater than 0.00837 mg respirable-sized TiO2 unbound particles per mg of bulk makeup powder; or (4) does not contain a valid Proposition 65 warning as described in section 2.3, below. Reformulation would be measured using either of the following methods:

# A. Air Capture

1. Testing should be carried out in a sealed laboratory glovebox or containment free

from external air movements or contaminates. Released particulate should be collected on a 25mm air monitoring cassette with a 0.45-micron MCE filter, connected to a personal air sampling pump calibrated to a flow rate of 2.0~L / min.

2. With the air sampling pump running, use a makeup applicator or brush and apply enough pressure to transfer the product onto the tool. Tap or blow off excess product. Simulate applying the product to a gloved hand or other nonporous surface located no more than 20 cm from the air cassette, for 10 minutes. Allow the air sampling pump to run for another 5 minutes with no disturbance of the product. Prepare the resulting filters from the air cassettes for TEM by collapsing the filter, coating with carbon evaporated in high vacuum (10-4 to 10-5 Pa), placing onto TEM grids, and dissolving away residual filter material. Particulate should be analyzed via a TEM with an acceleration voltage of 100KeV equipped with EDXA and SAED at magnifications of at least 15,000x. Calculated concentration should be made relevant to effective filter area (EFA) divided by the area analyzed, relative to the liters of air sampled, i.e., on a str/L basis.

## B. Bulk Testing

- 1. Preparation for qualitative presence or absence and quantification of TiO2 particles unbound in the respirable-size fraction by TEM are conducted as follows: The product is prepared for analysis by weighing and suspending a portion of the suspect material in an alcohol/deionized water mix. Measured aliquots of the sample suspension are then filtered through a 0.2 μm mixed cellulose ester filter (MCE). It has been determined that the optimal range of material extracted from the product falls between 10-50 mg suspended in a 400 mL 50/50 DI H2O/isopropyl alcohol solution\*, from which 1-5 mL aliquots are drawn and filtered. The final MCE filter is dried, collapsed with acetone, and coated with carbon in a vacuum evaporator. The fibers and solids collected on the carbon-coated filter replicate are transferred onto copper grids for TEM analysis.
- 2. The resulting preparation is then scanned to assure a particle loading of the filter between 5-15%, and then quantified by analysis, measuring lengths and widths and chemistries of particulate to determine overall percent TiO2 and size bin categorized for comparison with target value compliances. Only particles less than 10 µm relative aerodynamic diameter not touching or

adhering to other materials on the filter preparation that reveal only titanium (and oxygen) peaks by EDS will be considered for quantification. To observe and quantify all such structures down to unbound particles as small as 50 nm (minimum dimension of  $0.050 \mu m$ ), the analysis should be conducted at 20-25,000x magnification. Sufficient area of the filter shall be analyzed to reach an analytical sensitivity of at least  $5.0 \times 10^3$  RPTi/mg of product.

3. Products prepared and analyzed by this bulk screening protocol that are found to contain >5.0 X 10<sup>3</sup> RPTi /mg of product shall be deemed as "Fails TiO2 screening test", as would any product found to contain respirable titanium dioxide fibers (mineralogically, acicular to fibrous rutile) observed on the filter analyzed to the specified analytical sensitivity (5.0 X 10<sup>3</sup> RPTi /mg). Product samples thusly failing this standard would then be recommended for further testing to confirm releasability such as product use simulation in a controlled environment with appropriate air testing, etcetera. Alternatively, such products may be reformulated by the manufacturer or removed as noncompliant.

# C. Cascade Impactor

Use a cascade impactor (Andersen, NGI or Marple-Miller, All USP<601> approved impactors) to perform separation of the particle below 10um from the bulk makeup powder. 1-10 grams of bulk makeup powder will be aerosolized using an eductor with high pressure to aerosolize the makeup powder. This powder will be fed into a cascade impactor operating at 30 lpm. All powder will be collected and weighed to show mass fraction and weights above and below 10um in size. Particles collected below 10um will be analyzed for TiO2 content via ICP-AES, which will be used to determine the mass of TiO2 in the <10um powder and to quantify all TiO2 mass content below 10um. This value will be used to calculate the value for mass fraction and does of TiO2 below 10um in size present in the bulk powdered makeup samples.

# 2.2 Alternative Standards that Defendant May Use to Comply with this Agreement

A. Should EHA reach any other court-approved or out-of-court settlement with another cosmetics manufacturer alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to TiO2, Defendant, in its sole discretion and without notice to EHA, may comply with the reformulation standard in that

settlement (in or out of court) and Defendant shall be deemed to be in compliance with Proposition 65. Covered Products' compliance with either the air capture, bulk testing, cascade impactor standard set forth in this section or any other standard contained in any EHA TiO2 settlement, constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 as to TiO2 as well.

B. Covered Products' compliance with either the air capture, bulk testing, cascade impactor standard set forth in this section or any other standard contained in any EHA TiO2 settlement, constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 as to TiO2 as well.

## 2.3 General Warning Requirements

Subject to section 2.4 (Grace Period) below, commencing on the Effective Date Fitglow agrees that Covered Products, if any, sold in California that was not reformulated pursuant to paragraph 2.1 or 2.2 shall contain a Proposition 65 warning. Fitglow agrees that each warning, if any, shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Covered Products the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Products shall consist of a warning affixed to the packaging, label, or tag, directly to each Covered Products sold in California by Fitglow, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process that contains one of the following statements:

 MARNING: This product can expose you to chemicals including Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

OR

2) **AWARNING**: Cancer— www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

If the warning statement is displayed on the Covered Products' packaging, it must be in a type size no smaller than the largest type size used for other consumer information on the product. In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Products' packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. The same warning shall be posted on any websites under the exclusive control of Fitglow where Covered Products are sold into California. Fitglow shall instruct any third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered Products to include the same warning as a condition of selling the Covered Products in California.

# 2.4 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Covered Products

The injunctive requirements of Section 2 shall not apply to Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date, which Covered Products are expressly subject to the releases provided in Section 4.1. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products in the stream of commerce specifically include, but are not limited to, Covered Products in the process of manufacture.

# 3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

## 3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all claims alleged in the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Fitglow agrees to pay three thousand (\$3,000.00) in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount retained by EHA. Fitglow shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" and (b) Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. as follows:

- One payment of \$2,250.00 to OEHHA, due 14 (fourteen) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$750.00 to EHA, due 14 (fourteen) days after the Effective Date.
   All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to this Section shall be delivered

directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics

Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment P.O. Box 4010 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

All penalty payments owed to EHA shall be sent to:

Isaac Fayman Environmental Health Advocates 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

# 3.2 Attorney Fees and Costs

The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to EHA and its counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, Fitglow agrees it owes thirty-seven thousand dollars (\$37,000.00) to EHA and its counsel for all fees and costs incurred in investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Fitglow, and negotiating a settlement. The thirty-seven thousand dollars (\$37,000.00) in Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be payable to Entorno Law, LLP as follows:

- One payment of \$5,000.00, due on or before October 1, 2023.
- One payment of \$5,000.00, due on or before November 1, 2023.
- One payment of \$5,000.00, due on or before December 1, 2023.
- One payment of \$5,000.00, due on or before January 1, 2024.
- One payment of \$5,000.00, due on or before February 1, 2024.
- One payment of \$2,000.00, due on or before March 1, 2024.
- One Payment of \$10,000, due on or before April 1, 2024. However, if all other

payments are timely made, then EHA agrees to waive this final installment. A payment shall be considered timely if it is received within ten (10) days of the due date.

3.3 All payments required under this Section 3.2 shall be delivered to:

Noam Glick Entorno Law, LLP 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

Fitglow may send EHA's counsel post-dated checks in advance of the payment deadlines provided Section 3.2.

#### 3.4 Tax Documentation

Fitglow agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments, and EHA agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for each of the payees under this Settlement Agreement. The Parties acknowledge that Fitglow cannot issue any settlement payment pursuant to Section 3.1 and 3.2 above until after Fitglow receives the requisite W-9 forms from EHA's counsel. EHA shall provide Fitglow all needed W-2s at least fourteen (14) days of the first due date in Section 3.2, above.

## 4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

## 4.1 EHA's Release of Fitglow

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution of all claims by EHA, on its own behalf and not on behalf of the general public, against Fitglow that can or could have been asserted by EHA, on its own behalf, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees, against Fitglow and each of its respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, attorneys, and any entity, including, but not limited to each entity to whom Fitglow directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers (including but not limited to Fitglow Beauty LLC), franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, "Releasees"), based on the failure to warn about exposures to TiO2 under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, sold, offered for

sale or distributed for sale in California by Fitglow, as alleged in the Notice, or for any other reason.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, EHA on its own behalf and not on behalf of the general public, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees hereby waives any and all rights it may have to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims against Fitglow and Releasees including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees and attorney fees arising under Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to TiO2 required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by Fitglow, before the Effective Date.

# 4.2 Fitglow's Release of EHA

Fitglow, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Products.

#### 4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. EHA on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Fitglow on behalf of itself only, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF

# KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

EHA and Fitglow each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

## 5 **PUBLIC BENEFIT**

The commitments Fitglow has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Fitglow under this Settlement Agreement, confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Fitglow that to the extent any other private party serves a notice and/or initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Fitglow's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning actual or alleged exposure to TiO2, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Fitglow is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

# 6. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

## 7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

# 8. <u>ENFORCEMENT</u>

In any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

# 9. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

#### For Fitglow:

Malcolm C. Weiss (mweiss@hunton.com) Javaneh Tarter (jtarter@hunton.com) Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP 550 South Hope Street, Suite 2000 Los Angeles, CA 90071

with a copy to:

Anna Domi 225 NE Mizner Blvd. Suite 510 Boca Raton, FL 33432

#### For EHA:

Noam Glick (noam@entornolaw.com) Entorno Law, LLP 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

# 10. <u>COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES</u>

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

## 11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

EHA and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

# 12. **MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

# 13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:** 

**AGREED TO:** 

Date: 08/30/2023

Date: 09/11/202

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

FITGLOW BEAUTY LLC

ADVOCATES, INC.