

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 The Parties. This Settlement Agreement (“Settlement Agreement” or “Agreement”) is entered into by and between Ema Bell (“Bell”) and Braha Industries, Inc. (“Braha”). Together, Bell and Braha are collectively referred to as the “Parties, and sometimes individually a “Party.” Bell is an individual who resides in the State of California and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Bell alleges that Braha is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations. Bell alleges that Braha has exposed individuals to diethanolamine (“DEA”) from its sales of mascara products including but not limited to the *BYS*® lash tease mascaras, UPC # 9313880559539, without first providing users and consumers of the product with a clear and reasonable health hazard exposure warning as required pursuant to Proposition 65. DEA is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.

1.3 Product Description. The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are *BYS*® mascaras, including but not limited to the *BYS*® lash tease mascaras, UPC # 9313880559539, (the “Products”) that Braha has either imported, and/or distributed, and/or offered for sale and/or directly or indirectly sold in California.

1.4 Notice of Violation. On May 12, 2023, Bell served Braha, Ross Stores, Inc., Ross Stores, Inc. dba dd’s Discounts (collectively, “Ross”), and various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq.” (the “Notice”). The Notice provided Braha and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Braha was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn California consumers and customers that use of the Products will expose them to DEA. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

1.5 No Admission. Braha enters into this Settlement Agreement as a full and final settlement of all claims that were raised or that could have been raised in the Notice, and to avoid prolonged and costly litigation. Braha denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice, Braha denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice, maintains that it is not a person in the course of doing business that is subject to Proposition 65, that it is not subject to personal jurisdiction in California, and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that it has sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws and are completely safe for their intended use. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission against interest by Braha of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law or that it is subject to personal jurisdiction in California; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission against interest by Braha of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Braha. However, this § 1.5 shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Braha maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.

1.6 Effective Date. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term “Effective Date” shall mean the date that both Parties are have notice that this Agreement is fully executed.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS


2.1 Reformulation of Products. As of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Products that Braha directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either be: (a) “Reformulated Products” pursuant to § 2.2, below; or (b) labeled with a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to §§ 2.3 and 2.4, below. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a “Reformulated Product” is a Product that is in compliance with the reformulation standard set forth in § 2.2, below. The warning requirements set forth in §§ 2.3 and 2.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product or to any Product manufactured prior to the Effective Date.

2.2 DEA Reformulation Standard. To qualify as a “Reformulated Product” the Product must meet the following standard: DEA content that is not detectable (i.e., zero) or below the Reporting Limit (defined herein) when analyzed pursuant to liquid chromatography/tandem mass spectrometry (LC/MS/MS), inductively coupled mass-spectroscopy (ICP-MS) or other method of analysis utilized by the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) for qualitative and quantitative screening of cosmetics and cosmetic raw materials.

2.2.1 Reporting Limit. The “Reporting Limit¹” is 200 mg/kg.

2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning. As of the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, except as set forth in § 2.2, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 2.3 and 2.4 must be provided for all Products that Braha manufacturers, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a DEA Free Reformulated Product. The warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 2.3(a) or (b), respectively:

(a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:


 [California Prop 65] **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including diethanolamine (DEA), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

(b) **Alternative Warning:** Braha may, but is not required to, use the alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 2.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

 [California Prop 65] **WARNING:** Cancer - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.²

¹ The “Reporting Limit” is 200 mg/kg the lowest concentration at which DEA can be detected in a sample of a Product by an accredited testing laboratory employing LC/MS/MS analysis or other method of analysis utilized by the ISO for qualitative and quantitative screening of cosmetics and cosmetic raw materials.

² If Braha has reason to believe that other chemicals listed under Proposition 65 as carcinogens may be contained or emitted by the Products, Braha may use either of the following two warnings in place of those set forth in Section 2.1:

 [California Prop 65] **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including diethanolamine and [insert chemical], which are known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

Or

 [California Prop 65] **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

In the first warning above Braha must insert the name of the additional listed chemical. Language in brackets optional.

2.4 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 2.3 must print the word “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Products does not use the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** shall be affixed to or printed on the Products’ packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process, provided that the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it reasonably likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings.

If Braha sells Products via an internet website to customers located in California, the requirements of this Section shall be satisfied if the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**, or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word “**WARNING,**” appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this Section, Braha shall post the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** on its own website and, if it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers. If Braha has actual knowledge a third-party internet seller is offering Products for sale to California consumers, Braha shall provide such sellers with written notice about providing a Proposition 65 internet warning in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2.

2.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations. The Parties agree that Braha shall be deemed to be in compliance with Proposition 65 and this Settlement Agreement by either adhering to § 2 of this Settlement Agreement or by complying with warning regulations adopted by the State of California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“**OEHHA**”) applicable to the Product and the exposures at issue that are in effect after the Effective Date. If “consumer

information,” as that term is defined in Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.1(c) as it may be amended from time to time, is provided in a foreign language, Braha shall provide the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** in the foreign language in accordance with applicable warning regulations adopted by OEHHA. If “consumer information” (as defined in 27 Cal Code of Regs Section 25600.1(c)) is provided in a foreign language on a Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, Braha shall also provide the **Warning** in the foreign language on the Product’s packaging or labeling. If “consumer information” (as defined in 27 Cal Code of Regs Section 25600.1(c)) is provided in a foreign language on a warning sign prepared by Braha, Braha shall also provide the **Warning** in the foreign language on the warning sign for the Product.

3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all claims for monetary relief of any kind related to the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement (except for Plaintiff’s attorney’s fees and expenses set forth in § 4 below), Braha shall pay \$500 as a Civil Penalty in accordance with this Section. The Civil Penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the Penalty remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Penalty remitted to Bell. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

3.1 Civil Penalty. Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Braha shall issue two (2) separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment: (a) one to “OEHHA” in the amount of \$375; and one to (b) “Ema Bell” in the amount of \$125. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

3.2 Payment Procedures.

(a) Issuance of Payments. Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Bell, pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire
Brodsky Smith
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004.

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line “Prop 65 Penalties”) at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010.

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 “I” Street
Sacramento, CA 95814.

(b) Copy of Payments to OEHHA. Braha agrees to provide Bell’s counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA, simultaneously with its penalty payment to Bell, to be delivered to the address provided in § 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(c) Tax Documentation. Braha agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and Bell agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) “Ema Bell” whose address and tax identification number shall be provided within five (5) calendar days of the Effective Date;

(ii) “Brodsky Smith” (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) “Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment” 1001 “I” Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

Bell and her counsel recognize that without the W-9s set forth herein Braha cannot process the require Settlement Payments.

4. **REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The Parties acknowledge that Bell and her counsel offered to reach preliminary agreement on the material terms of this dispute before reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to her. The Parties thereafter reached an accord on the compensation due to Bell and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the Effective Date. Under these legal principles, Braha shall reimburse Bell's counsel the total amount of \$17,000 for any and all of Bell's fees and expenses, including but not limited to all investigative, expert, and testing expenses, incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to Braha's attention, and negotiating this settlement in the public interest. Within ten (10) business days of the Effective Date, Braha shall send a check payable to "Brotsky Smith" in the amount of \$17,000 for delivery to the address identified in § 3.2(a)(i), above.

5. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

5.1 Release of Braha and Upstream and Downstream Customers and Entities. This Settlement Agreement is a full, final and binding resolution between Bell, acting on her own behalf, and Braha, of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by Bell or on behalf of her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assigns ("Releasers") for any actual or alleged failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to DEA from use of the Products manufactured through the Effective Date, and Releasers hereby release any and all such claims against Braha and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities, shareholders, marketplaces, directors, officers, agents, employees, attorneys, successors and assignees, and each entity to whom Braha directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Products, including but not limited to, downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees, retailers, including but not limited to Ross, and its respective subsidiaries, affiliates and parents, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 through the Effective Date based on exposure to DEA from use of Products manufactured through the Effective Date.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to §§ 3 and 4 above, Bell, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby covenants not to sue and waives any right to institute, participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that she may have, including without limitation, all actions and causes of action in law and in equity, all obligations, expenses (including without limitation all attorneys' fees, expert fees, and investigation fees, and expenses), damages, losses, liabilities and demands against any of the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to DEA from use of the Products.

5.2 Braha's Release of Bell. Braha, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Bell, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by Bell and/or her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to exposure to DEA from use of the Products through the Effective Date.

5.3 California Civil Code § 1542. It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the products manufactured by or for Braha will develop or be discovered. Bell, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and or assignees only, on the one hand, and Braha, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims against the Releasees for products manufactured by or for Braha up through the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in §§ 5.1 and 5.2, above, may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE

MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE
DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Bell and Braha each respectively acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

5.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65. The Parties agree that compliance by Braha with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to DEA from use of the Products.

5.5. Public Benefit. It is the Parties' understanding that the commitments Braha has agreed to herein, and the actions to be taken by Braha under this Settlement Agreement, including payment of a civil penalty, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of the Parties that, to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Braha's failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to DEA prior to use of the Products it has manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, import, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Braha is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the Settlement Agreement being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Settlement Agreement.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable or limited by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, or if DEA is delisted, Braha shall provide written notice to Bell of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further

obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, a Product is so affected. This Settlement Agreement is enforceable solely by the Parties hereto.

8. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any Party by the other Party to the following addresses:

For Braha:

President
Braha Industries Inc.
10 West 33rd street
New York, NY 10001

With copy to:

J. Robert Maxwell, Esq.
Rogers Joseph O'Donnell
Robert Dollar Building, 311 California St., 10th Fl.
San Francisco, CA 94104

For Bell:

Evan J. Smith
Brodsky Smith
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Either party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Bell agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

12. ENFORCEMENT

Before any Party may take action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement for alleged breach, that Party must give the other Party written notice and a good faith opportunity to respond and cure the alleged violation. The Parties must thereafter meet and confer for a period of no less than 30 days to try to resolve any alleged violation. If the alleged violation cannot be resolved, the Party alleging a violation may thereafter move to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement.

13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

14. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: _____

Date: 01/12/2024

By: _____
Erna Bell

By: David Braha
Braha Industries, Inc.

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

12. ENFORCEMENT

Before any Party may take action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement for alleged breach, that Party must give the other Party written notice and a good faith opportunity to respond and cure the alleged violation. The Parties must thereafter meet and confer for a period of no less than 30 days to try to resolve any alleged violation. If the alleged violation cannot be resolved, the Party alleging a violation may thereafter move to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement.

13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

14. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 1 / 15 / 24

Date: _____

By:  _____

By: _____

Ema Bell

Braha Industries, Inc.